

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Pursuing Equal Opportunities

### *The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice*

*Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice* offers original and innovative contributions to the debate about equality of opportunity. Pursuing equality is an important challenge for any modern democratic society but this challenge faces two sets of difficulties: the theoretical question of what sort of equality to pursue and for whom, and the practical question concerning which legal and political institutions are the most appropriate vehicles for implementing egalitarian social policy and thus realizing egalitarian justice.

Part I sets out a theory of equality of opportunity that presents equal opportunities as a normative device for the regulation of competition for scarce resources. Parts II, III, and IV shift the focus to the consideration of the practical application by courts or legislatures or public policy makers of policies for addressing, respectively, racial, class, or gender injustices in Canada and the United States. The author examines in depth standardized tests in universities and colleges, affirmative action, workfare, universal health care, comparable worth, and the economic consequences of divorce.

*Pursuing Equal Opportunities* is unique in combining political and legal theory and cutting-edge socio-legal research, as well as in offering an overview of the concept of equality of opportunity and its history and application. As such, it will be of particular interest to professionals and graduate students in social and political philosophy, political science, law, sociology, and education.

Lesley A. Jacobs is Associate Professor and Director of the Law & Society Program at York University, Toronto.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Public Policy

General editor: Douglas MacLean, *University of Maryland,  
Baltimore County*

*Other books in the series*

Mark Sagoff: *The Economy of the Earth*

Henry Shue (ed.): *Nuclear Deterrence and Moral Restraint*

Judith Lichtenberg (ed.): *Democracy and Mass Media*

William Galston: *Liberal Purposes*

Elaine Draper: *Risky Business*

R. G. Frey and Christopher W. Morris: *Violence, Terrorism, and Justice*

Douglas Husak: *Drugs and Rights*

Ferdinand Schoeman: *Privacy and Social Freedom*

Dan Brock: *Life and Death*

Paul B. Thompson: *The Ethics of Aid and Trade*

Jeremy Waldron: *Liberal Rights*

Steven Lee: *Morality, Prudence, and Nuclear Weapons*

Robert Goodin: *Utilitarianism as a Public Policy*

Bernard Rollin: *The Frankenstein Syndrome*

Robert K. Fullinwider (ed.): *Public Education in a Multicultural Society*

John Kleinig: *The Ethics of Policing*

Norman Daniels: *Justice and Justification*

James P. Sterba: *Justice for Here and Now*

Erik Nord: *Cost-Value Analysis in Health Care*

David Wasserman and Robert Wachbroit (eds.): *Genetics and Criminal  
Behavior*

David Boonin: *A Defense of Abortion*

Ajuwe H. Wingo: *Veil Politics in Liberal Democratic States*

Deen K. Chatterjee and Dan E. Schleid (eds.): *Ethics and Foreign  
Intervention*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Pursuing Equal Opportunities

## The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

LESLEY A. JACOBS

*York University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521530217](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521530217)

© Lesley A. Jacobs 2004

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Jacobs, Lesley A.

Pursuing equal opportunities : the theory and practice of egalitarian justice /  
Lesley A. Jacobs.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in philosophy and public policy)  
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-82320-x – ISBN 0-521-53021-0 (pb.)

1. Equality. 2. Equality – United States. 3. Social justice. 4. Social justice –  
United States. I. Title. II. Series.

JC575.J33 2004

320'.01'1–dc21 2003043504

ISBN 978-0-521-82320-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-53021-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*For Brenda, Aaron, Grace, Oliver, and now Noah*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---



## Contents

*Acknowledgements* *page* xiii

### PART I. RETRIEVING EQUALITY OF OPPORTUNITY

1	Introduction	3
2	Equal Opportunities as a Regulative Ideal	10
	2.1 INTRODUCTION	10
	2.2 AN OUTLINE OF THE THREE-DIMENSIONAL MODEL	13
	2.3 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES FOR WHAT?	21
	2.4 BACKGROUND FAIRNESS AND STATUS EQUALITY	29
	2.5 THE IDEA OF STAKES FAIRNESS	37
	2.6 CONCLUSION	47
3	Equal Opportunity without Natural Inequalities	48
	3.1 INTRODUCTION	48
	3.2 THE ASSUMPTION ABOUT NATURAL INEQUALITIES	51
	3.3 THE MYTH OF NATURAL INEQUALITIES	53
	3.4 INEQUALITY BY DESIGN: LEARNING FROM THE IQ DEBATE	61
	3.5 TWO OTHER ISSUES ABOUT NATURE AND JUSTICE	71
	3.6 EGALITARIAN JUSTICE WITHOUT NATURAL INEQUALITY	72
	3.7 THE VULNERABLE MINORITY APPROACH	74
	3.8 CONCLUSION	79

### PART II. RACE

4	Equal Opportunities and Civil Rights: Merit, Standardized Tests, and Higher Education	83
	4.1 INTRODUCTION	83
	4.2 STANDARDIZED TESTS IN AMERICAN UNIVERSITIES	86

*Contents*

4.3	MERITOCRACY REGULATED BY EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES	88
4.4	THE IMPLICATIONS FOR CIVIL RIGHTS	101
4.5	THE WORRY ABOUT AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	111
4.6	CONCLUSION	114
5	Integration, Diversity, and Affirmative Action	116
5.1	INTRODUCTION	116
5.2	DIVERSITY OF WHAT? DIVERSITY FOR WHOM?	122
5.3	TAKING INTEGRATION SERIOUSLY AGAIN	124
5.4	THE VALUE OF DIVERSITY AND INTEGRATION	129
5.5	THE RATIONALE FOR AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	134
5.6	CONCLUSION	141
<b>PART III. CLASS</b>		
6	Justifying Workfare	145
6.1	INTRODUCTION	145
6.2	MAKING SENSE OF WORKFARE	149
6.2.1	THREE FLAWED ARGUMENTS FOR WORKFARE	151
6.2.2	THE ARGUMENT FROM DESERT	152
6.2.3	THE ARGUMENT FROM SELF-RESPECT	155
6.2.4	THE ARGUMENT FROM SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY	158
6.3	WORKFARE AND THE RELEVANCE OF STAKES FAIRNESS	161
6.4	CONCLUSION	168
7	Universal Access to Health Care	169
7.1	INTRODUCTION	169
7.2	THE SIGNIFICANCE OF UNIVERSAL ACCESS	169
7.3	TWO EGALITARIAN STRATEGIES	176
7.3.1	THE COMPREHENSIVE EGALITARIAN STRATEGY	178
7.3.2	EQUALITY OF RESOURCES	180
7.3.3	THE PLACE OF HEALTH CARE	183
7.3.4	THE GENERAL PROSPECTS FOR THE COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY	192
7.3.5	THE RESTRICTED EGALITARIAN STRATEGY	193
7.3.6	THE EQUAL BENEFIT VERSION OF THE RESTRICTED STRATEGY	194
7.3.7	DANIELS'S VERSION OF THE RESTRICTED STRATEGY	196
7.4	CONCLUSION	200

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

## PART IV. GENDER

8	Gender Inequalities in the Workplace	205
	8.1 INTRODUCTION	205
	8.2 UNDERSTANDING GENDER GAPS IN THE WORKPLACE	209
	8.3 IS THE SECOND SHIFT UNFAIR TO WOMEN?	213
	8.4 WHY FAMILIES ARE BEYOND EQUAL OPPORTUNITY REGULATION	219
	8.5 CONCLUSION	224
9	Equal Opportunities after Divorce	226
	9.1 INTRODUCTION	226
	9.2 WHAT'S WRONG WITH FAULT-BASED DIVORCE LAW?	230
	9.2.1 THREE DOMINANT APPROACHES TO DIVORCE SETTLEMENTS	231
	9.2.2 THE 'CLEAN BREAK' APPROACH	232
	9.2.3 PARTNERSHIP ANALOGIES	234
	9.2.4 EQUALIZING POST-DIVORCE STANDARDS OF LIVING	236
	9.2.5 AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES APPROACH	240
	9.2.6 DIVIDING MARITAL PROPERTY UPON DIVORCE	245
	9.3 CONCLUSION	250
	<i>Bibliography (including cases cited)</i>	251
	<i>Index</i>	267

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgements

This book has been a project of mine for a number of years, and the arguments and analysis I finally offer here have evolved and unfolded in ways I didn't anticipate at the outset. This evolution in my thinking is a reflection of the valuable feedback I have received from many different sources. I am immensely grateful to several universities and their faculty for valuable support. York University in Toronto provided me with two years of paid leave that allowed me to concentrate on the overall research for the book. Harvard Law School awarded me a Liberal Arts Fellowship in 1997–98, during which I became immersed in debates about race and the law and wrote the papers that laid the basis for Chapters 3 to 5. Christopher Edley in particular was a valuable resource from whom I learnt so much. The Centre for Socio-Legal Studies at Oxford University provided me with a Visiting Fellowship for Trinity Term, 1994. There, I first developed the framework that underlies Chapters 8 and 9. I am especially grateful to Mavis Maclean for some insightful conversations and comments. The Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada provided much appreciated research funds.

I have presented drafts of parts of this book in a wide range of forums. I am grateful to audiences and commentators at a number of universities: the University of British Columbia, the University of Alberta, the University of Toronto Law School, York University, Oxford University, Harvard Law School, the University of Western Ontario, and the University of Buffalo Law School. I have also presented material at numerous academic conferences, including the Law and Society Association Meetings in Snowmass and Glasgow, the Canadian Law and Society Association meeting in Ottawa, and the Canadian Political Science Association meeting in Charlottetown. I have also benefitted immensely from participation and presentations in some smaller scholarly networks, especially

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53021-7 - Pursuing Equal Opportunities: The Theory and Practice of Egalitarian Justice

Lesley A. Jacobs

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

the Toronto chapter of CSPT, Will Kymlicka's network on citizenship, and the Regional Socio-Legal Conference.

Numerous individuals have provided me with helpful written comments on particular chapters at some stage or other. At the risk of forgetting someone, the following is a list of individuals whom I recall providing especially helpful advice and criticism: Justine Burley, Joe Carens, Jerry Cohen, David Donaldson, Ronald Dworkin, Avigail Eisenberg, Margaret Moore, Brian Nakata, Eric Rakowski, Alex Smith, Richard Vernon, and Andrew Williams. My greatest debt in this regard is to the three reviewers for Cambridge University Press. Cambridge editor Terence Moore and the Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Public Policy Series editor Professor Douglas Maclean solicited excellent reports. The three reviewers (including my friend Matthew Clayton) each wrote exemplary constructive assessments of the book as a whole that were invaluable in my putting together the final manuscript.

Although the chapters in the book all appear in their current form for the first time in print, some sections of the chapters were originally parts of journal articles or chapters in books. Chapter 3 draws on 'Equal Opportunity, Natural Inequalities, and Racial Disadvantage: The Bell Curve and Its Critics,' *Philosophy of the Social Sciences*, Vol. 29, No. 1 (March 1999), pp. 120–44. Chapter 5 draws on 'Integration, Diversity, and Affirmative Action,' *Law and Society Review*, Vol. 32, No. 3 (1998), pp. 725–46. Chapter 6 draws on 'What Are the Normative Foundations of Workfare?' in Patricia Evans, Lesley Jacobs, Alain Noel, and Elisabeth Reynolds, *Workfare: Does It Work? Is It Fair?* (Montreal: Renouf/Institute for Research on Public Policy, 1995). Chapter 7 draws on 'Can an Egalitarian Justify Universal Access to Health Care?,' *Social Theory and Practice*, Vol. 22 (1996), 315–48. Chapter 8 draws on 'Equal Opportunity and Gender Disadvantage,' *The Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence*, Vol. 7 (1994), pp. 61–72, and 'Equity and Opportunity' in Francois Gingras, editor, *Gender and Politics in Contemporary Canada* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1995).

My greatest debt, as always, is to my family. My partner, Brenda, continues to endure my scholarly pursuits patiently. Our four children, Aaron (11), Grace (9), Oliver (6), and Noah (3) keep me grounded. They provide me with a sense of what is genuinely important in life, and indeed ultimately are the reason why I care so much that the future is more just than the past.