

PYTHAGORAS AND RENAISSANCE EUROPE: FINDING HEAVEN



Pythagoras Renaissance Europe: Finding Heaven, Christiane L. and Joost-Gaugier offers the first systematic study of Pythagoras, the ancient Greek sage, and his influence on mathematics, astronomy, philosophy, religion, medicine, music, the occult, and social life – as well as on architecture and art – in the late medieval and early modern eras. Spanning the period between Dante and Petrarch in the fourteenth century and Kepler and Galileo in the seventeenth, this book demonstrates that Pythagoras's influence in intellectual circles - Christian, Jewish, and Arab – was more widespread than has previously been acknowledged. Joost-Gaugier shows that during this period admiration for Pythagoras was great throughout Europe. She also shows how this admiration was translated into ideas that were applied to the visual arts by numerous well-known architects and artists who sought, through the use of a visual language inspired by the memory of Pythagoras, to obtain perfect harmony in their creations. Among these were Alberti, Bramante, Leonardo da Vinci, Michelangelo, and Raphael. Thus, she suggests, some of the greatest artworks in the Western world owe their modernity to an inspirational force that, paradoxically, was conceived in the distant past.

Christiane L. Joost-Gaugier is an internationally known and distinguished scholar. A three-time graduate of Harvard, she has published extensively in research journals, conference proceedings, and international catalogues on subjects ranging from classical literature to medieval architecture to Renaissance art and intellectual history. A recipient of grants from the American Council of Learned Societies, the American Philosophical Society, the Delmas Foundation, the Fulbright Association, and the National Endowment for the Humanities among others, she is the author of Jacopo Bellini: Selected Drawings, Raphael's Stanza della Segnatura: Meaning and Invention, and Measuring Heaven: Pythagoras and His Influence on Thought and Art in Antiquity and the Middle Ages. In 2005 she was awarded an Honorary Phi Beta Kappa from Harvard University for lifetime achievement.





Frontispiece: Montepulciano, San Biagio (Antonio da Sangallo the Elder) Photo: Allan Foy



PYTHAGORAS AND RENAISSANCE EUROPE

Finding Heaven



CHRISTIANE L. JOOST-GAUGIER





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107415232

© Christiane L. Joost-Gaugier 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009 First paperback edition 2014 Reprinted 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Joost-Gaugier, Christiane L.

Pythagoras and Renaissance Europe : finding heaven / Christiane L. Joost-Gaugier.

p. cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-51795-9 (hardback)

1. Pythagoras. 2. Pythagoras – Influence. 3. Philosophy, Modern.

B243.J66 2009

182'.2-dc22 2008040586

ISBN 978-0-521-51795-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-41523-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



First of all, I never get down to writing except at dead of night when it's absolutely quiet and deep silence reigns over all ... in short, when there's such complete peace that if Pythagoras were alive he would be able to hear the music of the spheres quite clearly. At such a time gods and goddesses delight to hold converse with pure minds.

Erasmus, Dialogus Ciceronianus (trans. Betty I. Knott)





CONTENTS



List of Illustrations	page x
Acknowledgments	xiii
INTRODUCTION	I
Part One: Pythagoras, Man for the Renaissance	
ONE: PROLOGUE: THE DIFFUSION OF KNOWLEDGE	
ABOUT PYTHAGORAS IN THE RENAISSANCE	15
TWO: THE EMERGENCE OF "SAINT" PYTHAGORAS IN	
THE EARLY RENAISSANCE	19
Early Fifteenth-Century Writers View Pythagoras	19
Pletho, Bessarion, Cusanus, and Alberti: An International Generation	
Applauds Pythagoras	24
Ficino's Pythagoras and His Significance as the Jewish "Grandfather"	
of Christianity	27
Pico's Venerable Pythagoras: Fountainhead of Wisdom	30
The Dissemination of Information about Pythagoras in	
the Late Fifteenth Century	31
THREE: THE APOTHEOSIS OF PYTHAGORAS IN	
THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY	37
The Authority of Pythagoras in the Early Sixteenth Century	38
Reuchlin Describes Pythagoras's "Luggage": The Hebrew	3
Patrimony of Christianity	42
Occultism, Virtue, and the "Jewish" Side of Pythagoras: The Heavenly	·
Teacher of Wisdom	45
Mathematics, Exorcisms, and the Inspiration of Painters	51
Pythagoras: The "Prince of Italian Philosophy"	55



FOUR: THE PYTHAGOREAN TRADITION IN THE

CONTENTS

PART TWO: THE MANY FACES OF RENAISSANCE PYTHAGOREANISM

EARLY FIFTEENTH CENTURY	63
The Resurgence of Pythagoreanism in Florence	65
The Greek Factor: Pletho and Bessarion	66
Intertwined Threads of Balance, Perfection, and Frugality:	
Germany, Florence, and Rome	72
FIVE: THE STRENGTHENING AND DEEPENING OF	
PYTHAGOREANISM IN THE LATER FIFTEENTH CENTURY	80
Ficino's Pythagoreanism and His Proselytizing	80
Pico's Version of Pythagoreanism	87
Other Late-Century Pythagoreans in Tuscany	92
Urbino and the Mathematical Angle	93
Other Mathematical Considerations	98
Gaffurio and the Harmonia of Music	102
The Roman Connection	103
SIX: THE MATURATION AND VICISSITUDES OF	
PYTHAGOREANISM IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY	108
Pacioli, Leonardo da Vinci, and Their Friends	109
Roman Perspectives	120
Venice: The Harmonia mundi of Francesco Zorzi and	
Pythagorean Musical Traditions	122
Esoteric Pythagoreanism: Reuchlin and His Contemporaries	
in Germany, Italy, England, and the Netherlands	123
International Pythagoreanism and Magic: France,	
Germany, England, and Italy	127
Finding Heaven: On the Brink of a New Science – From	
Copernicus to Kepler and Beyond	133
PART THREE: PYTHAGOREANISM IN ARCHITECTURE AND ART	
SEVEN: RENAISSANCE IMAGES OF PYTHAGORAS	145
EIGHT: THE SEARCH FOR HARMONY IN	
ARCHITECTURE AND ART IN THE FIFTEENTH CENTURY	162
Early Beginnings in the Florence of Brunelleschi and Michelozzo	162
Pythagorean Concepts Develop: Alberti in Florence and His	
Contemporaries in Pienza and Urbino	176

viii



CONTENTS

Contemplating Harmony at Cortona, Prato, Milan,	
and Rome	192
NINE: FINDING HARMONY: FORM AND MEANING IN	
ARCHITECTURE AND ART OF THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY	202
Prelude: The Pythagorean Experiments of Leonardo,	
Early Michelangelo, and Young Raphael	202
Bramante and the Perfect Church	211
Harmonious Unities in the Maturation of Leonardo,	
Michelangelo, Raphael, and Fra Bartolomeo	218
Venice and the Divinity of Proportion	230
The Theology of Arithmetic in Spain	233
TEN: CONCLUSIONS: THE PRINCE OF	
PHILOSOPHERS AND THE BIRTH OF HARMONY	
AS AN AESTHETIC NOTION	240
Appendix A: Pythagorean Works in Six Renaissance Libraries	245
Appendix B: English Translation of Filippo Beroaldo's	
Symbola Pythagorica (1503)	248
Notes	267
Select Bibliography	301
Index	315



ILLUSTRATIONS



Mo	ntepulciano, San Biagio (Antonio da Sangalio the Elder)	page 11
I	Luca della Robbia, Pythagoras Teaching Arithmetic to Plato	146
2	Luca della Robbia, Pythagoras Discovering Music	148
3	Pythagoras Spitting out Mathematical Formulas	149
4	Jörg Syrlin the Elder, Pythagoras Singing	151
5	Pythagoras in His Study	152
6	Jubal Inventing Music, Pythagoras Inventing Harmony,	
	Pythagoras Testing His Theory on a Monochord, and	
	Pythagoras Testing His Theory on Flutes	154
7	Boethius and Pythagoras	155
8	Raphael, Pythagoras from School of Athens	156
9	Pellegrino Tibaldi, Jubal and Pythagoras as Inventors of	
	Music and Arithmetic	158
IO	Pellegrino Tibaldi, det. from Jubal and Pythagoras as	
	Inventors of Music and Arithmetic	159
ΙΙ	Annibale Carracci, Hercules Bearing the Globe	160
12	Florence, Pazzi Chapel, int. (Brunelleschi)	163
13	Florence, San Lorenzo, Sacristy, int. (Brunelleschi)	165
14	Plan of San Lorenzo (Brunelleschi)	166
15	Plan of Santo Spirito (Brunelleschi)	167
16	Florence, Pazzi Chapel, façade (Brunelleschi)	168
17	Plan of Santa Maria degli Angeli (Brunelleschi)	169
18	Florence, Santa Maria degli Angeli (Brunelleschi)	169
19	Plan of Cathedral of Florence Lantern (Brunelleschi)	170
20	Lorenzo Ghiberti, east doors of the Florentine Baptistery	172
21	Masaccio, Tribute Money	173
22	Florence, Palazzo Medici, int. courtyard (Michelozzo)	174
23	Florence, Palazzo Medici, ext. (Michelozzo)	175
24	Florence, Palazzo Rucellai (Alberti)	177
25	Matteo dei Pasti, medal for Tempio Malatestiano	178



LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

26	Rimini, Tempio Malatestiano (Alberti)	179
27	Florence, Santa Maria Novella (Alberti)	180
28	Pienza, Cathedral (Bernardo Rossellino)	182
29	Pienza, Palazzo Piccolomini, courtyard (Bernardo Rossellino)	183
30	Pienza, Palazzo Piccolomini, east façade (Bernardo Rossellino)	184
3 I	Urbino, Palazzo Ducale, Grand Courtyard (Luciano Laurana)	185
32	Urbino, Palazzo Ducale, Cappella del Perdono (Bramante?)	186
33	Urbino, Palazzo Ducale, Tempietto delle Muse (Bramante?)	187
34	Piero della Francesca, Flagellation	189
35	Luciano Laurana (?), Ideal City	191
36	Cortona, Santa Maria del Calcinaio, int. (Francesco di Giorgio)	192
37	Cortona, Santa Maria del Calcinaio (Francesco di Giorgio)	193
38	Prato, Santa Maria delle Carceri (Giuliano da Sangallo)	194
39	Milan, Santa Maria presso San Satiro, int. (Bramante)	195
40	Milan, Santa Maria delle Grazie, int. (Bramante)	196
4I	Milan, Santa Maria delle Grazie (Bramante)	197
42	Rome, Sistine Chapel, original int.	198
43	Pythagorean Sphere	199
44	Leonardo, Benois Madonna	203
45	Leonardo, Adoration of the Magi	205
46	Leonardo, Madonna of the Rocks	206
47	Michelangelo, Madonna of the Steps	208
48	Michelangelo, Pietà	209
49	Raphael, Three Graces	210
50	Raphael, Marriage of the Virgin	211
51	Rome, Tempietto at San Pietro in Montorio (Bramante)	212
52	Fabio Calvo, view of ancient Rome	213
53	Fabio Calvo, view of ancient Rome	214
54	Cristoforo Caradosso, medal commemorating foundation	
	of St. Peter's (Bramante)	215
55	Montepulciano, San Biagio (Antonio da Sangallo the Elder)	216
56	Todi, Santa Maria delle Consolazione	217
57	Todi, Santa Maria delle Consolazione, int.	218
58	Leonardo, Burlington House Cartoon	219
59	Leonardo, Madonna and Child with St. Anne	220
60	Raphael, Canigiani Holy Family	221
61	Michelangelo, Pitti tondo	222
62	Michelangelo, Sistine Ceiling	223
63	Raphael, Ceiling of Stanza della Segnatura	226
64	Raphael, School of Athens	227
65	Raphael, <i>Disputà</i>	228
66	Raphael, Parnassus	229



LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

67	Fra Bartolomeo, Marriage of St. Catherine	231
68	Giorgione and Titian, Fête Champêtre (Memorial to Giorgione)	232
69	Vicenza, Villa Rotonda (Andrea Palladio)	234
70	Granada, Palace of Charles V, courtyard (Pedro Machuca)	235
71	Madrid, El Escorial, plan (Juan de Toledo and Juan de Herrera)	236
72	Luca Cambiaso, Trinity, det. of Gloria at El Escorial	237



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS



The present volume, following from one that aimed to set the stage for Pythagoras and his influence in Antiquity and the Middle Ages, is devoted to recapturing his influence for the Renaissance and to speculating on its effect on the visual arts and architecture. The subject of Pythagoras's influence on the Renaissance, and specifically on the visual arts, has been obscured by our modern tendency to view different disciplines as separated from each other. The broadly interdisciplinary nature of this problem is challenging because it requires the wider perspective that was understood in the Renaissance. The substructure of thinkers and ideas that lies deeply embedded in the culture of the Renaissance is fertile ground. The testimony of its sources is so suggestive it cannot be overlooked. Our knowledge respecting the contributions of these thinkers to each other is much fuller than is frequently realized. While my understanding may be imperfect, I have here attempted to indulge my curiosity in how Pythagoras served as a conduit enabling those who sought to imitate the past to achieve an original and stunning modernity. I hope my readers will understand that this volume does not purport to give a complete synthesis of Pythagoras and his importance for the Renaissance, but only to offer some suggestions for future exploration and for evaluating his importance for the history of art and architecture. It is this interest that has encouraged me to enlarge my own studies and to seek understanding of the past by listening to its own language. For this gratification I am indebted to many institutions and many people.

First and foremost, those who inspired me in the beginning with the thrill to understand the past left an indelible example for me. These were, especially, Millard Meiss and Federico Zeri, my mentors at Harvard, and Giuseppe Billanovich, who kindly opened his house at Padua to me on many occasions. Among the many libraries that opened their doors to me, I am grateful to the Harvard University libraries, especially the Houghton and Dumbarton Oaks research libraries, as well as to the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, the Library of the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florence, the Bibliothèque Nationale at Paris, the Library of Congress, the Library of the Folger Institute, and the National Library of Medicine. During



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

the time of my work on this volume, my most beloved home, however, was in the Library of the National Gallery at Washington, where the entire staff was always patient, kind, knowledgeable, and helpful.

I owe a special debt to those of my friends and colleagues whose superior knowledge in many important areas helped me to overcome problems or discover new tools of enlightenment. George Hersey, who sadly is no longer with us, first inspired and encouraged me to see this project through. Throughout its writing he was a confidant and a correspondent. Its realization owes a special debt of gratitude to two scholars whose knowledge, wisdom, grace, and common sense were never in short supply, Arielle Saiber and Mary Garrard. Francisco LaRubia Prado was helpful in innumerable imaginative ways, as was Carolyn Tuttle, whose first English translation of an important Renaissance work on Pythagoras is included as an appendix to this book. Among the many others who have helped me in one way or another to see this work through are Colin Eisler, Lamia Doumato, Yuri Long, Alexander Blachly, Allan Foy, David Alan Brown, Caroline Karpinski, Norberto Gramaccini, Helga DeLisle, Joscelyn Godwin, George Tatge, Shannon Pritchard, Dominique Surh, François Souchal, Carolyn Valone, Antonio Paolucci, Luba Freedman, Mary L. Robertson, Kent Killelea, Elaine Economides Joost, Charlotte DeMonte Phelps, Andrea Zezza, Inge Dupont, John Monfasani, Greg Murr, Gérard Bonneaud, Andrew Oliver, Ariel Cardoso, Elizabeth Welles, and Jorge Sobredo. I would also like to express my gratitude to the Kress Foundation for its support of this work in the form of a subvention. A very special word of thanks is due to Paolo Sfriso, who very kindly allowed the use of his photograph for the front cover.

To all these institutions and people I acknowledge my most vivid gratitude. I am especially honored to have worked, once again, with Cambridge University Press and its ever-wise and ever-gracious editor, Beatrice Rehl. Cambridge's production editor, Camilla Knapp, and copy editor, Susan Greenberg, both helped immeasurably in the process of publication.