

Organizational Control

Organization scholars have long acknowledged that control processes are integral to the way in which organizations function. While control theory research spans many decades and draws on several rich traditions, theoretical limitations have kept it from generating consistent and interpretable empirical findings and from reaching consensus concerning the nature of key relationships. This book reveals how we can overcome such problems by synthesizing diverse, yet complementary, streams of control research into a theoretical framework and empirical tests that more fully describe how types of control mechanisms (e.g. the use of rules, norms, direct supervision, or monitoring) aimed at particular control targets (e.g. input, behavior, output) are applied within particular types of control systems (i.e., market, clan, bureaucracy, integrative). Written by a team of distinguished scholars, this book not only sheds light on the long-neglected phenomenon of organizational control, it also provides important directions for future research.

SIM B SITKIN is Professor of Management and Faculty Director of the Fuqua/Coach K Center on Leadership and Ethics at the Fuqua School of Business, Duke University.

LAURA B. CARDINAL is Professor of Strategic Management at the C. T. Bauer College of Business, University of Houston.

KATINKA M. BIJLSMA-FRANKEMA is Associate Professor of Organization Theory at VU University in Amsterdam and Professor of Organization Sciences at the European Institute for Advanced Studies in Management (EIASM) in Brussels.



Organizational Control

Edited by

SIM B SITKIN, LAURA B. CARDINAL AND KATINKA M. BIJLSMA-FRANKEMA





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521731973

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Organizational control / edited by Sim B Sitkin, Laura B. Cardinal, Katinka M. Bijlsma-Frankema.

p. cm. – (Cambridge companions to management) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-51744-7 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-73197-3 (Pbk.)

Organization.
 Management.
 Sitkin, Sim B II. Cardinal, Laura B.
 Bijlsma-Frankema, Katinka, 1946– IV. Title.
 V. Series.
 HD31.O728 2010

302.3′5–dc22

2010016809

ISBN 978-0-521-51744-7 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-73197-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of figures			
List of tables			
No	Notes on contributors		
Fo	Foreword		
Pa	rt I Introduction and history	1	
1	Control is fundamental Sim B Sitkin, Laura B. Cardinal, and Katinka M. Bijlsma-Frankema	3	
2	A historical perspective on organizational control Roger L. M. Dunbar and Matt Statler	16	
Pa	rt II Conceptions of organizational control	49	
3	A configurational theory of control Laura B. Cardinal, Sim B Sitkin, and Chris P. Long	51	
4	Critical perspectives on organizational control: reflections and prospects Rick Delbridge	80	
Pa	rt III Identity, attention, and motivation in organizational control	109	
5	Identity work and control in occupational communities John Van Maanen	111	
6	Organizational identity and control: can the two go together Elizabeth George and Cuili Qian	r? 167	
7	Attention and control William Ocasio and Franz Wohlgezogen	191	

V



vi		Contents
8	The role of motivational orientations in formal and informal control M. Audrey Korsgaard, Bruce M. Meglino, and Sophia S. Jeong	222
Par	t IV Relational control	249
9	Relational networks, strategic advantage: collaborative control is fundamental <i>John Hagel III, John Seely Brown, and Mariann Jelinek</i>	251
10	Toward a theory of relational control: how relationship structure influences the choice of controls Laurie J. Kirsch and Vivek Choudhury	301
11	Peer control in organizations Misty L. Loughry	324
Par	t V Managerial and strategic control	363
12	Control to cooperation: examining the role of manageria authority in portfolios of managerial actions <i>Chris P. Long</i>	1 365
13	Consequences and antecedents of managerial and employee legitimacy interpretations of control: a natural open system approach Katinka M. Bijlsma-Frankema and Ana Cristina Costa	396
14	Managerial objectives of formal control: high motivation control mechanisms Antoinette Weibel	434
15	Control configurations and strategic initiatives Markus Kreutzer and Christoph Lechner	463
	•	
Ind	ex of terms	504



Figures

Figure 3.1a	Control system sequencing described by control	
	theorists pag	ge 68
Figure 3.1b	Control system sequencing according	
	to Barker (1993)	69
Figure 3.1c	Control system sequencing described by life-cycle	
	theorists	69
Figure 3.2	The applicability of different theories in explaining	
	the evolution of organizational control	71
Figure 7.1	Framework for control categories and attention	
	processes	197
Figure 8.1	A framework of motives and modes of processing	229
Figure 8.2	The role of motivational orientation in response to	
	informal and formal control	234
Figure 10.1	Antecedents of control	305
Figure 10.2	Types of relationships, risks, and trust mechanisms	309
•	An integrated model of control choices	311
Figure 15.1	Typology of strategic initiatives based on a ROIC	
	classification schema	467
Figure 15.2	Core growth initiatives control configuration	480
Figure 15.3	Growth outside the core initiatives control	
	configuration	483
Figure 15.4	Quality initiatives control configuration	485
Figure 15.5	Efficiency initiatives control configuration	487
•	Working capital initiatives control configuration	489
Figure 15.7	Fixed asset initiatives control configuration	491

vii



Tables

Table 2.1	A genealogy of organizational control	page 36
Table 2.2	A narrative perspective on organizational	
	control	43
Table 3.1	Distinguishing control configurations by reliance	
	on formal and informal controls	59
Table 3.2	Distinguishing control configurations by	
	additional details concerning control mechanisms,	
	control targets, and control systems	63
Table 3.3	Comparing control systems and control targets	64
Table 6.1	The types and managerial implications of	
	identity-based control	173
Table 9.1	Innovation networks: any broad-based resource	
	mobilization across boundaries	256
Table 11.1	Types of peer control mechanisms with examples	328
Table 12.1	Descriptions of managerial applications of control	•,
	trustworthiness-promotion, and fairness-promotio	n
	activities	378
Table 13.1	Managerial and employee legitimacy interpretation	ns
	of a control configuration	422
Table 15.1	Strategic initiatives control configurations	474

viii



Contributors

KATINKA M. BIJLSMA-FRANKEMA is Associate Professor of Organization Theory at VU University, Amsterdam and Professor of Organization Sciences at the European Institute for Advanced Studies in Management (EIASM) in Brussels. She received her M.A. in sociology from the University of Groningen and her Ph.D. in organization sciences from the University of Amsterdam. Current research interests include trust, control, and performance of teams and organizations; learning processes within and between teams; organizational cultures; and managerial cognitions. She has recently edited *Trust under pressure* (2005) and special issues on control in *The Journal of Managerial Psychology* (2004), on trust in *Personnel Review* (2003), and on trust and control in *International Sociology* (2005) and *Group and Organization Management* (2007).

JOHN SEELY BROWN is a visiting scholar and advisor to the Provost at the University of Southern California (USC) and Independent Co-Chairman, Deloitte Center for The Edge. Prior to that he was Chief Scientist of Xerox Corporation and Director of its Palo Alto Research Center (PARC) - a position he held for nearly two decades. He is a member of the National Academy of Education, a fellow of the American Association for Artificial Intelligence and of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS), and a trustee of the MacArthur Foundation. He serves on numerous public boards (Amazon, Corning, and Varian Medical Systems) and private boards of directors. He has published over 100 papers in scientific journals, and two books (with Paul Duguid The social life of information [2000 and 2002], and with John Hagel The only sustainable edge [2005]). He received a B.A. from Brown University in 1962 in mathematics and physics and a Ph.D. from the University of Michigan in 1970 in computer and communication sciences. In May 2000 Brown University awarded him an

ix



 \mathbf{X}

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-51744-7 - Organizational Control Edited by Sim B Sitkin, Laura B. Cardinal and Katinka M. Bijlsma-Frankema Frontmatter More information

Notes on contributors

honorary Doctor of Science Degree, which was followed by an honorary Doctor of Science in Economics conferred by the London Business School in July 2001, an honorary Doctor of Humane Letters from Claremont Graduate School in May 2004, and an honorary doctorate from the University of Michigan in 2005. He is an avid reader, traveler and motorcyclist. Part scientist, part artist, and part strategist, his views are unique, distinguished by a broad view of the human contexts in which technologies operate and a healthy skepticism about whether or not change always represents genuine progress.

LAURA B. CARDINAL is Professor of Strategic Management at the C.T. Bauer College of Business, University of Houston. She earned her Ph.D. from the University of Texas at Austin. Her areas of expertise include managing innovation and research and development capabilities, diversification and performance, and understanding the evolution and adaptation of control systems. She serves on the editorial boards of *Strategic Management Journal* and *Organization Science*. Previously, she served as the interest group chair for the Competitive Strategy Interest Group of the Strategic Management Society and as the program and division chair of the Technology and Innovation Management Division of the Academy of Management. She is a National Science Foundation grant recipient and has published in journals such as *Strategic Management Journal*, *Organization Science*, *Academy of Management Journal*, and *Journal of Accounting and Economics*.

VIVEK CHOUDHURY is Associate Professor and Head of the Information Systems Department at the College of Business at the University of Cincinnati (UC). He is also currently an SAP fellow at the College. Prior to joining UC in 2000, he taught at the College of Business at Florida State University and, before that, at the University of Pittsburgh. He earned his doctorate in information systems from the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA). His research interests include: management of offshored/outsourced information technology (IT) projects, trust in electronic commerce, and knowledge management. His publications have appeared in such outlets as Information Systems Research, MIS Quarterly, Journal of Strategic Information Systems, Journal of Small Business Research, Electronic Markets, E-Service Journal, and Competitive Intelligence Review. He serves,



Notes on contributors

xi

or has served, on the editorial boards of MIS Quarterly, Information Systems Research, and IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management.

ANA CRISTINA COSTA is a senior lecturer at Brunel Business School, Brunel University, London. She holds a Ph.D. in trust in organizations from Tilburg University in the Netherlands. Prior to joining Brunel University she was an assistant professor at the Delft University of Technology in the Netherlands. Her research primarily focuses on the development of trust in organizations and how it affects performance. More specifically she is interested in the role played by trust in contexts of cooperation and collaboration within and between organizations where concepts such as social capital, knowledge, and innovation are central. Her work has been published in journals such as Group and Organization Management, European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology, International Sociology, and Personnel Review.

RICK DELBRIDGE is Associate Dean (Research) and Professor of Organizational Analysis at Cardiff Business School, a senior fellow of the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC)/Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council (EPSRC) Advanced Institute of Management Research, and a fellow of the Sunningdale Institute. His research interests include the management of innovation and critical perspectives on work and organization. His work has appeared in a wide variety of leading journals including Academy of Management Review, California Management Review, Human Relations, Industrial Relations, Journal of Management Studies, and Organization Studies and Sociology. His books include Life on the line in contemporary manufacturing (2000) and The exceptional manager (2007). He is Associate Editor of Organization and an editorial board member of several other leading international journals.

ROGER L. M. DUNBAR is Professor of Management at the Stern School of Business, New York University. He is interested in sensemaking processes as they relate to organizational design and control, and how language use frames understandings and determines meaning. With Bill Starbuck, he edited a special issue of *Organization Science* (March–April 2006) that focused on organization design. He is a senior editor at *Organization Studies*. He was born in Dunedin,



xii

Notes on contributors

New Zealand, and studied at the University of Otago. He received his doctorate from Cornell University and his first academic appointment was at Southern Methodist University. He spent five years at the International Institute of Management, part of the Science Center of Berlin, Germany, before moving to New York University. He has held visiting appointments at the Free University in Berlin, the University of Auckland and the Victoria University of Wellington in New Zealand, and the University of Wollongong in Australia.

ELIZABETH GEORGE is an associate professor of management at the School of Business and Management, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology. She earned her Ph.D. from the University of Texas at Austin. Her research interests include identity of individuals in organizations, nonstandard work and workers, and institutionalization processes. Her work can be found in journals such as *Academy of Management Review, Administrative Science Quarterly*, and *Organization Science*.

JOHN HAGEL III, Director of Deloitte Consulting LLP, has nearly thirty years' experience as a management consultant, author, speaker, and entrepreneur. He has helped companies improve their performance by effectively applying information technology to reshape business strategies. He is Co-Chairman of the Silicon Valley-based Deloitte Center for The Edge, which conducts original research and develops substantive points of view for new corporate growth. Before joining Deloitte Consulting, he was an independent consultant and writer, and he held significant positions at leading consulting firms and companies. From 1984 to 2000 he was a principal at McKinsey and Co., where he was a leader of the strategy practice. He is the author of a series of bestselling business books, beginning with Net gain and including Net worth, Out of the box, and The only sustainable edge. He has won two awards from the Harvard Business Review for best articles in that publication and has been recognized as an industry thought leader by a variety of publications and professional service firms.

MARIANN JELINEK is the Richard C. Kraemer Professor of Strategy at the Mason School of Business, College of William and Mary in Williamsburg, VA, and Visiting International Professor of Strategy



Notes on contributors

xiii

and Entrepreneurship at the Technical University of Eindhoven in the Netherlands. She received her Ph.D. from the University of California at Berkeley (1973), and her D.B.A. from the Graduate School of Business at Harvard (1977). Her research interests have centered on innovation, strategic change and technology, in *The innovation mara*thon (1990; 1993) with C. B. Schoonhoven and Institutionalizing innovation (1979). She has published six books and more than fifty articles in journals such as Organization Science, IEEE Transactions in Engineering Management, Academy of Management Review, and Harvard Business Review, and has served on various editorial boards for more than twenty years. She was director of the Innovation and Organization Change program at the National Science Foundation from 1999 to 2001, and has been an academic fellow of the Center for Innovation Management Studies since 2002. Recent work includes studies funded by the National Science Foundation on industryuniversity relationships around innovation, and on the R&D "lab" of the future in an age of global economic links and computer technology.

SOPHIA SOYOUNG JEONG is a doctoral student in management at the Moore School of Business at the University of South Carolina. Her current research interests include ethical judgment and decisionmaking, prosocial behavior, trust, and cross-cultural organizational behavior.

LAURIE J. KIRSCH Professor of Business Administration and Senior Associate Dean, joined the Joseph M. Katz Graduate School of Business at the University of Pittsburgh after completing her Ph.D. at the University of Minnesota. Her research explores the exercise of control, governance, and knowledge transfer in the information systems context. She has published in leading scholarly journals such as MIS Quarterly, Management Science, Organization Science, Information Systems Research, and Accounting, Management and Information Technologies. Her research has been funded by the National Science Foundation and the Advanced Practices Council of the Society for Information Management International. She is very active in the International Conference on Information Systems (ICIS) and the Academy of Management. She serves, or has served, on the editorial boards of MIS Quarterly, Management Science, Information Systems Research,



xiv

Notes on contributors

Information and Organization, Decision Sciences, MISQ Executive, and The Journal of Strategic Information Systems.

M. AUDREY KORSGAARD is Professor of Organizational Behavior and Management at the Moore School of Business of the University of South Carolina. She received a Ph.D. in psychology from New York University. Her research addresses the topics of trust and prosocial behavior and their relationship to interpersonal and intragroup cooperation and conflict. She has studied these issues in a variety of work settings, including virtual teams, investor–entrepreneur relations, and joint ventures. She currently serves on the board of the *Journal of Management* and previously served as Associate Editor of the *Journal of Management* and served on the boards of *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice* and *Journal of Organizational Behavior*.

MARKUS KREUTZER is a senior lecturer of strategic management at the University of St. Gallen (Switzerland). He recently completed his Ph.D. at this university and wrote his thesis on Controlling strategic initiatives: a contribution to corporate entrepreneurship. His current research interests are in the areas of strategy processes, strategic initiatives, and organizational control. His research was published in Harvard Business Manager, IO New Management, Organizationsentwicklung, and Zeitschrift für Unternehmensberatung.

CHRISTOPH LECHNER holds the EMBA Chair of Strategic Management at the University of St. Gallen (Switzerland). He is Director of its Institute of Management and Academic Director of its Ph.D. program in strategy and management. His present research interests are in the areas of strategy processes, alliance and network strategy, and corporate competitiveness. He has written five books as well as numerous articles in outlets such as Academy of Management Journal, Journal of Management, Journal of Business Research, Journal of Management Studies, Long Range Planning, Sloan Management Review, and Wall Street Journal. He is a member of the editorial boards of Strategic Management Journal, Long Range Planning, and Journal of Strategy and Management.

CHRIS P. LONG is an assistant professor of management at the McDonough School of Business, Georgetown University. He earned his Ph.D. from Duke University. His research examines how leaders



Notes on contributors

xv

create contexts within which individuals can achieve high levels of performance (e.g., innovation, efficiency), satisfaction, and commitment. Much of his current work focuses on how leaders integrate their efforts to promote control, trust, and fairness in both traditional organizations and new organizational forms in order to accomplish organizational performance objectives within complex and dynamic business environments.

MISTY L. LOUGHRY is an associate professor of management at Georgia Southern University. She earned her Ph.D. from the University of Florida. Her research examines peer control, control of teamwork, and peer evaluations of teamwork. She is a co-principal investigator on two National Science Foundation grants aimed at improving teamwork in college classrooms. Her research has been published in journals including *Organization Science*, *Small Group Research*, and *Educational and Psychological Measurement*.

BRUCE M. MEGLINO is Business Partnership Foundation Professor at the Moore School of Business of the University of South Carolina. He received a Ph.D. in business administration from the University of Massachusetts. He conducts research on work values, helping behavior, and rationality. He has been elected a fellow of the American Psychological Association, the Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology, and the American Psychological Society. He serves on the boards of the *Journal of Applied Psychology* and *Journal of Management*.

WILLIAM OCASIO is the John L. and Helen Kellogg Distinguished Professor of Management of Organization at the Graduate School of Management, Northwestern University. His research focuses on understanding how attention in organizations is shaped by three sets of factors: (1) organizational structures and processes; (2) political capital and dynamics; and (3) culture, language, and institutional logic. He is currently the Division Chair of the Organization and Management Division of the Academy of Management, and Senior Editor at *Organization Science*. He holds an M.B.A. from Harvard University and a Ph.D. in organizational behavior from Stanford.

CUILI QIAN is currently a Ph.D. student of strategy in the Management of Organization Department at Hong Kong University of Science and



xvi

Notes on contributors

Technology. Her current research focuses on corporate governance and corporate social responsibility in emerging economies, and multinational corporations' staffing and control of subsidiaries.

SIM B. SITKIN is Professor of Management and Faculty Director of the Fuqua/Coach K Center on Leadership and Ethics at Duke University's Fuqua School of Business. His current research focuses on leadership and control systems and their influence on how organizations and their members become more or less capable of change and innovation. He is widely known for his research on the effect of formal and informal organizational control systems and leadership on risk taking, accountability, trust, learning, change, and innovation, including a book, *The legalistic organization*, numerous articles in journals and edited books, and teaching cases. He has served as Senior Editor of *Organizational Behavior*, as a member of the Board of Governors of the Academy of Management, and has also worked as a consultant and executive educator with many large and small corporations, non-profit and government organizations worldwide.

MATT STATLER is Associate Director, International Center for Enterprise Preparedness (InterCEP), New York University. He conducts research and coordinates special projects focused on how businesses can become more strategically prepared for disasters and other crises. Before joining InterCEP, he served as Director of Research at the Imagination Lab, a non-profit Swiss foundation. In that role, he designed and facilitated strategy processes for major corporate, non-governmental, and educational organizations, while guiding a multi-disciplinary research team that produced dozens of academic publications. Previously he had worked in A.T. Kearney's Nonprofit Practice, and as Managing Director at Weberize, an internet consulting firm. His educational background includes a B.A. in both philosophy and Spanish literature from the University of Missouri, Columbia. He spent one year at the University of Heidelberg as a Fulbright Scholar, and then obtained a Ph.D. in philosophy from Vanderbilt University. Written with the support of the Mellon Foundation, his dissertation examined the role of repetition in education and focused specifically on the philosopher's allegorical return to the cave. His organizational research has appeared in a number of academic



Notes on contributors

xvii

journals and edited volumes, including the Oxford handbook of organizational decision making (2008), and, his most recent, Everyday strategic preparedness: the role of practical wisdom in organizations (2007).

JOHN VAN MAANEN is the Erwin Schell Professor of Organization Studies in the Sloan School of Management at MIT. He has been a visiting professor at Yale University, the University of Surrey in the UK, and Insead in France. He has published a number of books and articles in the general area of occupational and organizational sociology, including *Tales of the field* (1988) and *Organizational transformations and information technology* (with JoAnne Yates, 2001).

ANTOINETTE WEIBEL is a professor at the University of Liechtenstein and a research fellow of the Center for Research in Economics, Management and the Arts (CREMA). She is vice-president of the First International Network of Trust Researchers (FINT) and an active member of the Academy of Management as well as of the European Group of Organization Studies. Her research interests are intrinsic motivation trust, control and reward systems, and virtuous behavior.

FRANZ WOHLGEZOGEN is a doctoral candidate at the Department of Management and Organization, Kellogg Graduate School of Management, Northwestern University. His research focuses on the cognitive underpinnings of strategy formation and implementation, and the challenges of strategizing interorganizational relationships. He has conducted research examining the impact of stakeholder feedback to publicized strategy on firms' commitment to these strategies, and he is currently examining the effect of firms' diversity of alliance partners on their subsequent alliance portfolio strategies. He holds an M.A. in strategy and international management from the University of St. Gallen, Switzerland, and was a management consultant and educator in Europe and Asia prior to joining the Ph.D. program.



Foreword

We are please to introduce *Organizational Control* by Sim Sitkin, Laura Cardinal, and Katinka Bijlsma-Frankema, the newest volume in our Cambridge Companions to Management series. The series is intended to advance knowledge in the fields of management by presenting the latest scholarship and research on topics of increasing intellectual importance. The volumes offer in-depth treatment of management topics that explore and extend our current knowledge and identify future opportunities for research. Each book in the series is one with a sufficient body of research, and holds significant future promise to inform debates, reviews, and empirical research.

Because management scholarship is increasingly international, scholars can no longer limit their reading to scholarship from their own countries, or restrict their conversations to their neighbors. Innovative intellectual work in management is now conducted throughout the world. Each of the volumes in this series is led by prominent scholars who bring together researchers from several countries in order to reflect multi-national perspectives and foster cross-national debate on the topic.

We appreciate the opportunity to work with Cambridge University Press to bring this series to you. Their rigorous independent scholarly reviews of proposals and manuscripts, and approvals via a board of renowned scholars helps ensure that only the highest-quality scholarship is published. We are confident scholars will find the books in this series stimulating and useful to their own programs of research and to the education of their graduate students.

This volume on control is an exemplar of the series. Organizational control is central to organizing, and this is reflected in the prominent place of theorizing about control in the field several decades ago. Despite the fundamental nature of the phenomenon, this area of study has been and remains seriously neglected. This volume seeks to spur theory and empirical research on control by taking on the serious

xviii



Foreword xix

conceptualization issues in control directly. It is based on the proposition that organizational control, as a fundamental and consequential feature of organizations, merits a revitalization of attention to both theory and empirical research. The foundations of control theorizing are reviewed and separated from much of the mischaracterization that helped undermine cumulative knowledge development. This forms the basis for the several new scholarly efforts gathered here to provide a foundation for renewed attention. This volume brings together new approaches to organizational control theory and research by a diverse group of scholars with different scholarly viewpoints to show the vibrancy and future potential of the domain for generative scholarship. The editors are to be congratulated for this ambitious treatment of an issue that is fundamental to management and organization. We are proud to have assisted in bringing what we believe to be a new foundational text in the field to you.

Cary Cooper, Lancaster University Management School Jone L. Pearce, University of California, Irvine Series editors