

Contents

	<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>page xi</i>
	<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xviii</i>
1	Introduction	1
	Introduction	1
	Basic propositions	1
	Summary of the book	3
	Why the power to remove charities from the register is important	4
	The importance of the charity sector in the delivery of public services	4
	Tax reliefs	6
	Donors	6
	Law reform	7
	Introduction to the general law	8
	The register of charities	8
	The Commission’s powers of removal	8
	General approach to writing the book	10
2	Essential indicia of charitable status	12
	Introduction	12
	A legal obligation to carry out the charitable purposes	14
	One or more of the three certainties is lacking	18
	Certainty of words	18
	Certainty of subject matter	19
	Certainty of objects	19
	Express clauses in a governing instrument which prevent charitable status	20
	The charitable objects are too widely drafted	22
	Jurisdiction	23
	Charitable purposes	23
	What are charitable purposes?	24
	The Commission’s dilemma	26
	Objects or activities?	27
		v

Contents

The objects are ambiguous	28
There is a doubt about whether the objects are charitable	29
The objects do not pass the public benefit test	30
Sham charities	31
Objects or activities: Conclusion	31
Fine distinctions	32
Public benefit	34
Introduction	34
What is public benefit?	34
Why is public benefit important to the question of removal now?	34
Problem areas in the law of public benefit	35
Little analysis by the court	35
Public benefit differs from one head of charity to another	36
The balance between public and private benefit	37
Harm or benefit?	37
Emphasis on form over substance	38
Anomalous decisions	41
The concept of public benefit changes with time	41
Public benefit conclusion	42
Viability	42
Independence from the state	43
Conclusion	43
 3 The powers of the Commission to remove charities from the register	 45
Introduction	45
‘No longer considers is a charity’	45
‘Ceased to exist’	50
‘Does not operate’	50
Rectification	52
Summary	52
‘No Longer considers is a charity’	52
Never a charity	53
Never had the essential indicia of charitable status	53
Sham charities	54
Change in the law	57
Mistaken understanding of the law	59
Distinguishing decisions of the court	60
Removal on a different ground	65
Making law	65
<i>Cy-pres</i> application of property where the institution was never a charity	67
Special trusts	69
Rectification	69

Contents

An institution was a charity but is no longer charitable	71
Introduction	71
<i>Cy-pres</i> where the institution was a charity but is no longer charitable	71
‘Any change in its trusts’	73
‘Ceased to exist’	75
Trusts	76
Trusts without permanent endowment	76
Trusts with permanent endowment	77
Unincorporated associations	80
Companies limited by guarantee	80
Striking off	81
Petitions to wind up a company	81
The survival of charity following dissolution	81
Restoration to the register	82
<i>Bona vacantia</i> property applied <i>cy-pres</i> by the Crown	82
Special trusts	83
The survival of charity following dissolution – Conclusion	83
‘Does not operate’	83
Conclusion	84
4 Limits on the Commission’s powers to remove controversial charities from the register	85
Introduction	85
Charities connected to the state	85
Why are charities connected to the state controversial?	86
Possible grounds for removal	86
Critical analysis of the possible grounds for removal	87
How the critical analysis supports the basic propositions	89
Charitable schools which charge fees	89
Why charitable schools which charge fees are controversial	89
Possible grounds for removal	90
Critical analysis of the possible grounds for removal	91
How the critical analysis supports the basic propositions	93
New religious movement charities	94
Why new religious movement charities are controversial	94
Possible grounds for removal	94
Failure to demonstrate public benefit	94
Not promoting a religion for the purposes of charity law	95
Critical analysis of the possible grounds for removal	97
Failure to demonstrate public benefit	97
Not promoting a ‘Religion’ for the purpose of charity law	99
How the critical analysis supports the basic propositions	102
Conclusion	102
	vii

 Contents

5	Property	103
	Introduction	103
	The position of the Commission	103
	What is 'charity'?	104
	The institution was never a charity	105
	The institution was a charity but has ceased to have charitable purposes	108
	What happens to the property of a charity which is removed from the register?	112
	Conclusion	113
6	The Commission's powers of investigation and the use of those powers to remove charities from the register	114
	Introduction	114
	Powers of investigation and protection	114
	Sections 18(1) and 19 protective powers	115
	Section 18(2) protective powers	116
	Appointment of additional trustees	116
	Appointment of an interim manager	117
	Making schemes	118
	Removal of trustees	119
	The institution of the inquiry leads the trustees to conclude that they should dissolve the charity	120
	New powers under the Charities Act 2006	120
	Documentary analysis	121
	Does not operate	121
	Ceased to exist	123
	Change in trusts	123
	No longer considers is a charity	124
	Conclusion	124
7	How the Commission's powers to remove charities from the register may be affected by changes to the law of charitable status	126
	Introduction	126
	The Human Rights Act 1998	128
	Public authorities	129
	Does the Human Rights Act 1998 apply to the removal of charities from the register?	130
	General principles and limitations	132
	Limits on Convention rights	133
	Prescribed by law	133
	Necessary in a democratic society	136

 Contents

General and particular Convention rights and the Commission's power to remove charities from the register	136
Article 1, Protocol 1: Right to property	137
The peaceful enjoyment of property	137
Deprivation of possessions	138
The state is entitled to control the use of property in accordance with the general interest by enforcing such laws as it deems necessary for that purpose	138
Limits on Article 1, Protocol 1	138
The public or general interest	138
Proportionality	139
Subject to conditions provided by law	139
Article 14: Freedom from discrimination	140
Do the facts fall within the ambit of one or more of the substantive Convention rights?	141
Different treatment	141
Comparable situation	143
Justification	144
Legitimate aim	144
Proportionality	144
Margin of appreciation	145
Article 9: Freedom of thought, conscience and religion	145
Religion or belief	146
Limits on Article 9	149
Prescribed by law	151
Necessary in a democratic society	151
For the protection of the rights and freedoms of others	151
For the protection of health and morals	151
Article 2, Protocol 1: Right to education	152
Article 2, Protocol 1 and Article 14 together	155
Respect for the religious and philosophical convictions of parents	156
Limits on Article 2, Protocol 1	157
Article 10: Freedom of expression	157
Think tanks	160
Limits to Article 10: Freedom of expression	162
Prescribed by law	162
Legitimate aims	163
For the protection of the rights of others	164
Maintaining the authority and impartiality of the judiciary	164
Necessary in a democratic society	165
Article 10 and Article 14 together	165
Reinterpretation of the rule against political objects	166
The Charities Act 2006	167
Conclusion	169

 Contents

8	Grounds for appeal	171
	Introduction	171
	Appealing against direct removal under section 3(4) Charities Act 1993	174
	Appealing against indirect removal	175
	Direct and indirect removal, judicial review and common-law action	177
	Direct removal, judicial review and common-law action	179
	The right to be heard and the Human Rights Act 1998:	
	Article 6: A right to a fair trial	180
	Legitimate expectation	180
	Estoppel	182
	Negligent mis-statement	183
	Indirect removal, judicial review and common-law action	184
	<i>Ultra vires</i> , <i>Wednesbury</i> unreasonableness and bias	184
	The right to be heard and the Human Rights Act 1998:	
	Article 6: Right to a fair trial	185
	Natural justice	186
	Estoppel and negligent mis-statement	187
	Conclusion	187
	Costs	188
	Alternatives to an appeal to the court	191
	The Commission's internal review procedure	191
	The Commission's complaints procedure	192
	The Ombudsman	192
	Conclusion	193
9	Conclusion	194
	Introduction	194
	Law reform	194
	The Commission's powers of removal are limited	194
	No powers of removal	195
	Greater powers of removal	196
	Powers to protect the property of removed institutions	197
	The Commission's powers of removal should be further restricted	198
	Conclusion: More or less removal?	199
	There is a distinction between a governing instrument of a charity and its property	199
	The problem of legality	200
	The need for clarification	200
	Access to justice	200
	Overall conclusion	202
	<i>Bibliography</i>	203
	<i>Index</i>	208