

### ROUSSEAU AND FREEDOM

Debates about freedom, an ideal continually contested, were first set out in their modern version by the eighteenth-century French philosopher Jean-Jacques Rousseau. His ideas and analyses were taken up during the philosophical Enlightenment, often invoked during the French Revolution, and still resonate in contemporary discussions of freedom. This volume examines Rousseau's many approaches to the concept of freedom, in the context of his thought on literature, religion, music, theater, women, the body, and the arts. Its expert contributors cross disciplinary frontiers to develop thought-provoking new angles on Rousseau's thought. By taking freedom as the guiding principle of their analysis, the essays form a cohesive account of Rousseau's writings.

CHRISTIE MCDONALD is Smith Professor of French Language and Literature in the Department of Romance Languages and Literatures and Professor of Comparative Literature at Harvard University.

STANLEY HOFFMANN is Paul and Catherine Buttenweiser University Professor in the Department of Government at Harvard University.



# ROUSSEAU AND FREEDOM

EDITED BY

CHRISTIE MCDONALD

AND

STANLEY HOFFMANN





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521515825

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Rousseau and freedom / [edited by] Christie McDonald, Stanley Hoffmann.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-51582-5 (Hardback)

- 1. Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 1712–1778–Criticism and interpretation.
  - Freedom–Philosophy.
     Liberty–Philosophy.
     McDonald, Christie, 1942–
  - 4. Liberty–Philosophy. I. McDonald, Christie, 1942-II. Hoffmann, Stanley. III. Title.

PQ2053.R567 2010 848'.509—dc22 2010001519

ısвn 978-0-521-51582-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

List of illustrations		<i>page</i> vii
Notes on contributors		viii
Acknowledgments		xii
List of abbreviations		xiii
	Introduction Christie McDonald	I
PART I		7
Ι	Freeing man from sin: Rousseau on the natural condition of mankind <i>Ioannis D. Evrigenis</i>	9
2	Making history natural in Rousseau's <i>Discourse on the Origins of Inequality</i> Natasha Lee	24
3	Rousseau's <i>Second Discourse</i> : between Epicureanism and Stoicism  Christopher Brooke	44
4	Jean-Jacques Rousseau and Diderot in the late 1740s: satire, friendship, and freedom <i>Marian Hobson</i>	58
5	If you please! Theater, verisimilitude, and freedom in the Letter to d'Alembert Jérôme Brillaud	77
6	Music, the passions, and political freedom in Rousseau <i>Tracy B. Strong</i>	92

v



vi	CONTENTS	
PART II		III
7	The Social Contract, or the mirage of the general will Stanley Hoffmann	113
8	"Par le bon usage de ma liberté": freedom and Rousseau's reconstituted Christianity  Jason Neidleman	142
9	The constraints of liberty at the scene of instruction Diane Berrett Brown	159
Ю	"Toutes mes idées sont en images": Rousseau and the yoke of necessity <i>Marius Hentea</i>	174
II	Rousseau's ruins Louisa Shea	193
12	Can woman be free?  Philip Stewart	207
13	The subject and its body: love of oneself and freedom in the thought of Rousseau  Mathieu Brunet and Bertrand Guillarme	216
PAF	RT III	229
14	Paranoia and freedom in Rousseau's final decade Leo Damrosch	231
15	Freedom and the project of idleness  Pierre Saint-Amand	245
16	On the uses of negative freedom Marie-Hélène Huet	257
17	Fail better: Rousseau's creative <i>délire</i> Christie McDonald	274
	Postface: Rousseau and freedom Stanley Hoffmann	292
Bibliography		295
Ind	Index	



### Illustration

4.1 Front board and title page of Sir William Petty, Several Essays in Political Arithmetick (London, 1699; SRAFFA 293), showing dedication from Rousseau to Diderot. Reproduced by kind permission of the Master and Fellows of Trinity College, Cambridge.

page 60



### Notes on contributors

- DIANE BERRETT BROWN, an independent scholar and editor, has recently published articles on Rousseau, Mercier, and Fénelon. She is completing a book manuscript, *Private Lessons: Enlightenment Education and the Eighteenth-Century French Novel*, that considers the trajectory of the eighteenth-century novel in terms of educational experiments and pedagogical imperatives.
- JÉRÔME BRILLAUD is the author of *Sombres Lumières: essai sur le retour à l'antique et la tragédie grecque au dix-huitième siècle* as well as articles on Ancien Régime theater, travel narratives, and eighteenth-century philosophy. He is currently writing a book on simplicity and Enlightenment thought. He teaches at Vanderbilt University.
- CHRISTOPHER BROOKE is a lecturer in political theory and the history of political thought at the University of Cambridge, where he is a Fellow of King's College. His work has appeared in *The Historical Journal*, *Grotiana*, the *New Left Review*, *Les Etudes philosophiques*, and elsewhere; and he has recently completed his first book, *Philosophic Pride: Stoicism and the Politics of Self-Love from Lipsius to Rousseau*.
- MATHIEU BRUNET is Associate Professor at the University of Provence (Aix–Marseille I). He is the author of *L'Appel du monstrueux: pensées et poétiques du désordre en France au XVIII*<sup>e</sup> siècle (2008) and of numerous articles on eighteenth-century French literature.
- LEO DAMROSCH is Ernest Bernbaum Professor of Literature at Harvard, where he has served as Chair of the Department of English and was awarded a Harvard College Professorship for distinguished teaching. Among his books are Symbol and Truth in Blake's Myth, God's Plot and Man's Stories: Studies in the Fictional Imagination from Milton to Fielding, Fictions of Reality in the Age of Hume and Johnson, and The Sorrows of the Quaker Jesus: James Nayler and the Puritan Crackdown on



#### NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

the Free Spirit. Most recently, Jean-Jacques Rousseau: Restless Genius was a finalist for the 2005 National Book Award and winner of the PEN New England Award for nonfiction.

- IOANNIS D. EVRIGENIS is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Tufts University. He is co-editor of Johann Gottfried Herder's *Another Philosophy of History and Selected Political Writings*, as well as the author of articles on a wide range of issues in the history of political thought, and of *Fear of Enemies and Collective Action* (Cambridge University Press, 2008), which received the 2009 Delba Winthrop Award for Excellence in Political Science.
- BERTRAND GUILLARME is Professor of Political and Social Philosophy at the University of Paris (Paris VIII Saint-Denis). He has published *Rawls et l'égalité démocratique* (1999) and *Penser la Peine* (2004).
- MARIUS HENTEA (BA Columbia, PhD Harvard) has recently completed his doctoral dissertation on international morality in the political thought of Thucydides, Machiavelli, and Hobbes. He is currently writing a PhD in English literature at the University of Warwick as well as working on a biography of Tristan Tzara (forthcoming).
- MARIAN HOBSON CBE is Professorial Research Fellow at Queen Mary, University of London, and a Fellow of the British Academy. She was formerly Lecturer in French, University of Cambridge, the first woman Fellow of Trinity College, and maître-assistante at the University of Geneva. A specialist of the European Enlightenment, and present-day literary theory and criticism, Hobson is the author of many books, among them *Jacques Derrida: Opening Lines* (1998) and *L'Art et son objet: Diderot, la théorie de l'illusion et les arts en France au XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle* (2007).
- STANLEY HOFFMANN is the Paul and Catherine Buttenweiser University Professor at Harvard University, where he has taught since 1955. He was the Chair of the Center for European Studies at Harvard from its creation in 1969 until 1995. Professor Hoffmann was born in Vienna in 1928. He lived and studied in France from 1929 to 1955; he graduated from the Institut d'études politiques of Paris and received a doctorate in law from Paris Law School. At Harvard, he teaches French intellectual and political history, American foreign policy, the sociology of war, international politics, ethics and world affairs, modern political ideologies, the development of the modern state, and the history of Europe

ix



#### X NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

since 1945. His latest book is *Chaos and Violence: What Globalization, Failed States and Terrorism Mean for U.S. Foreign Policy* (2006).

MARIE-HÉLÈNE HUET is M. Taylor Pyne Professor of French at Princeton University. Her recent books include *Rehearsing the Revolution, The Staging of Marat's Death* (1982), *Monstrous Imagination* (1993; winner of the Harry Levin Prize in Comparative Literature), and *Mourning Glory: The Will of the French Revolution* (1997). She has published a number of articles on Rousseau and is currently finishing a book on ethics and the Enlightenment.

NATASHA LEE is an Assistant Professor of French Literature in the Department of French and Italian at Princeton University, and holds the Laurence S. Rockefeller preceptorship at the University Center for Human Values. Her primary interests lie in the Enlightenment and its legacies, and the dialogue of literature and criticism with other disciplines, above all political theory and history of science. She has written several articles on Rousseau, as well as on eighteenth-century literature and its relation to scientific discourses. She is currently completing a manuscript on human classification in the French Enlightenment and on the implications of thinking social questions in scientific terms.

CHRISTIE MCDONALD is the Smith Professor of French Language and Literature in the Department of Romance Languages and Literatures and Professor of Comparative Literature at Harvard University, where she has served as Chair in the Department of Romance Languages and Literatures. Her research and teaching focus is on eighteenth- and twentieth-century French literary and philosophical thought. She has also published in the areas of ethics, feminist theory, and the arts. Her publications include *The Extravagant Shepherd* (1973, 2007) on Rousseau, *The Dialogue of Writing* (1985) on eighteenth-century dialogue; *Dispositions* (1986) on music and textuality; and *The Proustian Fabric* (1991). Among other edited works, she has published *The Ear of the Other* (1982, 1985), *Transformations in Personhood and Culture after Theory* (1994), *Images of Congo* (2005), and *Painting My World* (2009). *French Global: A New Approach to Literary History*, edited with Susan Suleiman, is forthcoming in 2010.

JASON NEIDLEMAN is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of La Verne, where he teaches political theory. He is author of *The General Will is Citizenship: Inquiries into French Political Thought* (2001), as well as articles on Jean-Jacques Rousseau and Michel Foucault. He is currently at work on a monograph on Rousseau and truthseeking.



#### NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

PIERRE SAINT-AMAND is Francis Wayland Professor of French Studies and Comparative Literature at Brown University. His publications include *Diderot: le labyrinthe de la relation* (1984), *The Libertine's Progress: Seduction in the Eighteenth-century French Novel* (1994), and *The Laws of Hostility: Politics, Violence, and the Enlightenment* (1996). He recently edited *Thérèse philosophe* (2000) and *Confessions d'une jeune fille* in *Romanciers libertins du XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle* (2005). He has just completed

LOUISA SHEA received her doctorate in Comparative Literature from Harvard University and is currently Assistant Professor in the Departments of Comparative Studies and French and Italian at Ohio State University. Her book, *The Cynic Enlightenment: Diogenes in the Salon* is forthcoming.

a manuscript tentatively entitled "Paresse des Lumières."

PHILIP STEWART specializes in the French novel and intellectual history of the Enlightenment and is a member of the Editorial Board of SVEC (Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century). His books include Imitation and Illusion in the French Memoir-Novel, 1700–1750 (1969), Le Masque et la parole: le langage de l'amour au XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle (1973), editions of Prévost's Cleveland (1977, 2003), two books of critical readings (Rereadings: Eight Early French Novels, 1984, and Half-told Tales: Dilemmas of Meaning in Three French Novels, 1987). He has published translations of Rousseau and Lee Smith and published a book and numerous articles on literary illustration.

TRACY B. STRONG is the author of several books including Friedrich Nietzsche and the Politics of Transfiguration (third edition, 2001), The Idea of Political Theory: Reflections on the Self in Political Time and Space (1990), and Jean-Jacques Rousseau and the Politics of the Ordinary (1995, 2000); as well as the editor or co-editor of Nietzsche's New Seas (1988, 1990), The Self and the Political Order (1991), Public Space and Democracy (2001), The One and the Many: Ethical Pluralism in Contemporary Perspectives (2003), and Nietzsche (2009). He has written numerous articles and essays in a variety of journals. He is currently working on a book on aesthetics and politics in the early twentieth century; on a series of essays which reads figures in the political theory canon as participant in contemporary concerns; and on music, language, and politics in the period that extends from Rousseau to Nietzsche. From 1990 until 2000 he was editor of Political Theory.

хi



# Acknowledgments

This book grew out of a conference held at the Rockefeller Foundation's Bellagio Study and Conference Center in Bellagio, Italy, that surpassed all expectations. We are grateful to the Rockefeller Foundation for giving us the opportunity to meet in the splendid Center situated on Lake Como. We would like to thank Pina Palacia, the Managing Director, Nadia Gilardoni, Conference Coordinator, and the whole team who took such good care of all the participants while we were there. We would also like to express our gratitude to the Florence Gould Foundation whose generous grant made travel to Italy possible for our junior colleagues.

Tali Zechory was assistant to the conference in Bellagio and for this volume. We thank her for her enthusiasm, her help at every stage, and for her commitment to this important field as *dix-huitiémiste*.

Laurie Calhoun, editor of *Transition Magazine*, oversaw the extensive first stage of copy-editing for the manuscript, and Rebecca du Plessis of Cambridge University Press the second; we are most grateful to both for their meticulous work.



## Abbreviation

OC Jean-Jacques Rousseau, Œuvres complètes, 5 vols. (Paris: Gallimard, 1959–1995).

xiii