

States Against Migrants

Deportation in Germany and the United States

In this comparative study of the contemporary politics of deportation in Germany and the United States, Antje Ellermann analyzes the capacity of the liberal democratic state to control individuals within its borders. The book grapples with the question of why, in the 1990s, Germany responded to vociferous public demands for stricter immigration control by passing and implementing far-reaching policy reforms, whereas the United States failed to respond effectively to a comparable public mandate. Drawing on extensive field interviews, Ellermann finds that these cross-national differences reflect institutionally determined variation in socially coercive state capacity. By tracing the politics of deportation across the evolution of the policy cycle, beginning with anti-immigrant populist backlash and ending in the expulsion of migrants by street-level bureaucrats, Ellermann is also able to show that the conditions underlying state capacity systematically vary across policy stages. Whereas the ability to make socially coercive law is contingent on strong institutional linkages between the public and legislators, implementation depends on the political insulation of bureaucrats.

Antje Ellermann is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of British Columbia. Her work has been published in *Comparative Political Studies*, *West European Politics*, and *Government and Opposition*. She has been the recipient of research grants from the Social Science Research Council in the United States and, in Canada, from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council and the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade.

States Against Migrants

Deportation in Germany and the United States

ANTJE ELLERMANN

University of British Columbia



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-0-521-51568-9 — States Against Migrants
 Antje Ellermann
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521515689

© Antje Ellermann 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2009

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Ellermann, Antje, 1971–

States against migrants : deportation in Germany and the United States / Antje Ellermann.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-51568-9 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-09290-6 (pbk.)

1. United States–Emigration and immigration. 2. Deportation–United States.

3. Germany–Emigration and immigration. 4. Deportation–Germany.

I. Title.

JV6483.E54 2009

325.43–dc22 2008042416

ISBN 978-0-521-51568-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-09290-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press & Assessment does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-0-521-51568-9 — States Against Migrants
Antje Ellermann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

*In memory of my mother, Ruthild Ellermann, and for Ruby Skye,
whose journey has just begun*

Contents

| | |
|---|----------------|
| <i>List of Figures</i> | <i>page</i> ix |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xi |
| Introduction: Deportation and the State | I |
| 1 A Theory of Socially Coercive State Capacity | 27 |
| 2 The Legislative Politics of Migration Control | 52 |
| 3 Deportation and the Executive Politics of Implementation | 84 |
| 4 Deportation and the Street-Level Politics of Implementation | 121 |
| 5 Conclusion | 147 |
| <i>Appendices</i> | 173 |
| <i>References</i> | 177 |
| <i>Index</i> | 191 |

List of Figures

| | | |
|---|---|----------------|
| 1 | Germany, deportations by reason (stacked), 1977–2001. | <i>page</i> 19 |
| 2 | Germany, deportations by reason (in percent), 1977–2001. | 21 |
| 3 | United States, removals by reason (stacked), 1971–2002. | 22 |
| 4 | United States, deportations by reason (in percent), 1971–2002. | 23 |
| 5 | Germany, deportations and police returns, 1992–1998. | 99 |
| 6 | INS employer investigations, 1992–2001. | 113 |
| 7 | United States: noncriminal deportations and required departures, 1971–2002. | 114 |

Acknowledgments

One of the greatest challenges of studying the politics of migration control is gaining access to the agencies charged with policing state borders. I am deeply indebted to those individuals who opened doors for me to the tightly guarded world of immigration enforcement. In Germany, I want to particularly thank Lothar Kaden in Beeskow for providing me with unlimited access to his agency and staff. In the United States, I extend special thanks to Mike Magee at the district office in San Diego, who engaged me in many thoughtful discussions about the internal workings of the Immigration and Naturalization Service. Understanding immigration enforcement equally required me to spend time on the other side of the barbed wire, studying the activities of civil society groups that seek to limit the state's reach into migrants' lives. Among the many advocates who gave generously of their time to this project, I want especially to express my appreciation to Marleine Bastien of Fanm Ayisyen Nan Miyami (Haitian Women of Miami) and the members of the Tübingen church sanctuary.

This book grew out of a dissertation at Brandeis University, and I wish to acknowledge and thank the members of my dissertation committee for their guidance along the way: George Ross, Steven Teles, Jeffrey Prottas, and Jytte Klausen. When in the weeks after September 11, 2001, German immigration agencies closed their doors on me, George Ross reassured me that it would all work out in the end (it did). His steady confidence helped propel me through the rough patches that are an inevitable part of any research project. I am particularly indebted to Steven Teles, who patiently and enthusiastically read draft after draft of the thesis and provided me with feedback as thoughtful as any student could ever hope for. His provocative comments and critical insights have shaped this project from beginning to end.

This research could not have happened without the financial and logistical support of many individuals and organizations. The fieldwork for this study was funded by the Social Science Research Council's International Migration Program. While in the field, I received generous institutional support from Thomas Cusack at the Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung. Reference staff members at numerous institutions have freely shared their time and knowledge with me. In Germany, this included staff at the Presse- und Informationsamt der Bundesregierung in Berlin, the Landespresseamt in Potsdam, the Dokumentationsstelle Bürgerrechte & Innere Sicherheit at the Freie Universität Berlin, and the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz. In the United States, I thank the staff at the (then) Immigration and Naturalization Service's reference library in Washington, D.C., the press archives of *The Miami Herald*, and the San Diego public library. After my return from the field, a Dissertation Year Fellowship at Brandeis University afforded me the luxury of full-time writing. And in the final writing stage, Sima Godfrey at the University of British Columbia's Institute for European Studies provided me with a beautiful office and a warm and collegial environment that enlivened the solitude of writing.

This research benefited from the constructive feedback and support of many scholars to whom I shall remain indebted for many years to come. I especially want to thank Larry Fuchs for first introducing me to the study of immigration and Jim Hollifield for taking me under his wing and introducing me to a larger community of migration scholars. Virginie Guiraudon read extensive parts of this work, and I have benefited immensely from her insights and constructive critiques. Thomas Faist and Steven Legomsky provided helpful comments at the project's early stages and Alexander Aleinikoff toward the end. Among other fellow scholars who provided valued feedback on this work are Fiona Barker, Tim Büthe, Mignon Duffy, Macartan Humphreys, Christian Joppke, Orit Kedar, Daniel Kryder, Gallya Lahav, John Michael Parrish, Diane Purvin, Benjamin Read, Peter Skerry, and Eiko Thielemann. At Brandeis, the Feminist Social Science Research Group provided an invaluable sounding board. At Harvard, the members of the Comparative Politics Workshop offered crucial input, as did discussants, fellow panelists, and audiences at numerous conferences and seminar presentations, in both Europe and North America.

Frank Hangler and Catherine Hecht provided valuable research assistance. I owe a debt of gratitude to Clare McGovern, who came to the rescue at the very end and with exceptional skill and determination applied the finishing copy-editing touches to this work. Anonymous reviewers of the book manuscript provided numerous constructive suggestions that made for a much improved

Acknowledgments

xiii

end product. At Cambridge University Press, Eric Crahan and Rakesh Siva Kumar have been helpful guides through the editorial and production process.

An earlier version of Chapter 4 originally appeared in *Comparative Political Studies*, 38(10), 2005, 1219–1244, and parts of the book’s overall argument were first published in *West European Politics*, 29(2), 2006, 287–303. I thank the editors for their permission to reuse these materials.

In many of the locations to which my graduate work carried me I had the good fortune of being surrounded by family and friends. One of the joys of studying in Boston was being close to Amy and Steven Lippmann. Judy and Stanley Jacobs and Kathryn Linehan and David Siu provided homes away from home during research visits in Miami and Washington, D.C. In Germany, carefree playtime with the Purrucker family provided welcome respite from the intensity of fieldwork. My father, Manfred Ellermann, has never tired of assuring me of his faith in me. And my grandparents, Johanna and Martin Gruhler, have been part of this journey all along. As a 100-year-old German, my grandfather has lived through more political regimes than most, and the stories he has told me over the years have helped to put the vicissitudes of everyday politics into perspective. My time in Germany also offered me the opportunity to reconnect with one of my earliest mentors, Friedrich Klotter-Bucher, who motivated and shaped my academic career probably more than he knows.

My husband, Alan Jacobs, knows this project nearly as well as I. My toughest critic and greatest source of support, his insights have provoked countless revisions without which this book would be a much inferior product. After many months of pursuing our research on separate continents, I was fortunate that he decided to pack up his office and join me on my travels. Traversing the deserts of the American Southwest in the heat of summer, in a car without air-conditioning and crammed to the roof with archival boxes and desktop computers, was an adventure I would not have missed for anything. His generosity and love have sustained me throughout this endeavor.

The final years of this research coincided with a sad period in my life, when my mother, Ruthild Ellermann, lost her heroic struggle with cancer. During this time, one of my greatest sources of sustenance has been time spent kayaking in British Columbia’s wilderness. I am fortunate to be living in a place where these journeys are possible. Not long after my mother left this world, Ruby arrived and lit up my days with her radiant smile. My mother lived to see neither the completion of this book nor the beginning of her granddaughter’s life, but I know she would have been absolutely thrilled with both. It is to her memory and to my beautiful daughter that I dedicate this book.