

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## PERFECTING VIRTUE

In Western philosophy today, the three leading approaches to normative ethics are those of Kantian ethics, virtue ethics, and utilitarianism. In recent years the debate between Kantian ethicists and virtue ethicists has assumed an especially prominent position. The twelve newly commissioned essays in this volume, by leading scholars in both traditions, explore key aspects of each approach as related to the debate, and identify new common ground but also real and lasting differences between these approaches. The volume provides a rich overview of the continuing debate between two powerful forms of enquiry, and will be valuable for a wide range of students and scholars working in these fields.

LAWRENCE JOST is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cincinnati. He is the co-editor of *Eudaimonia and Well-Being* (2003).

JULIAN WUERTH is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. He is the author of *Kant on Mind, Action, and Ethics* (2011).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# PERFECTING VIRTUE

*New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics*

EDITED BY

LAWRENCE JOST

*University of Cincinnati*

JULIAN WUERTH

*Vanderbilt University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics  
 Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City  
 Cambridge University Press  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org  
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521515252

© Cambridge University Press 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*  
 Perfecting virtue : new essays on Kantian ethics and  
 virtue ethics / [edited by] Lawrence Jost, Julian Wuerth.  
 p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-51525-2 (hardback)

1. Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804. 2. Ethics. 3. Virtue.

I. Jost, Lawrence J. (Lawrence John), 1944–

II. Wuerth, Julian. III. Title.

B2799.E8.P44 2011

170–dc22

2010040408

ISBN 978-0-521-51525-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
 this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>Notes on contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction	I
<i>Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth</i>	
1 Virtue ethics in relation to Kantian ethics: an opinionated overview and commentary	8
<i>Marcia Baron</i>	
2 What does the Aristotelian <i>phronimos</i> know?	38
<i>Rosalind Hursthouse</i>	
3 Kant and agent-oriented ethics	58
<i>Allen Wood</i>	
4 The difference that ends make	92
<i>Barbara Herman</i>	
5 Two pictures of practical thinking	116
<i>Talbot Brewer</i>	
6 Moving beyond Kant's account of agency in the <i>Grounding</i>	147
<i>Julian Wuerth</i>	
7 A Kantian conception of human flourishing	164
<i>Lara Denis</i>	
8 Kantian perfectionism	194
<i>Paul Guyer</i>	
9 Aristotle, the Stoics, and Kant on anger	215
<i>Nancy Sherman</i>	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
10	Kant's impartial virtues of love <i>Christine Swanton</i>	241
11	The problem we all have with deontology <i>Michael Slote</i>	260
12	Intuition, system, and the "paradox" of deontology <i>Timothy Chappell</i>	271
	<i>Bibliography</i>	289
	<i>Index</i>	302

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contributors

MARCIA BARON is Rudy Professor of Philosophy at Indiana University. Her publications include *Kantian Ethics Almost without Apology* (1995); “Kantian Moral Maturity and the Cultivation of Character,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy of Education*, ed. Siegel (2009); “Excuses, Excuses,” in *Criminal Law and Philosophy* (2007); “Acting from Duty,” in *Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals*, ed. and trans. Allen Wood (2002); and “Kantian Ethics and Claims of Detachment,” in *Feminist Interpretations of Immanuel Kant*, ed. Schott (1997).

TALBOT BREWER is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Virginia and a Faculty Fellow of the University of Virginia’s Institute for Advanced Studies in Culture. He is the author of *The Retrieval of Ethics* (2009) and a number of articles on Kantian and Aristotelian ethical thought.

TIMOTHY CHAPPELL is Professor of Philosophy at The Open University, UK, and a Visiting Research Fellow in Philosophy at St Andrews University. He is the author of *Ethics and Experience: Life beyond Moral Theory* (2009), and the editor of *Values and Virtues: Aristotelianism in Contemporary Philosophy* (2006) and *The Moral Problem of Demandingness* (2009). His current research is on Plato and on ethics.

LARA DENIS is Professor of Philosophy at Agnes Scott College in Decatur, GA. She is editor of *Kant’s Metaphysics of Morals: A Critical Guide* (Cambridge University Press, 2010). Her interest in Kant’s conception of duties to oneself has resulted in essays on the primacy of perfect duties to oneself, duties regarding nonhuman animals, Kant’s condemnation of “unnatural” sex, and a Kantian approach to abortion, as well as *Moral Self-Regard: Duties to Oneself in Kant’s Moral Theory* (2001).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

*Notes on contributors*

PAUL GUYER is Professor of Philosophy and Florence R.C. Murray Professor in the Humanities at the University of Pennsylvania. Among his recent books are *Kant* (2006); *Kant's Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals: A Reader's Guide* (2007); and *Knowledge, Reason, and Taste: Kant's Response to Hume* (2008). He has edited *The Cambridge Companion to the Critique of Pure Reason* (Cambridge University Press, 2010). He is currently working on a history of modern aesthetics.

BARBARA HERMAN is Griffin Professor of Philosophy and Professor of Law at UCLA. She writes on Kantian themes in ethics and politics, both broadly and narrowly construed. Her publications include *Moral Literacy* (2007).

ROSALIND HURSTHOUSE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Auckland, New Zealand. She is the author of *On Virtue Ethics* (1999); *Ethics, Humans and Other Animals* (2000), which is a textbook on the ethics of our treatment of the other animals; and numerous articles on ethics, applied ethics, and Aristotle. She is currently working on the question of what, if anything, evolutionary biology can contribute to ethics.

LAWRENCE JOST is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cincinnati. His publications center on Aristotle's ethical writings. He co-edited *Eudaimonia and Well-Being* (2003), a collection of essays on the intersection between ancient ethics and contemporary theories of well-being. He is presently finishing a monograph on the *Eudemean Ethics* in which he argues that its central argument is unified, coherent, and different from that of the *Nicomachean Ethics* in placing special emphasis on the individual.

NANCY SHERMAN is University Professor and Professor of Philosophy at Georgetown University. She is the author of *The Untold War* (2010); *Stoic Warriors* (2005); *Making a Necessity of Virtue* (Cambridge University Press, 1997); and *The Fabric of Character* (1989). She is also the editor of *Critical Essays on the Classics: Aristotle's Ethics* (1999).

MICHAEL SLOTE is UST Professor of Ethics at the University of Miami. He is the author of numerous books and articles on ethics, moral psychology, and political philosophy. His most recent work is at the intersection of virtue ethics and care ethics. His book *Moral Sentimentalism* was published 2010.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics  
Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Notes on contributors*

ix

CHRISTINE SWANTON is a philosophy professor at the University of Auckland, New Zealand. She is currently working on the virtue ethics of Hume and Nietzsche. Her book on virtue ethics, *Virtue Ethics: A Pluralistic View*, was published in 2003.

ALLEN WOOD is Ward W. and Priscilla B. Woods Professor at Stanford University. He has written numerous books and articles, especially on Kant, Fichte, Hegel, and Marx. He is co-general editor of the Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant. His most recent book is *Kantian Ethics* (Cambridge University Press 2008).

JULIAN WUERTH is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. He is the author of *Kant on Mind, Action, and Ethics* (2011). He is currently writing a book, *What Should I Do?: Kant's Ethics*, as one in a five-book, five-author series on Kant's "five questions," and is editing *The Cambridge Kant Lexicon* (Cambridge University Press, forthcoming).



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## *Acknowledgements*

Five of the twelve essays in this volume (those by Marcia Baron, Paul Guyer, Rosalind Hursthouse, Nancy Sherman, and Michael Slote) are versions of papers originally presented in 2005 at a conference that we organized in Cincinnati, “Virtue Ethics vs. Kantian Ethics.” For their generous financial support for this three-day conference, we would like to thank the Hebrew Union College–University of Cincinnati Center for the Study of Ethics and Contemporary Moral Problems, the University of Cincinnati College of Law, and the Charles Phelps Taft Research Center. We would also like to thank everyone in the University of Cincinnati Department of Philosophy who helped out with the event, in particular John Bickle, Head of Department. Our special thanks to Jonathan Cohen, Associate Professor at Hebrew Union College and Director of the HUC–UC Center for the Study of Ethics, and to Joseph Tomain, Dean of the University of Cincinnati College of Law, for their close work with us on the conference. We are also grateful to everyone who presented at the conference and to those in attendance. Finally, we are very appreciative of the excellent research assistance in preparing this volume provided by Garrett Bredeson and Alison Suen, graduate students in the Vanderbilt University Department of Philosophy.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## *Abbreviations*

Citations to Aristotle's works will refer to the title of the work using one of the abbreviations listed below. The next reference will be to a page number, column letter, and line number in Immanuel Bekker's 1831 Berlin edition of Aristotle's works. The *Nicomachean Ethics* begins at 1094a1, for example. Normally, this will be done without book or chapter numbers. Unless otherwise indicated, the translations used are from *The Complete Works of Aristotle: The Revised Oxford Translation*, ed. Jonathan Barnes (Princeton University Press).

M	<i>Metaphysics</i>
NE	<i>Nicomachean Ethics</i>
Rhet	<i>Rhetoric</i>

Citations to Kant's works, with the exception of citations to the first *Critique*, refer to the title of the work using one of the abbreviations listed below. They next refer to a volume and page number from *Kant's gesammelte Schriften, herausgegeben von der Berlin-Brandenburgischen Akademie der Wissenschaften* (formerly the *Deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin*, and before that the *Königlichen Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*), 29 volumes (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter [and predecessors], 1900–). Citations to the *Critique of Pure Reason* (trans. and ed. Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood) refer not to the title but instead to the edition of this work – “A” to the 1781 first edition, “B” to the 1787 second edition. Unless otherwise indicated, the essays in this volume use the translations listed here, all from the Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant.

A	<i>Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht</i> (7:117–333) [1796–97]. <i>Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View</i> , trans. Robert B. Loudon, in <i>Anthropology, History, and Education</i> , ed. Günter Zöllner and Loudon, 2007, 227–429
---	---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

*List of abbreviations*

- ABu *Anthropologie-Busolt* (25:1431–531) [1788–89?]
- AC *Anthropologie-Collins* (25:1–238) [1772–73]
- AF *Anthropologie-Friedländer* (25:465–728) [1775–76]
- AMr *Anthropologie-Mrongovius* (25:1205–429) [1784–85]
- APa *Anthropologie-Parow* (25:239–463) [1772–73]
- APi *Anthropologie-Pillau* (25:729–847) [1777–78]
- CB *Mutmaßlicher Anfang der Menschengeschichte* (8:107–23) [1786]. *Conjectural Beginning of Human History*, trans. Allen W. Wood, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, 163–75
- CF *Streit der Fakultäten* (7:1–116) [1798]. *The Conflict of the Faculties*, trans. Mary J. Gregor and Robert Anchor, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, ed. Wood and George di Giovanni, 1996, 233–327
- CPJ *Kritik der Urteilskraft* (5:165–485) [1790]. *Critique of the Power of Judgment*, trans. Paul Guyer and Eric Matthews, ed. Guyer, 2000
- CPRr *Kritik der praktischen Vernunft* (5:1–163) [1788]. *Critique of Practical Reason*, trans. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, ed. Gregor, 1996, 133–271
- EOAT *Das Ende aller Dinge* (8:325–39) [1794]. *The End of All Things*, trans. Wood, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, 217–31
- G *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten* (4:385–463) [1785]. *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, 37–108
- IUH *Idee zu einer allgemeinen Geschichte in weltbürgerlicher Absicht* (8:15–31) [1784]. *Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim*, trans. Wood, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, 107–20
- MD *Metaphysik Dohna* (28:611–702) [1792–93], trans. (of 28:656–90) Karl Ameriks and Steve Naragon, in *Lectures on Metaphysics*, ed. Ameriks and Naragon, 1997, 355–91
- Me *Anthropologie-Menschenkunde* (25:849–1203) [1781–82?]
- MK2 *Metaphysik K2* (28:705–816) [early 1790s], trans. (of 28:753–75) Ameriks and Naragon, in *Lectures on Metaphysics*, 393–413
- ML1 *Metaphysik L1* (28:183–350) [1777–80], trans. (of 28:195–301) Ameriks and Naragon, in *Lectures on Metaphysics*, 17–106
- ML2 *Metaphysik L2* (28:525–609) [1790–91?], trans. (of 28:531–94) Ameriks and Naragon, in *Lectures on Metaphysics*, 297–354
- MM *Metaphysik der Sitten* (6:203–493) [1797–98]. *The Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, 353–603

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics  
Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of abbreviations*

xiii

- MMr *Metaphysik Mrongovius* (29:747–940) [1782–83], trans. Ameriks and Naragon, in *Lectures on Metaphysics*, 107–308
- MoC *Moralphilosophie Collins* (27:237–473) [1784–85]. *Moral Philosophy: Collins's Lecture Notes*, trans. Peter Heath, in *Lectures on Ethics*, ed. Heath and J.B. Schneewind, 1997, 37–222
- MoMr *Moralphilosophie Mrongovius II* (29:593–642) [1785]. *Morality According to Prof. Kant: Mrongovius's Second Set of Lecture Notes* (selections), trans. Heath, in *Lectures on Ethics*, 223–48
- MoPo *Praktische Philosophie Powalski* (27:91–235) [1782–83?]
- MoVi *Metaphysik der Sitten Vigilantius* (27:479–732) [1793]. *Kant on the Metaphysics of Morals: Vigilantius's Lecture Notes*, trans. Heath, in *Lectures on Ethics*, 249–452
- MVi *Metaphysik Vigilantius (K<sub>3</sub>)* (29:943–1040) [1794–95], trans. Ameriks and Naragon, in *Lectures on Metaphysics*, 415–506
- OFBS *Beobachtungen über das Gefühl des Schönen und Erhabenen* (2:205–56) [1764]. *Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime*, trans. Guyer, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, 23–62
- P *Pädagogik* (9:437–99) [1803]. *Lectures on Pedagogy*, trans. Loudon, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, 434–85
- PMB *De medicina corporis, quae philosophorum est* (15:939–53) [1786] *On the Philosophers' Medicine of the Body*, trans. Gregor, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, 182–91
- R *Reflexionen* (15, 17, 18, 19, 23), trans. (of selections) Bowman, Guyer, and Rauscher, in *Notes and Fragments*, ed. Guyer, 2005
- REL *Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der bloßen Vernunft* (6:1–202) [1793]. *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*, trans. Di Giovanni, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, 39–215
- RH *Recensionen von J.G. Herders Ideen zur Philosophie der Geschichte der Menschheit* (8:43–66) [1785]. *Review of J.G. Herder's Ideas for the Philosophy of the History of Humanity*, trans. Wood, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, 121–42
- RP *Philosophische Religionslehre nach Pölitz* (28:989–1126) [mid-1780s?]. *Lectures on the Philosophical Doctrine of Religion*, trans. Wood, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, 335–451
- TP *Über den Gemeinspruch: Das mag in der Theorie richtig sein, taugt aber nicht für die Praxis* (8:273–313) [1793]. *On the*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51525-2 - Perfecting Virtue: New Essays on Kantian Ethics and Virtue Ethics

Edited by Lawrence Jost and Julian Wuerth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

*List of abbreviations*

- Common Saying: That May Be Correct in Theory, But It Is of No Use in Practice*, trans. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, 273–309
- TPP *Zum ewigen Frieden* (8:341–86) [1795]. *Toward Perpetual Peace*  
trans. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, 311–51
- WDO *Was heißt: Sich im Denken orientieren?* (8:131–47) [1786]. *What Does It Mean to Orient Oneself in Thinking?*, trans. Wood, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, 1–18