CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

SEEKING HUMAN RIGHTS JUSTICE IN LATIN AMERICA

This book studies how victims of human rights violations in Latin America, their families, and their advocates work to overcome entrenched impunity and seek legal justice. Their struggles show that legal justice is a multifaceted process, the overarching purpose of which is to restore human dignity and prevent further violence. Uncovering, revealing, and proving the truth are essential elements of legal justice, and are also powerful tools to activate the process. When faced with stubborn impunity at home, victims, families, and advocates can carry on their work for legal justice by bringing cases in courts in other countries or in the inter-American human rights system. These extra-territorial courts can jump-start the process of legal justice at home. *Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America* examines the political and legal struggle through the lens of the human story at the heart of these cases.

Jeffrey Davis is chair and associate professor in the Political Science Department at the University of Maryland Baltimore County (UMBC). He has taught human rights law, international law, constitutional law, and comparative law for more than ten years and has won several teaching awards. He is the author of *Justice across Borders: The Struggle for Human Rights in U.S. Courts* (Cambridge University Press 2008), and has published articles on human rights accountability, the inter-American human rights system, and judicial decision making. Research for this book was conducted in part while serving as a visiting scholar at the University for Peace in San Jose, Costa Rica, site of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America

TRUTH, EXTRA-TERRITORIAL COURTS, AND THE PROCESS OF JUSTICE

Jeffrey Davis
University of Maryland, Baltimore County

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521514361

© Jeffrey Davis 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data
Davis, Jeffrey, 1967–
Seeking human rights justice in Latin America : truth, extra-territorial courts, and the process of justice / Jeffrey Davis, University of Maryland, Baltimore County.
pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-51436-1 (hardback)
1. International human rights courts – Latin America. I. Title.
KG574.D38 2013
341.4′8–dc23 2013014272

ISBN 978-0-521-51436-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

To my father, Robert W. Davis

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments *page* xi

1 Building Justice from Truth – The Process Begins 1

The Case of the Jesuits 1
Denial and Institutional Impunity 11
Seeking Justice for Human Rights Violations 18
The Jesuits Case – Reaching beyond the State 22
Impunity under the Mask of Forgiveness 23
Questions Asked by the Jesuits Case – Methods, Research Questions, and Outline of the Book 26
The Accomarca Massacre – The Process Begins 30
Search for the Truth 33

2 Reconstituting Human Dignity and the Process of Legal Justice 38

The Méndez Case and Entrenched Guatemalan Impunity 38
Transitional Justice as More than a Legal Result 41
Legal Justice as a Multifaceted Process 46
Restoring Human Dignity 51
A Process to Restore Dignity 59

3 Truth and the Process of Justice 65

The Gudiel Cases 65
Truth and the Process of Justice 67
Without Truth, Impunity 71
Truth and Dignity 76
Truth as Justice 80

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

Missing Children Cases – Serrano Cruz Sisters 83
Missing Children Cases – The Gelman Case 86

4 The Foundation of Justice: The Rights to Truth and Information 90

The Right to Truth 90
The Foundations of the Right to Truth 91
The Inter-American System 92
Development and Expansion of the Right 95
The European Court of Human Rights 98
Treaties and International Agreements 102
The United Nations 104
Customary International Law 106
Obstacles to the Right to Truth 107
Defining the Right – The Right to Information 111

5 Moving the Process and Proving the Truth 117

Uncovering and Proving the Truth 117
The Engine of the Process – Nongovernmental Organizations 117
The García Case and the Founding of the Grupo de Apoyo Mutuo 120
Truth Commissions 126
Secret Documents 129
Secret Documents – The Edgar Fernando García Case 141
Uncovering Secret Documents around the World 148
Using Secret Documents to Excavate the Truth 152
Conclusion 156

6 Exposing the Truth and Jump-Starting the Process in Extra-Territorial Courts 157

Unlocking the Process 157
The Inter-American Human Rights System 160
The Diario Militar Case, *Gudiel v. Guatemala*, in the Inter-American System 161
The Decision of the Inter-American Court 165
The Decision of the Inter-American Court in *Fernando García and Family v. Guatemala* 172
Bringing Human Rights Cases from Latin America in the United States 175

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

The Rondón Case and Obstacles to Extra-Territorial Legal Justice 178
Bringing Latin American Cases before Spanish National Courts 185
The Guatemala Genocide Case 185
The Jesuits Case 192

7 The Effect of Extra-Territorial Courts on the Process of Justice and Conclusion 194

Effect of Extra-Territorial Legal Action on the Process 194
Effect of the Cases in Spain 194
Moving the Process in Guatemala 195
Effect of U.S. Cases 201
Effect of Cases before the Inter-American Court 207
Receiving Testimony and Enshrining the Truth 207
Equipping Advocates to Advance the Process at Home 209
Condemning Human Rights Violations 213
Using Individual Cases to Address a Broad Class of Victims 214
The Process Establishes a Web of Accountability 216

Conclusion 219

Legal Justice Is a Process 219
Truth through Testimony 221
Truth through Documents 223
Human Rights Groups 224
Extra-Territorial Courts 225
Restoring Dignity 226

Index 229

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-51436-1 - Seeking Human Rights Justice in Latin America: Truth, Extra-Territorial Courts, and the Process of Justice
Jeffrey Davis
Frontmatter
More information

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am extremely grateful to Kate Doyle at the National Security Archive for sharing her expertise, and to her colleagues for making millions of documents available to researchers, advocates, and the public. I am deeply thankful to Wendy Méndez, Oscar Reyes, Cecilia Moran Santos, and Juan Romagoza, who have shared their experiences seeking justice. I also thank Olger González at the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Almudena Bernabeu at the Center for Justice and Accountability, Roxanna Altholz at the Berkeley School of Law Human Rights Clinic, Soraya Long at the Center for Justice and International Law, and Adrianna Beltran at the Washington Office for Latin America. Without their knowledge, this research would not have been possible. I very much appreciate the help of my current and former students, Edward H. Warner, Micaela Perez Ferrero, and Morgan Vierling. I am grateful to Professor Daniel Whelan for his insightful critiques of an earlier version of this research. Last but certainly not least, I would like to thank my wife, Katie, for her tireless help and support.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org