

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 96



#### Volumes published under the title:

# ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

Vol. 1 (1919-22)	Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C., and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 2 (1923-24)	•
Vol. 3 (1925-26)	Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D., and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 4 (1927-28)	• .
Vol. 5 (1929-30)	
Vol. 6 (1931-32)	
Vol. 7 (1933-34)	
Vol. 8 (1935-37)	
Vol. 9 (1938-40)	
Vol. 10 (1941-42)	Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
Vol. 11 (1919-42)	Edited by 11. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., 1.B.A.
Vol. 12 (1943-45)	
Vol. 13 (1946)	
Vol. 14 (1947)	
Vol. 15 (1948)	
Vol. 16 (1949)	

#### Volumes published under the title:

#### INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

Vol. 17 (1950) Vol. 18 (1951)	
Vol. 19 (1952)	
Vol. 20 (1953)	Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
` '	F.B.A.
Vol. 21 (1954)	
Vol. 22 (1955)	
Vol. 23 (1956)	
Vol. 24 (1957)	Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
` ,	F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)	Elizable E Lautomath OO
Vol. 26 (1958-IÍ)	Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 27—68 and Con-	solidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1-35 and 36-45
	Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 69-96 and Con	solidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
	Treaties to Vols. 1—80
	Edited by E. Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
	and C. J. Greenwood



Research Centre for International Law
University of Cambridge

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

# VOLUME 96

Edited by

E. LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

and

C. J. GREENWOOD

Fellow of Magdalene College, University of Cambridge





# © E. LAUTERPACHT 1994

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

International Standard Book Number: 0 521 47293 8

Printed in Great Britain on acid-free paper by Gomer Press, Llandysul, Dyfed

Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne, 3166, Australia

First published 1994

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library



# **CONTENTS**

	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)	xv
Digest (main headings)	xviii
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 96	xix
Table of Treaties	liii
Reports of Cases	1
Additional Materials	737
Index	743



## **PREFACE**

Volume 96, the third volume of the International Law Reports to appear in 1994, contains more than fifty decisions from a range of national and international tribunals. The decisions of international tribunals include the latest opinions of the Arbitration Commission of the Peace Conference for the Former Yugoslavia, which deal principally with questions of State succession, two cases from the Court of Justice of the European Communities, two interesting and little-known decisions in ad hoc international arbitrations in the Elf Aquitaine and Lafico cases and the first decision of the Administrative Tribunal of the Asian Development Bank. The ever expanding international jurisprudence on human rights is represented by cases from the European Commission and Court of Human Rights, the Inter-American Court of Human Rights and the United Nations Human Rights Committee. Decisions from national courts in the Netherlands and the United States have also been included.

We are indebted to the following publishers who have kindly permitted us to use photographic reproductions of decisions from the reports which they publish: the Court of Justice of the European Communities (European Court Reports), the European Commission of Human Rights (Decisions and Reports of the European Commission of Human Right), the West Publishing Company (Federal Reporter and Federal Supplement) and the Lawyers' Co-operative Publishing Company (Lawyers' Edition of the United States Supreme Court Reports).

The volume has again been the work of many hands. The cases from the Netherlands were selected by Mr Andrew Oppenheimer, Associate Editor for Civil Law Jurisdictions of these Reports and Fellow of the Research Centre for International Law. The English translations of these decisions have been extracted from the Netherlands Yearbook of International Law by kind permission of the TMC Asser Institute in The Hague and the Editors of the Netherlands Yearbook. Concise statements entitled "The facts" appear in the Netherlands Yearbook before the text of the relevant part of each judgment and these statements have formed the basis of the summaries prepared for this volume by Mr Anthony Morgan LLM.

Ms Rosemary Rayfuse, LLM, Lecturer in Law at the University of New South Wales, and Dr Alfred de Zayas, Visiting Professor at De Paul University, Chicago, were responsible for the cases from the United Nations Human Rights Committee. Ms Rayfuse also summarized the decisions from the European Court of Human Rights and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights. Mr Anthony Morgan prepared the summaries of the United States cases and the



viii PREFACE

award in the Lafico arbitration. The award in Lafico was translated by Mr Oppenheimer. Ms Karen L. Lee, MA, contributed a number of summaries, prepared the Digest and the Tables of Cases and Treaties and gave invaluable general assistance. The Index was compiled by Miss Maureen MacGlashan. Mrs Marie Pepper was responsible for checking the copy and the proofs. Secretarial assistance was provided by Mrs Glen Howard, Miss Rebecca Webb and Mrs Jane Gilbert.

The volume has been published by the Cambridge University Press and printed, with their customary care, by the Gomer Press. To all the above, we extend our warmest thanks.

E. LAUTERPACHT

C.J. GREENWOOD

RESEARCH CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

June 1994



# EDITORIAL NOTE

The International Law Reports endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the Reports will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

#### DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The Reports seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the Reports to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the Reports will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Selected decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights will be printed, chosen by reference to the importance of the points at issue and their interest to public international lawyers generally. (All reports of decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights are published in an official series, the Official Collection of Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights, as well as in the European Human Rights Reports). Decisions of national courts on the



x

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-47293-7 - International Law Reports, Volume 96 Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood Frontmatter More information

EDITORIAL NOTE

application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these Reports are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration)). But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

#### DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

#### Editorial Treatment of Materials

The basic policy of the Editor is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is not part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.



#### EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

#### Presentation of Materials

The material in this volume is of two kinds, material reproduced photographically and material which has been freshly set for this volume.

Material photographically reproduced. This consists exclusively of reports originally printed in the English language. The material can usually be recognized by the differences between its type-style and the Baskerville type otherwise used in these Reports. The source of the material is identified by the reference to "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. Where more than one citation is given, the report used is the one first listed. The bold type figures in square brackets in the inner margin of each page refer to the pagination of the original report. The smaller figures in square brackets in the margins of these cases are the indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

Other material. The remaining material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. This includes all material specially translated into English for these Reports as well as some material in English which in its original form was not suitable for photoreproduction. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report. Small figures in square brackets within the text are indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

#### Notes

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

#### DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that



xii

#### EDITORIAL NOTE

heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at page xviii.



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

#### ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

AB and Others v. Italy (Communication No 413/1990), 706 (note)

Adiletta and Others Case, 601 (note) Ahlström Osakeyhtiö and Others v. Commission (In re Wood Pulp Cartel)

(Joined Cases 89/85, 104/85, 114/85, 116-17/85 and 125-9/85), 148

Air France v. Saks, 113

Algemene Bank Nederland v. Minister for Economic Affairs; Algemene Bank Nederland v. KF and Others, 344

Alimena Case, 601 (note)

Angelucci Case, 601 (note)

Arnbjornsdottir-Mendler v. United States, 104

Baggetta Case, 465 Baraona Case, 477

Bhinder v. Canada (Communication No 208/1986), 660

Board of the Teaching Hospital at the University of Amsterdam v. FW and Others, 339

Bock Case, 519 (note)

Brigandì Case, 601 (note) Caleffi Case, 601 (note)

Capuano Case, 451 CDS v. Netherlands, 383 Colacioppo Case, 601 (note)

Elf Aquitaine Iran v. National Iranian Oil Company, 251

Emergency, Judicial Guarantees in States of: see Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency (Articles 27(2), 25 and 8 of the American Convention on Human Rights) (Advisory Opinion OC-9/87)

Emergency Situations, Habeas Corpus in: see Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations (Articles 27(2), 25(1) and 7(6) of the American Convention on Human Rights) (Advisory Opinion OC-8/87) EP and Others v. Colombia (Communication No 318/1988), 705 (note)

Ferraro Case, 601 (note) Ficara Case, 601 (note) Frau Case, 601 (note)

Gale v. Andrus, 21 Girolami Case, 601 (note) Goldstar (Panama) SA v. United States, 54

H v. France, 535

Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations (Articles 27(2), 25(1) and 7(6) of the American Convention on Human Rights) (Advisory Opinion OC-8/87), 392

Hendriks v. Netherlands (Application No 9427/78), 602

Hendriks v. Netherlands (Communication No 201/1985), 623

Hoogenraad v. Organization for Research in the Netherlands, 389 Hot Air BV and Another v. Canadian

Hot Air BV and Another v. Canadian Pacific Airlines Ltd and Another, 333

In the Matter of the Requested Extradition of Tuttle; United States v. Tuttle, 110

Industria Panificadora SA and Others v. United States, 61 (note)

Industrial Insurance Board v. K, 358
Interpretation of the American Declaration
of the Rights and Duties of Man
within the Framework of Article 64 of
the American Convention on Human
Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-10/87),
416

Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency (Articles 27(2), 25 and 8 of the American Convention on Human Rights) (Advisory Opinion OC-9/87), 405



xiv

#### TABLE OF CASES

Kitok v. Sweden (Communication No 197/1985), 637

Klinghoffer and Others v. SNC Achille Lauro and Others, 68

Lechner and Hess Case, 430

Liberia, Republic of: see Republic of Liberia and Another v. Bickford and Another

Investment Arab Foreign Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi, 279

Lindsey v. Asian Development Bank,

Maclaine Watson and Co Ltd v. Council and Commission of the European Communities (Case C-241/87), 201

Maj Case, 601 (note)

Manzoni Case, 601 (note)

Marshall and Others v. Canada (Communication No 205/1986), 707

Martins Moreira Case, 498

Milasi Case, 476 (note)
Ministry of Defence of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. Gould, Inc and Others, 1

Mississippi Poultry Association Inc and Another v. Madigan and Another,

Mori Case, 601 (note) Motta Case, 601 (note)

Netherlands v. National Union of Students and Another, 364 Neves e Silva Case, 519 (note)

New York Chinese TV Programs Inc v. UE Enterprises Inc and Others, 81

Obermeier Case, 562 Oliveira Neves Case, 520 (note) Ominayak and the Lubicon Lake Band Canada (Communication No 167/1984), 667

Panama, Republic of: see Republic of Panama v. Air Panama Internacional SA and Others

Pugliese (I) Case, 601 (note) Pugliese (II) Case, 601 (note)

Rainbow Navigation Inc v. Department of the Navy, 97

Republic of Liberia and Another v. Bickford and Another, 90

Republic of Panama v. Air Panama Internacional SA and Others, 43 RL v. Canada (Communication No 358/1989), 706 (note)

Santilli Case, 601 (note)

Société Ivorienne de Transport Maritime (SITRAM) v. Junior Maritime Company, 373

Temengil and Others v. Trust Territory of the Pacific Islands and Others, 32

Trans-Orient Marine Corp v. Star Trading Marine Inc and Another, 62 Triggiani Case, 601 (note)

Tuttle, Requested Extradition of: see In the Matter of the Requested Extradition of Tuttle; United States v. Tuttle

Union Alimentaria Sanders SA Case, 520

Vereniging tot Behoud van Natuurmonumenten in Nederland Another v. Netherlands, 338

Vernillo v. France, 585

Verzekeringsmaatschappij Het Hollandsche Kruis v. United Kingdom, 380 Viezzer Case, 601 (note)

Vocaturo Case, 601 (note)

Vuolanne v. Finland (Communication No 265/1987), 649

Woodpulp Cases: see Ahlström Osakeyhtiö and Others v. Commission (In re Wood Pulp Cartel) (Joined Cases 89/85, 104/85, 114/85, 116-17/85 and 125-9/85)

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission Opinion No. 11, 718

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission Opinion No. 12, 723

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission Opinion No. 13, 726

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission Opinion No. 14, 729

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission Opinion No. 15, 733

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission Reactions to Statement by Federal Republic of Yugoslavia Government on its Competence, 713

Zanghì Case, 601 (note)



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

#### I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

Arbitration

LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal

1991

Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi, 279

Sole Arbitrator

1982

Elf Aquitaine Iran v. National Iranian Oil Company, 251

Asian Development Bank Administrative Tribunal

1992

Lindsey v. Asian Development Bank, 233

Commission of the European Communities

1984

A Ahlström Osakeyhtiö and Others v. Commission (In re Wood Pulp Cartel) (Joined Cases 89/85, 104/85, 114/85, 116-17/85 and 125-9/85), 148, 152

Court of Justice of the European Communities

1988

A Ahlström Osakeyhtiö and Others v. Lechner and Hess Case Commission (In re Wood Pulp Cartel) Milasi Case, 476 (note)

(Joined Cases 89/85, 104/85, 114/85, 116-17/85 and 125-9/85), 148, 154

1989

Maclaine Watson and Co Ltd v. Council and Commission of the European Communities (Case C-241/87), 201, 205

1990

Maclaine Watson and Co Ltd v. Council and Commission of the European Communities (Case C-241/87), 201, 231

1993

A Ahlström Osakeyhtiö and Others v. Commission (In re Wood Pulp Cartel) (Joined Cases 89/85, 104/85, 114/85, 116-17/85 and 125-9/85), 148, 200 (note)

European Commission of Human Rights

1982

Hendriks v. Netherlands (Application No 9427/78), 602

1990

Vernillo v. France, 585

European Court of Human Rights

1987

Baggetta Case, 465
Baraona Case, 477
Capuano Case, 451
Lechner and Hess Case, 430
Milasi Case, 476 (note)



xvi

#### TABLE OF CASES

1988

Martins Moreira Case, 498

1989

Bock Case, 519 (note)
H v. France, 535
Neves e Silva Case, 519 (note)
Oliveira Neves Case, 520 (note)
Uníon Alimentaria Sanders SA Case,
520

1990

Obermeier Case, 562 Vernillo v. France, 585

1991

Adiletta and Others Case, 601 (note) Alimena Case, 601 (note) Angelucci Case, 601 (note) Brigandì Case, 601 (note) Caleffi Case, 601 (note) Colacioppo Case, 601 (note) Ferraro Case, 601 (note) Frau Case, 601 (note) Girolami Case, 601 (note) Maj Case, 601 (note) Manzoni Case, 601 (note) Mori Case, 601 (note) Motta Case, 601 (note) Pugliese (I) Case, 601 (note) Pugliese (II) Case, 601 (note) Santilli Case, 601 (note) Triggiani Case, 601 (note) Viezzer Case, 601 (note) Vocaturo Case, 601 (note)

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Zanghì Case, 601 (note)

#### 1987

Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations (Articles 27(2), 25(1) and 7(6) of the American Convention on Human Rights) (Advisory Opinion OC-8/87), 392

Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency (Articles 27(2), 25 and 8 of the American Convention on Human Rights) (Advisory Opinion OC-9/87), 405

#### 1989

Interpretation of the American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man

within the Framework of Article 64 of the American Convention on Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-10/87), 416

Peace Conference on Former Yugoslavia: see under Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission

United Nations Human Rights Committee

#### 1988

Hendriks v. Netherlands (Communication No 201/1985), 623 Kitok v. Sweden (Communication No 197/1985), 637

#### 1989

Bhinder v. Canada (Communication No 208/1986), 660 Vuolanne v. Finland (Communication No 265/1987), 649

#### 1990

AB and Others v. Italy (Communication No 413/1990), 706 (note) EP and Others v. Colombia (Communication No 318/1988), 705 (note) Ominayak and the Lubicon Lake Band v. Canada (Communication No 167/1984), 667

#### 1991

Marshall and Others v. Canada (Communication No 205/1986), 707
RL v. Canada (Communication No 358/1989), 706 (note)

Yugoslavia Peace Conference, Arbitration Commission

#### 1993

Opinion No. 11, 718 Opinion No. 12, 723 Opinion No. 13, 726 Opinion No. 14, 729 Opinion No. 15, 733

Reactions to Statement by Federal Republic of Yugoslavia Government on its Competence, 713



#### TABLE OF CASES

xvii

#### II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

#### The Netherlands

1983

Hot Air BV and Another v. Canadian Pacific Airlines Ltd and Another, 333

1984

Vereniging tot Behoud van Natuurmonumenten in Nederland and Another v. Netherlands, 338

1986

Board of the Teaching Hospital at the University of Amsterdam v. FW and Others, 339

1987

Algemene Bank Nederland v. Minister for Economic Affairs, 344

1988

Industrial Insurance Board v. K, 358
Société Ivorienne de Transport Maritime
(SITRAM) v. Junior Maritime
Company, 373

1989

Algemene Bank Nederland v. KF and Others, 344

Netherlands v. National Union of Students and Another, 364

Verzekeringsmaatschappij Het Hollandsche Kruis v. United Kingdom, 380

1990

CDS v. Netherlands, 383

Hoogenraad v. Organization for Research in the Netherlands, 389

United States

1980

Gale v. Andrus, 21

1983

Arnbjornsdottir-Mendler v. United States, 104

1985

Air France v. Saks, 113

1988

Republic of Panama v. Air Panama Internacional SA and Others, 43

1989

Ministry of Defence of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. Gould, Inc and Others, 1

Temengil and Others v. Trust Territory of the Pacific Islands and Others, 32

1990

Rainbow Navigation Inc v. Department of the Navy, 97

Trans-Orient Marine Corp v. Star Trading Marine Inc and Another, 62

1991

Klinghoffer and Others v. SNC Achille Lauro and Others, 68

1992

Goldstar (Panama) SA v. United States,

In the Matter of the Requested Extradition of Tuttle; United States v. Tuttle, 110

Industria Panificadora SA and Others v. United States, 61 (note)

Ministry of Defence of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. Gould Inc and Others, 1

New York Chinese TV Programs Inc v. UE Enterprises Inc and Others, 81

Republic of Liberia and Another v. Bickford and Another, 90

1993

Mississippi Poultry Association Inc and Another v. Madigan and Another, 125



# DIGEST OF CASES

## List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. ix.)

Air International Tribunals

**Jurisdiction** Aliens

Lakes and Landlocked Seas Arbitration

Nationality Canals

Recognition Claims

Relationship of International Law and Comity

Municipal Law

Conciliation Reprisals and Countermeasures

Consular Relations Rivers

Damages Sea

Diplomatic Relations Sources of International Law

Economics, Trade and Finance Space

Environment State Immunity

Expropriation State Responsibility

State Succession Extradition

Governments States

Human Rights **Territory** 

Treaties International Court of Justice

War and Armed Conflict International Organizations



# DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 96

Page

#### Air

Civil air transport — Liability of international air carriers for accidents to passengers — Whether absolute — Definition of "accident" — Whether describing cause, or event of injury to passenger — Warsaw Convention, 1929, Article 17 — United States Supreme Court

Air France v. Saks

Civil air transport — Regulation of tariffs — Procedure for setting of tariffs applicable to scheduled air services — Canada-Netherlands Air Transport Agreement, 1974 — The Netherlands, District Court of The Hague

Hot Air BV and Another v. Canadian Pacific Airlines Ltd and Another 333

#### Aliens

Expulsion — Discretion of host State to order expulsion of aliens from its territory — Limits to discretion — Minimum international standards — Requirement that State establish factual grounds giving reasonable cause for expulsion — Collective expulsion — Whether lawful under international law — Whether presumption that collective expulsion violating minimum standards — Simultaneous expulsion by host State of aliens and diplomatic officials of same nationality — Whether provisions governing expulsion of diplomatic officials applicable to aliens — Burundi expelling all Libyan nationals on its territory on grounds of national security — Failure by Burundi to make any prior investigation as to whether expelled aliens causing threat to national security — Whether violating minimum standards — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal

Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi

#### Arbitration

Ad hoc international arbitration — Applicable law — Powers of tribunal — Procedure — Whether parties permitted to raise new ground at oral stage of proceedings — Arbitration Tribunal established by agreement between Burundi and the Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company to hear dispute concerning

279



xx

#### DIGEST OF CASES

Page Arbitration (cont.) bilateral agreement establishing Libyan-Arab Burundi Holding Company — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the 279 Republic of Burundi Agreement between State corporation and foreign corporation containing arbitration clause - Arbitration as the sole means of settling disputes - Effect of Iranian legislation seeking to override arbitration clause - Applicability of Iranian law excluded by the Agreement — Competence of the arbitrator to determine his own competence — Severability of the arbitration clause - Sole Arbitrator Elf Aquitaine Iran v. National Iranian Oil Company 251 Enforcement of award - Award by Iran - United States Claims Tribunal — Action for enforcement in municipal courts - New York Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards, 1958, Article V — Conditions for refusal of enforcement — Burden of proof — Requirement that award by based upon written arbitration agreement between parties - Iran-United States Algiers Accords, 1981 - Whether constituting written arbitration agreement between United States claimant and Iran - Decision turning on whether the President of the United States acting on behalf of United States nationals when signing Accords - Requirement that award of tribunal not exceed scope of dispute submitted to arbitration — Whether requirement that award be based on the national law of a signatory to the Convention — United States Court of Appeals (Ninth Circuit) Ministry of Defence of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. Gould, Inc and Others 1 Nature of arbitration — Arbitration Commission established by International Conference on the Former Yugoslavia - Terms of reference — Competence — Power to give advisory opinions — Status in law — Opinions not binding — Whether subsidiary means for the determination of international law - International Conference on the Former Yugoslavia, Arbitration Commission Reactions to Statement by Federal Republic of Yugoslavia Government on its Competence 713 Claims

Breach of treaty — Remedies — Waiver of remedy — Claimant State waiving right to claim for restitutio in integrum — Damage — Non-material damage to State — Whether satisfaction only remedy — Whether award of monetary compensation possible



DIGEST OF CASES	xxi
<ul> <li>Claim brought by State on behalf of nationals unlawfully expelled from territory of foreign State — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal</li> <li>Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi</li> </ul>	<i>Page</i> 279
Maritime claims — Whether claim for breach of contract constituting a maritime claim — International Convention Relating to the Arrest of Seagoing Ships, 1952, Article 1 — The Netherlands, District Court of Middelburg	
Société Ivorienne de Transport Maritime (SITRAM) v. Junior Maritime Company	373
Remedies — Requirement of exhaustion of local remedies — Whether applicable to contract containing an arbitration clause — Sole Arbitrator	
Elf Aquitaine Iran v. National Iranian Oil Company	251
State control over private claims — Effect of inter-State agreement — Iran-United States Algiers Accords, 1981 — Executive order issued by President of United States implementing Accords — Order suspending existing claims by United States nationals against Iran in United States courts and referring such claims to Iran-United States Claims Tribunal — Whether President having power to refer claims of United States nationals to Tribunal — United States Court of Appeals (Ninth Circuit)	
Ministry of Defence of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. Gould, Inc and Others	1
Damages	
Human rights violations — Costs and expenses — Complexity of case — Whether justifying award of costs for two counsel — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 50 — European Court of Human Rights	
Baraona Case	477
Human rights violations — Unreasonable delay in civil proceedings — Depreciation of judgment amount due to inflation — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 50 — European Court of Human Rights	
Unión Alimentaria Sanders SA Case	520
Human rights violations — Unreasonable delay in civil proceedings — Increased costs and expenses in domestic forums — Unidentified financial losses — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 50 — European Court of Human Rights	
Capuano Case	451



xxii

#### DIGEST OF CASES

	Page
Damages (cont.)  Human rights violations — Unreasonable delay in civil proceedings — Loss of opportunity — Increased costs due to delay — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 50 — European Court of Human Rights	
Lechner and Hess Case	430
Human rights violations — Unreasonable delay in civil proceedings — Loss of opportunity — Increased costs due to delay — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 50 — European Court of Human Rights	400
Martins Moreira Case	498
Human rights violations — Unreasonable delay in criminal proceedings — Loss of opportunity — Just satisfaction — Whether including award for retroactive instatement in employment — Power to order adoption of legislative measures — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 50 — European Court of Human Rights	
Baggetta Case	465
Losses for which damage recoverable — Non-material damage — Non-material damage to States — Violation of solemn obligation — Insult — Whether award of monetary compensation available as remedy — Non-material damage to individuals — Unlawful expulsion — Loss of reputation and honour — Whether award of monetary compensation available as remedy — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal	
Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi	279
Measure of damages — Breach of inter-State agreement establishing joint economic development corporation — Damnum emergens and lucrum cessans — Net asset value of corporation at time of unlawful act causing breach of agreement — Interest — Rate of interest — Date from which interest payable — Legal costs — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal	
Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi	279
Diplomatic Relations	
Expulsion of diplomatic officials — Whether receiving State permitted arbitrarily to expel diplomatic officials — Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Article 9 — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal	
Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi	279



	n
Severance — Legal effect — Severance of diplomatic relations by receiving State — Whether severance of diplomatic relations providing grounds for terminating treaty between receiving and sending State — Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Article 63 — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal	Page
Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi	279
Economics, Trade and Finance	
Bilateral commercial treaties — Taiwan-United States Friendship, Commerce and Navigation Treaty, 1946 — United States Court of Appeals (Second Circuit)	
New York Chinese TV Programs Inc v. UE Enterprises Inc and Others	81
Economic development corporation established by inter-State agreement — Rights of shareholders — Agreement between Libya and Burundi establishing joint economic development corporation for purpose of investing in the economy of Burundi — Agreement prohibiting signatories from taking any measures violating the rights of shareholders in corporation — Burundi expelling key Libyan officials of development corporation and prohibiting all Libyan nationals from entering its territory — Whether constituting violation of Libyan shareholders' rights and thereby a violation of Agreement — LAFICO-Republic of Burundi Arbitral Tribunal	
Libyan Arab Foreign Investment Company (LAFICO) and the Republic of Burundi	279
Export embargo — Legislative ban on arms sales to Iran — Award of Iran-United States Claims Tribunal requiring United States corporation to deliver military equipment to Iran — Whether award enforceable by United States court — Opinion of the United States Executive — Significance — United States Court of Appeals (Ninth Circuit)  Ministry of Defence of the Islamic Republic of Iran v. Gould, Inc and	
Others	1
International commodity markets — Tin — International Tin Council — Buffer stock price stabilization programme — Requirement that Member States keep information regarding programme confidential — Cessation of programme — Whether Member States still prohibited from divulging information regarding programme — The Netherlands, Council of State (Judicial Division, President) and Court of Appeal of The Hague Algemene Bank Nederland v. Minister for Economic Affairs; Algemene	344
Bank Nederland v. KF and Others	344

DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii



xxiv

#### DIGEST OF CASES

### Page Economics, Trade and Finance (cont.) International trade — Anti-competitive practices — Price fixing Agreements between producers outside the European Community to fix prices — Effect on the European Economic Community — Whether involving violation of Community competition law — European Economic Community Treaty, 1957, Article 85 — Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development Recommendation on Co-operation between States on Restrictive Practices affecting International Trade — Commission and Court of Justice of the European Communities A Ahlström Osakeyhtiö and Others v. Commission (In re Wood Pulp Cartel) (Joined Cases 89/85, 104/85, 114/85, 116-17/85 and 125-9/85) 148 Multilateral trade agreements — Conflict with municipal legislation — Whether municipal legislation taking precedence · Whether multilateral trade agreements constituting part of the law of nations - General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade -Canada-United States Free Trade Agreement — United States Court of Appeals (Fifth Circuit) Mississippi Poultry Association Inc and Another v. Madigan and Another 125 Environment Wetlands - Protection of wildlife - Proposed construction of port in environmentally protected area - Adequacy of impact studies - Ramsar Convention on Wetlands of International Importance as Waterfowl Habitat, 1971 - EEC Council Directive on the Conservation of Wild Birds, 1979 - The Netherlands, District Court of The Hague Vereniging tot Behoud van Natuurmonumenten in Nederland and Another v. Netherlands 338 Extradition Conditions - Allegations that accused would be mistreated if extradited - Whether matter for Executive or courts - United States Court of Appeals (Ninth Circuit) Arnbjornsdottir-Mendler v. United States 104 Governments Change of government — Effects — Change of government

effected by unlawful or questionable means — New regime not recognized by neighbouring State — Control of State assets

#### © Cambridge University Press



DIGEST OF CASES	xxv
located abroad — Assets located in State not recognizing new regime — Panama — Ownership of Panamanian assets in United States — United States District Court (Southern District, Florida)	Page
Republic of Panama v. Air Panama Internacional SA and Others	43
Change of government — Effects — Change of government effected by unlawful or questionable means — Whether new government bound by contractual obligations of prior government — Sudan — Whether military government established by coup d'état bound by obligations of prior civilian government — United States District Court (Southern District, New York)	<b>CO</b>
Trans-Orient Marine Corp v. Star Trading Marine Inc and Another	62
Change of government — Effects — Whether affecting sovereignty and rights of State — Liberia — Property belonging to Liberia held by third party — Whether Liberia's right to property affected by a change of government following civil war — United States District Court (Southern District, New York)	
Republic of Liberia and Another v. Bickford and Another	90
Recognition — Effect of non-recognition — Taiwan — With- drawal of recognition by United States — Whether withdrawal of recognition causing existing treaties between United States and Taiwan to terminate — United States Court of Appeals (Second Circuit)	
New York Chinese TV Programs Inc v. UE Enterprises Inc and Others	81
Human Rights	
Access to court — Right to hearing within a reasonable time — Case taking over seven years — Cause of delay — Two periods of judicial inactivity — Applicants' conduct of case contributing significantly to delay — Whether violation of right to hearing within reasonable time — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Commission and Court of Human Rights	
Vernillo v. France	585
Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time — Criminal proceedings — Proceedings lasting more than thirteen years — Determination of relevant period according to date of acceptance of right of individual petition — Reasonableness of length of proceedings assessed according to particular circumstances — Excessive workload of national court — Temporary back-log of business — Whether delay justifiable — Whether a matter of structural organization — Effect of failure to take	



xxvi

#### DIGEST OF CASES

Human Rights (cont.)	Page
remedial action — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights	
Baggetta Case	465
Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time — Proceedings lasting more than eight years — Cause of delay — Principal delays attributable to conduct of domestic courts and public authorities involved in litigation process — Heavy workload of courts — Lack of available medical experts — Whether violation of right to determination of civil rights and obligations within a reasonable time — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights	
Martins Moreira Case	498
Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time — Proceedings lasting more than five years at first stage — Principal delays attributable to conduct of domestic courts — Whether justified in view of disruption to Spanish judicial system as a result of restoration of democracy — Whether temporary back-log of cases justifiable — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights	
Unión Alimentaria Sanders SA Case	520
Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time — Proceedings lasting more than nine years — Reasonableness of length of proceedings assessed according to particular circumstances — Complexity and large number of proceedings involving interaction between administrative and judicial proceedings — Whether court proceedings constituting effective review of administrative authorities — Whether length of proceedings a violation of right to hearing within a reasonable time — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights	
Obermeier Case	562
Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time — Proceedings lasting more than seven years — Delay principally attributable to conduct of national authorities — Single period of over four years when no investigative measures taken — Backlog of cases — Whether temporary — Absence of remedial action — Whether a violation of right to hearing within a reasonable time — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights	
H v. France	535



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

Page

Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time in determination of civil rights — Existence of dispute — Meaning of "civil right" — Proceedings at first instance still pending after more than six years — Duty of domestic court to ensure expeditious handling of cases — Delay principally attributable to State authorities — Complexity of case — Preliminary nature of proceedings taken — Whether delay justifiable — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights

Baraona Case 477

Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time in determination of civil rights — Proceedings lasting more than eight years — Cause of delay — Factual complexity of case and conduct of applicants contributing to delay — Principal delays attributable to conduct of domestic courts — Whether violation of right to determination of civil rights and obligations within reasonable time — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights

Lechner and Hess Case 430

Access to court — Right to a hearing within a reasonable time in determination of civil rights — Proceedings still pending after more than ten years — Initiative and power of advancing proceedings resting on parties — Cause of delay — Failure to obtain expert reports in timely manner — Expert supervised by judge — Principal delay attributable to court's failure adequately to supervise its process — Whether violation of right to determination of civil rights and obligations within reasonable time — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights

Capuano Case 451

Criminal penalty — Freedom from condemnation to death penalty — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Protocol No 6, Article 1 — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

CDS v. Netherlands 383

Discrimination — In the provision of education — Allegation that legislation witholding financial facilities from certain categories of students discriminatory — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 14 and Article 2 of First Protocol — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966, Article 26 — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

Netherlands v. National Union of Students and Another 364



xxviii

#### DIGEST OF CASES

Human Rights (cont.)	Page
Discrimination — Prohibition against — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — Differentiation based upon objective and reasonable grounds not discriminatory — Allegation that municipal legislation governing payment of employment disability benefit discriminating against married women — Whether legislation violating Article 26 of Covenant — Scope of protection under Article 26 — Whether application of Article restricted to rights enshrined in Covenant — The Netherlands, Central Appeals Court for the Public Service and Social Security Matters	
Industrial Insurance Board v. K	358
Employment — Right to equal pay — International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966, Article 7(a)(i) — Criteria for determining whether right directly applicable — The Netherlands, Supreme Court	
Hoogenraad v. Organization for Research in the Netherlands	389
Employment — Right to equal pay — International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966, Article 7(a)(i) — Criteria for determining whether treaty provision creating rights for individuals — The Netherlands, Central Appeals Court for the Public Service and for Social Security Matters	
Board of the Teaching Hospital at the University of Amsterdam v. FW and Others	339
Enforcement — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 1 — Article extending rights and freedoms under Convention to all persons within "jurisdiction" of contracting States — Scope of "jurisdiction" — Whether including foreign serviceman stationed in contracting State — Whether including persons situated outside territory of contracting State — The Netherlands, Supreme Court	
CDS v. Netherlands	383
Fair trial — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — Whether requiring national courts to review national legislation by reference to fundamental principles of law — The Netherlands, Supreme Court	
Netherlands v. National Union of Students and Another	364
Freedom of conscience — Military service — Disciplinary procedures — Review by higher military officer, not by a court — Inhuman or degrading treatment — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee	
Vuolanne v. Finland (Communication No 265/1987)	649



DIGEST OF CASES	xxix
Freedom of religion — Discrimination — Reasonable and objective criteria — Restrictions on the manifestation of religion — Principle of "reasonable accommodation" — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  Bhinder v. Canada (Communication No 208/1986)	Page
·	
Judicial guarantees — Habeas corpus — Whether writ of habeas corpus a non-derogable judicial guarantee — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969, Articles 25(1), 7(6) and 27(2) — Inter-American Court of Human Rights	
Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations (Articles 27(2), 25(1) and 7(6) of the American Convention on Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-8/87)	392
Judicial guarantees — States of emergency — "Essential" and non-derogable judicial guarantees — Relationship between obligation to provide effective judicial remedies in accordance with due process rules and right to suspend judicial guarantees — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969, Articles 25, 8 and 27(2) — Inter-American Court of Human Rights	
Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency (Articles 27(2), 25 and 8 of the American Convention on Human Rights (Advisory Opinion OC-9/87)	405
Minority rights — Economic activity — Self-determination — Rights of indigenous populations — Concept of "people" — State responsibility — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee	
Kitok v. Sweden (Communication No 197/1985)	637
Right to determination of civil rights within a reasonable time — Judicial proceedings concerning arrangement for access to child lasting over 19 months — Whether length of proceedings unreasonable — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Commission of Human Rights Hendriks v. Netherlands (Application No 9427/78)	602
,	
Right to fair trial — Investigative measures — Duty of national courts to assess usefulness — Application for appointment of medical expert in contentious proceedings — National courts refusing to appoint — Whether proceedings fair as a whole — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights	
H v. France	535



xxx

#### DIGEST OF CASES

Page Human Rights (cont.) Right to fair trial — Judicial proceedings relating to access to child - Expert report ordered by court - Report shown to applicant's counsel but applicant not provided with copy -Whether violating right to fair trial — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Commission of Human Rights Hendriks v. Netherlands (Application No 9427/78) 602 Right to family life — Access to child — Domestic courts refusing grant of access on basis of mother's objection - Domestic legislation requiring consideration of best interests of child — Whether right of parent to access outweighing interests of child - Whether refusal of access in accordance with law - Whether refusal of access on basis of mother's objection justifiable — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 8 — European Commission of Human Rights 602 Hendriks v. Netherlands (Application No 9427/78) Right to self-determination — Right to dispose of natural wealth and resources — Lands claimed by Indian band expropriated for commercial exploitation - Band claiming violation of right to self-determination — Whether claim admissible — Right to enjoy own culture — Historical inequities and recent developments threatening way of life and culture of Indian band -Whether violation of rights of individual members of band — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966, Articles 1 and 27 — United Nations Human Rights Committee Ominayak and the Lubicon Lake Band v. Canada (Communication No 167/1984) 667 Right to take part in conduct of public affairs — Rights of indigenous peoples - Aboriginal group denied invitation to constitutional conferences dealing with aboriginal matters Certain aboriginal organizations invited as representatives of all aboriginal groups — Invitees not necessarily fully representing interests of all aboriginal groups — Whether denial of invitation amounting to denial of right to take part in conduct of public affairs — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966, Article 25(a) — United Nations Human Rights Committee Marshall and Others v. Canada (Communication No 205/1986) 707 Rights of the child — Right to family life — Divorce — Visiting rights for father — Concept of family — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee Hendriks v. Netherlands (Communication No 201/1985) 623