

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94  
Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 94

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Volumes published under the title:***ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS  
OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES**

- Vol. 1 (1919-22) Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,  
and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
- Vol. 2 (1923-24)
- Vol. 3 (1925-26) Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,  
and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
- Vol. 4 (1927-28)
- Vol. 5 (1929-30)
- Vol. 6 (1931-32)
- Vol. 7 (1933-34)
- Vol. 8 (1935-37)
- Vol. 9 (1938-40)
- Vol. 10 (1941-42) Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
- Vol. 11 (1919-42)
- Vol. 12 (1943-45)
- Vol. 13 (1946)
- Vol. 14 (1947)
- Vol. 15 (1948)
- Vol. 16 (1949)

*Volumes published under the title:***INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS**

- Vol. 17 (1950)
- Vol. 18 (1951)
- Vol. 19 (1952)
- Vol. 20 (1953) Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,  
F.B.A.
- Vol. 21 (1954)
- Vol. 22 (1955)
- Vol. 23 (1956)
- Vol. 24 (1957) Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,  
F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
- Vol. 25 (1958-I) Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
- Vol. 26 (1958-II)
- Vols. 27—68 *and* Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 *and* 36—45  
Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
- Vols. 69—94 *and* Consolidated Index *and* Consolidated Tables of Cases and  
Treaties to Vols. 1—80  
Edited by E. Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,  
and C. J. Greenwood

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94  
Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

*Research Centre for International Law  
University of Cambridge*

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME  
94

*Edited by*

E. LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC  
*Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge  
Bencher of Gray's Inn*

and

C. J. GREENWOOD  
*Fellow of Magdalene College, University of Cambridge*

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS  
 **CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94  
Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521472913](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521472913)

© E. Lauterpacht 1994

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published by Grotius Publications Ltd 1994  
Reprinted by Cambridge University Press 2006  
3rd printing 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by the CPI Group Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN-13 978-0-521-47291-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
PREFACE	vii
EDITORIAL NOTE	ix
TABLE OF CASES (alphabetical)	xiii
TABLE OF CASES (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xix
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 94	xxi
TABLE OF TREATIES	li
REPORTS OF CASES	1
INDEX	625

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## PREFACE

This volume contains decisions from a wide variety of jurisdictions. The Final Report of the United Nations Iraq-Kuwait Boundary Demarcation Commission is published here, together with its map. The jurisprudence of other international tribunals is reflected in the decisions of the International Court of Justice in the *Great Belt* and *Lockerbie* cases and in a number of cases from the United Nations Human Rights Committee. The volume also includes decisions from Canada, England, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands and the United States.

The cases from the Netherlands were selected by Mr Andrew Oppenheimer, Fellow of the Research Centre for International Law and Associate Editor for Civil Law Jurisdictions of these *Reports*. The English translations of these decisions have been extracted from the *Netherlands Yearbook of International Law* by kind permission of the TMC Asser Institute in The Hague and the Editors of the *Netherlands Yearbook*. Concise statements entitled “The Facts” appear in the *Netherlands Yearbook* before the text of the relevant part of each judgment and these statements have formed the basis of the summaries prepared for this volume. The decisions from the Netherlands and the United States have been prepared by Mr Anthony Morgan, LL.M., who has made a substantial contribution to this volume. Mr Oppenheimer selected, prepared and translated, with the assistance of Ms Sylvia Voss, the decisions from the Federal Republic of Germany.

Mr Marc Weller, Research Fellow of the Research Centre for International Law, summarized the Final Report of the United Nations Iraq-Kuwait Boundary Demarcation Commission. Dr Amrit Sarup selected and prepared the Canadian decisions with the exception of *United States of America v. Public Service Alliance of Canada and Others* which was summarized by Ms Rosemary Rayfuse, LL.M., Research Fellow of the Research Centre for International Law and now lecturer at the University of New South Wales. We are especially grateful to Dr Alfred de Zayas, Visiting Professor at De Paul University, Chicago, for the contribution that he has made to the preparation of the human rights cases. Ms Karen L. Lee, MA, prepared the English case, compiled the Tables of Cases and Treaties and played an invaluable part in seeing the volume through the press. Miss Maureen MacGlashan compiled the Index. Mrs Marie Pepper checked the copy and the proofs and Miss Rebecca Webb and Mrs Glen Howard gave valuable secretarial assistance.

We also record with appreciation our indebtedness to the Registrar of the International Court of Justice for allowing us to reproduce the decisions from *International Court of Justice Reports* and to the following publishers and institutions who have permitted the photographic reproduction of material from their publications: the West Publishing Company (*Federal Reporter* and *Federal Supplement*), the Canada Law Book Inc (*Dominion Law Reports* and *Canadian Criminal Cases*), the Law Society of Upper Canada (*Ontario Reports*) and the Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales (*The Law Reports*).

The volume has been printed with their customary care by the Gomer Press. To all the above, we extend our warmest thanks.

We cannot close this Preface without adverting to the fact that the happy and productive co-operation of the last sixteen years between this series and its publishers, Grotius Publications Limited, has now come to an end. The company has now been taken over by the Cambridge University Press, an institution of the greatest standing, with which we are proud to be associated. We are pleased, moreover, that the role which Grotius Publications Limited played in the promotion of significant titles on international law is being recognized by our new publishers by the continued presence of its name on the title page.

E. LAUTERPACHT

C. J. GREENWOOD

RESEARCH CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

*March 1994*



## EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of “political offences” or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

### DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or *ad hoc* arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

*Human rights cases.* The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as “views” of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Selected decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights will be printed, chosen by reference to the importance of the points at issue and their interest to public international lawyers generally. (All reports of decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights are published in an official series, the *Official Collection of Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights*, as well as in the *European Human Rights Reports*). Decisions of national courts on the

application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

*International arbitrations.* The *Reports* of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see *Yearbook Commercial Arbitration* (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration)). But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, *force majeure*) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

#### DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

#### EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editor is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is not part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

## PRESENTATION OF MATERIALS

The material in this volume is of two kinds, material reproduced photographically and material which has been freshly set for this volume.

*Material photographically reproduced.* This consists exclusively of reports originally printed in the English language. The material can usually be recognized by the differences between its type-style and the Baskerville type otherwise used in these *Reports*. The source of the material is identified by the reference to "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. Where more than one citation is given, the report used is the one first listed. The bold type figures in square brackets in the inner margin of each page refer to the pagination of the original report. The smaller figures in square brackets in the margins of these cases are the indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

*Other material.* The remaining material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. This includes all material specially translated into English for these *Reports* as well as some material in English which in its original form was not suitable for photo-reproduction. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report. Small figures in square brackets within the text are indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

## NOTES

*Footnotes.* Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

*Other notes.* References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

## DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94  
Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

xii

EDITORIAL NOTE

heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at page xix.

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

## ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

- AA *v.* Public Prosecutor, 306  
 Atlee and Others *v.* Laird and Others, 97
- Baboeram-Adhin and Others *v.* Suriname (Communication Nos 146/1983 and 148-154/1983), 377
- Canada Labour Code (No 2): *see* United States of America *v.* The Public Service Alliance of Canada and Others (*Re* Canada Labour Code)
- Deputy Registrar Case, 308
- Eckhardt *v.* European Organization for the Safety of Air Navigation (Eurocontrol) (No 2), 331
- Edwards *v.* BV Bureau Wijsmuller Scheepvaart Transport-en Zeesleepvaartmaatschappij, 361
- Espionage Prosecution Case (Case No 2 BGs 38/91), 68
- European Patent Office Taxation Case, 318
- Federal Republic of Germany and Others *v.* Elicofon, 133
- Final Report on the Demarcation of the International Boundary between the Republic of Iraq and the State of Kuwait, 1
- Finland *v.* Denmark: *see* Passage through the Great Belt (Finland *v.* Denmark) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures)
- Great Belt: *see* Passage through the Great Belt (Finland *v.* Denmark) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures)
- Hammel *v.* Madagascar (Communication No 155/1983), 415
- Harrington and Others *v.* Schlesinger and Others, 122
- Herrera Rubio *v.* Colombia (Communication No 161/1983), 432
- HMHK *v.* Netherlands, 342
- Iran-United States Claims Tribunal *v.* AS, 321
- Iraq-Kuwait Boundary Demarcation Report: *see* Final Report on the Demarcation of the International Boundary between the Republic of Iraq and the State of Kuwait
- Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar and Others *v.* Elicofon, 133
- LF and HMHK *v.* Federal Republic of Germany, 342
- Libya *v.* United Kingdom: *see* Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya *v.* United Kingdom) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures)
- Libya *v.* United States of America: *see* Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya *v.* United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures)
- Lockerbie, Aerial Incident at: *see* Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya *v.* United Kingdom)/ (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya *v.* United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures)
- LTK *v.* Finland (Communication No 185/1984), 396

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

## TABLE OF CASES

- MJG *v.* Netherlands (Communication No 267/1987), 443
- MK *v.* Republic of Turkey, 350
- MK *v.* State Secretary for Justice, 357
- Mpaka-Nsusu *v.* Zaire (Communication No 157/1983), 411
- Muhonen *v.* Finland (Communication No 89/1981), 388
- National Oil Corporation *v.* Libyan Sun Oil Company, 209
- Passage through the Great Belt (Finland *v.* Denmark) (Order discontinuing proceedings), 477 (note)
- Passage through the Great Belt (Finland *v.* Denmark) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures), 446
- PE *v.* Public Prosecutor, 307 (note)
- Public Prosecutor *v.* JBC, 339
- Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya *v.* United Kingdom) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures), 478
- Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya *v.* United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures), 596 (note)
- Re* Canada Labour Code (No 2): *see* United States of America *v.* The Public Service Alliance of Canada and Others (*Re* Canada Labour Code)
- Reference *re* Public Service Employee Relations Act, Labour Relations Act and Police Officers Collective Bargaining Act, 246
- Regina *v.* Farnquist, 238
- Regina *v.* Mallios, 231
- Republic of Portugal *v.* Algemene Oliehandel International, 315
- Republic of Portugal *v.* De Sousa, 314
- Republic of Somalia *v.* Woodhouse Drake and Carey (Suisse) SA and Others, 608
- Republic of Vietnam *v.* Pfizer Inc and Others, 199
- Republic of Zaire *v.* Duclaux, 368
- SMHIN *v.* Public Prosecutor, 349
- Solórzano *v.* Venezuela (Communication No 156/1983), 400
- Somali Diplomat Case (Case No 8 B 536/92), 596
- Stalla Costa *v.* Uruguay (Communication No 198/1985), 427
- Stichting Revalidatiecentrum “de Trappenberg” *v.* Kingdom of Morocco, 355
- Tavares *v.* Silva, 370
- Transportes Aereos de Angola *v.* Ronair Inc and Another, 202
- Tritt *v.* United States of America, 260
- Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Interim Measures) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90), 68 (note)
- Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90), 42
- United States *v.* Layton, 83
- United States of America *v.* The Public Service Alliance of Canada and Others (*Re* Canada Labour Code), 264
- Van der Hulst *v.* United States, 373

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS  
AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES)  
AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

### I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

<i>International Court of Justice</i>	
1991	(Communication Nos 146/1983 and 148-154/1983), 377
Case Concerning Passage through the Great Belt (Finland <i>v.</i> Denmark) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures), 446	LTK <i>v.</i> Finland (Communication No 185/1984), 396
	Muhonen <i>v.</i> Finland (Communication No 89/1981), 388
1992	1986
Case Concerning Passage through the Great Belt (Finland <i>v.</i> Denmark) (Order discontinuing proceedings), 477 (note)	Mpaka-Nsusu <i>v.</i> Zaire (Communication No 157/1983), 411
Case Concerning Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya <i>v.</i> United Kingdom) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures), 478	Solórzano <i>v.</i> Venezuela (Communication No 156/1983), 400
Case Concerning Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya <i>v.</i> United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures), 596 (note)	1987
	Hammell <i>v.</i> Madagascar (Communication No 155/1983), 415
	Herrera Rubio <i>v.</i> Colombia (Communication No 161/1983), 432
	MJG <i>v.</i> Netherlands (Communication No 267/1987), 443
	Stalla Costa <i>v.</i> Uruguay (Communication No 198/1985), 427
	<i>United Nations Iraq-Kuwait Boundary Demarcation Commission</i>
<i>United Nations Human Rights Committee</i>	1993
1985	Final Report on the Demarcation of the International Boundary between the Republic of Iraq and the State of Kuwait, 1
Baboeram-Adhin and Others <i>v.</i> Suriname	

### II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

<i>Canada</i>	1980
1978	Regina <i>v.</i> Farnquist, 238
Regina <i>v.</i> Mallios, 231	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi

## TABLE OF CASES

- 1987  
Reference *re* Public Service Employee Relations Act, Labour Relations Act and Police Officers Collective Bargaining Act, 246
- 1989  
Tritt *v.* United States of America, 260
- 1992  
United States of America *v.* The Public Service Alliance of Canada and Others (*Re* Canada Labour Code), 264
- Germany, Federal Republic of*
- 1990  
Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Interim Measures) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90), 67 (note)
- 1991  
Espionage Prosecution Case (Case No 2 BGs 38/91), 68  
Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90), 42
- 1992  
Somali Diplomat Case (Case No 8 B 536/92), 596
- The Netherlands*
- 1980  
AA *v.* Public Prosecutor, 306  
Deputy Registrar Case, 308
- 1981  
Republic of Portugal *v.* De Sousa, 314
- 1982  
Republic of Portugal *v.* Algemene Oliehandel International, 315
- 1983  
European Patent Office Taxation Case, 318  
Iran-United States Claims Tribunal *v.* AS, 321  
PE *v.* Public Prosecutor, 307 (note)
- 1984  
Eckhardt *v.* European Organization for the Safety of Air Navigation (Euro-control) (No 2), 331  
HMHK *v.* Netherlands, 342  
Iran-United States Claims Tribunal *v.* AS, 321  
Public Prosecutor *v.* JBC, 339  
Stichting Revalidatiecentrum "de Trappenberg" *v.* Kingdom of Morocco, 355
- 1985  
Iran-United States Claims Tribunal *v.* AS, 321  
MK *v.* Republic of Turkey, 350  
SMHIN *v.* Public Prosecutor, 349
- 1986  
LF and HMHK *v.* Federal Republic of Germany, 342  
MK *v.* State Secretary for Justice, 357  
Stichting Revalidatiecentrum "de Trappenberg" *v.* Kingdom of Morocco, 355
- 1987  
Edwards *v.* BV Bureau Wijismuller Scheepvaart Transport-en Zeesleepvaartmaatschappij, 361  
Tavares *v.* Silva, 370
- 1988  
Republic of Zaire *v.* Duclaux, 368  
Tavares *v.* Silva, 370
- 1989  
Van der Hulst *v.* United States, 373
- United Kingdom*
- England*
- 1992  
Republic of Somalia *v.* Woodhouse Drake and Carey (Suisse) SA and Others, 608
- United States*
- 1972  
Atlee and Others *v.* Laird and Others, 97



## TABLE OF CASES

xvii

1974 Harrington and Others <i>v.</i> Schlesinger and Others, 122	1981 Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar and Others <i>v.</i> Elicofon, 133 United States <i>v.</i> Layton, 83
1975 Harrington and Others <i>v.</i> Schlesinger and Others, 122	1982 Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar and Others <i>v.</i> Elicofon, 133 Transportes Aereos de Angola <i>v.</i> Ronair Inc and Another, 202
1977 Republic of Vietnam <i>v.</i> Pfizer Inc and Others, 199	1990 National Oil Corporation <i>v.</i> Libyan Sun Oil Company, 209
1978 Federal Republic of Germany and Others <i>v.</i> Elicofon, 133	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## DIGEST OF CASES

### List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. ix.)

<i>Air</i>	<i>Jurisdiction</i>
Aliens	<i>Lakes and Landlocked Seas</i>
<i>Arbitration</i>	Nationality
Canals	<i>Recognition</i>
<i>Claims</i>	<i>Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law</i>
Comity	<i>Reprisals and Countermeasures</i>
Conciliation	Rivers
<i>Consular Relations</i>	<i>Sea</i>
<i>Damages</i>	<i>Sources of International Law</i>
<i>Diplomatic Relations</i>	Space
<i>Economics, Trade and Finance</i>	<i>State Immunity</i>
<i>Environment</i>	<i>State Responsibility</i>
<i>Expropriation</i>	<i>State Succession</i>
<i>Extradition</i>	<i>States</i>
<i>Governments</i>	<i>Territory</i>
<i>Human Rights</i>	<i>Treaties</i>
<i>International Court of Justice</i>	<i>War and Armed Conflict</i>
<i>International Organizations</i>	
<i>International Tribunals</i>	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 94

	<i>Page</i>
<b>Air</b>	
Crimes against aircraft — Montreal Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Civil Aviation, 1971 — Whether applicable to allegations of State terrorism — System of <i>aut dedere aut punire</i> — Lockerbie bombing — International Court of Justice <i>Case Concerning Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United Kingdom)</i>	478
<b>Arbitration</b>	
Enforcement of award — Award made against corporation controlled by nationalized banks of foreign State — Action against foreign State for enforcement of award in municipal courts — State immunity — Whether courts having power to enforce arbitral award by seizure of property belonging to foreign State — The Netherlands, District Court of Rotterdam <i>Republic of Portugal v. Algemene Oliehandel International</i>	315
Enforcement of award — Award rendered abroad — Action for enforcement in municipal courts — New York Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards, 1958, Article V — Conditions for refusal of enforcement — Burden of proof — Post-award interest — Whether enforceable — Application of equitable principles — United States District Court (District of Delaware) <i>National Oil Corporation v. Libyan Sun Oil Company</i>	209
<b>Claims</b>	
State control over claims — Extinction of claims by treaty — Property expropriated by occupation authorities in East Germany, 1945-49 — Agreement between two German States at time of German reunification to exclude restitution of expropriated property — Whether violating property rights of individuals affected — Relevance of fact that any claims brought under international law would have been unenforceable — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court ( <i>BVerfG</i> ) <i>Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90)</i>	42

**Claims** (*cont.*)

State control over claims — United States International Emergency Economic Powers Act — Regulations issued by President limiting Libyan Government's access to municipal courts — Whether President having power to bar Libyan State corporation from enforcing arbitral award in United States courts — United States District Court (District of Delaware)

*National Oil Corporation v. Libyan Sun Oil Company*

209

**Consular Relations**

Archives — Inviolability — Whether savings books given to Consul for safe-keeping constituting consular archives — Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963, Article 33 — The Netherlands, District Court of Rotterdam

*Tavares v. Silva*

370

Immunity — Consul — Immunity from civil proceedings — Dispute relating to administration of estate of national of sending State — Unauthorized removal by third party of valuables belonging to plaintiff and estate of deceased — Valuables given to Consul for safe-keeping pending administration of estate — Refusal by Consul to return valuables to plaintiff — Whether Consul entitled to immunity from jurisdiction — Whether Consul acting in performance of official functions — Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963, Articles 43 and 5(g) — The Netherlands, District Court of Rotterdam

*Tavares v. Silva*

370

**Damages**

Measure of damages — Expropriation and interference with property — Circumstances in which full compensation not required — Property expropriated in East Germany during Soviet occupation, 1945-49 — Compensation payable by Federal Republic of Germany following German reunification — Whether level of compensation subject to executive discretion — Relevance of overall financial commitments of Federal Republic following reunification — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court (*BVerfG*)

*Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90)*

42

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

Page

**Diplomatic Relations**

Diplomats — Position and functions — Failure of sending State to pay salaries of its diplomats — Diplomats unable to support themselves and claiming social security in receiving State — Whether dependence of diplomats on social security in receiving State compromising independent performance of diplomatic functions — Whether payment of social security by receiving State in such circumstances violating Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, or rules of customary international law — Means available to receiving State for obtaining recall of diplomats by sending State in such circumstances — Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, Article 9 — Federal Republic of Germany, Superior Administrative Court (*OVG*) of North Rhine-Westphalia

*Somali Diplomat Case (Case No 8 B 536/92)* 596

Diplomats — Position and functions — Position of diplomats during civil war in sending State — Lack of effective government in sending State — Non-payment of salaries of diplomats — Whether diplomats required to renounce diplomatic status — Federal Republic of Germany, Superior Administrative Court (*OVG*) of North Rhine-Westphalia

*Somali Diplomat Case (Case No 8 B 536/92)* 596

Diplomats — Statement by diplomatic agents that State might pay arbitral award made against company — Company controlled by nationalized banks of State — Whether making of statements constituting a firm commitment by State to pay award — Principle of good faith — The Netherlands, District Court of Rotterdam

*Republic of Portugal v. Algemene Oliehandel International* 315

Immunity — Diplomatic agent — Commission of crime in territory of third State — Whether entitled to immunity from criminal jurisdiction — Waiver — Whether diplomat entitled to waive immunity from criminal jurisdiction — Whether waiver exclusive prerogative of sending State — Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Articles 32, 39 and 40 — The Netherlands, District Court of Haarlem

*Public Prosecutor v. JBC* 339

Immunity — Diplomatic status conferred on official of international organization — Applicability of Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961 — The Netherlands, District Court of The Hague

*Deputy Registrar Case* 308

	<i>Page</i>
<b>Diplomatic Relations</b> ( <i>cont.</i> )	
Immunity — Embassy bank account — Account in use for defraying running expenses of embassy — Whether subject to execution in receiving State — The Netherlands, Council of State	
<i>MK v. State Secretary for Justice</i>	357
Immunity — Exemption from social security provisions in receiving State — Scope of exemption — Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Article 33 — Whether excluding right to claim social security in receiving State — Whether diplomat required to renounce diplomatic status prior to claiming social security — Federal Republic of Germany, Superior Administrative Court ( <i>OVG</i> ) of North Rhine-Westphalia	
<i>Somali Diplomat Case (Case No 8 B 536/92)</i>	596
Immunity — Locally recruited employee — Action for wrongful dismissal — Whether defendant State entitled to immunity — The Netherlands, Supreme Court	
<i>Van der Hulst v. United States</i>	373
Immunity — Locally recruited employee — Action for wrongful dismissal — Whether sending State entitled to immunity — Status of embassy premises — Whether part of the territory of receiving State — The Netherlands, Sub-District Court of The Hague	
<i>MK v. Republic of Turkey</i>	350
Interference with performance of diplomatic functions — Declaration by court of receiving State that sending State bankrupt — Whether affecting sending State's ability to perform diplomatic functions — The Netherlands, Court of Appeal of The Hague	
<i>Republic of Zaire v. Duclaux</i>	368
Protection of embassy premises — Occupation of Surinamese Embassy in the Hague by protesters — Duty of receiving State to protect embassy — Court not entitled to question decision of Executive to allow Suriname to open embassy — The Netherlands, Court of Appeal of The Hague	
<i>SMHIN v. Public Prosecutor</i>	349
Protection of embassy premises and staff — Occupation of Iranian Embassy by protesters — Duty of receiving State to protect embassy — Initiation of criminal proceedings — Protester found guilty of various offences — Modification of original	



## DIGEST OF CASES

xxv

Page

sentence due to change of government in Iran — The Netherlands,  
 Court of Appeal of The Hague

*AA v. Public Prosecutor*

306

**Economics, Trade and Finance**

Economic sanctions — United States International Emergency  
 Economic Powers Act — Regulations applying economic sanctions  
 against Libya — Regulations limiting Libyan Government's  
 access to municipal courts — United States District Court  
 (District of Delaware)

*National Oil Corporation v. Libyan Sun Oil Company*

209

Nationalized banks — Banks owning controlling interest in  
 corporation — Scope and nature of financial obligations to  
 corporation — The Netherlands, District Court of Rotterdam

*Republic of Portugal v. Algemene Oliehandel International*

315

**Environment**

Marine pollution — Ballasting — Charge against captain of  
 foreign ship for failing to keep records — Whether ship in  
 Canadian waters — Whether operation requiring entry in  
 records occurred in Canadian waters — Whether Montreal  
 harbour in Canadian waters — Jurisdiction of coastal State —  
 Canada Shipping Act 1970, Section 755 — Oil Pollution  
 Prevention Regulations 1971, Section 31(1) — Canada, Quebec  
 Superior Court (Criminal Jurisdiction)

*Regina v. Mallios*

231

**Expropriation**

Compensation — Property expropriated in East Germany  
 during Soviet occupation, 1945-49 — Measure of compensation  
 required by Basic Law of Federal Republic of Germany —  
 Whether restitution required — Whether full compensation  
 equivalent to restitution required — Criteria for determining  
 appropriate level of compensation — Relevance of overall  
 financial obligations of the Federal Republic — Relevance of fact  
 that most property for which restitution being sought now  
 publicly owned — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal  
 Constitutional Court (*BVerfG*)

*Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR  
 1170, 1174, 1175/90)*

42

**Expropriation** (*cont.*)

Debt — *Situs* of debt — Obligation by German Democratic Republic to pay annuity to descendants of former sovereign — Whether obligation sited in the German Democratic Republic — United States District Court (Eastern District, New York) and Court of Appeals (Second Circuit)

*Federal Republic of Germany and Others v. Ellicofon; Kunstsammlungen zu Weimar and Others v. Ellicofon*

133

Extraterritorial effect — Expropriation without compensation carried out by foreign State — Recognition of effectiveness in forum State — Limitation to property within expropriating State — Territoriality principle — Public policy exception — Scope of exception — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court (*BVerfG*)

*Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90)*

42

**Extradition**

General principles — Whether State under a duty to extradite in the absence of an extradition treaty — Anti-terrorist conventions — Montreal Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Civil Aviation, 1971 — Extradition provisions — Whether creating duty to extradite — Whether State required to extradite own nationals — International Court of Justice

*Case Concerning Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United Kingdom)*

478

**Governments**

Recognition of governments — Overthrow of Government of Somalia — International conference nominates provisional president — Interim government — Whether legitimate successor government — Whether entitled to State property — Money paid into court — Interim government instructs solicitors to obtain payment out — Whether solicitors having authority to act on behalf of Republic of Somalia — England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division

*Republic of Somalia v. Woodhouse Drake and Carey (Suisse) SA and Others*

608

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

Page

**Human Rights**

- Arrest and detention — Banishment — Freedom of movement — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  
*Mpaka-Nsusu v. Zaire (Communication No 157/1983)* 411
- Arrest and detention — Conditions of detention — Trial of civilian by military court — *Habeas corpus* — Fair hearing — Equality of arms — Examination of witnesses — Ill-treatment of detainees — Delay in proceedings — Amnesty — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  
*Solórzano v. Venezuela (Communication No 156/1983)* 400
- Arrest and detention — *Habeas corpus* — Rights of aliens — Access to counsel — Expulsion — Exhaustion of domestic remedies — Application of remedies unreasonably prolonged — National security — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  
*Hammel v. Madagascar (Communication No 155/1983)* 415
- Arrest and detention — Right to life — Torture and ill-treatment — Arbitrary execution — Political opposition — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  
*Baboeram-Adhin and Others v. Suriname (Communication Nos 146/1983 and 148-54/1983)* 377
- Arrest and detention — Search of homes — Disappeared persons — Right to life — Summary or arbitrary executions — Torture and ill-treatment — Parliamentary forces — Responsibility of States — Security of persons — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  
*Herrera Rubio v. Colombia (Communication No 161/1983)* 432
- Discrimination — Access to public service — Affirmative action for victims of human rights violations under earlier regime — Whether discrimination against other applicants — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee  
*Stalla Costa v. Uruguay (Communication No 198/1985)* 427

	<i>Page</i>
<b>Human Rights</b> ( <i>cont.</i> )	
Freedom of association — Constitutional protection — Provincial statutes prohibiting lockouts and strikes in public service and providing for compulsory arbitration — Whether amounting to denial of freedom of association — Whether limits reasonably and demonstrably justified in a free and democratic society — ILO Convention (No 87) Concerning Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize, 1948 — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966, Article 22 — International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966, Article 8 — Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948 — Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms 1982 — Canada, Supreme Court <i>Reference re Public Service Employee Relations Act, Labour Relations Act and Police Officers Collective Bargaining Act</i>	246
Freedom of conscience — Military service — Alternative civilian service — Conscientious objection — Fair hearing — Written procedure — Imprisonment — Compensation for unjust detention — Equity — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee <i>Muhonen v. Finland (Communication No 89/1981)</i>	388
Freedom of conscience — Military service — Alternative civilian service — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee <i>LTK v. Finland (Communication No 185/1984)</i>	396
Military service — Conscientious objection — Review of conviction and sentence — Right to appeal — Discrimination — Distinction between military and civilian regimes — International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — United Nations Human Rights Committee <i>MJG v. Netherlands (Communication No 267/1987)</i>	443
Procedure for enforcement — Fundamental rights under Basic Law of Federal Republic of Germany — Property rights — German reunification — Agreement to exclude restitution of property expropriated during Soviet occupation of East Germany, 1945-49 — Whether violating fundamental rights under the Basic Law — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court ( <i>BVerfG</i> ) <i>Unification Treaty Constitutionality Case (Merits) (Case Nos 1 BvR 1170, 1174, 1175/90)</i>	42
Procedure for enforcement — Fundamental rights under Basic Law of Federal Republic of Germany, Article 3(1) — Equality of	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-47291-3 - International Law Reports: Volume 94

Edited by E. Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxix

Page

treatment — Prosecution for espionage of head of intelligence of former German Democratic Republic following German reunification — Whether prosecution violating principle of equality — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Supreme Court (*BGH*)

*Espionage Prosecution Case (Case No 2 BGs 38/91)*

68

**International Court of Justice**

Provisional measures of protection — Grounds for indication of provisional measures — Requirement that Court's jurisdiction be established *prima facie* — Protection of the rights claimed by the Applicant — Whether rights illusory — Whether measures may be indicated solely to prevent extension or aggravation of dispute — Indication of provisional measures by Court *proprio motu* — Relationship between Court and Security Council — Matter before both Court and Security Council — Duties of both organs — Security Council adopting binding resolution in respect of matter pending before Court — Whether Court possessing powers of judicial review — Whether resolution to be presumed valid at provisional measures stage — Procedure — Court conducting hearings on request for provisional measures — Security Council adopting binding resolution after close of hearings but before Court rules on request — International Court of Justice

*Case Concerning Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United Kingdom)*

478

Provisional measures of protection — Whether Court must satisfy itself that it has jurisdiction on the merits before indicating provisional measures — Nature of interlocutory proceedings — Role of Court — Purpose of provisional measures — Preservation of rights pending decision on the merits — Whether necessary for Party requesting provisional measures to establish *prima facie* case that rights in question exist — Protection of disputed rights — Whether Party requesting provisional measures should give cross-undertaking to compensate if other Party successful on the merits — Relevance of remedies which might be granted on the merits — Whether relevant that Party resisting request for provisional measures contends that restitution would not be an appropriate remedy — International Court of Justice

*Case Concerning Passage through the Great Belt (Finland v. Denmark)*

446

## International Organizations

Immunity — Jurisdictional immunity — Nature and scope — Rationale for granting of immunity to international organizations — Absence of headquarters agreement with host State — Whether organization entitled to immunity under customary international law — Whether host State having power to confer immunity — Distinction between State immunity and immunity of international organizations — Immunity of international organizations limited to acts and relationships connected with essential functions of the organization — Employment relationships — Criteria for determining which employment relationships covered by jurisdictional immunity — Employee performing duties essential to tasks of international organization — Iran-United States Claims Tribunal — Interpreter — Whether performing essential task for Tribunal — The Netherlands, Local and District Court of The Hague and Supreme Court

*Iran-United States Claims Tribunal v. AS*

321

Immunity — Jurisdictional immunity — Nature and scope — Treaty establishing international organization — No provision for immunity from jurisdiction — Whether organization entitled to immunity under customary international law — Whether right to immunity derived from transfer of sovereignty from Member States — Immunity limited to acts performed in exercise of public functions of organization — Contract of employment — Criteria for determining whether termination of employment covered by jurisdictional immunity — Staff regulations — Validity of staff regulations restricting jurisdiction of national courts — The Netherlands, District Court of Maastricht

*Eckhardt v. European Organization for the Safety of Air Navigation (Eurocontrol) (No 2)*

331

Immunity — Officials — European Patent Organization — Officials who are also nationals of host State — Entitlement to immunity from domestic taxation — Protocol on the Privileges and Immunities of the European Patent Organization, 1973, Article 16 — Whether conflicting with provisions of domestic tax law of host State — The Netherlands, Supreme Court

*European Patent Office Taxation Case*

318

Immunity — Officials — International Court of Justice — Agreement between International Court of Justice and the Netherlands, 1946 — Agreement conferring diplomatic status on Deputy Registrar of Court — Tenancy agreement — Action for eviction against Deputy Registrar for breach of agreement —