

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

## Index

- acceptance, principle of, 290, 304, 309  
    statement of, 376
- accomplishment, 19, 23, 24, 41, 52, 53,  
    54–55, 58, 59–61, 63. *See also* success
- actual desire, 48–49, 56
- actual preference, 58–59
- actual value, 135
- adaptation
- and just allocation, 158–59
  - sensory, 131–32, 136–38
  - underestimation of, 143–45
  - and welfare policy, 145–47
- adaptation level, 131, 138
- adequacy, test of, 41
- adult-equivalence scale, 13
- applications, 164–65
  - and interhousehold comparisons of utility, 173–78
- adult-equivalent index, 178
- age, and allocation of medical resources, 118–19
- aggregate wealth criterion, 202
- aggregation theorem (Harsanyi), 14,  
    255–315 *passim*, 314
- with continuous orderings, 277
  - Fishburn's restatement of, 266
  - with independent prospects condition, 272–73
  - with nonlinear social welfare functions, 282–89
  - with semistrong Pareto condition, 273–74
  - with strong Pareto condition, 274–76
  - variants of, 264–82
  - weighting in, 294
- Weymark's statement of, 277
- alienation, 7
- allocation of goods
- mechanisms of, 101–6
  - practical considerations, 107–9
- alternative. *See* social alternative
- Amemiya, T., 217
- Anderson, E.A., 139
- Angell, M., 121n
- anonymous function, 354
- anti-paternalism, 350–53
- weak, 258–62
- antisocial preference, 27, 28
- Archibald, G.C., 206
- Argyle, M., 141
- Arrow, K.J., 31, 43, 46, 52n, 77n, 130,  
    202, 207, 213, 215–17, 221–23, 227,  
    228, 264n, 276n, 281n, 313n, 331n,  
    341n, 377–78. *See also* impossibility theorem (Arrow)
- aspiration level, 8
- assimilation effect, 139
- Atkinson, A.B., 174n, 226
- attainable utility vector, 275
- attitude, 61
- auction, 105, 149
- Aumann, R.J., 202, 203, 382
- autonomous good, 87–90
- autonomous self, 46–47
- autonomy, 7, 68
- axiological significance, 87–91
- Ayer, A.J., 204–5, 211–12
- backward-looking comparison, 109,  
    111–14
- bad luck, 124–25, 126
- bare preference, 217
- bargaining, 108
- bargaining theory, 3–4, 203
- Bar-Hillel, M., 98n, 155, 227
- Barone, E., 202, 205
- Barry, B., 213
- Barten, A.P., 173n, 177n
- Barten scale. *See* Barten's model of commodity-specific scales

## 388 INDEX

- Barten's model of commodity-specific scales, 165, 174, 176–78, 181, 182–83  
advantages, 193  
comparison to ESE, 186–93  
Gorman's generalization of, 177, 186,  
188, 193, 194–95  
and isomorphy, 222  
welfare-economic applications, 185–93
- Bartleby the Scrivener* (Melville), 37n  
basic preference, 45, 53–55, 65  
Basu, K., 302n  
Baum, A., 137  
Baum, C.S., 137  
Beach, C.M., 173n  
Becker, G.M., 217  
Becker, G.S., 223  
behaviorist approach  
to interpersonal comparisons, 214–26  
to preference ordering, 305  
Bentham, J., 127, 128  
Bergson, A., 205, 226, 276n  
Berlyne, D.E., 145  
Bernoulli, D., 127, 157  
best possible set of tastes and attitudes,  
61  
betterness, order of, 74  
betterness relation, 72–74  
dated, 79–82  
Bezembinder, T., 256n  
binary interest rule, 361, 368–69  
Blackburn, S., on widening sensibility,  
61–62  
Blackorby, C., 13, 164, 165, 170n, 173n,  
175, 179, 184, 190n, 214, 222, 235,  
282n, 300n, 303n, 322, 337n  
Blum, A., 104n  
bonus, 147  
Border, K., 266n  
Bossert, W., 170n, 172n, 302n  
Bourguignon, F., 174n  
Bovens, L., 203  
Brandt, R.B., 26n, 49  
Brickman, P., 140, 143, 146  
Brock, H.W., 202  
Broome, J., 13, 15, 38n, 71–73, 80n, 224,  
298n, 347n  
Browning, M., 165, 168, 173n, 177,  
179n, 187, 188n  
Bulman, R.J., 140
- Cahn, E., 101n  
Campbell, A., 141  
Campbell, D.T., 141, 143, 146  
Canadian Senate, 173n
- capability, basic, 9, 41, 144  
Card, D.E., 173n  
cardinal full comparability (CFC), 171,  
172, 173  
cardinally measurable and fully comparable, 302, 312  
cardinally measurable and level comparable, 303  
cardinally measurable and noncomparable, 302  
cardinally measurable and unit comparable, 302  
cardinal noncomparability (CNC), 170  
cardinal unit plus comparability, 303–4,  
308  
Catch-22 effects, 108  
changing places, 227  
characteristic, 355–56, 374  
definition, 343  
Gorman–Lancaster, 221–22  
source of, 372  
children, allocation of, 105  
Childress, J.F., 108n, 119n  
Chipman, J.S., 202, 205  
choice. *See also* impersonal choice utilitarianism; probabilistic choice models  
cost of, 140  
and utility, 77n  
utility theory of, 46n  
Choisel, F., 104n  
Coates, D., 141  
Cobb–Douglas case of ESE, 182–83  
Cobb–Douglas function, as welfare function, 286  
coding, of experience, 138–41, 143–46  
Cohen, G.A., 9n, 100n, 210  
Cohen, S.J., 139  
coherent relation, 72  
coincidence axiom, 328, 329, 330  
college. *See* educational institution  
comfort, versus pleasure, 5, 145–46  
commodity-independent equivalence scale, 165, 175–76  
commodity-specific equivalence scale, 165, 176–78  
and equivalence-scale exactness, 178–80  
compassion, 120, 121, 123  
complaints, 34, 108  
Confucius, 221  
congruent utility function, 300  
consciousness  
agreeable states of, 23  
state of, 41

- consequentialism, 201, 206, 259n  
 consumer sovereignty argument, 132  
 consumer sovereignty value judgment, 225  
 consumer's-surplus test, 164  
 contentment, 32  
 context effect, 139  
 continuity axiom, 328  
     generalized, 329  
     statement, 260  
 contrast effect, 137, 146  
 contribution, and distribution, 103  
 conversion ratio, 379–80  
     choice of, 372–73  
 cooperative game for distribution, 202–3  
 Cooter, R.D., 205, 321  
 Copeland, J.G., 120n  
 corresponding function, 344–45  
 cost scaling model, generalized, 187–88  
 Coulhon, T., 266n, 272n  
 counterfactual alternative, 139  
 Cramer, G., 127  
 crazy desire, 49–50  
 Crosby, F., 142
- Dahl, R.A., 217  
 Dasgupta, P.S., 231  
 d'Aspremont, C., 13, 14, 170n, 171n, 203, 235, 300n, 337n, 385  
 Davidson, D., 35, 36–37, 38, 51, 52n, 57, 58, 67  
 Deaton, A.S., 168, 173n, 176n, 223  
 de Bohigas, N., 104n, 111n  
 Debreu, G., 262n  
 decision-making, costs of, 107  
 de Finetti, B., 382  
 DeGroot, M.H., 217  
 demobilization of military personnel, 104, 109–10, 111, 114, 123  
 deprivation, 142  
 derived preference, 54  
 Dermer, M., 139  
 Deschamps, R., 298n  
 desire. *See also* actual desire; crazy desire; improved desire; rational desire  
     relation to value, 45  
     strength of, 55–56, 58–59, 65  
     and understanding, 59–67  
 desire-satisfaction, 5–9, 299. *See also* preference-satisfaction  
 Diamond, P.A., 215, 297, 298n  
 dictatorial function, 340, 357–58, 365, 366, 368  
 dictatorship, 226, 235, 322. *See also* inter-  
     est dictatorship; judgment dictatorship;  
     positional dictatorship  
 Diener, E., 141  
 Diewert, W.E., 175n  
 difference principle, 210, 212  
 dissatisfaction, degree of, 34–38  
 distribution, versus redistribution, 154–57  
 distribution principle. *See also* utilitarian principle of distribution  
     types of, 101–6  
 distribution schedule, 147  
 distributive justice, 2, 5, 100n, 322, 371  
     effect of limited information on concept of, 379–83  
 distributive principle, 92n  
 disuniting metaphysics, 15  
     and principle of temporal good, 84–91  
     and utilitarianism, 70n, 71, 91–95  
 divine justice, 4  
 Dobb, M., 206  
 Domotor, Z., 266n, 273n, 274n  
 Donaldson, D., 13, 164, 165, 170n, 171, 173n, 179, 184, 190n, 214, 222, 235, 282n, 300n, 303n, 322, 337n  
 dual comparison, 211  
 dual entitlement, 153  
 Duesenberry, J.S., 140  
 Duncan, O., 141  
 Dworkin, G., 231  
 Dworkin, R., 8, 99n, 126, 210, 322
- Easterlin, R.A., 141  
 Eavey, C., 134n, 155  
 economies of scale in household, 173–74  
 Edgeworth, F.Y., 216, 230  
 educational institution, admissions policy, 104–5, 107, 112–13  
 Edwards, W., 217  
 effective demand, and distribution, 103  
 efficiency. *See also* productivity  
     and allocation of resources, 117, 119–25  
 egalitarianism, 8, 99, 100, 209  
 Elster, J., 7n, 9n, 13, 101n, 105n, 107n, 112n, 121n, 133, 134n, 145n, 348n  
 empathy, 11–12, 308, 321  
 empirical comparison, 66–67  
 endowment, 139n  
 endowment effect, 150–52  
 end-state comparison, 9  
 energy, allocation of, 105  
 Engel equivalence exactness, 180–83  
 enjoyment. *See* pleasure  
 entitlement, 112  
     dual, 153

## 390 INDEX

- envy, 2, 27  
 Epstein, S., 137  
 equal-income Lindahl equilibrium, 186  
 equality, 84, 338n  
     absolute, distribution principle of, 101  
 equal treatment, 314  
 equal utility units, 314  
 equity axiom, 209  
 equivalence-scale exactness (ESE), 165,  
     178–80  
     advantages, 194  
     comparison to Barten's model, 186–93  
     and income-ratio comparability, 183–85  
     special cases, 180–83  
     welfare-economic applications, 186–93  
 ESE. *See* equivalence-scale exactness  
 ethical preference, 296–97  
 ethics  
     and allocation of resources, 200–1  
     and interpersonal comparisons of utility, 17–44, 226–34  
 evil person, 4  
 excessively demanding, 34–35  
 exchangeable probability distribution, 382  
 expectational utility function, 73  
 expected utility axioms, 264, 305, 312  
     appropriateness of, 297  
     statement of, 260–61  
 expected utility theorem, 263–64, 306  
 expected utility theory, 72, 257–64  
 experience. *See also* hedonic concept; local expertise  
     coding of, 138–41, 143–46  
     intensity of, and contrast, 137, 146  
     maximization of, 131–32  
     as morally significant unit, 94–95  
     and personal hypotheses, 12  
 experience theory of good, 84n  
 experience utility, 128, 135, 136–47, 158  
     and adaptation, 136–38  
     distinguished from preference utility, 131–32  
 experiential concept of good. *See* hedonic concept  
 experientialism, 20, 32. *See also* hedonic concept  
 experiential state, 3–4  
 extended preference, 55, 289, 305  
 extended social alternative, 289, 374–75  
 extended sympathy, 31, 227, 373  
 extended utility function, 54–55  
 facial expression, 139  
 fact of the matter, 10–11, 12  
 fairness  
     justice as, 377–78  
     of transactions, 152–54  
 faithful spouse problem, 7–8  
 family size, 219, 223  
 Fehr, B., 139  
 Feinberg, J., 6n  
 fetishist handicap, 9  
 finite chain, 333–35  
 Fishburn, P.C., 74n, 266n, 272n, 273n,  
     274n, 306n, 377  
 Fisher, F.M., 169, 186, 188, 202, 223  
 Fisher, I., 205  
 Flatters, F., 173n  
 Flaubert, G., 11  
 Fleming, M., 256n  
 Foley, D., 322  
 Føllesdal, D., 10n  
 Fool-state, 53, 54–55, 58, 65–66  
 form of life, 51  
 forward-looking comparison, 110, 111–14  
 frame of reference, 138  
 framing effect, 151  
 Frank, R.H., 130, 140  
 Freeman, R., 113n  
 Friedman, M., 215  
 friendship, 19, 22–23, 24, 63  
 Frohlich, N., 134n, 155  
 Fuerst, J.S., 105n  
 full homotheticity, 180, 181–83, 184,  
     189–93, 195–96  
 fundamentalism, a priori and empirical,  
     378  
 fundamental preference, 211–14, 236,  
     374, 384  
     and isomorphy, 221–24  
 fundamental utilitarian theorem, statement  
     and axioms of, 375–77  
 gain, and fairness, 152–54  
 general betterness relation theorem, 74  
 Georgian land lottery, 103  
 Gérard-Varet, L.A., 13, 14, 385  
 Gevers, L., 171n, 298n, 337n, 354n  
 Gibbard, A., 2n, 7, 8, 12, 23n, 33, 36,  
     224, 323n, 364  
 Gilbert, H., 101n  
 Glass, D.C., 137  
 global consideration, 107  
 global ordering of person–state pairs, 12,  
     327–30  
 Goldstick, D., 202  
 good life, experientialist view, 22  
 good-life judgment, 18–19  
 Goodman, L.A., 216

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX 391

- good(s). *See also* autonomous good; income; personal good; primary goods; social goods; temporal good; wealth  
 allocation mechanisms and criteria, 101–6  
 definition, 70, 71  
 interpersonal weighing of, 71–79  
 intertemporal weighing of, 79–82  
 natural metric of, 82  
 of person, supervenience of, 86–87  
 quantity of, and utility, 74–79
- Gordon, S., 213  
 Gorman, W.M., 173n, 177, 221  
 Griffin, D., 139n, 146, 147  
 Griffin, J., 9, 53n, 54n, 57n, 61n, 63n, 68n, 224, 237  
 Grunau, R., 168  
 Gschneidinger, E., 139  
 Guess, R., 7n  
 Guttman, L., 219
- habituation. *See* adaptation  
 Hagenaars, A.J.M., 218  
 Hammond, P.J., 13, 74n, 114n, 201, 202, 203, 206, 209, 211, 230, 282n, 305n, 312n, 337n, 339n  
 handicapped individual, 9, 12, 142, 144  
 happiness, 8, 17, 24, 47–48, 128, 129, 139, 142, 144, 299  
 greatest (Hutcheson), 230  
 Parducci's theory of, 146–47  
 happy slave problem, 6, 8  
 Harberger, A.C., 202  
 Hare, R.M., 52n, 54n, 212  
 Harrod, R.F., 206  
 Harsanyi, J.C., 13–15, 24–44 *passim*; 52n, 54–56, 73n, 74n, 201, 208, 212–13, 215, 227, 224–27, 229, 255–316 *passim*; 307–8, 314, 371–88 *passim*. *See also* aggregation theorem (Harsanyi); impartial observer theorem (Harsanyi); impersonal choice utilitarianism (Harsanyi)  
 Harvard College, admission policies, 112–13  
 Havighurst, C.M., 101n  
 heart transplantation, candidate selection, 120–21, 122  
 hedonic concept, 5, 127–28  
 rejection of, 22–30  
 hedonic experience, 158  
 hedonic treadmill, 141–43  
 hedonism, 20  
 Helson, H., 138, 143
- Herstein, I.N., 213, 260n  
 heteronomous self, 46  
 Higgins, E.T., 139  
 Hildreth, C., 202  
 Hirschleifer, J., 6n  
 household. *See also* interhousehold comparisons of utility  
 model of, 166–69  
 reference, 175  
 household equivalence scale, and isomorphy, 222  
 household tasks, allocation of, 106  
 human existence, components of, 63  
 human nature, components of, 45  
 Hume, D., 46, 60, 61, 220, 226  
 Hume's law, 220, 226, 236  
 Hurley, S., 35n  
 Hutcheson, F., 230  
 Hylland, A., 12, 110n, 340n, 341n, 348n, 362  
 hyperplane, 260n
- ICU. *See* interpersonal comparisons of utility  
 ICUD. *See* interpersonal comparisons of utility differences (ICUD)  
 ICUL. *See* interpersonal comparisons of utility level (ICUL)  
 identity axiom, 208  
 immigration policies, 234  
 impartiality, 289, 291, 297, 371. *See also* observer  
 impartial observer theorem (Harsanyi), 255–315 *passim*. *See also* observer implicit assumption in, 308–16  
 statement of, 293  
 impartial observer theorem (Weymark), 311–12, 313  
 imperiousness, 37–38  
 impersonal choice utilitarianism (Harsanyi), 212, 371–85  
 fundamental theory of, 373–79  
 impersonality concept, 211–14  
 impersonal preference, 236  
 imposing a bad, 145n  
 impossibility theorem (Arrow), 13, 206–7, 228, 235, 282n, 323n, 338, 340, 348  
 improved desire, 57, 58  
 improvement, 61–63  
 incentive, 14, 112  
 incentive-compatible procedure, 203  
 incentive constraint, 380  
 incentive effect, 107

## 392 INDEX

- income, individual welfare function of, 142–43, 219, 233–34
- income-ratio comparability (IRC), 183–85, 189, 194
- income satisfaction, 142–43
- increment in welfare criterion, 115–21
- independence assumption, 381
- independence axiom, 260, 297
- independence of irrelevant alternatives, 348, 349–50
- independent prospects, 272–82
- index of well-being, 41–42, 44
- indifference, 326n
- indifference relation, 259
- individual preference, 265, 305
- individual welfare, and distribution, 102
- individual welfare function of income. *See also* income
- inequality, 84
- information
  - asymmetric, 15
  - limited, and utilitarianism, 371–85
  - informationally equivalent utility functions, 300
- information-equivalence class, 170–73
- information set, and assumptions about ordering, 300–3
- institution, allocative behavior of, 98–126
- intelligibility, 51, 57–58. *See also* understanding
- intensive care unit, admission criteria, 115
- intention, 90
- interest dictatorship, 359, 368
- interests, 339, 342, 345–47, 357
  - concept of, 58n
- interhousehold comparisons of utility
  - and adult-equivalence scales, 173–78
  - and social evaluation, 169–73
  - using Barten's model, 185–86
  - using ESE, 183–84
- interpersonal comparisons of the individual, subjective, 339
- interpersonal comparisons of utility, 200–1
  - behaviorist approach, 214–26
  - elements required for, 65
  - and ethical decisions, 226–34
  - forms of, 207–11
  - Harsanyi on, 307–8
  - and local justice, 106–14
  - reluctance to use, 204–7
  - research applications, 202–3
  - revealed by preferences, 228–30
  - and taste model, 52–56
- interpersonal comparisons of utility differences (ICUD), 210–11, 213, 214
- interpersonal comparisons of utility level (ICUL), 211, 213, 214
- interpersonal comparisons of welfare, and allocation processes by institutions, 114–26
- interpersonal comparisons of well-being
  - approaches to, 10–15
  - evaluative purposes of, 4–5
  - moral basis of, 17–44
  - and positive theory, 2–4
  - preference-satisfaction approach, 30–38
- intertemporal weighing of good, 79–82
- intransitivity, 329, 331
- intrapersonal comparison
  - and interpersonal comparison, 324–25
  - of utility, 11n, 224–26
- Intriligator, M., 217
- intrinsic reward, 12
- introspection, 23n
- intuition, 11–12
  - about distribution and redistribution, 155–56
  - shortcomings of, 143–45
- invidious comparison, 2
- Isbell, J.R., 215, 216
- isomorphy, 221–24
- Ittleson, W.H., 143
- Jacobsen, E., 139
- Jakobovits, I., 101n
- Janoff-Bulman, R., 141
- Jeffrey, R.C., 215, 216, 224
- Jevons, W.S., 135, 205
- Jewish ethics, 101
- job, allocation of, 105
- Jorgenson, D., 168, 173n, 191
- judge's preference, 52–56
- judgment. *See also* subjective judgment
  - of fairness, 152–54
  - interpersonal, and local expertise model, 321–31
  - of relative well-being, 17, 18–20, 23n
- judgment dictatorship, 357–60, 368
- jump, 335
- just allocation problem, modes of framing consequences, 154–57
- justice. *See also* distributive justice; local justice
  - as fairness, 377–78

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX 393

- global theories, 99–100
- just noticeable difference, 216–17
- Kahneman, D., 2, 4, 5, 6, 11, 128–57  
*passim*
- Kalai, E., 4, 203
- Kaldor–Hicks compensation principle, 201–2
- Kamm, F.M., 120n
- Kaneko, M., 216, 227
- Kant, I., 46–47, 384
- Kapteyn, A., 143, 218, 220
- Karellis, C., 117n
- Keeney, R.L., 203
- Kelly, J.S., 203, 348n
- Kemp, M.C., 226
- Kennedy School of Government, admission policies, 112–13
- Keren, G., 149
- kidney transplantation, candidate selection, 121–25, 126
- Kindleberger, C.P., 218
- King, M.A., 173n
- King, N.M., 101n
- Kirkwood, C.W., 203
- Kjellstrand, M., 122n, 123n
- Klitgaard, R., 112n
- Knesper, D.J., 115n
- Knetsch, J.L., 150, 151n, 152, 153
- knowledge, 117–18
- Kohn, I., 138
- Kolm, S.-C., 221, 322
- Kurz, M., 202
- Kwong, S., 173n, 191
- labor unions, 113
- Laffont, J.-J., 260n
- $\lambda$ -utilitarian outcome function, 380
- Lancaster, K.J., 221
- language, 51–52
- Larson, E.B., 101n
- lattice, interpersonal comparability on, 327–30
- Lawler, E.E., III, 147
- Layard, P.R.G., 46n
- Lazarus, R.S., 137
- Leibniz, G.W., 5, 116
- leisure, 19
- Lerner, A.P., 225
- level of utility, comparisons of, 207–10.  
*See also* interpersonal comparisons of utility level
- with adult-equivalence scales, 165, 169–73
- level of welfare criterion, 115–21
- Levy, S., 219
- Lewbel, A., 165, 173n, 179n, 188n, 192n
- Lewis, D., 70n, 86n, 89n
- leximin rule, 209
- Leyden approach, 218–19
- litigation, influence of, 108
- local comparison, 12
- local expertise, 323–25
- local expertise model, 326–27
- local expertise theorem, 328, 330
- local justice
  - concept of, 100–106
  - and interpersonal comparison of utility, 106–14
- Locke, J., 5
- Loewenstein, G., 135
- logical positivism, 2–4, 204–5
- Loomes, G., 130
- Los Angeles County-USC Hospital Intensive Care Unit, admission criteria, 115
- loss, and fairness, 152–54
- loss aversion, 147–58
  - and avoidance of risk, 148–50
  - and effect of ownership on value, 150–52
- lottery, 101, 103, 107, 109
  - compound, 259
  - to determine ICUDs, 213
  - in expected utility theory, 256, 257–60, 280n, 299
  - extended, 289
  - happiness of winners, 141–42
  - impartial, 292
  - original position, 375, 378
  - simple, 259, 374–75
- Luce, R.D., 3n, 216, 217, 257n, 306n
- Lurie, L., 139
- Lyons, D., 213
- McClelland, G., 155
- McFarland, C., 140
- Machina, M., 257n
- MacKay, A.F., 221
- McKennell, A.C., 219
- Magee, B., 204, 205, 212
- malice, 27
- Malinraud, E., 260n
- malleability, 28–30, 38, 43
- manic-depressive, 11
- manifest preference, 28–29, 42
- March, J.G., 133

## 394 INDEX

- marginal rates of substitution, utility ratios as, 232–34
- marginal utility, and distribution, 115–17
- market, distribution principle of, 103
- Markovitz, H., 216
- Marschak, J., 217, 260n
- Marx, K., on theory of justice, 125
- Marxism, 7, 100
- Maskin, E., 15n
- Massachusetts, policy on transplantation, 101
- maximax rule, 354
- maximin rule, 212–13, 338, 354
- May, K., 323n
- McClenen, E.F., 298n
- mechanism design, 380
- medical resource
  - and age, 118–19
  - allocation of, 104, 110–11, 115, 155–57
- medical school admission policy, in Netherlands, 103
- Medoff, J., 113n
- memory
  - accuracy assumption, 325
  - and context effects, 139
  - and experience utility, 135, 144
  - as unifying relations, 88–90
- Menger, K., 215
- mereology, 86
- Messick, D.M., 110n
- military service. *See also* demobilization
  - of military personnel
  - selection for, 104, 111
- Mill, J.S., 127
- Miller, D.T., 140, 146
- Milnor, J., 213, 260n
- Mirrlees, J.A., 221, 222
- Mollat, G., 116n
- Mongin, P., 266n, 272n
- Moore, J.C., 202, 205
- morale, 142
- morality, 47n
- moral judgment, 18
  - by impartial observer, 289, 291
- morally significant unit, 93–95
- moral preference, 27, 40, 384
- moral value, and perception model, 47, 48
- Morgenstern, O., 260n
- motivation, 60
- Muellbauer, J., 168, 173n, 176n, 177n, 187, 222, 223
- Myerson, R.B., 203, 228, 229, 380
- Nagel, T., 50n, 94n
- natural resource, allocation of, 105
- need, and distribution, 102, 103, 108
- neighborhood of competence, 328
- Neilson, L.T., 203
- Nelson, J., 168, 173n, 177n
- Netherlands, medical school admission policy, 103, 109
- neutral adaptation level, 147–48
- neutrality, 30, 38, 39–40, 44, 68
  - of OIC-function, 355
- neutral point, 146
- neutral subjective experience, 136
- news value, 135
- new welfare economics, 206–7
- Ng, Y.-K., 216, 226
- NMUU. *See* Neumann–Morgenstern utility function (NMUF)
- nonlevelness assumption, 382–83
- norm (of experience), 138, 140
- norm, and just distribution, 154–55
- 0-normalization assumption, 382, 383
- normative decision theory, 201
- Nozick, R., 99, 154, 202
- Nunan, R., 298n, 299n
- nursery school, admission policy, 104
- nursing home, admission policy, 104
- objective causal variables, 308
- objective concept of well-being, 9–10
- objective interpersonal comparison. *See*
  - social choice function for objective interpersonal comparison
- objective measures, 9–10, 388
- objectivist view of utility, 127, 129–31
- observer, 227–28, 235, 236. *See also* empathy; extended sympathy; impersonal choice utilitarianism (Harsanyi)
  - in Harsanyi's models, 291
  - impartial, 255–56
  - risk-averse, 311
- OIC-function. *See* social choice function for objective interpersonal comparison
- Okun, A., 153
- Olmstead, A., 105n
- Opelz, G., 108n, 122n
- Oppenheimer, J., 134n, 155
- ordering axiom, 260
- ordinal full comparability (OFC), 170, 171, 172, 173
- ordinally measurable and fully comparable, 301

- ordinally measurable and noncomparable, 301  
 ordinal noncomparability (ONC), 170  
 Oregon, moratorium on transplantation, 101  
 original position, 212, 213, 228, 371–72, 378  
 original position lottery, 375, 378  
 Ortúñoz-Ortín, I., 12, 225  
 outcome function, 380–82  
 output-maximizing criterion, 117, 119–21  
 Overlaet, B., 227  
 Ovid-Tacitus example, 61–62
- Page, A.N., 128n  
 Pagnucco, D.J., 115n  
 Pantaleoni, M., 205  
 Parducci, A., 139n, 146  
 Pareto, V., 202, 205  
 Pareto indifference, 265–71, 293  
 Pareto optimality, 348  
   strong, 349–50  
   weak, 349  
 Pareto optimal outcome function, 381  
 Pareto principle (Harsanyi), 15  
 Parfit, D., 15, 82n, 85, 88–91, 93–94  
 past. *See also* memory  
   and fact of the matter, 11  
 paternalism, 350–53  
   rejection of, 27  
 paternalistic judgment, 339, 350  
 Pattanaik, P.K., 311  
 Pazner, E.A., 203  
 perception model, 45–46  
 personal experience. *See* experience; local expertise  
 personal good, principle of, 15, 80, 81, 85  
 statement of, 73  
 preference. *See also* actual preference;  
   antisocial preference; bare preference; basic preference; derived preference; ethical preference; extended preference; fundamental preference; impersonal preference; individual preference; manifest preference; moral preference; personal preference; risk-averse preference; subjective preference; true preference  
 change over time, 26n  
 in household-behavior model, 169  
 judge's, 52–56  
 relation to utility, 299–300  
 strength of, 33, 36–37  
 in taste and preference models, 45  
   and value or desire, 25–26  
 preference autonomy, 7, 24–38, 43  
 preference intensity, 210  
   measures of, 215–18  
 preference priority, 209  
 preference relation, 299. *See also* social preference relation  
   extended, 289  
   in Harsanyi's theorems, 260–61  
   of impartial observer, 292  
   individual, 265  
   rational, 72  
   strict, 259  
   weak, 259  
 preference-satisfaction, 8, 17, 24–44, 71.  
   *See also* desire-satisfaction; good(s)  
 preference utilitarianism (Harsanyi), 24–38  
 preference utility, 128, 135  
   distinguished from experience utility, 131–32  
 pre-filter, 343–45, 356–57  
 Prescott, J.R., 105n  
 pricing decision, 152–54  
 primary goods, index of, 8–10, 15, 39, 41, 372  
 Primont, D., 175n  
 private, distinguished from public, 40  
 probabilistic choice models, 217  
 process value judgment, 19–20  
 procreation rights, allocation of, 106  
 productivity. *See also* social welfare  
   and distribution, 102, 103  
 professional school. *See* educational institution; medical school  
 profile, 264–65  
 Proshansky, H.M., 143  
 prospect, 15, 258  
   independent, 272–82  
   pure, 258  
 prospect theory, and risky choices, 148–50  
 proxy, observable, and interpersonal comparisons, 117–18  
 prudential deliberation, 59–69  
 prudential value, 47–48, 51–52  
   definition, 52  
   types of, 63–64  
 personal hypotheses, 12  
 personal preference, 27, 384  
 personal value, 50–51  
 personhood  
   disuniting metaphysical theory of, 84–91  
   theories of, 70n, 71

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

## 396 INDEX

- person-segment
  - and distribution, 91–95
  - psychological connection, 90–91
  - temporal, 84–91
- person-state pair
  - ordering of, 12, 324–35, 337
- Phelps, E.S., 203
- Phipps, S., 191
- Pigou, A.C., 128
- pleasure, 5, 24, 63, 64, 128, 299
  - versus comfort, 5, 145–46
- point system
  - in military, 104, 110
  - and transplant candidate selection, 103, 123–25
- Pollak, R.A., 168, 173n, 177, 222, 223, 225
- positional dictatorship, 354–55
- positive theory, 2–4, 204–5
- Posner, R.A., 202
- poverty utility level (poverty relative), 178, 191, 194
- powerful subset, 343
- practicality, test of, 41
- predicted utility, 128
  - use in interpersonal comparisons, 65–69
- psychological view of utility, 130–31
- public, distinguished from private, 40
- public housing, allocation of, 105
- publicness of commodity, degree of, 176, 185
- public opinion, influence of, 108
- quality-adjusted life years, 118n
- queuing, 102, 105, 107
- Quinn, R., 155
- Raiffa, H., 3n, 257n, 306n
- Rapoport, P., 205, 321
- rational desire, 49–50, 56, 59
- rationality condition, 129, 130, 383
- rationing, 105
- ratio-scale, 171
- ratio-scale full comparability, 172
- Rawls, J., 2, 9, 27n, 39, 47–50, 67, 70n, 99, 100, 154, 210, 212, 215, 291n, 322, 354n, 371–72, 377–78
- Ray, R., 187
- recidivism, 117–18
- redistribution, versus distribution, 154–57
- redness maximization problem, 131–32
- reductionist view, 93–94. *See also* disuniting metaphysics
- referee, 346
- reference consumption bundle, 178
- reference household, 175
- reference level, 138
- reference transaction, 153
- regret, 140
- Renal Network in the American Midwest, 122
- representation theorems, 298
- Rescher, N., 110n, 219
- resentment, 27
- Resnick, M.D., 274n
- resource channeling, 108
- Rhode, P., 105n
- right to decide, 352
- risk-averse observer, 311
- risk-averse preference, 148–50
- risk-averse utility function, 134
- risk aversion, 157. *See also* loss aversion
- risk-seeking utility function, 134
- Rivlin, L.G., 143
- Robbins, L., 200, 205, 206, 234–35
- Roberts, K.W.S., 214, 226, 235, 337n, 339n, 349n, 350n, 354n, 356n, 357n, 358n
- Robertson, J.A., 120n
- Robin Hood problem, 157–58
- Roemer, J.E., 3n, 12, 99n, 210, 225, 322, 353n
- Rohrbaugh, J., 155
- Rosner, F., 101n
- Roth, A.E., 203
- Rothenberg, J., 202, 227
- Russell, J.A., 139
- Russell, P.S., 108n
- Russell, R.R., 175n
- sadism, 6n, 27
- Samet, D., 203
- Samuelson, P.A., 221, 260n, 276n
- Sandel, M., 47n
- Sartre, J.-P., projected play by, 10
- satisfaction, 128, 139, 257, 299. *See also* desire-satisfaction; preference-satisfaction
  - degree of, 34–38
  - determinants of, 141–43
  - expressions of, and interpersonal comparisons, 34
- Satterthwaite, M.A., 364
- Savage, L.J., 215, 260n
- Scafuri, A.J., 203
- scaling factor, 182
- Scanlon, T.M., 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 29n, 237

- Schelling, T.C., 133  
 Schick, F., 216  
 Schokkaert, E., 227  
 Schultz, B., 71n  
 Schulz, N., 385  
 Schwartz, B., 102n  
 Schwartz, T., 231  
 Schwarz, N., 139  
 Scitovsky, T., 5, 143, 145, 146  
 scope, 28, 30, 38, 40  
 Seidl, C., 218, 219  
 selection function, 362–65  
 Selinger, S., 266n, 298  
 semistrong Pareto, 265, 273–74  
 Sen, A.K., 3n, 6, 9, 14, 41, 52n, 100,  
     128, 129, 130, 140, 145n, 168, 169,  
     170n, 171n, 174n, 201, 202, 206,  
     208, 209, 215, 226, 227, 228, 237,  
     256–316 *passim*, 321, 322, 337n,  
     339n, 348n, 375, 377  
 seniority, 102, 107, 108, 112, 113–14  
 sensory level, comparison of, and adaptation, 131–32, 136–38  
 sentiment. *See* attitude  
 Sentis, K., 110n  
 Shafer, W.J., 203  
 Shapley, L.S., 11n, 202  
 shared values, 51, 57–58  
 Shatin, L., 110n  
 Shefrin, H.M., 147  
 Shubik, M., 11n  
 SIC-function. *See* social choice function  
     for subjective interpersonal comparison  
 similarity postulate, 307, 308  
 Simon, J.L., 218  
 Simons, P., 86n  
 Singer, J.E., 137  
 single reference adult, 174  
 skill level, 222–23  
 slave, *See* happy slave problem  
 Slesnick, D., 168, 173n, 191  
 Smith, Adam, 227  
 Snell, J., 128, 133  
 social alternative, 324, 341, 373–74  
     certain, 257  
     extended, 289, 374–75  
     in Harsanyi's theorems (expected utility theory), 256, 257, 258, 289  
     ranking of, 30–38  
 social choice, without interpersonal comparisons of utility, 204–7  
 social choice function for objective interpersonal comparison, 342  
     conditions satisfied by, 353–57  
     dictatorial, 353–54  
     input, 347  
 social choice function for subjective interpersonal comparison, 342, 357–61  
     conditions imposed on, 348–53  
     input, 345–47  
     nondictatorial, 359–61  
 social choice theory, 14–15  
     single-profile, 264  
 social comparison, 140  
 social evaluation, and interpersonal comparisons, 169–73  
 social goods, 8–10, 15, 39, 41, 372  
 social indicators, and cardinalization of utility, 218–21  
 social justice, and preference utilitarianism, 27  
 social ordering, 300  
 social preference relation, 265  
 social state. *See* social alternative  
 social utility function, 275  
 social welfare, and allocation criteria, 110–11  
 social welfare function  
     Bergson–Samuelson, 276–82  
     nonlinear, 282–89, 295–97, 305, 306, 313  
     and utility, 235  
 social welfare functional (SWFL), 203  
 social welfare measurement, direct approach, 226–27  
 social welfare ordering, 275–82  
 social worth, and distribution, 103  
 society  
     correlation of circumstances and well-being, 141–43  
     segments of, 85–87  
     utility of persons to, 13, 230–32  
 Socrates-state, 53, 54–55, 58, 62, 65–66  
 Solomon, R.L., 137  
 sour grapes problem, 6  
 Spence, M., 112n  
 Spencer, W.A., 136  
 spite, 6n  
 standard case, 346, 347  
 standard of living, 6  
 Starzl, T., 123, 124n  
 status, and distribution, 102  
 status quo point, 383  
 Stehling, F., 170n, 172n  
 Stouffer, S., 104n, 109n, 110n  
 Strack, F., 139  
 Strasnick, S., 209

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

## 398 INDEX

- strength of desire, 55–56, 58–59, 65  
 strength of preference, 33, 36–37  
 strong Pareto, 265, 274–76, 293  
 Strotz, R.H., 202  
 subjective comparability, 337  
 subjective interpersonal comparison. *See also* social choice function for subjective interpersonal comparison  
     of the individual, definition, 339  
 subjective judgment by individual, 339, 342, 345–47  
     in aggregation process, 339  
 subjective mental state, 5, 299  
     objective proxies for, 10, 117–18  
 subjective preference, 296  
 substance, 63  
 success, 8, 82n. *See also* accomplishment  
 suffering, 93–94  
 Sugden, R., 130, 257n  
 supervenience, 86n  
 Suppes, P., 208, 216  
 Svensson, L.-G., 216  
 Swalm, R.O., 157  
 symmetric function, 381  
 symmetry assumption, 381  
 sympathy. *See* extended sympathy
- taste, 222  
     future, predictability of, 133–34  
 taste model, 45–69  
     and attitudes, 61  
     definition, 45–46  
     explanatory inadequacy, 48–56  
     historical background, 46–48  
     interpersonal comparisons based on, 52–69  
     utility in, 55–56
- temporal good, principle of, 15, 72  
     defense of, 84–91  
     *prima facie* evidence against, 82–84  
     statement of, 80
- Thaler, R.H., 147, 150, 151n, 152, 153
- Thompson, R.F., 136
- Thomson, W., 322
- thoroughness of treatment, 121
- thought experiment, 135, 144–45, 291
- Tinbergen, J., 218, 221, 322n
- Tocqueville, A. de, 6, 109
- Toharia, L., 218
- tolerance, range of, 137
- transaction  
     fairness of, 152–54  
     reference, 153
- transplantation  
     candidate selection, 101, 119–22  
     and organ donation, 108
- true preference, 28–29, 43
- Tversky, A., 130, 134, 135, 136, 139n, 140, 146, 147, 148, 149, 151, 154, 157, 217
- type, 324–25, 326, 327–28  
     actual, 374  
     possible, 374  
     reporting of, 379–80
- UD. *See* unrestricted domain
- understanding, and desire, 59–67
- unifying relation, 87–91
- unilateral function, 364
- United Network for Organ Sharing, 122
- universalizability, 212
- universal unanimity, 350n
- unrestricted domain, 339–40, 350–53  
     statement of, 348  
     and subjective interpersonal comparison, 357–62  
     subject to strong anti-paternalism, 351–52  
     subject to weak anti-paternalism, 350–51, 352–53
- utilitarianism, 13–15, 99, 100, 128, 201, 212. *See also* fundamental utilitarian theorem; impersonal choice utilitarianism  
     formulation of, 299–305  
     Harsanyi's interpretation of, 13–14, 24–38, 201, 297–315  
     and interhousehold comparisons, 169–70  
     requirements for meaningfulness, 303–5  
     weighted, 299
- utilitarian metaphysics, 70–95
- utilitarian principle of distribution, 70–95 *passim*  
     and person-segments, 92–95  
     and principle of temporal good, 81–82, 91–95  
     statement of, 70
- utilitarian psychophysics, 157–58
- utility. *See also* experience utility; impersonal choice utilitarianism; interpersonal comparisons of utility; objectivist view of utility; psychological view of utility  
     cardinal measure of, 11n, 214–26  
     and choice, 77n

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX 399

- concepts of, 48, 67–69, 127–36, 298–300  
 as friends, 229–30  
 of income function, 233–34  
 individual, 299  
 intrapersonal comparisons of, 11n, 224–26  
 measurability and comparability, 11n, 128–29, 214–26, 300–3  
 of persons, to society, 13, 230–32  
 and quantity of good, 74–79  
 relation to preference, 299–300  
 shortcomings of intuitions about, 143–45  
 in taste model, 55–56  
 utility difference, comparability, 314  
 utility function. *See also* social welfare function; von Neumann–Morgenstern utility function (NMUF)  
 congruent, 300  
 in expected utility theory, 261–62  
 extended, 54–55  
 informationally equivalent, 300  
 social, 275  
 utility level. *See* interpersonal comparisons of utility level (ICUL); level of utility  
 utility of escalating bads, 134–36  
 utility ratio, as marginal rates of substitution, 232–34  
 utility theory of choice, 46n  
 utility units, equal, 314  
 utility weight, 14, 314. *See also* weighting
- value. *See also* actual value; personal value, shared values  
 effect of ownership on, 150–52  
 and preference, 25–26  
 relation to desire, 45  
 and taste model, 50  
 value judgment  
 avoidance of, 17, 18  
 consumer sovereignty, 225  
 kinds of, 18–20  
 and preference-satisfaction approach, 31  
 process, 19–20  
 van Acker, P., 256n  
 van de Geer, S., 143  
 van der Saar, N.L., 218  
 van de Stadt, H., 143  
 van Herwaarden, F., 218  
 van Praag, B.M.S., 142, 218, 220
- Varey, C., 2, 4, 5, 6, 11  
 Varian, H., 322  
 veil of ignorance, 212, 235, 236, 291n, 371  
 verificationism, 77n  
 vicarious stimuli, 139  
 Vickrey, W.S., 215, 291n, 372, 373  
 von Neumann, J., 260n  
 von Neumann–Morgenstern expected utility theorem, 377  
 von Neumann–Morgenstern utility function (NMUF), 14, 212, 213, 215, 233  
 applicability of, 255–315 *passim*  
 definition, 262  
 versus nonlinear social welfare function, 296  
 voting, 360–61, 364
- Wagenaar, W.A., 149  
 Walder, A., 112n  
 Waldner, I., 217  
 Wales, T.J., 168, 173n, 177, 222, 223  
 Walters, A.A., 46n  
 Walzer, M., 100n  
 water, allocation of, 105  
 weak Pareto, 265n  
 wealth. *See also* good(s)  
 level of versus change in, 154–58  
 weighting, 14, 63, 299, 343, 344n. *See also* intertemporal weighing of good  
 Weinstein, N.D., 133n  
 Weirich, P., 215  
 welfare  
 as basis of interpersonal comparisons, 114–26  
 observable proxies for, 10, 117–18  
 welfare economics. *See* new welfare economics  
 welfare identity, principle of, 308–15  
 statement of, 309  
 welfare income function, 142–43, 219, 233–34  
 welfare ordering, 207–9  
 welfare policy, and adaptation, 145–47  
 welfarist social evaluation, and interhousehold comparisons, 169  
 well-being. *See also* good(s); hedonic concept; interpersonal comparisons of well-being; preference-satisfaction concepts of, 2–3, 5–10, 299  
 definition, 1, 71  
 index of, 41–42, 44  
 standards of, 39–44

Cambridge University Press

052145722X - Interpersonal Comparisons Well-Being

Edited by Jon Elster and John E. Roemer

Index

[More information](#)

400 INDEX

- Weymark, J.A., 13, 14, 170n, 171, 214, 235, 266n, 272n, 273n, 274n, 282n, 300n, 322, 337n  
Wheeler, J.R.C., 115n  
Williams, B., 99n, 200  
Winet, M., 216  
Winkel, G.H., 143  
Winslow, G., 104n, 110n, 115n, 119n  
Wittgenstein, L., 51, 57, 67  
Wittman, D., 202  
Wohlwill, J.F., 138  
Wolf, S., 91n  
women, morale of, 142  
Yaari, M.E., 98n, 155, 202, 227, 230–31  
Yannelis, N.C., 203  
Yemin, E., 105n  
Young, H.P., 123n  
Young, H. Peyton, 123  
Zajac, E.J., 105n, 113n