

This volume brings together new essays from distinguished scholars in a variety of disciplines – philosophy, history, literary studies, art history – to explore various ways in which aesthetics, politics, and the arts interact with one another. Politics is an elastic concept, covering an oceanic breadth of mechanisms for conducting relations among variously empowered groups, and these essays offer a range of perspectives, including nations, classes, and gendered subjects, which examine the imbrication of politics with arts. Together they demonstrate the need to counteract the reductionist view of the relationship between politics and the arts which prevails in various ways in both philosophy and critical theory, and suggest that the irreducibility of the aesthetic must prompt us to reconceive the political as it relates to human cultural activity.





CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND THE ARTS

 $Series\ editors$ SALIM KEMAL and IVAN GASKELL

Politics and aesthetics in the arts



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND THE ARTS

Series editors

SALIM KEMAL and IVAN GASKELL

Advisory board

Stanley Cavell, R. K. Elliott, Stanley E. Fish, David Freedberg, Hans-Georg Gadamer, John Gage, Carl Hausman, Ronald Hepburn, Mary Hesse, Hans-Robert Jauss, Martin Kemp, Jean Michel Massing, Michael Podro, Edward S. Said, Michael Tanner.

"Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and the Arts" is a forum for examining issues common to philosophy and critical disciplines that deal with the history of art, literature, film, music and drama. In order to inform and advance both critical practice and philosophical approaches, the series analyses the aims, procedures, language and results of inquiry in the critical fields, and examines philosophical theories by reference to the needs of arts disciplines. This interaction of ideas and findings, and the ensuing discussion, brings into focus new perspectives and expands the terms in which the debate is conducted.



Politics and Aesthetics in the Arts

Edited by
SALIM KEMAL

University of Dundee

and

IVAN GASKELL

 $Harvard\ University\ Art\ Museums$





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521454186

© Salim Kemal and Ivan Gaskell 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Politics and aesthetics in the arts / edited by Salim Kemal and Ivan Gaskell; illustrations with Neil McWilliam and Michael Kelly.

p. cm. (Cambridge studies in philosophy and the arts)
Includes index.

ISBN 0 521 45418 2 (hardback)

1. Aesthetics – Political aspects.

2. Arts – Political aspects.

I. Kemal, Salim. II. Gaskell, Ivan. III. Series.

BH301.P64P65 2000

111.85-dc21 99-11073 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-45418-6 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-14196-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of illustrations		page 1x
Li	st of contributors	Х
E_{i}	Editors' acknowledgments	
1	Contesting the arts: politics and aesthetics SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL	1
2	"From the stage to the state": politics, form, and performance in the Elizabethan theatre LOUIS MONTROSE	11
3	Republican beauty, sublime democracy: civic humanism in Gadamer and Rawls J. M. BERNSTEIN	50
4	Travelers, colonizers, and the aesthetics of self- conception: Denis Diderot on the perils of detachment ANTHONY PAGDEN	85
5	The aesthetics of nationalism and the limits of culture DAVID CARROLL	112
6	Peripheral visions: class, cultural aspiration, and the artisan community in mid-nineteenth-century France NEIL MCWILLIAM	140
7	The war of tradition: Virginia Woolf and the temper of criticism DANIEL COTTOM	174

vii



Contents

8	The discomfort of strangeness and beauty: art, politics, and aesthetics PETER DE BOLLA	204
9	The political autonomy of contemporary art: the case of the 1993 Whitney Biennial MICHAEL KELLY	221
Index		264



Illustrations

6.1	Antoine Etex, Mort a un nomme ae genie page	145
	incompris, 1845, reproduced by permission of the	
	Musée des beaux-arts, Lyon	
6.2	Célestin Nanteuil, after Antoine Etex, La Délivrance,	147
	ou la mort du prolétaire, 1849, reproduced by permission	
	of the Cabinet des estampes, Bibliothèque nationale, Paris	
6.3	The Berryer. Chef d'œuvre presented to the lawyer	163
	Berryer by the Compagnons Passants Charpentiers du	
	Devoir, Bons-Drilles du Tour de France (Soubises) in	
	1845; reproduced by permission of the Compagnons	
	Charpentiers des Devoirs du Tour de France, Paris	
9.1	Hans Haacke, Photo Opportunity (After the Storm/Walker	236
	Evans), 1992, reproduced by permission of the artist	
9.2	Robert Gober, <i>Newspaper</i> , 1992, reproduced by	239
	permission of the artist and the Paula Cooper	
	Gallery, New York	
9.3	Laura Simpson, <i>Hypothetical?</i> , 1992, reproduced by	241
	permission of the Sean Kelly Gallery, New York	
9.4	Sue Williams, <i>It's a New Era</i> , 1992, reproduced by	243
	permission of the 303 Gallery, New York	
9.5	Janine Antoni, <i>Chocolate Gnaw</i> , 1992 (photo by	245
	John Bessler), reproduced by permission of the artist	
9.6	Cindy Sherman, untitled, 1992, reproduced by	248
	permission of Metro Pictures	
9.7	Byron Kim, <i>Synechdoche</i> , 1991–2, reproduced by	249
	permission of Max Protetch, New York	
9.8	Glenn Ligon, Notes on the Margin of the "Black Book",	251
	1991–3, reproduced by permission of the artist; in the	
	collection of the Bohen Foundation, New York	



Contributors

J. M. BERNSTEIN Vanderbilt University

DAVID CARROLL University of California, Irvine

> DANIEL COTTOM University of Oklahoma

PETER DE BOLLA University of Cambridge

MICHAEL KELLY

Columbia University

NEIL MCWILLIAM University of Warwick

LOUIS MONTROSE University of California, San Diego

ANTHONY PAGDEN
The Johns Hopkins University



Editors' acknowledgments

There are many people we should like to thank, too many to list here. Jane Baston and Jane Whitehead, as always; Leo, Sara, and Rahim, as always; William and Kathryn Robinson. We would like to thank our Advisory Board members and the other readers and advisors on particular papers for the series, and those who have encouraged us through reviews, citations, and proposals for journals and further volumes. Perhaps it is fitting that a topic such as the relation of politics to aesthetics, so open to contention, so provocative of passion, and in some people's minds so entrenched in a system of received opinions and prejudices, should conclude the series. Throughout we have sought not only to bring together philosophers from both the analytical and continental schools, and theoretically minded practitioners of many other human science disciplines to consider common problems, but also to choose problems that in themselves challenge the theoretical status quo. The results have not fitted in with any existing orthodoxy, nor, we suspect, made many people feel more comfortable with their existing theoretical commitments. Our own choices have been informed by both politics and aesthetics: a politics and an aesthetics of surprise, quiet defiance, and disconcertion. With sincere thanks to all who have taken part in the series we now take our leave.