

PUBLICATIONS OF THE GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE WASHINGTON, D.C.

Edited by Hartmut Lehmann, with the assistance of Kenneth F. Ledford

Paths of Continuity



THE GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE, WASHINGTON, D.C.

The German Historical Institute is a center for advanced study and research whose purpose is to provide a permanent basis for scholarly cooperation between historians from the Federal Republic of Germany and the United States. The Institute conducts, promotes, and supports research into both American and German political, social, economic, and cultural history, into transatlantic migration, especially in the nine-teenth and twentieth centuries, and into the history of international relations, with special emphasis on the roles played by the United States and Germany.

Other books in the series

- Hartmut Lehmann and James J. Sheehan, eds., An Interrupted Past: German-Speaking Refugee Historians in the United States after 1933, 1991.
- Carole Fink, Axel Frohn, and Jürgen Heideking, eds., Genoa, Rapallo, and European Reconstruction in 1933, 1991.
- David Clay Large, ed., Contending with Hitler: Varieties of German Resistance in the Third Reich, 1992.
- Larry Eugene Jones and James Retallack, ed., Elections, Mass Politics, and Social Change in Modern Germany: New Perspectives, 1992.
- Hartmut Lehmann and Guenther Roth, eds., Weber's "Protestant Ethic": Origins, Evidence, Contexts, 1993.
- Jeffry M. Diefendorf, Axel Frohn, and Herman-Josef Rupieper, eds., American Policy and the Reconstruction of West Germany, 1945-1955, 1993.
- Catherine Epstein, A Past Renewed: A Catalog of German-Speaking Refugee Historians in the United States after 1933, 1993.



Paths of Continuity

CENTRAL EUROPEAN HISTORIOGRAPHY FROM THE 1930S TO THE 1950S

Edited by
HARTMUT LEHMANN
and
JAMES VAN HORN MELTON

GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE

Washington, D.C.





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© German Historical Institute 1994

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1994 First paperback edition 2002

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
Paths of continuity: central European historiography from the 1930s to the 1950s / edited by Hartmut Lehmann and James van Horn Melton.

p. cm. – (Publications of the German Historical Institute)
 Includes bibliographical references and index.
 ISBN 0 521 45199 X hardback

1. Germany – Historiography. 2. Austria – Historiography.

3. Historiography – Germany – History – 20th century.

Historiography – Austria – History – 20th century.
 Historians – Germany – History – 20th century.
 Historians – Austria – History – 20th century.
 Germany – Intellectual life – 20th century.
 Austria – Intellectual life – 20th century.
 Lehmann,

Hartmut, 1936- . I. Melton, James Van Horn, 1952- .

III. Series. DD86.P38 1994 943.08′072043-dc20 93-8424 CIP

ISBN 0 521 45199 X hardback ISBN 0 521 53121 7 paperback



Contents

Preface p Contributors		page vii	
		ix	
Intr	oduction: Continuities in German Historical Scholarship, 1933–1960 James Van Horn Melton	. 1	
1.	German Historiography from the 1930s to the	. 1	
	1950s Winfried Schulze	19	
	Comment: Georg G. Iggers	43	
2.	Friedrich Meinecke (1862–1954) Jonathan B. Knudsen	49	
	Comment: Ernst A. Breisach	73	
3.	Change and Continuity in German Historiography from 1933 into the Early 1950s: Gerhard Ritter (1888-		
	1967) Klaus Schwabe	83	
	Comment: Thomas A. Brady, Jr.	109	
4.	Hans Rothfels (1891–1976) Klemens von Klemperer	119	
	Comment: Douglas A. Unfug	137	
5.	Franz Schnabel (1887-1966) Lothar Gall	155	
	Comment: Hartmut Lehmann	167	
6.	Heinrich Ritter von Srbik (1878–1951) Fritz Fellner	171	
	Comment: John W. Boyer	187	
7.	"Historical Social Science" and Political Myth: Hans Freyer (1887–1969) and the Genealogy of Social		
	History in West Germany Jerry Z. Muller	197	
	Comment: Roger Chickering	231	

V



vi	Contents	
8.	Some Observations on the Work of Hermann Aubin (1885–1969) Marc Raeff	239
	Comment: Edgar Melton	251
9.	From Folk History to Structural History: Otto Brunner (1898–1982) and the Radical-Conservative Roots of German Social	
	History James Van Horn Melton	263
	Comment: Steven Rowan	293
10.	and the Historian's Measures Irmline Veit-Brause	299
	Comment: Peter Reill	345
11.	Continuity, Innovation, and Self-Reflection in Late Historicism: Theodor Schieder (1908–1984)	
	Jörn Rüsen	353
	Comment: Charles S. Maier	389
Inde	Index	



Preface

Like the history of seventeenth-century England, and of eighteenth-century and nineteenth-century France and the United States, the history of twentieth-century Germany is characterized by severe political upheavals and drastic changes, such as those in 1918–1919, 1933, 1945, and most recently 1989. These changes affected politics primarily, but they also had a noticeable effect on scholarship, not least of all on the field of history.

The German Historical Institute's first conference, held in December 1988, dealt with "German-Speaking Refugee Historians in the United States from 1933 to the 1970s." On that occasion, we discussed the intellectual impact and the scholarly achievements of those German historians who lost their positions in Germany after 1933, whose careers were disrupted by the Nazi seizure of power, and who were forced into exile. There were about one hundred historians – persons with a PhD in history who made this discipline the focus of their professional lives – who had to leave Germany after 1933. The papers delivered at the conference, as well as a catalog containing biographical and bibliographical information on the refugee historians, have appeared as volumes in this series.

In sheer numbers, many more historians remained in Germany after Machtergreifung, Reichstagsbrand, Ermächtigungsgesetz, Bücherverbrennung, Gleichschaltung, Röhmputsch, Rheinlandbesetzung, Anschluss, and Kristallnacht. So far we have only a vague notion of how their careers were impinged upon by the rise and fall of National Socialism and by the events of 1933 and 1945. As always, there was no uniform pattern of change, but there are certainly some remarkable trends.

When James Melton asked me whether the German Historical Institute would take an interest in questions of twentieth-century German historiography, I responded without hesitation. We quickly



viii Preface

agreed that it was a worthwhile challenge to reconstruct and piece together the paths of continuity of Central European historiography from the 1920s to the 1950s – paths that we have sometimes heard about, that we sometimes suspect or assume, but about which we still know far too little. What ensued were lively and, in my view, very rewarding discussions, first with James Melton, and then, after we had conceived a plan for the conference, between the two of us and the potential contributors.

Some may wonder why we have chosen to approach a topic laden with Sozial- und Strukturgeschichte via biographical avenues. After debating the possible analytical routes, we decided that by examining the careers of individual historians we could best ensure that the varieties within the stream of continuity – the full range of feasible continuities – would be spelled out and discussed.

It is my pleasure to thank the History Department of Emory University for its hospitality during the conference, and Professor Kenneth Ledford for helping to prepare the papers for publication and for assisting in the publication of this volume. I am particularly grateful to James Melton for his advice and guidance, and Patsy Stockbridge of Emory University.

We dedicate this book to the memory of Felix Gilbert, in whose Princeton office we first met and who encouraged us to go ahead with this project. The conference on "Paths of Continuity" was one of the last Felix was able to attend. He spoke from notes on the state of historical scholarship in Germany in 1945. Much to our dismay, he was unable to prepare a manuscript for inclusion in this volume.

Washington, D.C.

Hartmut Lehmann



Contributors

John W. Boyer Professor of History University of Chicago

Thomas A. Brady, Jr. Professor of History University of California at Berkeley

Ernst A. Breisach Professor of History

Western Michigan University

Roger Chickering Professor of History University of Oregon

Fritz Fellner Professor of History University of Salzburg

Lothar Gall Professor of History University of Frankfurt

Georg G. Iggers Distinguished Professor of History State University of New York at Buffalo

Klemens von Klemperer L. Clark Seelye Professor Emeritus of History Smith College

Jonathan B. Knudsen Professor of History Wellesley College Edgar Melton Associate Professor of History Wright State University

James Van Horn Melton Associate Professor of History Emory University

Jerry Z. Muller Associate Professor of History Catholic University of America

Marc Raeff Professor of History Emeritus Columbia University

Peter Reill Professor of History University of California at Los Angeles

Steven Rowan Associate Professor of History University of Missouri-St. Louis

Jörn Rüsen Professor of History University of Bielefeld

Winfried Schulze Professor of History Ruhr University in Bochum

Klaus Schwabe Professor of History Rheinisch-Westfälische Technische Hochschule in Aachen



X

Contributors

Hartmut Lehmann Director of the German Historical Institute Washington, D.C.

Charles S. Maier Professor of History Harvard University Douglas A. Unfug Associate Professor of History Emory University

Irmline Veit-Brause Professor of History Deakin University