

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Aristotle was both a metaphysician and the inventor of formal logic, including the logic of possibility and necessity. *Aristotle's Modal Logic* presents a new interpretation of Aristotle's logic by arguing that a proper understanding of the system depends on an appreciation of its connection to his metaphysics.

Richard Patterson develops three striking theses in this book. First, there is a fundamental connection between Aristotle's logic of possibility and necessity and his metaphysics, a connection extending far beyond the widely recognized tie to scientific demonstration and relating to the more basic distinction between the essential and accidental properties of a subject. Second, although Aristotle's development of modal logic depends in very significant ways on his metaphysics, this does not entail any sacrifice in logical rigor. Third, once one has grasped the nature of that connection, one can better understand certain genuine difficulties in the system of logic and also appreciate its strengths in terms of the purposes for which it was created.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Aristotle's modal logic

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the *Organon*

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Aristotle's modal logic

Essence and entailment in the *Organon*

RICHARD PATTERSON

EMORY UNIVERSITY



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521451680

© Cambridge University Press 1995

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1995
First paperback edition 2002

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-45168-0 Hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-52233-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel
timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at
the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee
the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

	<i>page</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		
<i>Chapter 1</i> Introduction		1
1.1 Background to the principal issues		1
1.2 Main themes of this work		11
<i>Chapter 2</i> The basic modal proposition		15
2.1 Aristotle's general introduction to the modalities		15
2.2 Some initial problems about conversion		23
2.3 <i>Cop</i> and its competitors: problems for modal predicates		30
2.4 Further problems for <i>de dicto</i> and for a modal <i>dictum</i> /modal predicate alternation		33
2.5 Strong <i>cop</i> vs. <i>de dicto</i>		35
2.6 The four predicables as syllogistic terms		38
2.7 Two readings of the necessity proposition		41
2.8 Two notes on Aristotle's concrete terms		44
2.9 An important moral		46
2.10 Intensional relations and the unity of the two <i>cop</i> readings		47
2.11 Conversion of necessity propositions		48
2.12 <i>De dicto</i> conversion as parasitic on strong <i>cop</i>		52
<i>Chapter 3</i> Syllogisms with two necessity premises		54
3.1 The general parallel to assertoric syllogisms		56
3.2 First-figure syllogisms		57
3.3 Strong <i>cop</i> and scientific demonstration		58
3.4 The surprising strength of some first-figure mixed <i>cop</i> moods and their relation to scientific demonstration		60
3.5 Second-figure syllogisms		63

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

3.6	The third figure and the even more surprising strength of some weak <i>cop</i> premises	66
3.7	The <i>ekthesis</i> proofs for Baroco and Bocardo	70
Chapter 4	Mixed syllogisms: one assertoric and one necessity premise	75
4.1	The two Barbaras: Aristotle's position and its critics	75
4.2	Mixed assertoric/ <i>cop</i> necessity syllogisms	81
4.3	The two Barbaras and a close look at some univocal readings	87
Chapter 5	Two-way possibility: some basic preliminaries	124
5.1	The structure of two-way possibility propositions	125
5.2	The affirmative form of two-way possibility propositions	132
5.3	Qualitative conversion on the <i>cop</i> reading	135
5.4	Term conversion	136
5.5	Ampliation	141
Chapter 6	Two-way possibility syllogisms	145
6.1	Two problematic premises: first figure	145
6.2	Problematic Barbara and scientific demonstration	149
6.3	Two invalidity proofs	154
6.4	One problematic, one assertoric premise	155
6.5	First proof of Barbara <i>A</i> , <i>pp/p</i>	159
6.6	Second proof for Barbara <i>A</i> , <i>pp/p</i>	164
6.7	Omnitemporal premises?	166
6.8	Nortmann on A.15, and possible-worlds semantics	176
6.9	A few remaining assertoric/problematic curiosities from the first figure	182
6.10	One problematic, one necessity premise: first figure	185
6.11	Two contingent premises in the second figure: discovery, before our very eyes, of an ingenious "proof"	188
6.12	The spread of a proof-theoretic infection	192
6.13	An important principle overlooked	194
6.14	Third-figure syllogisms	198
6.15	A day in the sun for <i>ekthesis</i>	203
Chapter 7	Aristotle's perfect syllogisms	206
7.1	Plain syllogisms and the <i>dictum de omni</i>	207
7.2	Perfection of perfect modal moods	214
7.3	'Applies to all/none' again	220

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Chapter 8</i> Principles of construction	225
<i>Appendix: Categorical propositions and syllogisms</i>	235
<i>Notes</i>	241
<i>Select bibliography</i>	283
<i>Index</i>	287

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-45168-0 - Aristotle's Modal Logic: Essence and Entailment in the Organon

Richard Patterson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

I owe special thanks to Peter Geach, whose seminar on the *Prior Analytics* at the University of Pennsylvania in 1973 first aroused my interest in Aristotle's modal logic. He would certainly not agree with all of Aristotle's ideas on the subject, or with all of my ideas about Aristotle, but he is nonetheless responsible for much of anything that may be found useful in this book.

For ideal working conditions and generous financial support I am grateful to the National Humanities Center, the Institute for Advanced Study, and the University Research Council of Emory University.

Many readers have helped me make improvements in various versions of the manuscript over the last ten years. Besides the two anonymous and extremely helpful readers for the Press, these include Michael Ferejohn, John Corcoran, Robin Smith, Howard Stein, William Rumsey, Brian Chellas, Charles Kahn, Morton White, Henry Mendel, Betsey Devine, Allan Silverman, Henry Mendel, Jim Goetsch, and Laura Wedner.