

Studies in the Social and Cultural Foundations of Language No. 17

## Rethinking linguistic relativity

Linguistic relativity is the claim, associated especially with the names of Humboldt, Sapir, and Whorf, that culture, through language, affects the way in which we think, and especially our classification of the experienced world. This book re-examines ideas about linguistic relativity in the light of new evidence and changes in theoretical climate. Parts I and II address the classical issues in the relation between thought and language, and the extent of linguistic and cultural universals. Parts III and IV show how changes in our understanding of meaning require that we look at how context enters into interpretation, and how context is constituted in social interaction, reflecting properties of larger social wholes. The editors have provided a substantial introduction which summarizes changes in thinking about the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis in the light of developments in anthropology, linguistics, and cognitive science; and also introductions to each section which will be of especial use to students.



#### Studies in the Social and Cultural Foundations of Language

The aim of this series is to develop theoretical perspectives on the essential social and cultural character of language by methodological and empirical emphasis on the occurrence of language in its communicative and interactional settings, on the socioculturally grounded "meanings" and "functions" of linguistic forms, and on the social scientific study of language use across cultures. It will thus explicate the essentially ethnographic nature of linguistic data, whether spontaneously occurring or experimentally induced, whether normative or variational, whether synchronic or diachronic. Works appearing in the series will make substantive and theoretical contributions to the debate over the sociocultural functional and structural-formal nature of language, and will represent the concerns of scholars in the sociology and anthropology of language, anthropological linguistics, sociolinguistics, and socio-culturally informed psycholinguistics.

Editorial Board

Keith H. Basso Judith T. Irvine
Charles Briggs Stephen C. Levinson
Shirley Brice Heath John A. Lucy
William F. Hanks Elinor Ochs
Dell H. Hymes Bambi Schieffelin

- 1. Charles L. Briggs: Learning how to ask: a sociolinguistic appraisal of the role of the interview in social science research
- 2. Tamar Katriel: Talking straight: Dugri speech in Israeli Sabra culture
- 3. Bambi B. Schieffelin and Elinor Ochs (eds.): Language socialization across cultures
- 4. Susan U. Philips, Susan Steele, and Christine Tanz (eds.): Language, gender, and sex in comparative perspective
- 5. Jeff Siegel: Language contact in a plantation environment: a sociolinguistic history of Fiji
- 6. Elinor Ochs: Culture and language development: language acquisition and language socialization in a Samoan village
- 7. Nancy C. Dorian (ed.): Investigating obsolescence: studies in language contraction and death
- 8. Richard Bauman and Joel Sherzer (eds.): Explorations in the ethnography of speaking
- 9. Bambi B. Schieffelin: The give and take of everyday life: language socialization of Kaluli children
- 10. Francesca Merlan and Alan Rumsey: Ku Waru: language and segmentary politics in the western Nebilyer valley, Papua New Guinea
- 11. Alessandro Duranti and Charles Good vin (eds.): Rethinking context: language as an interactive phenomenon
- 12. John A. Lucy: Language diversity and thought: a reformulation of the linguistic relativity hypothesis
- 13. John A. Lucy: Grammatical categories and cognition: a case study of the linguistic relativity hypothesis
- 14. Don Kulick: Language shift and cultural reproduction; socialization, self and syncretism in a Papua New Guinea village
- 13. Jane H. Hill and Judith T. Irvine (eds.): Responsibility and evidence in oral discourse
- 16. Niko Besnier: Literacy, emotion, and authority: reading and writing on a Polynesian atoll
- 17. John J. Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson (eds.): Rethinking linguistic relativity



# RETHINKING LINGUISTIC RELATIVITY

## Edited by

## JOHN J. GUMPERZ

Professor Emeritus, University of California, Berkeley

and

## STEPHEN C. LEVINSON

Director, Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics and Cognitive Anthropology Research Group, Nijmegen





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1996

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1996 Reprinted 1997, 1999

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data
Rethinking linguistic relativity/edited by John J. Gumperz and
Stephen C. Levinson

cm.-(Studies in the social and cultural foundations of language, no. 17)
 Includes indexes.

ISBN 0 521 44433 0 (hardback).-ISBN 0 521 44890 5 (paperback)

1. Sapir-Whorf hypothesis. 2. Thought and thinking.

Language and culture. I. Gumperz, John Joseph, 1922–
 II. Levinson, Stephen C. III. Series

P35.R465 1996 401-dc20 95-38476 CIP

ISBN 0 521 44433 0 hardback ISBN 0 521 44890 5 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2000



## **CONTENTS**

	List of contributors Acknowledgements	vii viii
1	John Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson Introduction: linguistic relativity re-examined	1
Part I	Linguistic determinism: the interface between language and thought	
	John Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson Introduction to part I	21
2	John A. Lucy The scope of linguistic relativity: an analysis and review of empirical research	37
3	Dan I. Slobin From "thought and language" to "thinking	70
4	for speaking" Paul Kay	97
	Intra-speaker relativity	•
5	Charles M. Keller and Janet Dixon Keller Imaging in iron, or thought is not inner speech	115
Part II	Universals and variation in language and culture	
	Stephen C. Levinson Introduction to part II	133
6	Melissa Bowerman The origins of children's spatial semantic categories	145
7	cognitive versus linguistic determinants  Stephen C. Levinson  Relativity in spatial conception and description	177
8	Pascal Boyer Cognitive limits to conceptual relativity: the limiting-case of religious ontologies	203

V



vi	Contents	
Part III	Interpretation in cultural context	
	John J. Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson Introduction to part III	225
9	William F. Hanks Language form and communicative practices	232
10	John B. Haviland Projections, transpositions, and relativity	271
11	Herbert H. Clark Communities, commonalities, and communication	324
Part IV	The social matrix: culture, praxis, and discourse	
	John J. Gumperz Introduction to part IV	359
12	John J. Gumperz  The linguistic and cultural relativity of inference	374
13	Elinor Ochs Linguistic resources for socializing humanity	407
14	Elsa Gomez-Imbert When animals become "rounded" and "feminine": conceptual categories and linguistic classification in a	438
	multilingual setting	470



## CONTRIBUTORS

Melissa Bowerman

Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics, Nijmegen

Pascal Boyer

Dynamique du langage, M.R.A.S.H., Lyon

Herbert H. Clark

Department of Psychology, Stanford University

Elsa Gomez-Imbert

Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Paris

John J. Gumperz

Professor Emeritus, University of California at Berkeley

William F. Hanks

Department of Anthropology, University of Chicago

John B. Haviland

Dept. of Linguistics and Anthropology, Reed College, Portland, Oregon

Paul Kay

Department of Linguistics, University of California at Berkeley

Charles M. Keller

Department of Anthropology, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Janet Dixon Keller

Department of Anthropology, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Stephen C. Levinson

Director, Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics and Cognitive Anthropology Research Group, Nijmegen

John A. Lucy

Department of Anthropology, University of Pennsylvania

Elinor Ochs

Department of TESL/Applied Linguistics, University of California at Los Angeles

Dan I. Slobin

Department of Psychology, University of California at Berkeley



### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This volume arises from a conference entitled "Rethinking linguistic relativity," Wenner-Gren Symposium 112, held in Ocho Rios, Jamaica, in May 1991. The participants were Niyi Akkinaso, Talal Assad, Norine Berenz, Melissa Bowerman, Pascal Boyer, Herbert Clark, Elsa Gomez-Imbert, John Gumperz, William Hanks, John Haviland, Paul Kay, Janet Keller, Jean Lave, Stephen Levinson, John Lucy, Elinor Ochs, Seidel Silverman, Dan Slobin, Len Talmy, Pamela Wright. The book is not a direct record of the proceedings, for which see Gumperz & Levinson (1991). Rather, it pursues selectively just some of the themes raised at the conference, and the papers have been extensively revised for publication in the light of animated discussion. Thus, although not all the participants are represented in the volume directly, their contributions have no doubt been woven into the fabric of the book. We would like to thank them all. We have in addition had the benefit of further discussions with some of them, especially Melissa Bowerman, John Haviland, Paul Kay, John Lucy, and Dan Slobin. In addition, we owe an especial debt to Seidel Silverman, who, on behalf of the Wenner-Gren Foundation, encouraged the original idea, and was deeply involved in the planning of the conference. We are also indebted to the staff of the foundation for further detailed planning and organization.

#### Reference

Gumperz, J. J. & Levinson, S. C. 1991. Rethinking linguistic relativity. *Current Anthropology*, 32(5), 6130.5-23.