The first volume in the series "Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and the Arts" offers a range of responses by distinguished philosophers and art historians to some crucial issues generated by the relationship between the art object and language in art history. Each of the chapters in this volume is a searching response to theoretical and practical questions, in terms accessible to readers of all human science disciplines. The issues they discuss challenge the boundaries to thought that some contemporary theorizing sustains.

The first contributors examine the dissonance of language and art object. Jean-François Lyotard and Stanley Rosen propose that art concerns presence and transcendence, rather than just communication, and thereby render the object always beyond our linguistic reach. The next contributors consider this disparity. Richard Wollheim develops a concept of projection to reaffirm our grasp of objects through their expressive qualities. For Michael Baxandall, art criticism is talking about talking about art, a view which Catherine Lord and José Benardete examine critically in their contribution. The exploration of the necessarily figurative qualities of art historical language proceeds vigorously in chapters by Carl Hausman, by Richard Shiff (with a particularly fruitful discussion of catachresis), and by David Summers. Finally, Andrew Harrison determines how we must conceive of the supra-linguistic quality of art objects once all that can be accounted for linguistically has been established.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND THE ARTS

Series editors:
SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL

The language of art history
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND THE ARTS

Series editors:
SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL

Advisory board:

“Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and the Arts” is a forum for examining issues common to philosophy and critical disciplines that deal with the history of art, literature, film, music, and drama. In order to inform and advance both critical practice and philosophical approaches, the series analyses the aims, procedures, language, and results of inquiry in the critical fields, and examines philosophical theories by reference to the needs of arts disciplines. This interaction of ideas and findings, and the ensuing discussion, bring into focus new perspectives and expand the terms in which the debate is conducted.

Forthcoming volumes in the series include:
Explanation and value in the literary and visual arts
Authenticity and the performing arts
Landscape, natural beauty, and the arts
Politics, aesthetics and the arts
The language of art history

Edited by
SALIM KEMAL
Pennsylvania State University
and
IVAN GASKELL
Harvard University Art Museums
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of plates</th>
<th>page viii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of contributors</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editors' acknowledgments</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Art history and language: some issues</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Presence</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JEAN-FRANÇOIS LYOTARD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Writing and painting: the soul as hermeneut</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STANLEY ROSEN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Correspondence, projective properties, and</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expression in the arts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RICHARD WOLFFHEIM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The language of art criticism</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MICHAEL BAXANDALL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Baxandall and Goodman</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATHERINE LORD AND JOSÉ A. BENARDETE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Figurative language in art history</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARL R. HAUSMAN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Cézanne’s physicality: the politics of touch</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RICHARD SHIFF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Conditions and conventions: on the disanalogy of</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>art and language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAVID SUMMERS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 A minimal syntax for the pictorial: the pictorial</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and the linguistic – analogies and disanalogies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANDREW HARRISON</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index                                                 vii
Plates

8.1 Paul Cézanne, *Three Apples (Deux pommes et demie).* The Barnes Foundation, Merion, Pa.  

page 130  
141  
143  
145  
156  
161  
163
Contributors

MICHAEL BAXANDALL
University of California, Berkeley

JOSÉ A. BENARDETE
Syracuse University

ANDREW HARRISON
University of Bristol

CARL R. HAUSMAN
Pennsylvania State University

CATHERINE LORD
Syracuse University

JEAN-FRANÇOIS LYOTARD
University of California, Irvine

STANLEY ROSEN
Pennsylvania State University

RICHARD SHIFF
University of Texas at Austin

DAVID SUMMERS
University of Virginia, Charlottesville

RICHARD WOLLHEIM
University of California, Berkeley and Davis
Editors’ acknowledgments

Several members of the series' Advisory Board have given us help and advice beyond the call of their responsibilities. We should particularly like to thank Carl Hausman and R. W. Hepburn. Other colleagues offered valuable counsel, chief amongst them Emily Grosholz.

Marian Hobson and Tom Cochran kindly undertook the translation of Jean-François Lyotard’s chapter at very short notice. This essay, ‘Presence’, was first published (in French) in his *Que peindre?* *Adami, Arakawa, Buren* (Editions de la Différence, Paris, 1988).

Michael Baxandall’s paper is a revised version of an article originally published in *New Literary History*, 10 (1979). We are grateful to Johns Hopkins University Press for permission to publish it in this collection.

At Cambridge University Press we should like to thank Terence Moore (New York) and Judith Ayling (Cambridge) for their patience and support.

Finally, we both – individually and collectively – owe a great deal to Jane Baston and Jane Whitehead who have borne the brunt of our anxieties since the inception of this volume and the series as a whole.