

The first volume in the series "Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and the Arts" offers a range of responses by distinguished philosophers and art historians to some crucial issues generated by the relationship between the art object and language in art history. Each of the chapters in this volume is a searching response to theoretical and practical questions, in terms accessible to readers of all human science disciplines. The issues they discuss challenge the boundaries to thought that some contemporary theorizing sustains.

The first contributors examine the dissonance of language and art object. Jean-François Lyotard and Stanley Rosen propose that art concerns presence and transcendence, rather than just communication, and thereby render the object always beyond our linguistic reach. The next contributors consider this disparity. Richard Wollheim develops a concept of projection to reaffirm our grasp of objects through their expressive qualities. For Michael Baxandall, art criticism is talking about talking about art, a view which Catherine Lord and José Benardete examine critically in their contribution. The exploration of the necessarily figurative qualities of art historical language proceeds vigorously in chapters by Carl Hausman, by Richard Shiff (with a particularly fruitful discussion of catachresis), and by David Summers. Finally, Andrew Harrison determines how we must conceive of the supralinguistic quality of art objects once all that can be accounted for linguistically has been established.



### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND THE ARTS

Series editors:

SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL

The language of art history



### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND THE ARTS

#### Series editors:

### SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL

### Advisory board:

Stanley Cavell, R. K. Elliott, Stanley E. Fish, David Freedberg, Hans-Georg Gadamer, John Gage, Carl Hausman, Ronald Hepburn, Mary Hesse, Hans-Robert Jauss, Martin Kemp, Jean Michel Massing, Michael Podro, Edward S. Said, Michael Tanner.

"Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and the Arts" is a forum for examining issues common to philosophy and critical disciplines that deal with the history of art, literature, film, music, and drama. In order to inform and advance both critical practice and philosophical approaches, the series analyses the aims, procedures, language, and results of inquiry in the critical fields, and examines philosophical theories by reference to the needs of arts disciplines. This interaction of ideas and findings, and the ensuing discussion, bring into focus new perspectives and expand the terms in which the debate is conducted.

Forthcoming volumes in the series include:

Explanation and value in the literary and visual arts
Authenticity and the performing arts
Landscape, natural beauty, and the arts
Politics, aesthetics and the arts



# The language of art history

Edited by

SALIM KEMAL

Pennsylvania State University and

IVAN GASKELL

Harvard University Art Museums





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press 1991

First published 1991 Reprinted 1993

British Library cataloguing in publication data
The language of art history.

1. Arts. Philosophy
I. Kemal, Salim II. Gaskell, Ivan
700.1

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

The language of art history / edited by Salim Kemal and Ivan Gaskell
p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in philosophy and the arts)
Includes index.
ISBN 0-521-35384-x

Art – History.
 Object (Aesthetics).
 Communication in art.

 Kemal, Salim.
 Gaskell, Ivan.
 Series.
 N53–3.024
 1991

 709 – dc20
 90–28256
 CIP

ISBN 0 521 35384 x hardback ISBN 0 521 44598 1 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 1999



## Contents

	List of plates	page viii
	List of contributors	ix
	Editors' acknowledgments	×
1	Art history and language: some issues SALIM KEMAL AND IVAN GASKELL	1
2	Presence JEAN-FRANÇOIS LYOTARD	11
3	Writing and painting: the soul as hermeneut STANLEY ROSEN	35
4	Correspondence, projective properties, and expression in the arts RICHARD WOLLHEIM	51
5	The language of art criticism MICHAEL BAXANDALL	67
6	Baxandall and Goodman CATHERINE LORD AND JOSÉ A. BENARDETE	76
7	Figurative language in art history CARL R. HAUSMAN	101
8	Cézanne's physicality: the politics of touch RICHARD SHIFF	129
9	Conditions and conventions: on the disanalogy of art and language DAVID SUMMERS	181
10	A minimal syntax for the pictorial: the pictoria and the linguistic – analogies and disanalogies ANDREW HARRISON	al 213
	Index	240

vii



## **Plates**

8.1	Paul Cézanne, Three Apples (Deux pommes et demie).		
	The Barnes Foundation, Merion, Pa. page	130	
8.2	Paul Cézanne, Wine Glass and Apples. Rudolf Staeche-		
	lin Family Foundation, Basel. Photograph: Hans Hinz.	141	
8.3	Paul Cézanne, Les Grandes Baigneuses. Philadelphia		
	Museum of Art: W. P. Wilstach Collection.	143	
8.4	Paul Cézanne, Camille Pissarro Seen from the Back.		
	Öffentliche Kunstsammlung Basel Kupferstichkabinett:		
	Collection Robert von Hirsch.	145	
8.5			
	Institute Galleries, London: Courtauld Collection.	156	
8.6	Paul Cézanne, Mont Sainte-Victoire. The Metropolitan		
	Museum of Art, New York, bequest of Mrs. H.O.		
	Havemeyer, 1929: the H.O. Havemeyer Collection		
	(29.100.64).	161	
8.7	Pablo Picasso, Bowl with Fruit, Violin, and Wine Glass.		
	Philadelphia Museum of Art: A. F. Gallatin Collection	163	

viii



### **Contributors**

MICHAEL BAXANDALL University of California, Berkeley

JOSÉ A. BENARDETE Syracuse University

ANDREW HARRISON
University of Bristol

CARL R. HAUSMAN Pennsylvania State University

CATHERINE LORD
Syracuse University

JEAN-FRANÇOIS LYOTARD
University of California, Irvine

STANLEY ROSEN
Pennsylvania State University

RICHARD SHIFF University of Texas at Austin

DAVID SUMMERS
University of Virginia, Charlottesville

RICHARD WOLLHEIM University of California, Berkéley and Davis



# Editors' acknowledgments

Several members of the series' Advisory Board have given us help and advice beyond the call of their responsibilities. We should particularly like to thank Carl Hausman and R. W. Hepburn. Other colleagues offered valuable counsel, chief amongst them Emily Grosholz.

Marian Hobson and Tom Cochran kindly undertook the translation of Jean-François Lyotard's chapter at very short notice. This essay, 'Presence', was first published (in French) in his Que peindre? Adami, Arakawa, Buren (Editions de la Différence, Paris, 1988).

Michael Baxandall's paper is a revised version of an article originally published in *New Literary History*, 10 (1979). We are grateful to Johns Hopkins University Press for permission to publish it in this collection.

At Cambridge University Press we should like to thank Terence Moore (New York) and Judith Ayling (Cambridge) for their patience and support.

Finally, we both – individually and collectively – owe a great deal to Jane Baston and Jane Whitehead who have borne the brunt of our anxieties since the inception of this volume and the series as a whole.