

This is a comprehensive survey of the history of the church between around 900 and around 1125, considered both as a set of institutions and as a spiritual body. The emphasis of the first half is on the structures of religious belief and practice in the period between 900 and around 1050: conversion and mission; religious life and experience; the church hierarchy; rulers and the churches in their kingdoms; monasticism; currents of orthodox and heterodox thought. The second half concentrates on the revolutionary changes associated with the rise of the papacy to a new position of rulership within the church. It shows how far one can talk of a 'reform movement' and what the relations were between those who sought for a renewal of Christian life and those who wished to assert the authority of the papacy over all Christians, lay and clerical. It also does justice to the 'opposition', stressing the deep religious convictions of those who on certain issues came to oppose popes and 'reformers', and showing also how fragmentary were the advances of the 'reform movement'.

Tellenbach's survey is the book of a scholar who has been working in the field for sixty years, characterised by the freshness and the maturity of its judgements, which cuts through many fashionable theories and shows how thin is the evidence for them. No other work on the topic offers the same range, depth, and authority.



Cambridge Medieval Textbooks

THE CHURCH IN WESTERN EUROPE FROM THE TENTH TO THE EARLY TWELFTH CENTURY



#### Cambridge Medieval Textbooks

This is a series of specially commissioned textbooks for teachers and students, designed to complement the monograph series Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought by providing introductions to a range of topics in medieval history. The series combines both chronological and thematic approaches, and will deal with British and European topics. All volumes in the series will be published in hard covers and in paperback.

For a list of titles in the series, see end of book.



# THE CHURCH IN WESTERN EUROPE FROM THE TENTH TO THE EARLY TWELFTH CENTURY

#### GERD TELLENBACH

Emeritus University Professor of History, Freiburg in Breisgau

# Translated by TIMOTHY REUTER

University of Southampton





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, VIC 3166, Australia

Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 1993

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1993 Reprinted 2000

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data Tellenbach, Gerd, 1903-

[Westliche Kirche vom 10, bis zum frühen 12. Jahrhundert. English]

The Church in western Europe from the tenth to the early twelfth century / Gerd Tellenbach: translated by Timothy Reuter.

p. cm. - (Cambridge medieval textbooks)

Translation of: Die westliche Kirche vom 10. bis sum frühen 12. Jahrhundert.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 43105 0. – ISBN 0 521 43711 3 (pbk.)

1. Europe – Church history – Middle Ages, 600–1 500. 1. Title.
11. Series.

BR270.T4513 1993

274'.03 - dc20 92-13778 CIP

ISBN 0 521 43105 0 hardback ISBN 0 521 43711 3 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2004



> For Marie Elisabeth



### **CONTENTS**

•

$T_{i}$	ranslator's note	page xi			
$A_1$	uthor's preface	xiii			
Li	List of abbreviations				
I	Western Christendom and its environment in the tenth				
	and eleventh centuries	1			
	The internal and external security of western Christendom	I			
	On the nature and significance of Christian mission in				
	Europe in the tenth and eleventh centuries	6			
2	The church and its manifestations on earth	22			
	The universality of the church	22			
	Parish and diocese, church provinces and synods	26			
	The significance of kingdoms and principalities for the				
	formation of particular churches	37			
	The pope: ideal and reality	65			
3	The material existence of the churches and the clergy	75			
4	Religious life and thought	91			
	The sense of closeness between this world and the next	91			
	Monasticism: a life determined by the next world and its				
	influence on this one	101			
	Christian 'estates'	122			



X	Contents	
5	The beginnings of the revolution in church history	135
	The prehistory	135
	The popes and the emancipation of the Roman church	
	following the synods of Sutri and Rome (1046)	141
	'Church reform'	157
6	Gregory VII (1073-1085)	185
	The growth of papal activity from Leo IX to Alexander II	185
	Gregory VII and the bishops	205
	Gregory VII and the rulers outside the empire	218
	Gregory VII and Henry IV	222
7	Continuing conflicts between established principles	253
	The schism and its consequences	253
	The investiture contest	264
	The struggle against property in churches and monasteries	286
8	Pope, church, and Christendom	304
	The papal primacy in spiritual matters	304
	The means and instruments of power at the papacy's disposal	322
	Ecclesia and Christianitas	334
	Epilogue	348
Se	lect bibliography	354
	Index	



TRANSLATOR'S NOTE

The translation is a complete rendering of the German original, which appeared in 1988. The bibliography and footnotes have been reworked to conform to English practice, typographical and other small errors have been silently corrected where noted, and the author has taken the opportunity to add two or three paragraphs in chapters 6 and 7, and to cite additional literature in a few footnotes. Works for which an English translation exists have been cited using the pagination of the original, and English works used by Professor Tellenbach in German translation have been cited using the pagination of the translation; but in these cases a reference to the English translation or original is given in the bibliography. The work has not otherwise been revised. Professor Tellenbach has seen and approved the entire translation, and I should like to express my gratitude to him here for his care and attention and his many helpful suggestions; but I alone am responsible for the errors of translation which remain.

Timothy Reuter Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Munich



# **AUTHOR'S PREFACE**

In 1983 I published a draft of an introduction to this book.¹ Contrary to my intention then, I shall not repeat what I wrote there, merely refer to it. Only a few points necessary for the understanding of this period of church history will be set out here by way of a prelude.

He who concerns himself with church history must be constantly aware of the fact that it is a whole of which all isolated happenings are merely a part; for it is determined by divine foreknowledge. However puzzling may be the connections between its transcendental origins and destination on the one hand and its human, sometimes all too human course on the other, this unity is nowadays seen as a crucial element of church history by church historians of all confessions, whatever they may understand by the term church history. Even an author like Joseph Lortz regarded it as fruitless 'to acknowledge the existence of certain questionable episodes in church history and the history of theology'. It would be to diminish God's control over history if one were small-mindedly to try to explain away its many weaknesses, scandals, and contradictions; God rules the world and makes human error a tool of his will – even human guilt is made use of in this way and becomes *felix culpa*.<sup>2</sup>

Such a conception allows full freedom to a scholarly study of church history. Nothing need be touched up or passed over in an apologetic spirit. The history of the church needs no human advocate. The famous dispute about whether the history of the church since the time of the primitive church is to be seen as one of progress and development or as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Tellenbach, 'Abendländische Kirche'. <sup>2</sup> Lortz, Geschichte der Kirche, 1 vii and 7.



xiv

#### Author's preface

one of decline becomes pointless, since both rise and fall are subsumed in God's plan for man's salvation.

What men think about the history of the church and of human salvation is historically determined and subject to historical change. The middle ages tended to see God's hand everywhere in earthly events. The prophetic spirit was accustomed to interpret history on the basis of the Old and New Testaments, and not just the whole course of history but individual events as well. The sacred texts were interpreted inventively and without preconceptions, symbolically, allegorically, and literally, and these interpretations were made to serve both the religious life and also quite concrete earthly interests. It was thought possible to look to the world beyond and determine God's intentions. Nowadays one is generally more modest and more cautious in interpreting the significance for the history of salvation of particular characteristics and changes in the history of the church; nevertheless, many prominent theologians and historians still occasionally risk crossing this frontier. The author of this book belongs to those who refuse strictly to draw any parallels between the visible history of the church and the mystery of divine intentions.

Historical periodisations, if they are not purely chronological, can often be of assistance to the understanding of historical connections, but they also carry the danger of arbitrary or at least one-sided interpretations. Since we nevertheless need a beginning and an end for every survey, the question arises: what could make the history of the church in the tenth and eleventh centuries a coherent period within the history of the church as a whole? To survey such a period might be justified either on the grounds that both centuries have so much in common that they appear by contrast with the periods before and after to form a unity, or on the quite opposite grounds that changes of such significance took place during them that afterwards conceptions of the nature of the church were quite different from those which had prevailed before.

There are convenient labels available for this period: 'Cluny', 'Church reform', 'Gregorianism', 'Reform papacy', 'freeing of the church from lay control'. But do these not, even where they have not simply become clichés, tend if inadequately defined to overstress certain aspects of the historical process and so to conceal more than they explain?

The subtitle of my book of 1936 – 'The church and the ordering of the world in the age of the Investiture Contest' – was already intended to refer primarily to the changes in ecclesiology. In Yves Congar's *Die Lehre von der Kirche* the fifth chapter on the reform of the church in the eleventh century has the subtitle 'the ecclesiological turning point'. In it he writes, among other things, 'The Ecclesiology of the Latin church followed the path which we shall describe: the development of papal authority,



#### Author's preface

xv

juristification, clericalisation, a challenge to secular power which brought the church to see itself as a power'.<sup>3</sup> And Gilles Gérard Meersseman has explained from a new perspective the changes in the relations between clerics and laymen in the life of the church.<sup>4</sup>

These few references may help to suggest that the second half of the eleventh century was an epoch of church history whose importance can only be understood in connection with its preconditions and its consequences. In this sense the period dealt with in this book is determined not so much by its bracketing dates of c. 900 and c. 1100, as above all by the critical era of the second half of the eleventh century and the early twelfth century.

- <sup>3</sup> Y. Congar, Die Lehre von der Kirche. Von Augustinus bis zum abendländischen Schisma (Handbuch der Dogmengeschichte III 3c, Freiburg 1971), 60f.
- <sup>4</sup> Meersseman, Ordo Fraternitatis, 241.



#### ABBREVIATIONS

AfDArchiv für Diplomatik

AHCAnnuarium Historiae Conciliorum AHPArchivum Historiae Pontificum

AHVNAnnalen des historischen Vereins für den

Niederrhein

AKGArchiv für Kulturgeschichte ALWArchiv für Liturgiewissenschaft

Annales ESC Annales. Economies, Sociétés, Civilisations

**AUF** Archiv für Urkundenforschung **BDLG** Blätter für deutsche Landesgeschichte

Bulletino dell'Instituto Storico Italiano per il BISI

Medio Evo

Bouquet, RHF H. Bouquet and M. Brial, Recueil des

Historiens des Gaules et de la France (Paris

1738 - )

H. Bresslau, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches Bresslau,

Jahrbücher Konrads II. unter Konrad II., 2 vols. (Leipzig 1879-84) BZJ.-F. Böhmer, Papstregesten 911-1024,

edited by H. Zimmermann (Vienna 1969)

(cited by number)

Cahiers de Civilisation Médiévale

CCM

Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittel-DA

DACL Dictionnaire d'Archéologie Chrétienne et de

Liturgie

xvi



## List of abbreviations

xvii

-		-	7
1 1	$\boldsymbol{-}$	•	-
-		<b>\1</b>	1.

Dümmler,

Jahrbücher Ottos I. Dümmler, Jahrbücher des ostfränkischen Reiches

EC

EHR FMSt

Hirsch, Pabst, and Bresslau, Jahrbücher Heinrichs II.

HJb HZ

Jaffé, BRG

JE JK JL

JEH LThK Mansi

Meyer von Knonau, Jahrbücher Heinrichs IV.

Meyer von Knonau, Jahrbücher Heinrichs V.

MGH

BDK Capit. Const. Dipl. Dictionnaire d'Histoire et de Géographie Ecclesiastiques

R. Köpke and E. Dümmler, Kaiser Otto der Große (Leipzig 1876)

E. Dümmler, Jahrbücher des ostfränkischen Reiches, 3 vols. 2nd edn (Leipzig 1887–8) P. Jaffé, Epistolae Collectae, Bibliotheca rerum

Germanicarum (Berlin 1865) English Historical Review

Frühmittelalterliche Studien

S. Hirsch, H. Pabst, and H. Bresslau, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches unter Heinrich II., 3 vols. (Leipzig 1862–75)

Historisches Jahrbuch Historische Zeitschrift

P. Jaffé, Bibliotheca rerum Germanicarum, 6 vols. (Berlin 1860–9)

P. Jaffé, Regesta pontificum Romanorum ab condita ecclesia ad annum post Christum natum MCXCVIII, 2nd edn by W. Wattenbach, P. Ewald, F. Kaltenbrunner, and S. Loewenfeld, 2 vols. (Leipzig 1885–8); cited as JK (to AD 590), JE (AD 590–882) or JL (AD 882–1198) and number Journal of Ecclesiastical History

Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche

J. D. Mansi, Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et Amplissima Collectio (Venice 1757–98)

G. Meyer von Knonau, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches unter Heinrich IV. und Heinrich V., vols. 1 to v (Leipzig 1890–1902)

G. Meyer von Knonau, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches unter Heinrich IV. und Heinrich V, vols. vI and vII (Leipzig 1907–9)

Monumenta Germaniae Historica, with subseries:

Die Briefe der deutschen Kaiserzeit Capitularia regum Francorum

Constitutiones Diplomata



Cambridge University Press

0521437113 - The Church in Western Europe from the Tenth to the Early Twelfth

Century - Gerd Tellenbach

Frontmatter/Prelims

More information

xviii	List of abbreviations
AVIII	List of wooleviations

Epp. Epistolae LdL Libelli de Lite

SRG Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum

scholarum

SRG NS Scriptores rerum Germanicarum, nova

series

SS Scriptores in Folio

Migne, PL J. P. Migne, Patrologia Latina (Paris, 1841-

64)

MIÖG Mitteilungen des Instituts für österreichische

Geschichtsforschung

MCSM Miscellanea del Centro di Studi Medievali

(Mendola)

NA Neues Archiv der Gesellschaft für ältere

Geschichtskunde

NSLG Niedersächsisches Jahrbuch für Landesgeschichte

PBA Proceedings of the British Academy

PRE Realencyclopädie für protestantische Theologie

und Kirche

QFIAB Quellen und Forschungen aus Italienischen

Archiven und Bibliotheken

RAC Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum
Registrum Gregorii VII Registrum, ed. E. Caspar

(MGH Epistolae selectae II/1-2, Berlin 1920-3), cited by book and

number

RGG Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart

RH Revue Historique

RHE Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique RQ Römische Quartalschrift

RSCI Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia

RSI Rivista Storica Italiana s.a. sub anno: under the year

Settimane Settimane di Studi sull'alto Medio Evo
Steindorff, E. Steindorff, Jahrbücher des deutschen
Jahrbücher Heinrichs III. deutschen Reiches under Heinrich III., 2 vols.

(Leipzig 1874-81)

StGrat Studia Gratiana StGreg Studi Gregoriani

StMed Studi Medievali, 3rd series

StMGBO Studien und Mitteilungen zur Geschichte des

Benediktinerordens



#### List of abbreviations

xix

TRHS
Uhlirz, Jahrbücher Ottos II.

Translations of the Royal Historical Society
K. Uhlirz, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches
unter Otto II. und Otto III., vol. 1 (Leipzig

1902)

Uhlirz, Jahrbücher Ottos III. K. Uhlirz, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches

unter Otto II. und Otto III., vol. II (Berlin

1954)

VSWG Vierteljahresschrift für Sozial- und Wirtschafts-

geschichte

VuF Vorträge und Forschungen herausgegeben vom

Konstanzer Arbeitskreis für mittelalterliche

Geschichte

WaG Die Welt als Geschichte

Waitz, Jahrbücher Heinrichs I. G. Waitz, Jahrbücher des deutschen Reiches

uinter König Heinrich I. 919-936, 3rd edn

(Leipzig 1883)

ZBLG Zeitschrift für bayerische Landesgeschichte
ZGO Zeitschrift für die Geschichte des Oberrheins

ZKG Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte

ZRGGA Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechts-

geschichte, Germanistische Abteilung

ZRGKA Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechts-

geschichte, Kanonistische Abteilung