

> New methods in comparative and historical research in political economy have not been recognized either within an integrated framework or as a major field of comparative research methodology. The most recent works have stressed historical or qualitative approaches, but not the wide range of quantitative work. Existing comparative methodology texts were written before most new methods were in widespread use; Thomas Janoski and Alexander Hicks fill the gap in comparative political economy by focusing on these new comparative/historical methods - time-series, pooled time and cross-sectional, event history, and Boolean analyses. In the introduction, they provide a sweeping overview of the comparative research process and the methods that have been used in the past decade. In subsequent chapters, distinguished scholars in the field introduce specific methods and then demonstrate each one by applying it to social and economic policy in advanced industrialized states. In the conclusion, Janoski and Hicks clarify the slippery topic of "political economy" and identify the four directions they expect the comparative political economy of the welfare state to take over the next few decades.



THE COMPARATIVE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF THE WELFARE STATE



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE POLITICS

General editor PETER LANGE Duke University

Associate editors

ELLEN COMISSO University of California, San Diego
PETER HALL Harvard University
JOEL MIGDAL University of Washington
HELEN MILNER Columbia University
SIDNEY TARROW Cornell University

This series publishes comparative research that seeks to explain important, cross-national domestic political phenomena. Based on a broad conception of comparative politics, it hopes to promote critical dialogue among different approaches. While encouraging contributions from diverse theoretical perspectives, the series will particularly emphasize work on domestic institutions and work that examines the relative roles of historical structures and constraints, of individual or organizational choice, and of strategic interaction in explaining political actions and outcomes. This focus includes an interest in the mechanisms through which historical factors impinge on contemporary political choices and outcomes.

Works on all parts of the world are welcomed, and priority will be given to studies that cross traditional area boundaries and that treat the United States in comparative perspective. Many of the books in the series are expected to be comparative, drawing on material from more than one national case, but studies devoted to single countries will also be considered, especially those that pose their problem and analysis in such a way that they make a direct contribution to comparative analysis and theory.

OTHER BOOKS IN THE SERIES

Allan Kornberg and Harold D. Clarke Citizens and Community:

Political Support in a Representative Democracy
David D. Laitin Language Repertoires and
State Construction in Africa
Ellen Immergut Health Politics: Interests and Institutions in
Western Europe
Sven Steinmo, Kathleen Thelen, and Frank Longstreth, eds.,
Structuring Politics: Historical Institutionalism in
Comparative Analysis



THE COMPARATIVE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF THE WELFARE STATE

THOMAS JANOSKI

Duke University

ALEXANDER M. HICKS

Emory University





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press 1994

First published 1994

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Janoski, Thomas.

The comparative political economy of the welfare state / Thomas Janoski, Alexander M. Hicks.

cm. - (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)
 Includes index.

ISBN 0-521-43473-4 (hard). – ISBN 0-521-43602-8 (pbk.)

1. Welfare economics. 2. Welfare state. 3. Comparative economics. I. Hicks, Alexander M. II. Title. III. Series.

HB846. J36 1994

330.12'6 – dc20

93-17335 CIP

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 0-521-43473-4 hardback ISBN 0-521-43602-8 paperback



> To our political economy and methodology teachers at Berkeley and Wisconsin as well as Nancy, Ryan, and Nat



Contents

List of contributors List of tables and figures Preface		page x xi xv
1	Methodological innovations in comparative political economy: an introduction	
	Thomas Janoski and Alexander M. Hicks	1
	PART I TIME-SERIES ANALYSIS	
2	Introduction to time-series analysis Thomas Janoski and Larry W. Isaac	31
3	Direct state intervention in the lebor market: the explanation of active labor market policy from 1950 to 1988 in social democratic, conservative, and liberal regimes	
	Thomas Janoski	54
4	Quality of quantity in comparative/historical analysis: temporally changing wage labor regimes in the United States and Sweden	
	Larry W. Isaac, Susan M. Carlson, and Mary P. Mathis	93
5	The politics of public and private investment in Britain John R. Freeman and James E. Alt	136



Contents

PART II POOLED TIME-SERIES AND CROSS-SECTIONAL ANALYSIS

6	Alexander M. Hicks	169
7	The social democratic corporatist model of economic performance in short- and medium-run perspective Alexander M. Hicks	189
8	National variation in the fortunes of labor: a pooled and cross-sectional analysis of the impact of economic crisis in the advanced capitalist nations <i>Philip J. O'Connell</i>	218
	PART III EVENT HISTORY ANALYSIS	
9	Introduction to event history methods David Strang	245
10	Welfare state development in a world system context: event history analysis of first social insurance legislation among 60 countries, 1880–1960 Chikako Usui	254
11	British and French political institutions and the patterning of decolonization David Strang	278
	PART IV BOOLEAN ANALYSIS	
12	Introduction to qualitative comparative analysis Charles C. Ragin	299
13	A qualitative comparative analysis of pension systems Charles C. Ragin	320
14	qualitative comparisons, and cluster analysis Olli Kangas	346



Contents

15	Conclusion: <i>quo vadis</i> political economy? Theory and methodology in the comparative analysis of the welfare	
	state Thomas Janoski and Alexander M. Hicks	365
Aut	hor index	381
Subject index		384



Contributors

James E. Alt Harvard University

Susan M. Carlson University of North Carolina, Charlotte

John R. Freeman University of Minnesota

Alexander M. Hicks Emory University

Larry W. Isaac Florida State University

Thomas Janoski Duke University

Olli Kangas University of Turku, Finland Philip J. O'Connell
University of North Carolina,
Chapel Hill
Economics and Social Research
Institute, Dublin

Mary P. Mathis Emory University

Charles C. Ragin Northwestern University

David Strang Cornell University

Chikako Usui University of Missouri, St. Louis



Tables and figures

TABLES

1.1	Mill's methods of inductive reasoning	page	14
1.2	Comparisons using internal and external analysis		20
2.1	Types of temporal concepts and locations of possible		
	change in time-series models of historical process		41
3.1	Government expenditures on active labor market polic	y	
	divided by GNP	•	55
3.2	The determinants of active labor market policy		
	expenditures, 1950-87		68
3.3	Sweden: the determinants of active labor market policy	y	
	expenditures over GNP, 1950-88		70
3.4	West Germany: the determinants of active labor market	et	
	policy expenditures over GNP, 1952-88		71
3.5	United States: the determinants of active labor market		
	policy expenditures over GNP, 1950-88		75
3.6	Comparisons of regression equations for Sweden,		
	West Germany, and the United States		78
3.7	Summary of results		79
4.1	Summary statistics for "output" and "parameter"		
	structures in the United States	1	121
4.2	Social Keynesian-stabilized wage labor regime:		
	Sweden, 1950-87	1	122
4.3	, ,		
	inflation, and wages: subperiod averages for		
	post-World War II United States and Sweden	-	124
5.1	Vector autoregressive model and theoretical predictions		144
5.2	F-statistics for six-variable vector autoregressive model		
	Britain, 1956-III thru 1984-II	1	149



Tables and figures

5.3	Tests for homegeneity across major political and	
	ecomonic eras and administrations: six-variable vector	
~ .	autoregressive models	151
5.4	Percentages of forecast error variance k quarters ahead produced by each innovation: Britain 1956-III thru	4.50
	1984-II	153
6.1	Modes of pooled analysis	182
7.1	Social democratic corporatist, interactive model of economic performance	192
7.2	Policy instruments for achievement of aggregate economic growth and high unemployment: short- and	
	medium-run effects	197
7.3	Congenial estimation models/techniques for combinations of theoretical time frame, temporal/spatial dominance in variance of data array, and stress of error structure	
	model	200
7.4	Short- and medium-run GLS analyses of percent growth in real GDP, 1966-83, with a focus on policy	
	instruments	203
7.5	Short- and medium-run GLS analyses of percent growth	
	in unemployment rates, 1966-83, with a focus on policy instruments	204
7.6	Short- and medium-run GLS analyses of percent growth	
	in real GDP, 1966-83, with a focus on SDC factors	207
7.7	Short- and medium-run GLS analyses of percent growth and levels of unemployment rates, 1966-83, with a	
	focus on SDC factors	209
8.1	Variables, operationalization, and data sources	228
8.2	Means and standard deviations of major variables by	
	institutional and macroeconomic context	231
8.3	Unstandardized regression coefficients for models of real compensation per worker during expansionary period,	
	1961–73	233
8.4	Unstandardized regression coefficients for models of real compensation per worker during crisis period, 1974–83	235
10.1	Effects of domestic and world variables on the rate of	
10.1	first social insurance legislation, 1880–1960	267
10.2	Effects of domestic and world variables on the rate of	207
10.2	first social insurance legislation, 1880–1960	268
11.1	Decolonization counts by empire, 1870–1987	283
11.2	Descriptive statistics: colonial dependencies, 1870–1987	288
11.3	Maximum likelihood estimates for transitions to	200
11.3	independence, 1870–1987	289

xii



12.2

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-43602-1 - The Comparative Political Economy of the Welfare State Thomas Janoski and Alexander M. Hicks Frontmatter More information

Tables and figures

Case-oriented and variable-oriented research strategies

Simple example of QCA using hypothetical data

13.1	Characteristics of pension systems	323
13.2	Summary of causal variables	327
13.3	Example of winsorized-standardized values:	
	a 20 percent trim of LEFCAB	331
13.4	The translation of the truth table to cluster centers	333
13.5	Results of the cluster analysis of causal conditions	334
13.6	Cluster analysis of characteristics of pension systems	335
13.7	Truth table for causes of diversity among pension	
	systems	337
14.1	OLS regression of the level of social rights in health	
	insurance in 1950 and 1985	351
14.2	Truth table for causes of quality of health insurance	
	provisions in 1950	354
14.3	Truth table for causes of quality of health insurance	
	provisions in 1985	354
15.1	The substance of political economy studies	372
	FIGURES	
1 1	A	o
1.1	A model of the comparative research process	8
4.1	Rates of unemployment and inflation: United States,	10/
4.3	1890–1988	106
4.2	Percent change in nominal and real wage rates:	405
4.5	United States, 1891–1988	107
4.3	Temporally moving covariances between unemployment	
	and percent change in manufacturing hourly real wage	40=
	rates: United States, 1890–1900,, 1890–1988	107
4.4	Rates of unemployment and inflation: Sweden,	
	1937–87	116
4.5	Percent change in norminal and real wage rates:	
	Sweden, 1947-87	116
4.6	Temporally moving covariances between unemployment	
	and percent change in manufacturing hourly real wage	

intention to vote for the incumbent government (VOTE) xiii

Simulated response of the moving-average representation of the six-variable British political economic system to a one standard deviation, orthogonalized, positive surge or shock in the proportion of the electorate expressing an

rates: Sweden, 1950-9, ..., 1950-87

117

155

302

310



Tables and figures

5.2	Simulated response of the moving-average representation of the six-variable British political economic system to a one standard deviation, orthogonalized, positive surge or shock in the log of combined government investment (PUB-GOVT)	156
5.3		
	(PUB-GOVT)	157
5.4	Simulated response of the moving-average representation of the six-variable British political economic system to a one standard deviation, orthogonalized, positive surge or shock in the log of combined government investment	
	(PUB-GOVT)	158
10.1	Events in social insurance adoption by programs	
	(N = 60): first adoptions	263
10.2	Events in social insurance adoption by programs	
	(N = 60): work injury programs	264
10.3	First adoption of social security system - all countries	265
11.1	British decolonization	284
11.2	French decolonization	285
14.1	Dendrogram plots on characteristics of health insurance	
	schemes in OECD countries in 1950	358
14.2	Dendrogram plots on characteristics of health insurance	
	schemes in OECD countries in 1985	358



Preface

This book is intended to be an analog of sorts to Theda Skocpol's edited volume Vision and Method in Historical Sociology. The format is entirely different in that we organize it around method rather than author, focus it as much on specific policy theories as on general visions, and target it as much on methodological techniques as on designs. Yet the intent is the same – to introduce a broad range of methodological approaches to the comparative social sciences. In keeping with Charles Ragin's concept of synthetic analysis, we see this volume joining together an ample range of comparative, quantitative, and, indeed, historical methods. A mesh of methods enriches a field. We hope that our net is tight and broad enough to gather a rich new catch of insights about the welfare state.

This book began in the planning of a Southern Sociological Society session and then reached fruition in the "New Compass of the Comparativist" conference held at Duke University in 1991. Three sources in Durham, New York, and Washington, D.C., provided approximately equal funding to finance the conference on which this book is largely based. First, we would like to thank Edward Tiryakian, Director of the Center for International Studies at Duke University, for providing the seed funding that started the ball rolling on this project. Without his help, this project would probably not have gotten off the ground. Second, we would also like to thank Dr. Ioannis Sinanoglou and the Council for European Studies for their Western European Studies Workshop Grant. And third, we thank William V. D'Antonio for funding from the joint American Sociological Association/National Science Foundation Fund for the Advancement of the Discipline. All three sources contributed equally in making the conference a success and this book a reality.

We would like to thank those who contributed to and participated in the "New Compass of the Comparativist" conference: Peter Bearman of the University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, Gary Gereffi of Duke



Preface

University, Larry Griffin of Vanderbilt University, Larry Isaac of Florida State University, Miguel Korzeniewicz of the University of New Mexico, Peter Lange of Duke University, Philip O'Connell of the University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, Charles Ragin of Northwestern University, Richard Rubinson of Emory University, David Smith of the University of California-Irvine, David Strang of Cornell University, George Tsebellis of the University of California-Los Angeles, Chikako Usui of the University of Missouri-St. Louis, and Michael Wallerstein of the University of California-Los Angeles. We would especially like to thank Charles Ragin for his roles as discussant and presenter and in helping us obtain two key participants. Graduate students from the Duke University sociology and political science departments played an important role in the conference. They met with paper presenters concerning the methodology and substance of each paper presented. We would like to thank these discussants also: Michael Alvarez, Phillip Atkison, Jihee Choi, Adele Cummings, Stephanie Fonda, Fabrice Laboucq, Patrice LeClerc, Bryan Lyond, P. A. McManus, Stephen Russell, and Vince Salazar. Finally, we thank Judith Dillon for her conference planning and Adele Cummings, Rhonda Dollas, and Brigitte Neary for their logistical support.

At Cambridge University Press, we have a debt of gratitude toward Peter Lange, the series editor, and Emily Loose, social sciences editor. Peter and Emily provided timely editorial input, and Peter also served as a discussant at the conference. Emily Loose gave accurate and optimistic input even when an early review was less than enthusiastic.

We would also like to thank our four anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press for their instructive and critical feedback and the seven reviewers connected to funding this project for their views. Finally, Amby Rice and Judith Dillion at the Duke University Sociology Department entered and often reconstructed our tables and figures from a diverse array of styles and programs.

This book is in part dedicated to our political economy and methodology teachers at Berkeley and Madison. Although many teachers made important contributions, the Berkeley author would like to thank Harold Wilensky, who has been a driving force in welfare state analysis and has always warned against methodological dogmatism. The Madison author additionally would like to thank the originators and participants in the weekly "social organization" and "methodology" seminars of the 1970s Sociology Department, exemplary intellectual pluralists all.