

## The fine art of repetition

Peter Kivy is the author of many books on the philosophy of art and, in particular, the aesthetics of music. This collection of essays spans a period of some thirty years and focuses on a richly diverse set of issues: the biological origin of music, the role of music in the liberal education, the nature of the musical work and its performance, the aesthetics of opera, the emotions of music, and the very nature of music itself. Some of these subjects are viewed as part of the history of ideas, others as current problems in the philosophy of art.

A particular feature of the volume is that Kivy avoids the use of musical notation so that no technical knowledge at all is required to appreciate his work. Thus, the essays will prove enjoyable and insightful not just to professionals in the philosophy of art and musicologists, or to musicians themselves, but also to any motivated general reader with a deep interest in music.



# The fine art of repetition

Essays in the philosophy of music

## PETER KIVY

RUTGERS: THE STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW JERSEY





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Victoria 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press, 1993

First published 1993

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Kivy, Peter.

The fine art of repetition: essays in the philosophy of music / Peter Kivy.

p. cm.

Collection of essays written over the past thirty years and published in various books and journals.

ISBN 0-521-43462-9 (hbk.) - ISBN 0-521-43598-6 (pbk.)

1. Music - Philosophy and aesthetics. I. Title.

ML3845.K583 1993

781'.1 – dc20

92-25274 CIP

MN

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 0-521-43462-9 hardback ISBN 0-521-43598-6 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2001



> For Arthur Danto: Who taught my generation how to make philosophy of art



". . . they say it is possible to select the best laws, as though even the selection did not demand intelligence and as though right judgement were not the greatest thing, as in matters of music."

Aristotle, Ethica Nicomachea (trans. W. D. Ross)



## **Contents**

	Preface	page 1X
	Introduction	1
	PRELUDE: MUSIC AND US	
I	Music and the liberal education	11
	WORK AND PERFORMANCE	
II	Platonism in music: A kind of defense	35
III	Platonism in music: Another kind of defense	59
IV	Orchestrating Platonism	75
V	Live performances and dead composers: On the	
	ethics of musical interpretation	95
VI	On the concept of the "historically authentic" per-	
	formance	117
VII	THE WORLD OF OPERA	
VII VIII	Opera talk: A philosophical "phantasie"	137
111	How did Mozart do it?: Living conditions in the world of opera	160
ΙX	•	
IX	flow did Mozart do it:. Replies to some chites	178
	MUSIC AND THE HISTORY OF IDEAS	
Χ	Mozart and monotheism: An essay in spurious	
	aesthetics	189
ΧI	Child Mozart as an aesthetic symbol	200
XII	Charles Darwin on music	214

vii



#### Contents

	MUSIC AND EMOTION	
XIII	Mattheson as philosopher of art	229
	Kant and the Affektenlehre: What he said, and what	-
	I wish he had said	250
XV	Something I've always wanted to know about	
	Hanslick	265
XVI	What was Hanslick denying?	276
XVII	A new music criticism?	296
	MUSIC ALONE	
XVIII	The fine art of repetition	327
	Is music an art?	360



### **Preface**

The essays collected in this volume, written over a period of thirty years, and parceled out among a variety of journals and books, are addressed to an audience of philosophers, musicians, scholars in other disciplines, and whatever part of a general readership that might be interested in topics at the same time both musical and philosophical. It is not likely that any member of any one of these groups would have had access to more than a few of the places where these essays have appeared. I am delighted, therefore, that they are now together in one place, so as to be available to a larger audience than heretofore.

The earliest essay in this collection was published in 1959, the most recent is published here for the first time. It cannot be expected that essays written over so long a period of time will be entirely consistent with one another, or with my other writings on musical aesthetics, either in questions of philosophy or in points of historical interpretation. I know I have changed my mind on various issues since 1959, and I hope I have learned a few things as well. Nevertheless, rereading my essays, in the preparation of this volume, I have concluded that even at the outset I had, if not a core of fixed beliefs, at least some basic intuitions regarding what music is, and how one should talk about it.

Thus, in spite of the long period of time over which these essays were written, I think of them as an integrated body of work, and of a piece, as well, with the series of books on the philosophy of music I have published since 1980. And I am



### Preface

glad that now, with the publication of these essays in a single volume, my work on the philosophy of music to date can be viewed and (I hope) discussed in its entirety.

The original places and dates of publication are as follows:

I: The Journal of Aesthetic Education 25 (1991), pp. 79-93. II: Grazer philosophische Studien 19 (1983), pp. 109-29. III: American Philosophical Quarterly 24 (1983), pp. 245-52. IV: Aesthetic Distinction: Essays Presented to Göran Hermerén on His 50th Birthday, ed. T. Anderberg, T. Nilstun, and I. Persson (Lund: Lund University Press, 1988), pp. 42-55. V: Human Agency: Language, Duty and Value, ed. Jonathan Dancy, J. M. E. Moravcsik, and C. C. W. Taylor (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988), pp. 219-36. Reprinted by permission of Stanford University Press. © 1988 by the Board of Trustees of the Leland Stanford Junior University. VI: The Monist 71 (1988), pp. 278-90. Copyright © 1988 by The Monist, La Salle, IL 61301. Reprinted by permission. VII: Cambridge Opera Journal 3 (1991), pp. 63-77. VIII: Published here for the first time. IX: Published here for the first time. X: Journal of Musicology 2 (1983), pp. 322-8. XI: Journal of the History of Ideas 28 (1967), pp. 249-58. XII: Journal of the American Musicological Society 12 (1959), pp. 42-8. XIII: The Musical Quarterly 70 (1984), pp. 248-65. XIV: Kant's Aesthetics, ed. Ralf Meerbote and Hud Hudson, Volume I of the North American Kant Society Studies in Philosophy (Altascadero, CA: Ridgeview, 1991), pp. 63-74. Reprinted by permission of Ridgeview Publishing Company. XV: Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 46 (1988), pp. 413-17. XVI: Journal of Musicology 8 (1990), pp. 3-18. XVII: The Monist 73 (1990), pp. 247-68. Copyright © 1990 by The Monist, LaSalle, IL 61301. Reprinted by permission. XVIII: Published here for the first time. XIX: Journal of Philosophy 88, 10 (October 1991), pp. 544-54.