

Politics, Theology and History is a major new book by a prominent academic and an active politician. It ranges widely across the disciplines of theology, political theory and philosophy and poses acute questions about the basic moral foundations of liberal societies.

Lord Plant focuses on the role that religious belief can and ought to play in argument about public policy in a pluralistic society. He examines the potential political implications of Christian belief and the ways in which it may be deployed in political debate. The book is a contribution to the modern debate about the moral pluralism of western liberal societies, discussing the place of religious belief in the formation of policy and asking what sorts of issues in modern society might be the legitimate objects of a Christian social and political concern.

Raymond Plant has written an important study of the relationship between religion and politics which will be of value to students, academics, politicians, church professionals, policy makers and all concerned with the moral fabric of contemporary life.

RAYMOND PLANT is Professor of European Political Thought at the University of Southampton and a Member of the House of Lords. He was a Home affairs spokesperson for the Labour Party from 1992 to 1996, and Master of St Catherine's College, Oxford, from 1994 to 2000. Lord Plant's main publications are Social and Moral Theory in Casework (1970), Community and Ideology: An Essay in Applied Moral Philosophy (1974), Hegel (1974), Political Philosophy and Social Welfare (with H. Lesser and P. Taylor-Gooby, 1979), Philosophy, Politics and Citizenship (with A. Vincent, 1983), Hegel: Second Edition (1983) and Modern Political Thought (1994).



POLITICS, THEOLOGY AND HISTORY



#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN IDEOLOGY AND RELIGION

General Editors: Duncan Forester and Alistair Kee

Editorial Board: José míguez bonino, rebecca s. chopp, John de gruchy, graham howes, yeow choo lak, David mclellan, kenneth medhurst, raymond plant, Christopher rowland, elisabeth schüssler-fiorenza, Charles Villa-Vicencio, haddon wilmer

Religion increasingly is seen as a renewed force, and is recognized as an important factor in the modern world in all aspects of life cultural, economic, and political. It is no longer a matter of surprise to find religious factors at work in areas and situations of political tension. However, our information about these situations has tended to come from two main sources. The news-gathering agencies are well placed to convey information, but are hampered by the fact that their representatives are not equipped to provide analysis of the religious forces involved. Alternatively, the movements generate their own accounts, which understandably seem less than objective to outside observers. There is no lack of information of factual material, but a real need for sound academic analysis. Cambridge Studies in Ideology and Religion meets this need. It attempts to give an objective, balanced and programmed coverage to issues which - while of wide potential interest – have been largely neglected by analytical investigation, apart from the appearance of sporadic individual studies. Intended to enable debate to proceed at a higher level, the series should lead to a new phase in our understanding of the relationship between ideology and religion.

A list of titles already published in the series is given at the end of the book.



# POLITICS, THEOLOGY AND HISTORY

#### RAYMOND PLANT

University of Southampton Honorary Fellow of St Catherine's College, Oxford





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, VIC 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2001

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface 11/12.5pt Baskerville System 3b2 [CE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ısвn o 521 43320 7 hardback ısвn o 521 43881 o paperback



To
The Master and Fellows
St Catherine's College
Oxford



We do not know what to do, but our eyes are upon you.

2 Chronicles 20.12.

World remains World. But God is God Karl Barth, Kriegszeit und Gottesreich



### **Contents**

Prej	face	page xiii
I	Liberal society and political theology	I
PAI	RT I THE POSSIBILITY OF POLITICAL THEOLOGY	24
2	Theology and politics: context, community and prophecy	25
3	God, history and political theology	44
4	Totality, finitude and history	79
5	Narratives and foundations	112
6	Natural law and natural order	142
PAI	RT II THE SITE OF POLITICAL THEOLOGY	171
	Introduction	173
7	Markets, morality and theology	177
8	Social justice, freedom and the common good	196
9	Human rights, human dignity and the scope of responsibility	224
ю	Self and community	257

хi



xii	Contents	
PART III LIBERALISM, RELIGION AND SOCIAL U		297
	Introduction	299
ΙΙ	Policy and pluralism	303
12	The civil community, the religious community and the unity of society	330
Sele	ect bibliography	36o
Index of names		373
Index of subjects		377



## **Preface**

A good deal of modern political theory in recent years has been dominated by issues to do with liberalism, pluralism and the claims of community. The present book aims to be a contribution to that debate. It does, however, come to the issues in an indirect way. Most of the current literature is written in a rather abstract way and leads to conclusions of a rather general sort about the place of moral communities, such as those of religious believers, within a liberal society. This book starts in the opposite direction. It looks at the idea that religious belief, in this case Christian belief, has clear implications for the nature and organisation of society and politics, and goes on to look at how all of these ideas relate to the politics of a liberal society. It therefore tries to answer three questions:

What, if any, are the social and political implications of Christian belief?

If there are such implications, to which aspects of modern society do they relate?

What role, if any, should such beliefs play in the policies of a liberal society?

The book aims, therefore, to be part of a modern debate about the relationship between liberalism and moral and religious pluralism.

The book has had a very long period of gestation and has been through many drafts written for different audiences. I first thought about the project in the late 1980s and since then I have been fortunate enough to be asked to give various series of lectures which have allowed me to focus more clearly upon my concerns. So the present book brings together the following:



xiv Preface

The Stanton Lectures in the Philosophy of Religion at Cambridge University 1989–1991; The Sarum Lectures at Oxford University in Hilary Term 1991; the Samuel Ferguson Lectures at the University of Manchester in 1993; the Scott Holland Lectures at Manchester Cathedral in 1994; the Gore Lecture at Westminster Abbey and Birmingham Cathedral in 1996; the R. H. Tawney Lecture in London in 1999; the Eleanor Rathbone Memorial Lecture at the University of Bristol in 1997; the St George's House, Windsor Castle Lecture in 1997 and the John Baillie Lecture at Edinburgh University in 1996. I am pleased to thank the various electoral boards and trustees of these lectures and institutions for inviting me to give them and for the incentive they provided to reflect upon my rather zigzagging approach to these problems.

I should also like to thank St John's College and Jesus College, Cambridge for hospitality during my tenure of the Stanton Lectureship, and Christchurch, Oxford for hospitality during my tenure of the Sarum Lectureship. I am also indebted to Harris Manchester College, Oxford, of which I am pleased to be an Honorary Fellow, for the use of its library. Thanks are also due to Sally Collins, Librarian of St Catherine's College, Oxford, for help in tracking down arcane materials.

As a non-theologian, whose reading in theology has been sporadic and ill disciplined, I owe a number of people great debts for intellectual help: Professor Nicholas Lash, Bishop Steven Sykes and Professor Nicholas Sagovsky in Cambridge; Professor O. and Dr J. O'Donovan, Professor M. Wiles, the Rt. Revd Rowan Williams and the Very Revd John Drury at Christchurch; John Lucas at Merton College and Dr Ernest Nicholson Provost of Oriel in Oxford: members of the DASH group and in particular the late David Nicholls; Professor John Haldane of St Andrew's University who gave me some of his writings; and Brendan McLaughlin at St Catherine's College who put me right about Prudentius. Special thanks are also due to Professor Duncan Forrester and Professor David Pailin who invited me to lecture at Edinburgh and Manchester Universities respectively and who have been friends and intellectual guides of many years standing. I would also like to thank Professor



Preface xv

Ronald Preston and Canon John Atherton who have taken an interest in this book during its evolution.

I also acknowledge a debt to the late Fr. J. Westmoreland and to the late Fr. K. Richardson of St Augustine's Anglican church in Grimsby, who taught me most of what I know about Christian belief and whose own faith was uncluttered by the doubts and complexities which form the substance of this book. Fr. Westmoreland gave me a book on Goethe when I was about thirteen and created an interest in continental thought during the *Goethezeit* which has stayed with me ever since and which makes intermittent appearances in the book.

During the main period of writing this book I was Master of St Catherine's College, Oxford and I have been pleased that I have been able to finish it before demitting office at the end of 1999. I owe an enormous debt to my two secretaries Margaret Lavercombe and Judith Arneil who not only typed the book but also balanced the frantic pressures of a life divided between academic work, administration and politics. Without them the book would never have been completed. I would also like to thank Jane Parker, my secretary in Southampton, for her enormous help in the final stages. I have also been much helped by Gillian Maude who copy-edited the manuscript for Cambridge University Press.

I have to thank my family, and particularly my wife Katherine for her support during an exceptionally busy period in my life: *Wir leben durch die Lieb' allein*. The book is dedicated to all our friends and colleagues at St Catherine's College.