

Cambridge University Press

0521430690 - Universality and the Liar: An Essay on Truth and the Diagonal Argument -

Keith Simmons

Index

[More information](#)

Index

- Adams, Marilyn McCord, xi, 183 *n6*, 199–200 *n5*
affirmative insoluble, *see* insoluble
Albert of Saxony, 90, 204 *n44*
algorithmic function, 31–2, 189 *n30*
ampliation, 90–1, 204 *ns39&44*, 204–5 *n45*
anaphoric Liar, 108, 109, 124, 133, 177, 178,
181, 193 *n24*; *see also* singularity
anaphoric singularity, *see* singularity
Aristotelian conception of truth, 11
Aristotle, 83, 89, 90
Asher, Nicholas, 192–3 *n24*
Ashworth, E. J., 201 *n13*, 202 *n25*
asymmetrical network, 112, 120; *see also*
nonexplicit reflection
- Bain, David, xii
Bar-Hillel, Y., 183 *n6*
Bar-On, Dorit, xii, 186 *n48*
Barwise, Jon, x, 96, 101, 106, 179, 183 *n1*,
214 *n9*
basic tree, 113, 115, 119, 125–6; extended
definitions of, 161, 167, 176, 178
Belnap, Nuel, 196–7 *n16*
β-level reflection, 134
β-reflective sentence, 135
bivalence, *see* principle of bivalence
Bocheński, I. M., 185–6 *n22*, 199 *n3*, 201
n12, 201 *ns12&14*
Bochvar, D. A., *see* three-valued logic
Boehner, Philotheus, 201 *n13*
Boolos, George, 183 *n1*
Bottin, Francesco, 201 *n13*
Bradwardine, Thomas, 183 *n8*, 184 *n11*,
200 *ns7&10*
Brandom, Robert, x, 9, 78–80
Burali-Forti's paradox, 187 *n1*
Burge, Tyler, x, xi, 96–8, 101, 104, 106, 179,
192 *ns17&19*, 207 *ns68&74*, 208 *n5*, 210
n25, 213 *ns3(Ch8)&4(Ch9)*, 214 *n8*
- Buridan, John, 4, 110, 111, 183 *n3*
Burley, Walter, x, 84–98, 184 *n9*, 186 *n22*,
201 *ns12&19*, 202 *n23*, 202–3 *n27*, 203
ns29&30, 205 *ns47&49*, 206 *ns54&58*;
see also Ockham–Burley–Pseudo–
Sherwood solution
- Cantor, Georg, 187 *ns1&2*
Cantor's diagonal argument, *see* diagonal
argument
Cantor's paradox, 35; as a diagonal
argument, 35, 188 *n19*
Cantor's power set theorem, 20, 21, 27, 35,
39, 187 *n1*, 187–8 *n7*, 188 *n9*
Cantor's theorem, 16–17, 19, 20–1, 22–5,
26, 27, 29, 32, 187 *n1*
cassantes, *see* cassation
cassation, 183 *n8*, 200 *n8*
category mistake, 9, 55
chains, 4–6, 8, 100, 109–12, 119, 127, 128–9,
138, 150–1, 151–2, 155, 156, 183 *n4*, 203
n29, 211 *n2*; *see also* heads a chain
choice negation, 53; *see also* exclusion
negation
Chrysippus, 83
Church, Alonzo, 13, 206 *n63*
Church's thesis, 44
Cohen, L. Jonathan, 213 *n3(Ch8)*
complete explicit reflection, *see* explicit
reflection
context-independent uses of 'true', 173–5,
177, 180, 181, 182
contextual approaches to the Liar, 93–4,
96–8, 101–6
Curry's paradox, 3–4, 148–9
cycling paradoxes: semantic, 27, 37; set-
theoretic, 27, 34–5
- d'Ailly, Pierre, 184 *n10*, 185–6 *n22*, 200 *n7*,
201 *ns12,14,&15*

Index

- Dauben, J. W., 187 *n4*
 Davidson, Donald, 195 *n30*
 Definite Liar, 74–6, 78; as a diagonal argument, 73–4
 definite truth, 72–8
 de Rijk, L. M., 201 *n16*, 204 *ns39&44*
 diagonal argument, Cantor’s use of, 16–7, 20–2, 26, 27, 187 *n1*
 diagonal argument, general analysis, 22–6, 37–9; array of, 22, 37–8; cells of an array, 23; countervalue of a diagonal, 24–5, 38; diagonal, 23–4, 38, 188 *n9*; occurrence as a row, 25, 38; side of an array, 22; top of an array, 22; value of a diagonal, 24, 38; values of an array, 22, 37
 diagonal arguments, direct and indirect: direct, 26, 29–33, 35, 36, 37; indirect, 26, 29, 33, 35, 37
 diagonal arguments, good and bad: good, 20, 27, 29–37, 45, 52–3, 56–8, 61, 62, 66–7, 68, 71, 73–4, 75, 76, 78, 189 *n31*; bad, 20, 27, 28–9, 31–7, 45, 60–1, 188 *n19*, 189 *n31*, 190 *n39*
 diagonal theorems: basic, 25; generalized, 38, 43, 190 *n38*
 Diogenes Laertius, 83
 Du Bois-Reymond, Paul, 187 *n1*
 Dumbleton, John, 183 *n6*
 Etchemendy, John, x, 96, 101, 106, 179, 183 *n1*, 214 *n9*
 Eubulides, 83
 evaluated sentence, 102; *see also* evaluation
 evaluated tree, 114–15, 115–16, 119
 evaluated₀ tree, 132; extended definition of, 161
 evaluated_β tree, 137; extended definitions of, 161, 167, 176, 178
 evaluation, 102; *see also* explicit reflection; nonexplicit reflection
 exclusion negation, 53–5, 192 *n20*; *see also* choice negation
 explicit reflection, 102, 118–20, 123, 127–8, 211 *n2*; complete explicit reflection, 103, 118–21, 128, 208–9 *n6*, 209 *n13*, 211 *n7*; partial explicit reflection, 102–3, 118–21, 128, 208–9 *n6*, 209 *n13*, 211 *n7*; *see also* nonexplicit reflections
 expressive incompleteness, 18–19, 36, 45–7, 58–61, 66–7, 73, 78, 98
 fallacy *secundum quid et simpliciter*, 83, 85–6, 89–91, 94, 202 *ns21&23*, 203 *n35*, 204 *ns37&40*
 false₀ sentence, 123
 false₁ sentence, 132
 false_α sentence, 139
 Feferman, Solomon, x, 70–2, 77, 197 *ns17&18*
 Fine, Kit, 185 *n17*
 Fitch, Frederic B., 183 *n8*, 184 *ns9&10*, 190 *n1*
 Frege, Gottlob, 55, 206–7 *n63*
 further singularities, *see* singularity
 fuzzy logic, 56–8; Zadeh’s fuzzy logic, 57–8, 185 *n17*
 fuzzy truth values, 57–8, 59
 Gaifman, Haim, x, 96, 101, 106, 211 *ns2&7*
 Garver, Newton, 183 *n6*
 global sentences, 97, 182, 207 *n74*
 global truth predicate, *see* universal truth predicate
 Goddard, Leonard, 188 *n10*
 Gödel, Kurt, 94–6, 107, 116, 188–9 *n23*, 189 *n26*, 206 *n61*, 206–7 *n63*, 207 *n64*, 210 *n31*
 Gödel’s first incompleteness theorem, x, 20, 27, 29–31, 32; as a diagonal theorem, 30–1
 Goldstein, Laurence, 201 *n15*, 206 *n58*
 Grabmann, Martin, 201 *n16*
 Grattan-Guinness, Ivor, 187 *n1*
 Grelling’s paradox, *see* heterological paradox
 grounded sentence, 15, 100, 121–3, 129, 136, 139, 159–63, 176, 181, 210 *n28*, 211 *ns5&6*; grounded β-reflective sentence, 136; grounded reflection-free sentence, 129; grounded sentence of level α, 139, 160; *see also* Kripke’s theory of truth; paradoxes of grounding
 Gupta, Anil, x, 62–9, 70, 72, 196 *ns7&12*, 196–7 *n16*
 g-witness, 122–3; extended definitions of, 167, 176, 178
 Haack, Susan, 195 *n29*
 halting problem, 33–4
 Hart, W. D., xi, 184 *n10*
 heads a chain, 127
 Herzberger, Hans G., x, 58–61, 62–9, 70, 72, 188 *n10*, 195 *n31*, 196 *n7*, 196–7 *n16*, 206 *n63*
 heterological paradox, 1, 2, 9, 19, 27, 45–6, 52, 95, 96; as a diagonal argument, 17–18, 35–6, 41, 42, 59–61; three-dimensional version, 40–1; *n*-dimensional version, 42; *see also* superheterological paradox
 Heytesbury, William, 183 *n6*, 200 *n7*

Index

- hierarchy of languages, *see* Tarskian hierarchy of languages
 Hintikka, Jaakko, 206 *n*63
- inconsistent worlds, 78–80
 insoluble: affirmative, 86, 88, 89, 96;
 negative, 86, 87, 88
- Jeffrey, Richard, 183 *n*1
 Johnston, Mark, 188 *n*10
- Kalish, Donald, 188 *n*11
 Kaplan, David, xi
 key singularity, *see* singularity
 Kleene, S. C., 43, 189 *n*28, *see also* three-valued logic
 Kneale, W. C., 183 *n*6
 Kretzmann, Norman, 203 *n*36, 204 *n*39
 Kripke, Saul, 6
 Kripke's theory of truth, x, 47–55, 62, 63,
 66, 70, 72, 73, 76, 77–8, 184 *n*12, 185
 *n*13, 191 *n*15, 192 *n*20, 192–3 *n*24, 193–5
 *n*25, 215 *n*14; grounded sentences,
 47–8, 66, 192–3 *n*24, 193–4 *n*25;
 minimal fixed point, 49–52, 53, 66, 73,
 75, 76, 193–4 *n*25, 196–7 *n*16;
 paradoxical sentences, 48
- Liar paradox, 1–7; empirical versions of,
 5–6, 7–8, 11–12, 13; *see also* anaphoric Liar; Definite Liar; Revenge Liar;
 Strengthened Liar; Superliar paradox
 Löb's theorem, 183 *n*1
 looped sentence, 4–6, 100, 110–12, 127,
 151–2, 156, 203 *n*29; Nixon/Dean loop,
 142–5; policeman/prisoner loop, 145–8
 Łukasiewicz, J., *see* three-valued logic
 Lycan, William, xi
- Mar, Gary, 188 *n*11
 Martin, D. A., xi
 Martin, Robert L., 9, 45, 46, 55, 184
 *ns*10&12, 188 *n*10, 191 *n*13, 195 *ns*33&34
 McGee, Vann, x, 9, 72–8, 197 *ns*29&31, 198
 *ns*33&38, 199 *n*41
 metalanguage, 12–13, 18, 99; and Feferman,
 71–2; and Herzberger and Gupta, 67–9;
 and Kripke, 52–3, 62, 76, 192 *n*20; and
 McGee, 75, 76–8; and Ockham–Burley–Pseudo-Sherwood, 92–3; and Priest, 80–2;
 and Rescher and Brandom, 80; and
 singularity approach, 117, 140–1,
 159, 160, 164, 168, 173–81; *see also*
 metalanguage; Tarskian hierarchy of
 languages; theoretical language
 Minimality, *see* principle of Minimality
 Montague, Richard, 188 *n*11
 Moody, Ernest A., 201 *n*12
 Moschovakis, Y. N., 191 *n*14
- negative insoluble, *see* insoluble
 nonexplicit reflection, 112, 115, 120, 127,
 129, 135, 209 *n*12, 211 *n*2; *see also*
 explicit reflections
 Normore, Calvin, xi
- object language, 12–13; and Feferman,
 71; and Herzberger and Gupta, 67–8,
 71; and Kripke, 62, 76; and McGee,
 76; and Ockham–Burley–Pseudo-Sherwood,
 92–3; and Priest, 80–2;
 and Rescher and Brandom, 80; and
 singularity approach, 117, 140–1,
 159, 160, 164, 168, 173–81; *see also*
 metalanguage; Tarskian hierarchy of
 languages; theoretical language
 Ockham, *see* William of Ockham
 Ockham–Burley–Pseudo-Sherwood
 solution, 83–98, 100, 203 *n*29&33, 207
 *n*74, 207–8 *n*3, 210 *n*23
- paraconsistent approach to the Liar, *see*
 Brandom, Robert; Priest, Graham;
 Rescher, Nicholas
 paradox of propositions, 190 *n*39, 207 *n*1
 paradox of stable truth, 66–9; as a
 diagonal argument, 66–7; *see also*
 stable truth
 paradoxes of grounding, 159–60, 162–3
 Parsons, Charles, x, 96–8, 101, 106, 179,
 214 *n*8
 Parsons, Terence, 54, 55
 part–whole distinction: integral part, 89,
 203 *n*36; integral whole, 89, 203 *n*36;
 universal part, 89–90, 204 *n*38;
 universal whole, 89–90, 204 *n*38
 partial explicit reflection, *see* explicit
 reflection
 Paul of Venice, 7, 46, 183 *ns*6&8, 184
 *ns*10&12, 199–200 *n*5, 200 *ns*9&10, 201
 *n*12, 204 *n*44
 Peter of Spain, 204 *n*44
 PM, 29–31, 188–9 *n*23, 189 *n*26
 power set theorem, *see* Cantor's power set
 theorem
 Priest, Graham, 9, 80–2, 199 *ns*45&53
 prime container, 130, 212 *n*8
 prime for the propositional calculus, 130,
 212 *n*8
 primitive recursive derivation, 32
 primitive recursive function, 31–2
 principle of bivalence, 8, 96, 116, 117

Index

- principle of Minimality, 107–9, 112, 114, 118, 120, 125, 140, 141, 145, 157, 175, 178
 principle of Symmetry, 110, 112, 118, 119, 120, 129, 131, 136, 153–4, 155, 157
 Prior, A. N., 183 *n*6, 213 *n*3
 productive set, 189 *n*32
 proper classes, 188 *n*8, 214 *n*8
 propositions, 7–8, 10–11, 83, 94–5, 106, 179, 200 *ns*8&9; *see also* paradox of propositions
 pruned tree, 113–14, 115, 119
 pruned₀ tree, 126
 pruned₀^R tree, 128
 pruned_g tree, 133
 pruned_g^R tree, 134
 Pseudo-Sherwood, x, 84–98, 184 *n*10, 200 *n*8, 201 *ns*12, 16, 19, & 20, 202 *ns*21, 23, & 26, 205 *n*47, 206 *ns*52&58; *see also* Ockham–Burley–Pseudo-Sherwood solution
 quantification over contexts, 165–74, 176, 182, 213 *n*4(*Ch*9)
 range of significance, 95, 96
 redundant contextual subscript, 166; clause for, 166
 reflection-free sentences, 124, 129; *see also* β-level reflection; β-reflective sentence
 reflective hierarchy, 124–41; and English, 124–5, 139–41
 Rescher, Nicholas, x, 9, 78–80
 Resnik, Michael, xi
restringentes, 87, 89, 92, 93, 184 *n*9, 201 *n*12, 202 *n*26, 205 *n*47, 206 *n*50; *see also* *restringentes*' rule; self-reference
restringentes' rule, 84, 86–9, 94, 184 *n*9, 185–6 *n*22, 200 *n*11, 202 *n*26, 202–3 *n*27, 203 *n*30, 205 *n*46; *see also* *restringentes*; self-reference
 Revenge Liar, 7, 191 *n*6
 Richard's paradox, 27–9, 31, 33; as a diagonal argument, 28
 Rogers, Hartley, 31, 189 *ns*29, 30, & 37
 Roseth, Roger, 184 *n*9
 Roure, Marie-Louise, 89, 92, 201 *ns*12, 13, & 16, 203 *n*35, 204 *n*37, 205 *n*47, 205–6 *n*49
 Rudin, Walter, 187 *n*1
 Russell, Bertrand, x, 10, 15–16, 20, 25, 27, 29, 99, 185 *n*19, 188 *n*10, 190 *n*39, 207 *n*1
 Russell's paradox, x, 33, 34, 37, 189 *n*31, 206 *n*63; as a diagonal argument, 33
 Russell's theory of types, 8, 10–11, 13, 28, 83, 92, 94–5, 107, 186 *ns*25&26, 201 *n*13, 205 *n*47, 206 *n*61, 207 *n*1
 Russell's vicious circle principle, 10, 18, 28, 83, 185 *n*19, 185–6 *n*22, 188 *n*18
 schematic worlds, 78–9
secundum quid et simpliciter, *see* fallacy
secundum quid et simpliciter
 self-reference, 8, 83, 86–9, 94, 184 *ns*9&10, 200 *n*11; *see also* *restringentes*; *restringentes*' rule
 semantic closure, *see* semantic universality
 semantic universality, 12–13, 15–16, 18–19, 46–7, 52–3, 58, 62, 98, 117, 174, 179–82; *see also* universality
 sentence (as sentence type in a context), 113, 120
 Sexgrave, Walter, 184 *n*9
 Simmons, Keith, 188 *n*16, 190 *n*39, 191 *n*14, 201 *n*15
 singularity, 95–6, 108, 114, 212 *n*9; actual vs. possible, 108, 158; anaphoric, 157, 177–8, 181, 182, *see also* anaphoric Liar; as notion in the object language, 163, 171, 213 *n*3; further singularities, 114, 153–8, 168–9, 213 *n*2; key singularity, 130, 136, 139, 168
 singularity approach to the Liar:
 antihierarchical nature of, 108–9, 116–17, 125, 139–41, 174–80; as a contextual solution, 101–6; informal presentation of, 100–12; pragmatic and semantic components of, 118–21
 Skyrms, Brian, 184 *n*11
 Spade, Paul Vincent, 89, 183 *n*6, 184 *ns*9&11, 191 *n*6, 199 *n*5, 200 *ns*8&10, 201 *ns*13&16, 202 *ns*25&26, 203 *n*34, 204 *n*37, 205 *n*46
 stable truth, 15, 64–9; *see also* paradox of stable truth
 Strawson's theory of presuppositions, 9, 55
 Strengthened Liar, 6–7, 68–9, 72, 96, 97, 101–6, 116, 118, 192–3 *n*24, 196 *n*13, 206 *n*58, 207 *n*64, 208 *n*5, 209 *n*8, 209–10 *n*13, 211 *ns*3&7; *see also* strengthened reasoning
 strengthened reasoning, 119–20, 208–9 *n*6, 209 *n*13; *see also* Strengthened Liar
 superheterological paradox, 46–7, 52, 54–5; as a diagonal argument, 54
 Superliar paradox, 164, 171–4, 181, 182, 213 *n*4
 supervaluations, 73, 194 *n*25, 197 *n*24
 supposition, 84, 201 *n*18
 Swineshead, Roger, 190–1 *n*6, 200 *n*7
 symmetrical network, 110–12; β-level symmetrical network, 135; reflection-

Index

- free symmetrical network, 129; *see also* asymmetrical network
- Symmetry, *see* principle of Symmetry
- Tarski, Alfred, ix, xi, 11–13, 14–15, 47, 99, 186 *ns*27&37, 187 *n*52, 201 *n*13, 206 *n*53, 214 *n*11
- Tarskian hierarchy of languages, x, 8, 12–13, 18, 28, 36, 83, 92, 107; and Herzberger and Gupta, 67–9; and Kripke, 52–3, 191 *n*15, 192–3 *n*24, 195 *n*25; and Ockham–Burley–Pseudo–Sherwood, 97, 201 *n*13, 205 *ns*47&49, 206 *ns*52&53; and Parsons and Burge, 97; and Priest, 80–2; and Rescher and Brandom, 80; and singularity approach, 99–100, 106, 108–9, 116–17, 174–80; *see also* metalanguage; object language; theoretical language
- Tarski's schema T, 11–12, 13, 192 *n*20
- Tarski's undefinability theorem, ix, x, 18, 19, 20, 27, 36, 52, 66, 179, 189 *n*36; as a diagonal theorem, 18, 36–7
- theoretical language, 140–1, 159, 173–181; *see also* metalanguage; object language
- Tarskian hierarchy of languages
- theory of types, *see* Russell's theory of types
- Thomson, J. F., 188 *n*10, 206 *n*63
- three-valued logic: Bochvar, 184 *n*11; Kleene, 48, 73, 123, 184 *n*11, 193 *n*25, 210 *n*28; Łukasiewicz, 56, 184 *n*11
- tokens and types, 96, 100–1, 113, 120, 164–7, 169, 177
- transcasus, 200 *n*7
- true₀ sentence, 123
- true₁ sentence, 132
- true_α sentence, 138
- true_{obj} sentence, 174
- true_{obj+} sentence, 177
- truth in a context, 15, 163–74
- Truth Teller, 3, 67, 103, 120, 132, 191 *n*12, 208–9 *n*6
- truth-value gaps, 7, 8–9, 15, 36, 45–7, 58, 59, 83, 97, 184 *n*12, 190 *n*4; and category mistakes, 9, 55; and Kripke 47–8, 52–5, 61, 62; and presuppositions, 9, 55; and vagueness, 9, 56, 72–8
- truth-value gluts, 9, 78–82, 83
- types, *see* tokens and types
- ungrounded ancestor, 155, 156, 169, 214 *n*6
- universal truth predicate, 97, 179, 181, 207 *n*74, 210 *n*23, 215 *n*15
- universality, 13–15, 19, 46–7, 53, 56, 71, 76, 98, 117, 140, 179–82; *see also* semantic universality
- unsettled sentences, 72–5, 78
- utterance, *see* sentence
- vagueness, *see* truth-value gaps
- van Fraassen, Bas, 9, 55, 184 *n*12; *see also* supervaluations
- vicious circle principle, *see* Russell's vicious circle principle
- Wang, Hao, 187 *n*1
- Whitehead, Alfred North, 29
- William of Ockham, x, 84–98, 184 *n*9, 186 *n*22, 201 *ns*13&19, 202 *ns*22&23, 202–3 *n*27, 204 *n*44, 204–5 *n*45, 205 *ns*46&47, 205–6 *n*49, 206 *n*58; *see also* Ockham–Burley–Pseudo–Sherwood solution
- William of Sherwood, 201 *n*16
- Woodruff, Peter, 184 *n*12, 191 *n*13
- Yablo, Stephen, 75, 197–8 *n*32, 198 *n*33, 208 *n*6
- Zadeh, L. A., *see* fuzzy logic
- ZF set theory, 15, 29, 189 *n*31
- Ziff, Paul, 186 *n*49, 209 *n*7