

What can we learn about the precision, explanatory power, and empirical adequacy of the methods of community ecology by examining instances in which it is used to solve practical environmental problems? On the whole, general ecological theory has been unable, so far, to provide the precise predictions often required to direct sound preservation and conservation.

In this volume, K. S. Shrader-Frechette and E. D. McCoy discuss what practical contributions ecology can and cannot make in applied science and environmental problem-solving. In the first section, they discuss the ambiguities and inconsistencies surrounding the concepts of "balance" and "stability" that have often muddied theorizing in community ecology. Using island biogeography as an example, they also examine the ways that science (especially community ecology) is laden with ethical and methodological value judgments that impede theory building.

In the second section, however, they show that ecology can give us specific answers to practical environmental questions. Emphasizing natural history and ethical analysis, they reject several traditional norms governing statistical error and scientific decisions under uncertainty. Instead, they argue that successful conservation and preservation require both a new scientific method – that of case studies – and a new understanding of scientific rationality, one that makes an explicit appeal to ethical principles. They illustrate their new approach with a detailed case study of the endangered Florida panther. Shrader-Frechette and McCoy end by outlining a dominant role for the important, but relatively undeveloped, task of applying ecology to practical environmental problem-solving.



#### METHOD IN ECOLOGY



# METHOD IN ECOLOGY: STRATEGIES FOR CONSERVATION

#### K. S. Shrader-Frechette

Department of Philosophy University of South Florida, Tampa, Florida, USA

and

E. D. McCoy

Department of Biology University of South Florida, Tampa, Florida, USA





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press 1993

First published 1993

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Shrader-Frechette, K. S., 1944–
Method in ecology: strategies for conservation / K.S. ShraderFrechette and E. D. McCoy.
p. cm.

p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 41861 5. ISBN 0 521 44693 7 (pbk)

Ecology—Philosophy.
 Nature conservation—Philosophy.
 McCoy, Earl D. II. Title.

QH540.5.S57 1993 574.5'01—dc20 93-9343 CIP

ISBN 0 521 41861 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 44693 7 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2003



### **Contents**

Acknowledgments		page ix
1	Introduction: What ecology can't do	1
2	Ecological concepts are problematic	11
3	Ecological theory is problematic	68
4	Ecological science is value laden	80
5	What ecology can do: The logic of case studies	106
6	Ecology and a new account of rationality	149
7	Objections to ethical rationality in ecology	170
8	A case study: The Florida panther	198
9	Policy aspects of the Florida-panther case	240
10	Conclusions	279
References		289
Name index		316
Subject index		322



## Acknowledgments

All of the work in this volume originated as a result of research supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant BBS-86-159533, "Normative Concepts in Ecology and their Consequences for Policy," from the Ethics and Values Program. Any opinions expressed in this book, however, are ours and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.

The volume is better than it might have been, thanks to the biologists and philosophers who offered constructive criticisms of the first and second drafts: Greg Cooper, Reed Noss, Michael Ruse, and Dan Simberloff. Their responses to our work have been invaluable in improving it. Whatever errors remain are our responsibility.

Dan Wigley, Heidi Adrien, and Jeannine De Bolt have done excellent work as research and editorial assistants for this book. Our greatest debt, however, is to our families. They make everything worthwhile.

University of South Florida, Tampa, Florida, USA K.S.S.-F. and E.D.M.