

WOODROW WILSON CENTER SERIES

The state and social investigation in Britain and the United States



Other books in the series

- Michael J. Lacey, editor, Religion and Twentieth-Century American Intellectual Life
- Michael J. Lacey, editor, The Truman Presidency
- Joseph Kruzel and Michael H. Haltzel, editors, Between the Blocs: Problems and Prospects for Europe's Neutral and Nonaligned States
- William C. Brumfield, editor, Reshaping Russian Architecture: Western Technology, Utopian Dreams
- Mark N. Katz, editor, The USSR and Marxist Revolutions in the Third World
- Walter Reich, editor, Origins of Terrorism: Psychologies, Ideologies, Theologies, States of Mind
- Mary O. Furner and Barry Supple, editors, The State and Economic Knowledge: The American and British Experiences
- Michael J. Lacey and Knud Haakonssen, editors, A Culture of Rights: The Bill of Rights in Philosophy, Politics, and Law—1791 and 1991
- Robert J. Donovan and Ray Scherer, Unsilent Revolution: Television News and American Public Life, 1948-1991
- Nelson Lichtenstein and Howell John Harris, editors, Industrial Democracy in America: The Ambiguous Promise
- William Craft Brumfield and Blair A. Ruble, editors, Russian Housing in the Modern Age: Design and Social History



The state and social investigation in Britain and the United States

Edited by MICHAEL J. LACEY and MARY O. FURNER

WOODROW WILSON CENTER PRESS



AND





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© 1993 by the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1993 First paperback edition 2004

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
The State and social investigation in Britain and the United States /
ed. by Michael J. Lacey and Mary O. Furner.
p. cm. - (Woodrow Wilson Center series)
Includes index.

ISBN 0521416388

1. Great Britain – Social policy – History. 2. United States – Social policy – History. 3. Welfare state – History. I. Lacey, Michael James. II. Furner, Mary O. III. Series.

HV248.S78 1993

361.6'1'0941–dc20 92-41255 CIP

ISBN 0521416388 hardback ISBN 0521528534 paperback



WOODROW WILSON INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR SCHOLARS

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

William J. Baroody, Jr., Chairman; Dwayne O. Andreas, Vice Chairman; Robert McC. Adams; James A. Baker III; James H. Billington; Warren M. Christopher; Marlin Fitzwater; Gertrude Himmelfarb; Carol Iannone; Eli Jacobs; Richard W. Riley; S. Dillon Ripley; William L. Saltonstall; Donna E. Shalala; Robert H. Tuttle; Don W. Wilson

The Center is the "living memorial" of the United States of America to the nation's twenty-eighth president, Woodrow Wilson. The U.S. Congress established the Woodrow Wilson Center in 1968 as an international institute for advanced study, "symbolizing and strengthening the fruitful relationship between the world of learning and the world of public affairs." The Center opened in 1970 under its own board of trustees, which includes citizens appointed by the president of the United States, federal government officials who serve ex officio, and an additional representative named by the president from within the federal government.

In all its activities the Woodrow Wilson Center is a nonprofit, nonpartisan organization, supported financially by annual appropriations from the U.S. Congress, and by the contributions of foundations, corporations, and individuals.

WOODROW WILSON CENTER PRESS

The Woodrow Wilson Center Press publishes the best work emanating from the Center's programs and from fellows and guest scholars, and assists in publication, in-house or outside, of research works produced at the Center and judged worthy of dissemination. Conclusions or opinions expressed in Center publications and programs are those of the authors and speakers and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Center staff, fellows, trustees, advisory groups, or any individuals or organizations that provide financial support to the Center.

Woodrow Wilson Center Press Editorial Offices 370 L'Enfant Promenade, S.W., Suite 704 Washington, D.C. 20024-2518 telephone: (202) 287-3000, ext. 218



Contents

Foreword by Michael J. Lacey

page xi

Part I. Knowledge and government

1	Social investigation, social knowledge, and the	
	state: an introduction Michael J. Lacey and	
	Mary O. Furner	3
	The growth of knowledge and the histories of	
	states	9
	The meaning and types of social investigation	11
	Enlightenment beginnings	16
	The emergence of social empiricism and the	
	growth of government	23
	Social investigation and the new liberalism	31
	Exemplars: theoretical and descriptive	4 0
	The postwar context of social investigation	50
	Focusing pluralism	56
	Agenda for research	59
2	The science of the legislator: the Enlightenment	
	heritage Donald Winch	63
	Role of the legislator	66
	State and civil society	69
	Machinery versus men	73
	New challenges and channels of communication	77
	Malthus and statistics	82
	Anglo-American comparisons	85
	John Stuart Mill's synthesis	88
	vii	



viii

Contents

Part II. Empiricism and the new liberalism

3	Experts, investigators, and the state in 1860:	
	British social scientists through American	
	eyes Lawrence Goldman	95
	The milieu of mid-Victorian social investigation	99
	Features of the community of experts	103
	Modus operandi of the statesmen in disguise	108
	The anomalous position of experts	112
	Schemes for securing expertise	117
	Mill and the problem of skilled agency	121
4	The world of the bureaus: government and the	
	positivist project in the late nineteenth	
	century Michael J. Lacey	127
	Emergence of the scientific community	128
	Leadership of the Washington community	133
	The network of political support	138
	Liberal positivism	142
	Government and the state	148
	Government and law	150
	The rationale for government research	153
	Science and ethics	161
	Government science and the new liberalism	168
5	The republican tradition and the new liberalism:	
	social investigation, state building, and social	
	learning in the Gilded Age Mary O. Furner	171
	Alternatives to laissez-faire: social science and the	
	formation of a new liberalism	177
	Redefining labor: republican dreams and	
	industrial realities	197
	Redefining monopoly: market failure and the	
	limits of state action	218
	A more statist future?	235
6	The state and social investigation in Britain,	
	1880–1914 Roger Davidson	242
	The effects of contemporary perceptions of crisis	245



	Contents	ix
	The extent of government and private social	
	investigation	249
	Logistical and ideological constraints on social	
	investigation	257
	Social investigation and welfare policy	267
	Managed reform	27 3
	Part III. Pluralism, skepticism, and the modern state	
7	Think tanks, antistatism, and democracy:	
	the nonpartisan ideal and policy research	
	in the United States,	
	1913–1987 Donald T. Critchlow	279
	The Brookings Institution	285
	The American Enterprise Institute	295
	The Institute for Policy Studies	305
	The Heritage Foundation	313
	Partisanship and expertise	319
8	Social investigation and political learning in the	
	financing of World War I W. Elliot Brownlee	323
	The background for wartime financial policy	325
	Enacting radical tax reform	328
	Minimizing the borrowing	337
	Floating low-interest, long-term loans	339
	McAdoo's "statist" approach to mobilizing	
	capital	341
	Maximizing the sale of bonds to the middle class	343
	Administration for wartime taxing and borrowing	346
	Corporate reactions to new tax policies	354
	The Wilson administration's investigation of tax	
	options	357
	A compromise	360
	Postwar consolidation	361
9	The state and social investigation in Britain between	
	the world wars Barry Supple	365
	Ambiguities	368
	Varieties of motive	371



X	Contents	
	Varieties of experience	373
	Coal mining: a case study	376
	Vehicles of social change and investigation	380
10 V	Var mobilization, institutional learning, and state	
	building in the United States,	
	1917–1941 Robert D. Cuff	388
	Wilson's mobilization	389
	Institutional learning between the wars,	
	1919–1939	398
	The defense period, 1939–1941	409
	Bureaucratic learning	419
About	the authors	427
Index		429



Foreword

This volume is a result of a Woodrow Wilson Center project on the growth of knowledge and the rise of the modern state. It is a companion collection to the essays contained in The State and Economic Knowledge: The American and British Experiences (1990), edited by Mary O. Furner and Barry Supple. The project began with the recognition that of all the activities undertaken by the modern state, the most neglected as a subject of study is the subtle and multifaceted role played by government institutions in helping to elicit, organize, assess, augment, employ, refine, and conserve in many fields the knowledge base on which contemporary life has come to depend. Those of us who have worked with the project hope that these volumes will deepen understanding of the processes behind the development of knowledge itself, the diffusion of knowledge, and the effects of that knowledge on social and cultural life. We also hope that these studies will highlight once again the usefulness of a historical approach to public affairs and encourage closer collaboration between those who are concerned with the history of ideas and those who work on the political and administrative history of public institutions.

A word of thanks is due to those former fellows and advisers at the Wilson Center who began the conversations that resulted in the symposium in which preliminary versions of most of the chapters presented here appeared. We were particularly fortunate to have as keynote speakers at the symposium Senator Daniel Patrick Moynihan, who knows as much as anyone in public life about the nexus between investigation and policy, and Professor Edward Shils, a distinguished student of the relationship. The late Warren Susman, a gifted historian and interpreter of emerging trends in scholarship, was especially helpful in getting things started, as was the late Jack L. Walker, whose death deprived us of a rare source of wisdom and insight into American politics and institutions.

The editors wish to thank all those who participated in the symposium



xii Foreword

where most of the chapters were first presented, as well as those who gave us chapters subsequently that helped illustrate more fully the themes that came up in discussions at the symposium and in the later stages of planning for this volume. The contributors were tolerant and cooperative in their responses to editorial suggestions, and as patient as could be hoped for in the face of delays in the production of the book. The Woodrow Wilson Center gratefully acknowledges the support of the Ford Foundation, the Shell Oil Company Foundation, and the Exxon Education Foundation for helping to make the work possible.

MICHAEL J. LACEY