> This book addresses the problem of the precariousness of justice in relations between non-equals (men, and men and women), via an analysis of Rousseau which uses techniques of reading associated with literary theory, and draws particularly on the work of Derrida, de Man and Starobinski. The best possible relationship between unequals, according to Rousseau, is one of bienfaisance, giving, receiving and repaying benefits. To function successfully the practice of beneficence should be inspired by a passionate impulse and governed by a rational code. It should be distinct from aristocratic magnanimity and from a market economy, starting from an assumption of hierarchical difference but working to mitigate that inequality. The book includes study of classical sources for eighteenth-century thinking on beneficence; including Seneca, Cicero, Aristotle and Plato.

> Rousseau also notoriously claims that to preserve social existence women must adhere to the code of pudeur. Dr Still argues that ultimately it is sexual difference, constructed defensively as a fixed opposition, which disturbs beneficence. This emerges through analysis of the conceptual underpinnings of Rousseau's ethics and of the gaps and contradictions in some of his 'minor' texts which present more excessive scenes of transgression than his lengthier, more harmonious and more influential works. Rousseau's reworking of the classical inheritance on ethical and political issues in a revolutionary historical moment, his peculiar combination of Enlightenment rationality and near-pathological sensibility, his oscillating self-identification with virility and femininity, make his work a particular pressure point for the question whether it is possible to have just and generous relations where there is difference.

Cambridge Studies in French 39

### JUSTICE AND DIFFERENCE IN THE WORKS OF ROUSSEAU

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-41585-9 - Justice and Difference in the Works of Rousseau: Bienfaisance and Pudeur
Judith Still
Frontmatter
More information

#### Cambridge Studies in French

GENERAL EDITOR: Malcolm Bowie (All Souls College, Oxford) EDITORIAL BOARD: R. Howard Bloch (University of California, Berkeley), Ross Chambers (University of Michigan) Antoine Compagnon (Columbia University) Peter France (University of Edinburgh) Toril Moi (Duke University) Naomi Schor (Duke University)

Recent titles in this series include

- 28. DAVID BAGULEY: Naturalist Fiction: The Entropic Vision
- 29. LESLIE HILL: Beckett's Fiction: In Different Words
- 30. F. W. LEAKEY: Baudelaire: Collected Essays, 1953-1988
- 31. SARAH KAY: Subjectivity in Troubadour Poetry
- 32. GILLIAN JONDORF: French Renaissance Tragedy: The Dramatic Word
- 33. LAWRENCE D. KRITZMAN: The Rhetoric of Sexuality and the Literature of the French Renaissance
- 34. JERRY C. NASH: The Love Aesthetics of Maurice Scève : Poetry and Struggle
- 35. PETER FRANCE: Politeness and its Discontents: Problems in French Classical Culture
- 36. MITCHELL GREENBERG: Subjectivity and Subjugation in Seventeenth-Century Drama and Prose: The Family Romance of French Classicism
- 37. TOM CONLEY: The Graphic Unconscious in Early Modern French Writing
- 38. MARGERY EVANS: Baudelaire and Intertextuality: Poetry at the Crossroads

A complete list of books in the series is given at the end of the volume

# JUSTICE AND DIFFERENCE IN THE WORKS OF ROUSSEAU

Bienfaisance and Pudeur

JUDITH STILL

Lecturer in Critical Theory, Department of French, University of Nottingham



### CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-41585-9 - Justice and Difference in the Works of Rousseau: Bienfaisance and Pudeur
Judith Still
Frontmatter
More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521415859

© Cambridge University Press 1993

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1993

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Still, Judith, 1958– Justice and difference in the works of Rousseau: *bienfaisance* and *pudeur*/ Judith Still. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in French; 39) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-41585-3 1. Social justice. 2. Equality. 3. Sex role. 4. Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 1712–1778 – Political and social views. I. Title. II. Series. HM216.S764 1993 305.3-dc20 92-3203 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-41585-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

To my mother

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-41585-9 - Justice and Difference in the Works of Rousseau: Bienfaisance and Pudeur
Judith Still
Frontmatter
More information

## Contents

Ack	nowledgements	page xi
A p	reliminary note on vocabulary and conventions	xii
Inti	roduction	I
I	The problem: the intersection of beneficence and	
	pudicity	5
	Beneficence	8
	Theoretical contradictions	9
	Textual disruptions	12
	Writer–reader relations	15
2	The code of beneficence	16
	Social bond	18
	Rational calculation and emotional intuition	24
	Magnanimity and slavery	28
3	The practice of beneficence and model benefactors	s
	in the major works	37
	The Confessions: the identification of the self with the	
	weaker party	4 <sup>I</sup>
	The Confessions: Rousseau as benefactor	57
	The Dialogues: false beneficence	63
	Model beneficence: Julie	68
	Model beneficence: Wolmar, Emile's tutor and the	
	legislator	72
4	The passion of pity in Rousseau's theory of man	82
	The relation of passions to reasoned behaviour	82
	Self-love: amour de soi and amour-propre	83
	The three stages of pity	86
	The relation between pity and amorous passion	92

Cambridge University Press	
978-0-521-41585-9 - Justice and Difference in the Works of Rousseau: Bienfaisance and Pudeu	ır
Judith Still	
Frontmatter	
More information	

x	Contents	
	Pudicity Spectacle	97 101
5	Gyges' ring: a reading of Rousseau's 6 <sup>e</sup> Promenade Failed beneficence The Gyges' ring daydream and the origin in Plato's	108 109
	Republic	113
	Invisible omnipotence	119
	The transgression of pudicity	123
	Hierarchy	125
6	Pudicity in some of Rousseau's minor writings: its	
	relationship to beneficence The portrayal of women in La Mort de Lucrèce, Les Amours	131
	d'Edouard, Le Lévite d'Ephraïm and Les Solitaires	133
	The breakdown of pudicity	146
	The relationship between pudicity and beneficence The function of the marginal works as tests of those	160
	hierarchies which Rousseau acknowledges	173
	The lessons of the marginal works	185
Cor	nclusion	188
	Towards a new interpretation of the major works	188
	Towards a reconstructive reading	194
Appendix: Generosity and pudicity in Gyges und sein Ring		
	and Le Roi Candaule	197
Not	es	206
Bib	liography	242
Inde	? <b>x</b>	00

### Acknowledgements

I should like to thank all those who have read the manuscript of this book at various stages and made helpful comments; all those with whom I have discussed ideas; and all those who have given love, comfort and support.

Earlier or expanded versions of sections of chapters have already appeared as follows: from Chapter 2, 'Elements of the Classical Code of Beneficence Presupposed in Rousseau's Writing' in *Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century*; from Chapter 5, 'From Eliot's "Raw Bone" to Gyges' Ring: Two Studies in Intertextuality' in *Paragraph*; from Chapter 6, 'Lucretia's Silent Rhetoric' in *The Oxford Literary Review* and 'Rousseau's *Lévite d'Ephraïm*: The Imposition of Meaning (on Women)' in *French Studies*. I am grateful to the editors of these journals for permission to reprint.

### A preliminary note on vocabulary and conventions

I have generally chosen to translate Rousseau's term *pudeur* by the rare English term 'pudicity' (from the Latin *pudicitia* or 'shamefacedness') when *pudeur* is used to refer to a code structuring the possibilities of virtuous feminine identity or women's adherence to a strict moral reserve in order to protect men from the consequences of unbridled amorous passion. The usual modern translation of *pudeur* is 'modesty' (from the Latin modestia or 'moderation'), but the primary and secondary meanings of modesty are 'moderation; freedom from excess; self control; clemency; the quality of being modest' (defined as 'well-conducted, orderly; not domineering; having a humble estimate of one's own merits'). Only the third meaning listed by the Shorter Oxford English Dictionary suggests 'womanly propriety of behaviour; scrupulous chastity of thought, speech and conduct'. By employing 'pudicity' as well as Rousseau's pudeur I want to reverse the order of connotation for the English reader, tie pudeur closer to the feminine, and, by the strangeness of 'pudicity' to the modern ear, reinforce a point which can easily be elided, namely that here *pudeur* is understood as a social construct and not simply as a natural emotion. Feminine pudeur or 'pudicity' is unusual amongst the virtues which Rousseau prizes, as there can be no split between inner assent and outer appearance: the veil of pudicity is a social display (or rather non-display) with crucial apotropaic and economic functions, saving men from excessive expenditure and thus enabling reproduction. By employing a somewhat alienating archaism I am emphasising the seemingly archaic quality of Rousseau's analysis of (his fears and fantasies around) femininity; but I

xii

#### Note on vocabulary and conventions xiii

hope that it is obvious to readers that the fears and fantasies survive in various forms, reworked in modern vocabularies of provocation, negligence or emasculation, for example. To trace the genealogy of the policing of specifically feminine thought, reading, speech, conduct, dress and so on to control and to excite desire is unfortunately beyond the scope of the present work.

Wherever possible citations from Rousseau will be from the *Œuvres complètes de Jean-Jacques Rousseau*, edited by Bernard Gagnebin and Marcel Raymond, 4 vols. (Paris, 1959–69). Citations from the *Lettre à d'Alembert* will be from the edition by M. Fuchs (Geneva, 1948). Citations from the *Essai sur l'origine des langues* will be from the edition by Charles Porset (Paris, 1970). Citations from Rousseau's correspondence will be from the *Correspondance complète*, edited by Ralph A. Leigh, 40 vols. (Oxford, 1965–82).

All page references will be given in the text. All spelling in quotations from seventeenth- and eighteenth-century authors has been modernised. Publication details of all works cited are in the bibliography.