

Language is regarded, at least in most intellectual traditions, as the quintessential human attribute, at once evidence and source of most that is considered transcendent in us, distinguishing ours from the merely mechanical nature of the beast. Even if language did not have the sacrosanct status it does in our conception of human nature, however, the question of its presence in other species would still promote argument, for we lack any universally accepted defining features of language, ones that would allow us to identify it unequivocally in another species. Both the role of language in differentiating ours from other species and contention over the crucial attributes of language are responsible for the stridency of the debate over whether nonhuman animals can learn language.

Aping Language is a critical assessment of each of the recent experiments designed to impart a language, either natural or invented, to an ape. The performance of the animals in these experiments is compared with the course of semantic and syntactic development in children, both speaking and signing. The book goes on to examine what is known about the neurological, cognitive, and specifically linguistic attributes of our species that subserve language, and it discusses how they might have come into existence. Finally, the communication of nonhuman primates in nature is assayed to consider whether or not it was reasonable to assume, as the experimenters in these projects did, that apes possess an ability to acquire language.



Aping language



Editors: John Dunn, Jack Goody, Geoffrey Hawthorn

Edmund Leach: Culture and communication: the logic by which symbols are connected: an introduction to the use of structuralist analysis in social anthropology

Anthony Heath: Rational choice and social exchange: a critique of exchange theory

P. Abrams and A. McCulloch: Communes, sociology and society

Jack Goody: The domestication of the savage mind

Jean-Louis Flandrin: Families in former times: kinship, household and sexuality

John Dunn: Theory in the face of the future

David Thomas: Naturalism and social science: a post-empiricist philosophy of social science Claude Meillassoux: Maidens, meal and money: capitalism and the domestic community

David Lane: Leninism: a sociological interpretation

Anthony D. Smith: The ethnic revival

Jack Goody: Cooking, cuisine and class: a study in comparative sociology

Roy Ellen: Environment, subsistence and system: the ecology of small-scale formations

S. N. Eisenstadt and L. Roniger: Patrons, clients and friends: interpersonal relations and the structure of trust in society

John Dunn: The politics of socialism: an essay in political theory

Martine Segalen: Historical anthropology of the family

Tim Ingold: Evolution and social life

David Levine: Reproducing families: the political economy of English population history Robert Hinde: Individuals, relationships and culture: links between ethology and the social

sciences

Paul Connerton: *How societies remember* G. E. R. Lloyd: *Demystifying mentalities*



Aping language

JOEL WALLMAN

Harry Frank Guggenheim Foundation, New York City





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Victoria 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press 1992

First published 1992

A cataloguing in publication record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Wallman, Joel.
Aping language/Joel Wallman.
p. cm. – (Themes in the social sciences)
includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-40487-8. – ISBN 0-521-40666-8 (pbk.)
1. Apes – Psychology. 2. Human – animal communication
I. Title. II. Series.
QL737.P96W35 1992
599.88'0451–dc20 91-28564 CIP

ISBN 0 521 40487 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 40666 8 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 1999



> To my parents Ronetta and Louis



A dog cannot relate his autobiography; however eloquently he may bark, he cannot tell you that his parents were honest though poor.

BERTRAND RUSSELL Human Knowledge: Its Scope and Limits



Contents

Acknowledgments	page xii
I. BACKGROUND	1
1 Introduction	3
2 History of the ape-language projects	10
II. THE ARTIFICIAL-LANGUAGE PROJECTS	29
3 The Lana project	31
4 The Sarah project	38
III. APES AND LANGUAGE: ONTOGENY	47
5 Words	49
6 Sentences	79
IV. APES AND LANGUAGE: PHYLOGENY	107
7 Language, evolution, and anatomy	109
8 Primate communication in nature	128
V. CONCLUSION	147
9 The chimpanzee and the Chinese room	149
Notes	154
References	166
Index	184



Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the members of the anthropology and psychology departments at Columbia University who contributed so much to the perspective this book reflects: Alexander Alland, Jr., Don Melnick, and the late, beloved Robert Murphy; and Barbara Landau and Herbert Terrace.

Among the many others – roughly one per page – who are responsible, in ways diverse, for whatever is good in this work are Ernie Alleva, Michael Billig, Jeff Bogumil, Brian Burkhalter, Barry Cerf, Marc Edelman, Constantin Fasolt, Brian Ferguson, Sue Herman, Janice Hirota, Robert Hoffmeister, Reamy Jansen, Jessica Kuper, Louise Lennihan, Rosemary Masters, Laura Petitto, Sekhar Ramakrishnan, Alan Richter, David Rosner, Candelario Saenz, Elizabeth Stone, Virginia Valian, and Annie Williams. I know Brian Ferguson will understand when he learns that I declined to pursue his suggestion that the apes were actually speaking "passable French."

I offer a special kind of gratitude to Gary Pasternak, Larry Wallman, Don Zavelo, and, especially, my wife, Karen Kane.

I thank the Sigma Xi Research Society for helping me get these monkeys off my back with a grant-in-aid.