

This book is a philosophical study of the content of mental representations of music. The central problem it addresses is as follows: how is it possible to describe a listener's cognition using music-theoretic concepts the listener does not possess? The author explains what it is for music cognition to be nonconceptual and how such mental representation contrasts with conceptual thought.

The author is both a philosopher and a musicologist and uniquely combines the perspectives of both disciplines. Exploring philosophical questions of mental representation in the relatively neglected, nonverbal domain of music, this study is a major contribution to the philosophical understanding of music perception and cognitive theory.



Music and Conceptualization



Music and Conceptualization

MARK DEBELLIS

Columbia University





Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1995

First published 1995

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

DeBellis, Mark

Music and conceptualization / Mark DeBellis.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-521-40331-6

1. Music – Philosophy and aesthetics. I. Title.

ML3800.D3 1995

781'.11 - dc20 95-2405

CIP

MN

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 0-521-40331-6 Hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2004



Contents

	Acknowledgments	page vii
1	Introduction: Hearing Ascriptions	1
2	Musical Hearing as Weakly Nonconceptual	19
3	Musical Hearing as Strongly Nonconceptual	57
4	Is There an Observation–Theory Distinction in Music?	80
5	Theoretically Informed Listening	117
6	Conceptions of Musical Structure	132
	Works Cited	153
	Index	161



Acknowledgments

I have been helped by many people in writing this book. I owe special thanks to Paul Benacerraf, who supervised the dissertation from which the book was developed and whose constant probing and criticism in response to my ideas at every stage served as a model and an inspiration. Both Gilbert Harman and Christopher Peacocke provided extensive comments on earlier drafts, suggested numerous avenues to pursue, and offered many points of clarification. I also profited from the remarks and advice of Akeel Bilgrami, James Dreier, Joseph Dubiel, Peter Kivy, Jonathan Kramer, Jerrold Levinson, Sidney Morgenbesser, Gideon Rosen, George Wilson, and participants in my seminar in philosophy of music cognition, Columbia University, in response to written and oral presentations of earlier versions of this material.

Sometimes it is hard to remember how one first became interested in a problem or topic. But I can trace my thinking about the themes of this book to conversations I had with my uncle, Michael de Bellis, some twenty years ago; for helping to point me down this road, I extend warmest thanks.



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Finally, and most important, I want to thank my wife, Karla Johnsen, for her advice – always on target – on many aspects of this project and for her patience throughout.

Chapter 4 is reprinted with minor revisions from Current Musicology 55 (1993), pp. 56-87, by the kind permission of Columbia University. Chapter 5 originally appeared in Michael Krausz, ed., The Interpretation of Music: Philosophical Essays (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993). Chapter 6 is reprinted with minor revisions from Midwest Studies in Philosophy, Vol. 16: Philosophy and the Arts, Peter A. French, Theodore E. Uehling, Jr., and Howard K. Wettstein, eds., pp. 378-93, © 1991, by permission of the University of Notre Dame Press. Example 1.1 is reproduced from Ray Jackendoff, Consciousness and the Computational Mind (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1987), p. 226, and Examples 2.6 and 3.2 from Fred Lerdahl and Ray Jackendoff, A Generative Theory of Tonal Music (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1983), pp. 42 and 15, respectively, all with permission. Example 1.2 is reprinted from Heinrich Schenker, Free Composition, edited and translated by Ernst Oster, Supplement: Musical Examples, copyright © 1979, by permission of Schirmer Books/Simon & Schuster Macmillan.

This work was supported in part by an NEH Summer Stipend, fellowships from the Columbia University Council for Research in the Humanities, and a Chamberlain Fellowship from Columbia College, all of which I gratefully acknowledge.



Music and Conceptualization