

This stimulating collection of essays in ethics addresses everyday moral issues, examines alternative responses to them, and explores the deeper theoretical questions which they raise. The essays focus especially on attitudes, virtues, and vices that are important to personal relationships and to how one views oneself. The primary aim is not to refine abstract theories but to understand the competing values that underlie dissatisfaction with oversimple answers produced by "applying" various theories. Among the issues are: Is it wrong to tell a lie to protect someone from a painful truth? Can one be both autonomous and compassionate? Other topics discussed are servility, weakness of will, suicide, obligations to oneself, snobbery, environmental ethics, and affirmative action. A feature of the collection is the contrast of Kantian and utilitarian answers to these problems.

"The book would be an invaluable accompaniment to Kant's own texts in a Kant's ethics course and it would make a much more interesting main text than one can usually get in a practical ethics course."

Christine Korsgaard, University of Chicago



Autonomy and self-respect



Autonomy and self-respect

THOMAS E. HILL, JR.
The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press 1991

First published 1991 Reprinted 1992, 1995

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 0-521-39464-3 hardback

ISBN 0-521-39772-3 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2000



Contents

| Sources and acknowledgments Introduction | | page vii | |
|--|--|----------|--|
| | | 1 | |
| ľ | Servility and self-respect | 4 | |
| 2 | Self-respect reconsidered | 19 | |
| 3 | Autonomy and benevolent lies | 25 | |
| 4 | The importance of autonomy | 43 | |
| 5 | Symbolic protest and calculated silence | 52 | |
| 6 | Moral purity and the lesser evil | 67 | |
| 7 | Self-regarding suicide: a modified Kantian view | 85 | |
| 8 | Ideals of human excellence and preserving natural environments | 104 | |
| 9 | Weakness of will and character | 118 | |
| 0 | Promises to oneself | 138 | |
| 11 | Social snobbery and human dignity | 155 | |
| 12 | Pains and projects: justifying to oneself | 173 | |
| 13 | The message of affirmative action | 189 | |
| Index | | 212 | |



Sources and acknowledgments

Three of my essays included in this volume appear for the first time, and ten are reprinted, with minor editing, from prior publications. I gratefully acknowledge the following for the permission to reprint my essays.

- 1. "Servility and Self-Respect." Copyright 1973, *The Monist*, La Salle, Illinois 61301. Reprinted by permission.
- 2. "Self-Respect Reconsidered" originally appeared in *Tulane Studies in Philosophy*, vol. 31 (1983), pp. 129–37, and is reprinted here by permission of the publisher.
- 3. "Autonomy and Benevolent Lies" was first printed in *The Journal of Value Inquiry*, vol. 18 (1984), pp. 251-67. It is reprinted by permission of the publisher.
- 4. "The Importance of Autonomy" was originally published in *Women and Moral Theory*. Edited by E. F. Kittay and D. T. Meyers (Rowman and Littlefield, 1987), pp. 129–38. It is reprinted here by permission of the publisher.
- 5. "Symbolic Protest and Calculated Silence" was originally published by Princeton University Press in *Philosophy and Public Affairs*. It is reprinted by permission of Princeton University Press.
- 6. "Moral Purity and the Lesser Evil." Copyright 1983, *The Monist*, La Salle, Illinois 61301. Reprinted by permission.
- 7. "Self-Regarding Suicide: A Modified Kantian View" was originally published by Human Sciences Press Incorporated in Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior, vol. 13, no. 4 (1983). It is reprinted by permission of the publisher.
- 8. "Ideals of Human Excellence and Preserving the Natural Environment" was first published in *Environmental Ethics*, vol. 5 (1983), pp. 211-24, and is reprinted here by permission of the publisher.
- 9. "Weakness of Will and Character" originally appeared in *Philosophical Topics*, vol. XIV, no. 2 (Fall 1986) and is reprinted by permission of the publisher.
- 10. "The Message of Affirmative Action" was originally published by *Philosophy and Social Policy* (1991). It is reprinted here by permission of the publisher.



SOURCES AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The three remaining essays were not previously published: these are "Promises to Oneself," "Pains and Projects: Justifying to Oneself," and "Social Snobbery and Human Dignity." The order of presentation of these essays with the others was influenced more by topic than by the time of writing. An early version of "Promises to Oneself" in fact was the first essay written, and "Social Snobbery and Human Dignity" was the last.

During the period in which the essays selected for this volume were written I received financial and other institutional support from the University of California, Los Angeles (1968–84), the National Endowment for the Humanities (1972–73), the National Humanities Center (1982–83), and the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill (1984–1991). This support is gratefully acknowledged.

Philosophy is, and ought to be, a cooperative venture in which one builds on others' ideas, learns from their criticisms and suggestions, and takes heart from their interest and encouragement. Over the years I have been extraordinarily fortunate in the help I have had from teachers, colleagues, students, friends, and family.

My first and deepest debt is to my mother and father who provided unfailing support in all my projects. My father first inspired my academic interests and introduced me to philosophy, and he continues to be an invaluable friend and philosophical colleague. My mother, a teacher of mathematics and physics, lived a life with grace, sensitivity, and courage, exemplifying the sort of ideals that moral philosophy at its best aspires to understand. Another early debt is to teachers at Harvard and Oxford, especially to my advisors at different periods, Raphael Demos, Roderick Firth, Gilbert Ryle, and John Rawls.

More recently I gained much from colleagues and students at the University of California, Los Angeles, especially from participants in the Moral and Political Philosophy Discussion Group started by Arnold Kaufman. Particularly helpful regarding the earlier papers in this collection were Robert Merrihew Adams, Sharon Bishop, Bernard Boxill, Jean Hampton, Gregory Kavka, Herbert Morris, Warren Quinn, and Richard Wasserstrom. I am grateful to Sharon Bishop for both personal and philosophical help. Much of my thinking about autonomy and sexism was stimulated and importantly influenced by her ideas. During my year at the National Humanities Center at the Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, I had valuable discussions with Stephen Darwall, Gerald Postema, Gregory Trianosky, Larry Thomas, Lance Stell, and Carl Wellman. My almost daily dialogues with Stell about autonomy, and other matters, were particularly helpful and have not yet been adequately acknowledged.

Discussions with my colleagues and students at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill have also been stimulating. I am grateful to several people, at Chapel Hill and elsewhere, for extensive comments on various drafts of later papers. These include Michael Bratman, Bernard Boxill, Christine Korsgaard,



SOURCES AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

William Lycan, Geoffrey Sayre McCord, Gerald Postema, Gregory Trianosky, David Schmidtz, and William Williams. Participants in discussions at the various universities and colleges where these papers were presented have also contributed usefully. Thanks are due to the participants of the Triangle Ethics Group, including colleagues at Chapel Hill, philosophers from neighboring universities and colleges, and especially David Falk, who is the host, founder, and inspiration of the group.

Geoffrey Sayre McCord first encouraged me to publish these papers as a collection, and I am grateful for his help. Thanks are also due to Claire Miller, Gucki Obler, and Kathy Sauls for staff support, to Carolyn Viola-John for her editing, and to Karánn Durland for her editing, handling permission letters, and doing the index.

Most of all I am grateful to Robin for her constant support and for giving my life new zest and meaning.