

More information

WOODROW WILSON CENTER SERIES

The state and economic knowledge



Other books in the series

The Truman presidency, edited by Michael J. Lacey
Religion and twentieth-century American intellectual life, edited by
Michael J. Lacey

Between the blocs: problems and prospects for Europe's neutral and nonaligned states, edited by Joseph Kruzel and Michael H. Haltzel Origins of terrorism: psychologies, ideologies, theologies, states of mind, edited by Walter Reich

Reshaping Russian architecture: Western technology, utopian dreams, edited by William C. Brumfield



The state and economic knowledge

The American and British experiences

Edited by MARY O. FURNER and BARRY SUPPLE

WOODROW WILSON INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR SCHOLARS

AND

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge

New York Port Chester Melbourne Sydney



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521394246

© Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars 1990

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1990 First paperback edition 2002

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
The State and economic knowledge.
(Woodrow Wilson Center series)
"The result of a symposium organized by
the . . . Center's Program on American Society and
Politics" – Fwd.

United States – Economic policy – Congresses.
 Economics – United States – History – Congresses.
 Administrative agencies – United States – History – Congresses.
 Great Britain – Economic policy – Congresses.
 Economics – Great Britain – History – Congresses.
 Administrative agencies – Great Britain –

History – Congresses. I. Furner, Mary O. II. Supple, Barry. III. Series.

HC103.874 1990 338.973 90-1541

ISBN 978-0-521-39424-6 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-52315-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



WOODROW WILSON INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR SCHOLARS

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

William J. Baroody, Jr., Chairman; Dwayne O. Andreas, Vice Chairman; Robert McC. Adams; James A. Baker III; Theodore C. Barreaux; James H. Billington; Lynne V. Cheney; Bruce S. Gelb; Gertrude Himmelfarb; Max M. Kampelman; J. Willard Marriott, Jr.; John S. Reed; John H. Sununu; Robert Tuttle; Don W. Wilson

The Center is the "living memorial" of the United States of America to the nation's twenty-eighth president, Woodrow Wilson. The U.S. Congress established the Woodrow Wilson Center in 1968 as an international institute for advanced study, "symbolizing and strengthening the fruitful relationship between the world of learning and the world of public affairs." The Center opened in 1970 under its own presidentially appointed board of trustees.

In all its activities, the Woodrow Wilson Center is a nonprofit, nonpartisan organization, supported financially by annual appropriations from the U.S. Congress and contributions from foundations, corporations, and individuals. Conclusions or opinions expressed in Center publications are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Center staff, fellows, trustees, advisory groups, or any individuals or organizations that provide financial support to the Center.

Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars 1000 Jefferson Drive, S.W. Washington, D.C. 20560 (202) 357-2429





Contents

For	reword by Michael J. Lacey	page xii
	Part I. The state and the uses of economic knowled	lge
1	Ideas, institutions, and state in the United States and Britain: an introduction Mary O. Furner and Barry Supple The problem Some categories of economic knowledge Knowledge and institutions	d 3 4 11 26
2	Economic knowledge and government in Britain: some historical and comparative reflections Donald Winch The nineteenth-century legacy Academic recognition and public service The interwar state and economic knowledge: technocratic possibilities and hopes Some Anglo-American comparisons Ideas and action	40 41 46 54 61 67
	Part II. The state and economic performance	
3	Liberty by design: freedom, planning, and John Quincy Adams's American System John Lauritz Larson	73
	vii	



viii	Contents	
	Adams's message	76
	Adams's meaning	79
	Inheriting the Revolution	84
	Reaction in 1825	89
	Liberty without design	97
4	Government as a laboratory for economic learning in the years of the Democratic Roosevelt	
	William J. Barber	103
	The administration and the state of the art, 1933–1936	104
	The recession of 1937-1938 and its intellectual	
	fallout Consolidation of the Keynesian beachheads in	112
	1940	120
	Girding for war in 1941	122
	Economic argument in the environment of all-out mobilization	128
	The American Keynesians and their vision of	
	postwar planning	133
	The educational legacy of a dozen years	135
5	The emergence of economic growthmanship in the United States: federal policy and economic knowledge in the Truman years	
	Robert M. Collins	138
	The policy context: from the economics of scarcity	
	to the economics of abundance, 1932–1946	139
	The Council of Economic Advisers and the	
	emergence of economic growthmanship,	
	1946–1952	146
	The policy-knowledge interface	155
	Perspectives and conclusions	168
6	The Treasury's analytical model of the British	
	economy between the wars Peter Clarke	171
	The role of the Treasury	173
	Treasury personnel	175
	The orthodox theory	177



	Contents	ix
	Changing the premises	189
	Conclusion	203
7	Old dogs and new tricks: the British Treasury and	
	Keynesian economics in the 1940s and	
	1950s George C. Peden	208
	The "old dogs"	210
	The "new tricks"	214
	Policy-making, 1940–1945	218
	Policy-making, 1945–1951	223
	Policy-making, 1951–1959	227
	The compilation of economic data	232
	Microeconomic aspects of policy	234
	Conclusion	236
	Part III. Industrial maturity and economic policy	
8	Knowing capitalism: public investigation and the	
	labor question in the long Progressive Era	
	Mary O. Furner	241
	Economic knowledge and the American New	
	Liberalism	242
	Carroll Wright, the Bureau of Labor Statistics, and	
	the limits of state power	246
	The United States Industrial Commission and the	
	corporatist vision	268
	The Commission on Industrial Relations and	0=4
	democratic collectivism	274
	Ideological systems in tension	284
9	Economic inquiry and the state in New Era America:	
	antistatist corporatism and positive statism in	
	uneasy coexistence Ellis W. Hawley	287
	The context	288
	The Bureau of Agricultural Economics,	
	1922–1930	293



X	Contents	
	The National Bureau of Economic Research,	
	1920–1930	299
	Tension and conflict	307
	Recent economic changes	313
	The 1920s in perspective	320
	Conclusion	323
10	Official economic inquiry and Britain's industrial	
	decline: the first fifty years Barry Supple	325
	Industrial performance and economic axioms	326
	Maturity, competition, and free trade	330
	The audit of war	337
	Industrial structures and economic performance	
	between the world wars	340
	Industrial economics and structural dislocation	344
	Regional economic policy	346
	Industrial maturity, politics, and economics	351
11	Economic ideas and government policy on industrial organization in Britain since 1945	
	Leslie Hannah	354
	Industrial policy	354
	British antitrust policy	355
	The economist class	360
	Electricity: nationalization and privatization	363
	Conclusions and further research	371
	Part IV. Economic knowledge and social action	
12	Economic knowledge and British social policy	
	Jose Harris	379
	The problem	379
	Definition, convergence, and tension	381
	Theory and policy: an erratic relationship	383
	The "sovereignty" of facts	387
	The culture of policy: four epochs	391



	Contents	xi
13	Economists and the formation of the modern tax system in the United States: the World War I	
	crisis W. Elliot Brownlee	401
	Taxation and economic knowledge before World	
	War I	402
	Anticorporate, statist taxation and Thomas S.	
	Adams	407
	Seligman versus Adams	411
	The state investigates	415
	The victory of "progressive capitalism"	421
	Tax reform under "progressive capitalism"	429
	Economic knowledge and the modern state	434
14	Population, economists, and the state: the Royal Commission on Population, 1944–1949	
	Jay M. Winter	436
	Population decline: some European initiatives in	
14	the 1930s	439
	The British debate in the 1930s	445
	Population and World War II: the origins of the	
	Royal Commission	449
	The Royal Commission and its Economics	4
	Committee	450
	Conclusions and implications	458
Abc	out the authors	461
Index		465





Foreword

This volume is the result of a symposium organized by the Woodrow Wilson Center's Program on American Society and Politics. It represents one element in a long-term project designed to reexamine in historical and comparative perspective relations between government activity and the development of knowledge in the domains of society, economy, and culture. The project began with the recognition that of all the activities undertaken by the modern state, the most neglected as a subject of study is the subtle and multifaceted role played by its agencies in helping to elicit, organize, assess, augment, employ, refine, and conserve in many fields the knowledge base upon which in complex ways contemporary life has come to depend. It is the hope of those who have supported and worked on the project that this volume and subsequent volumes will deepen understanding of the processes behind the development of knowledge itself, its diffusion, and its impact on changing social and cultural life. And so far as the agendas of the scholarly disciplines themselves are concerned, the hope is to highlight once again the usefulness of a historical approach to public affairs and to encourage closer collaboration of those concerned with the history of ideas and those who work on the administrative history of public institutions.

The project grew out of the daily life of the Woodrow Wilson Center, and a word of thanks is due to those former Center fellows and advisers who began these discussions and helped organize the program. The late Warren Susman, a gifted historian and interpreter of emerging trends in scholarship, was especially important in getting things started. This volume's editors, Mary O. Furner and Barry Supple, not only brought into being the present collection of essays but contributed importantly to the formulation of other aspects of the total project as well. Robert Cuff, Hugh Heclo, Don K. Price, and the late Jack L. Walker also assisted at key points in the course of things. Finally the Center grate-

xiii



xiv

Foreword

fully acknowledges the support of the Ford Foundation, the Nuffield Foundation, and the Shell Oil Company Foundation for helping to make the work possible.

Michael J. Lacey, Director Program on American Society and Politics Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars