

Kant's theory of freedom

Cambridge University Press
0521387086 - Kant's Theory of Freedom - Henry E. Allison
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Kant's theory of freedom

HENRY E. ALLISON
University of California, San Diego



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
0521387086 - Kant's Theory of Freedom - Henry E. Allison
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1990

First published 1990
Reprinted 1991, 1993, 1995

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0-521-38270-X hardback
ISBN 0-521-38708-6 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2003

Cambridge University Press
0521387086 - Kant's Theory of Freedom - Henry E. Allison
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

TO THE MEMORY OF ERIC

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Note on sources and key to abbreviations and translations</i>	xi
Introduction	1
Part I: Freedom and rational agency in the <i>Critique of Pure Reason</i>	
1 The Third Antinomy	11
I: Some preliminaries	11
II: The arguments	14
III: The resolution of the Third Antinomy	22
IV: The Third Antinomy and freedom of the will	25
2 Empirical and intelligible character	29
I: The distinction in general and empirical character in particular	30
II: Intelligible character	35
III: The compatibility of empirical and intelligible character	41
IV: Timeless agency and the causality of reason	47
3 Practical and transcendental freedom	54
I: Freedom in the Dialectic and the Canon	54
II: The ambiguous nature of practical freedom	59
III: Freedom in Kant's moral theory circa 1781	66
4 Two alternative interpretations	71
I: Beck's critique and reconstruction	71
II: Transcendental idealism and anomalous monism	76
Part II: Moral agency and moral psychology	
5 Rational agency and autonomy	85
I: Rational agency in <i>Groundwork</i> II	85
II: Autonomy as a property of the will	94
III: From property to principle	99
6 Duty, inclination, and respect	107
I: A good will and moral worth	107
II: Respect	120

CONTENTS

7	<i>Wille, Willkür, and Gesinnung</i>	129
	I: The <i>Wille</i> – <i>Willkür</i> distinction	129
	II: Kant's concept of <i>Gesinnung</i>	136
8	Radical evil	146
	I: Radical evil and rigorism	146
	II: The propensity and its universality	152
	III: Degrees of radical evil	157
9	Virtue and holiness	162
	I: The nature of virtue	162
	II: Holiness as a moral ideal	171
10	The classical objections	180
	I: Schiller's critique	180
	II: Hegel's critique	184
	III: Williams's critique	191
Part III: The justification of morality and freedom		
11	The Reciprocity Thesis	201
	I: The formulations of the thesis	202
	II: Freedom and practical law: a first attempt	204
	III: Freedom and practical law: completing the argument	207
	IV: From practical law to the moral law	210
12	The deduction in <i>Groundwork</i> III	214
	I: The preparatory argument	214
	II: The hidden circle	218
	III: Completing the deduction	221
	IV: The failure of the deduction	227
13	The fact of reason and the deduction of freedom	230
	I: The nature of the fact	231
	II: The fact as the fact of reason	233
	III: The deduction of freedom: the basic argument	239
	IV: The deduction of freedom, the Third Antinomy, and the unity of theoretical and practical reason	243
	V: The deduction of freedom: a final consideration	245
	<i>Notes</i>	250
	<i>Bibliography</i>	286
	<i>Index</i>	295

Acknowledgments

I am indebted to many individuals and to some institutions for their generous help and support for this project. Beginning with the latter, I would like to thank the National Endowment for the Humanities for providing me with a fellowship for the academic year 1985–6 and the John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation for a fellowship for the year 1986–7. My thanks also go to the Academic Senate of the University of California at San Diego for two summer grants for research and clerical assistance and to my department for permitting me the luxury of two consecutive years of leave.

Among the individuals, my thanks go first to Allen Wood for his extremely helpful criticisms of a preliminary draft of most of the manuscript. Although I am sure that he will still find much to criticize, his incisive comments were of great assistance to me in my endeavor to formulate the issues separating us. I would also like to thank Karl Ameriks, Barbara Herman, Adrian Piper, and Andrews Reath for their helpful comments on portions of the manuscript and my colleagues Patricia Kitcher and Robert Pippin, not only for their many useful suggestions and criticisms, but also for their ready willingness to discuss Kant. I count myself fortunate indeed to be a member of a department in which there is such interest and expertise in the “Sage of Königsberg.” In this group I must also include Michelle Gilmore, who once again has proved invaluable to me as a research and editorial assistant. I likewise wish to thank Peter Mangan for the preparation of the index. Finally, but above all, I must express my deep gratitude to my wife, Norma, who continued to encourage me in my work and to create an atmosphere in which I could pursue it during a time of great sadness for both of us. Without her support, this book would never have seen the light of day.

An earlier version of much of Chapter 2 is contained in my paper “Empirical and Intelligible Character in the *Critique of Pure Reason*,” which was presented at the Seventh Jerusalem Philosophical Encounter on Kant’s practical philosophy at the Hebrew University in December 1985 and is published in the proceedings of that conference: *Kant’s Practical Philosophy Reconsidered*. The basic argument of Chapter 3 is foreshadowed in “The Concept of Freedom in Kant’s ‘Semi-Critical’ Ethics,” which appeared in the *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie*. That of Chapter 11 was initially presented in “Morality and Freedom: Kant’s Reciprocity Thesis,” which was published in the *Philosophical Review*. Similarly, early drafts of portions of the argument of Chapter 12 are contained in “The Hidden Circle in *Groundwork* III,” which was presented at the Sixth International Kant Con-

Cambridge University Press
0521387086 - Kant's Theory of Freedom - Henry E. Allison
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

gress and is published in its proceedings, and “Kant’s Preparatory Argument in *Groundwork* III,” which was presented in a conference on the *Groundwork* held at Sigriswil, Switzerland, in June 1986 and is published in *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten. Ein kooperativer Kommentar*. Finally, I initially dealt with the issues discussed in Chapter 13 in “Justification and Freedom in the *Critique of Practical Reason*,” which was delivered at the Stanford Conference on Kant’s Deductions in April 1986 and was published in its proceedings: *Kant’s Transcendental Deductions: The Three “Critiques” and the “Opus postumum.”* All of this material has been substantially revised for the book and in some cases, particularly the last, my views have changed significantly. Nevertheless, I would like to thank the organizers of these conferences, specifically Yirmahu Yovel, Otfried Höffe, and Eckart Förster, for inviting me to participate and, together with the editors of the above-mentioned journals, for their kind permission to reuse some of the material they initially published.

Note on sources and key to abbreviations and translations

Apart from the *Critique of Pure Reason* and the *Lectures on Ethics*, all references to Kant are to *Kants gesammelte Schriften* (KGS), *herausgegeben von der Deutschen* (formerly *Königlichen Preussischen*) *Akademie der Wissenschaften*, 29 volumes [Berlin: Walter de Gruyter (and predecessors), 1902]. References to the *Critique of Pure Reason* are to the standard A and B pagination of the first and second editions. References to the *Lectures on Ethics* are to *Eine Vorlesung über Ethik*, edited by Paul Menzer, Berlin: Rolf Heise, 1924. Specific works cited in the main body of the text are referred to by means of the abbreviations listed below. Those cited only in the notes are given with the full title. Kant's letters are usually identified by means of recipient and date, and citations from them are based on the translation of Arnulf Zweig, *Kant: Philosophical Correspondence* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970). The other translations used are listed in what follows and, except in the case of the *Critique of Pure Reason*, are referred to immediately following the reference to the volume and page of the German text. It should be noted, however, that I have frequently modified these translations significantly. Where there is no reference to an English translation, the translation is my own.

- A/B *Kritik der reinen Vernunft* (KGS 3 and 4).
Critique of Pure Reason, trans. N. Kemp Smith, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1965.
- Anthro *Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht* (KGS 7).
Anthropology from a Practical Point of View, trans. Mary J. Gregor, The Hague: Nijhoff, 1974
- Diss *De Mundi Sensibilis Atque Intelligibilis Forma
 Et Principiis* (KGS 2).
On the Form and Principles of the Sensible and Intelligible World (The Inaugural Dissertation), trans. G. B. Kerferd and D. E. Walford, New York: Manchester University Press, 1968
- Ethik *Eine Vorlesung über Ethik*.
Lectures on Ethics, trans. Louis Infield, Indianapolis: Hackett, 1981.
- Gr *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten* (KGS 4).
Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals, trans. H. J. Paton, New York: Harper & Row, 1964.

SOURCES AND ABBREVIATIONS

- KprV *Kritik der praktischen Vernunft* (KGS 5).
Critique of Practical Reason, trans. L. W. Beck, Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1956.
- KU *Kritik der Urtheilskraft* (KGS 5).
Critique of Judgement, trans. Werner Pluhar, Indianapolis: Hackett, 1987.
- MAN *Metaphysische Anfangsgründe der Naturwissenschaften* (KGS 4).
Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science, trans. James Ellington, Indianapolis, New York: Bobbs-Merrill, 1970.
- MK₃ *Metaphysik K₃* (KGS 28).
- ML₁ *Metaphysik L₁* (KGS 28).
- MM *Metaphysik Mrongovius* (KGS 29).
- MrM *Moral Mrongovius II* (KGS 29).
- MS *Die Metaphysik der Sitten* (KGS 6).
The Metaphysic of Morals, Introduction and Part II (*The Doctrine of Virtue*), trans. Mary Gregor, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1964.
- MV *Metaphysik Volkmann* (KGS 28).
- Proleg *Prolegomena zu einer jeden künftigen Metaphysik die als Wissenschaft wird auftreten können* (KGS 4).
Prolegomena to any Future Metaphysics, trans. L. W. Beck, Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1950.
- R *Reflexionen* (KGS 17–19).
- Rel *Die Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der blossen Vernunft* (KGS 6).
Religion within the Limits of Reason Alone, trans. Theodore M. Greene and Hoyt H. Hudson, New York: Harper & Row, 1960.