

Cambridge University Press

0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict

Isaac Levi

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## HARD CHOICES

Cambridge University Press

0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict

Isaac Levi

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# HARD CHOICES

Decision making under unresolved conflict

ISAAC LEVI

*Columbia University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

Cambridge University Press  
0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict  
Isaac Levi  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521325271](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521325271)

© Cambridge University Press 1986

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1986  
Reprinted 1987  
First paperback edition 1990  
Reprinted 1999

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN-13 978-0-521-38630-2 paperback  
ISBN-10 0-521-38630-6 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2006

Cambridge University Press

0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict

Isaac Levi

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

TO MY MOTHER,  
EVA LUNENFELD LEVI  
IN MEMORY OF MY FATHER,  
ELIEZER ASHER LEVI

## Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xi</i>
<b>1 MORAL STRUGGLE</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Two kinds of struggle	1
1.2 Withholding judgement	5
1.3 For the best, all things considered	13
1.4 The plan of this book	17
<b>2 DILEMMAS</b>	<b>20</b>
2.1 Conflict and deontic logic	20
2.2 Guilt	24
2.3 Choosing without resolving conflict	28
2.4 Unresolved conflict generalized	35
<b>3 VALUES IN SCIENTIFIC INQUIRY</b>	<b>36</b>
3.1 Cognitive values	36
3.2 Cognitive and practical values	42
3.3 Pluralism and conflict	46
<b>4 CHOICE AND FOREKNOWLEDGE</b>	<b>47</b>
4.1 Ability and possibility	47
4.2 Choice	53
4.3 Foreknowledge and freedom	58
4.4 The argument thus far	67
<b>5 VALUE STRUCTURES</b>	<b>69</b>
5.1 Value commitments, value structures and ways of evaluation	69
5.2 Ways of evaluation	71
5.3 The mixture property	74
5.4 Potential resolutions	77
5.5 Cardinal and ordinal conflict	79
5.6 V-admissibility	80
5.7 Lexicographically ordered value structures	80

6	VALUES REVEALED BY CHOICES	83
6.1	Choice and preference	83
6.2	Value preference	84
6.3	Robust preference	85
6.4	Optimality	86
6.5	Categorical preference	91
6.6	Revealing preference	95
6.7	Normality	97
6.8	Revealed preference according to V-admissibility	99
6.9	Lexicographical V-admissibility	104
6.10	Conclusion	106
7	UNCERTAINTY AS A SOURCE OF CONFLICT	108
7.1	Uncertainty	108
7.2	Extended value structures	109
7.3	Lexicography	110
7.4	Expected value	111
7.5	Credal indeterminacy	114
7.6	Upper and lower betting quotients	122
7.7	Ellsberg's problem	128
7.8	The Allais problem	140
7.9	Consistency of choice	145
7.10	Conclusion	148
8	CONFLICT AND SOCIAL AGENCY	149
8.1	What is an agent?	149
8.2	Benevolence and conflict	154
9	DISTRIBUTING BENEFITS	158
9.1	Benevolence for each and benevolence for all	158
9.2	Benefit comparison structures	164
9.3	The average benefit principle	170
9.4	Benefit level dictatorship	173
9.5	Admissibility	174
9.6	Fair distribution	177
10	UTILITARIANISM AND CONFLICT	185
10.1	The sources of conflict	185
10.2	Concern and conflict	185
10.3	Average versus total utility	186

Cambridge University Press

0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict

Isaac Levi

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS		ix
10.4	Classical utilitarianism	190
10.5	Preference utilitarianism	192
10.6	Conclusion	198
<b>11</b>	<b>SOCIAL CHOICE THEORY</b>	<b>201</b>
11.1	Social benefit functionals	201
11.2	Lexicography	204
11.3	Independence	206
11.4	Paretian conditions	208
11.5	Invariance	210
11.6	Anonymity	211
11.7	Benevolence for all	212
11.8	Potential resolutions	213
11.9	Utilitarian aggregation	213
11.10	Leximinb-admissibility and abl(i)leximin- admissibility	214
11.11	Arrow's impossibility	216
<b>12</b>	<b>CONFLICT AND INQUIRY</b>	<b>219</b>
	Notes	223
	Bibliography	243
	Name index	247
	Subject index	249

Cambridge University Press

0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict

Isaac Levi

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Preface

For a long time, I have been interested in identifying the respects in which scientific inquiry is and is not value laden and have understood my ideas on this matter as a corrective to views advanced by Charles Peirce and John Dewey, in whose tradition I have located my own outlook. Dewey was also interested in the extent to which questions about values could be addressed in a manner exhibiting central features of scientific inquiry. In this volume, I have taken some first steps towards addressing this side of Dewey's concern.

I have had generous help and encouragement from many sources. Ruth Marcus read and commented copiously on an earlier version of what are now the first two chapters, inducing me to remove many errors. No doubt she will not be satisfied with the result, but I am very grateful for her help.

Norbert Hornstein read the entire manuscript and made several suggestions which, together with the comments of two referees for Cambridge University Press, led to a substantial reorganization of the contents of the book. I wish to thank him and the two referees (one of whom identified himself as Ned McClennen) for their kindness. Hornstein also suggested the title of the book. I am, of course, entirely to blame for accepting his suggestion.

Teddy Seidenfeld not only read a large portion of the manuscript, he participated in its construction through his encouragement and his positive contributions to the elaboration of the ideas contained therein.

I began work on this manuscript while on sabbatical leave at Cambridge University in 1980. I want to thank the members of the Faculty of Philosophy at Cambridge and the members of Darwin College for their kind hospitality. Special thanks are due to Hugh Mellor for his help and his attendance at the course of lectures I gave at Cambridge where I first elaborated the ideas which form the substance of this book.

I also thank those students who attended a recent seminar of mine at Columbia where I discussed the penultimate version of these ideas. Rebecca Berlow, Bruce Cooper, Yair Gutman, Melissa Mabon and Pinchas Ungvary were especially helpful.

Bruce Ackermann, Paul Lyon, Sidney Morgenbesser, Frederic Schick



Cambridge University Press

0521386306 - Hard Choices: Decision Making under Unresolved Conflict

Isaac Levi

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

PREFACE

and Amartya Sen have all read parts of this essay or discussed its ideas with me. My debt to Sen in chapters 8 to 11 and to Schick in chapter 4 will be apparent, but I have learned from all of them.

The work done at Cambridge in 1980 was partially supported by a fellowship from the NEH and a grant from the NSF.

My wife, Judith, has been a gold mine of moral support. Without her encouragement, I would not have managed to see this or any other large project I have undertaken to a conclusion.

This book is dedicated to the memory of my father, Eliezer Asher Levi, whose passionate commitment to his values bred a model of integrity for me to emulate, and to my mother, Eva Lunenfeld Levi, whose love and support enabled me to stand on my own two feet.

New York City  
June 1985