

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

Piers Vitebsky's study of religion and psychology in tribal India focusses upon a unique form of dialogue between the living and the dead, conducted through the medium of a shaman in trance. The dead sometimes nurture their living descendants, yet at other times they inflict upon them the very illnesses from which they died. Through intimate dialogue, the Sora use the occasion of death to explore their closest emotional attachments in all their ambivalence. Dr Vitebsky analyses the actors' words and relationships over several years and develops a typology of moods among the dead and of kinds of memory among the living. In comparing Sora shamanism with the treatment of bereavement in psychoanalysis and psychotherapy, he highlights a contrast in their assumptions which has far-reaching consequences for the social and professional scope of the two kinds of practice.

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of
Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

A list of books in this series will be found at the end of the volume

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of
Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

Cambridge Studies in Social and Cultural Anthropology
Editors: Ernest Gellner, Jack Goody, Stephen Gudeman,
Michael Herzfeld, Jonathan Parry

88

Dialogues with the dead

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)



At a funeral: the widow speaks to her dead husband through a shaman (right).

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

DIALOGUES WITH THE DEAD

*The discussion of mortality among the
Sora of eastern India*

PIERS VITEBSKY

Scott Polar Research Institute, University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1993

First published 1993

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Vitebsky, Piers.

Dialogues with the dead: the discussion of mortality among the Sora of eastern India /
Piers Vitebsky.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in social and cultural anthropology; 88)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 38447 8

1. Savara (Indic people) – Funeral customs and rites. 2. Savara (Indic people) –
Religion. 3. Bereavement. 4. Savara (Indic people) – Psychology. I. Title. II. Series.
DS432.S37V58 1992

306.9'0899595 – dc20 92-5723 CIP

ISBN 0 521 384478 hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2004

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of
Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

To my Sora friends, their ancestors and descendants
and to my own family

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of
Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

Give sorrow words; the grief that does not speak
Whispers the o'er-fraught heart and bids it break.

Macbeth, IV.iii.209–10

Contents

<i>List of plates</i>	<i>page</i> xii
<i>List of figures</i>	xiii
<i>List of texts</i>	xv
<i>Preface</i>	xvii
Part I Sonum: the continuation of consciousness after death	1
1 Dialogues between the living and the dead	3
The encounter	3
An outline of the argument	7
A note on ‘shamans’ and other intermediaries	18
2 The Sora people	24
A ‘tribe’ in Hindu India	24
Main personalities	33
3 The formation of the Sora person	46
Gradual transformations in the journey from birth to death and beyond	46
Sun-Woman as blacksmith and embryologist: heat, form and the development of consciousness	50
Naming the baby: childbearing and the husband’s lineage	54
Destiny and susceptibility to other persons	63

x	<i>Contents</i>	
4	Interpreting and persuading the dead	66
	Ancestor and Experience: mapping two distinct	
	modes of being dead	66
	Encountering, welcoming and dismissing sonums	76
	From medical history to biography	81
	Speaking for oneself: formal debates and ordinary	
	conversations	89
	Part II Responding to a new death	95
5	Transcription of a dialogue from the inquest on Jamano	99
	Deteriorating relations between Jamano and Mengalu	99
	Jamano's death and the first inquest at his cremation	99
	The second inquest at Jamano's stone-planting	103
6	Redeeming the dead and protecting the living	121
	Jamano's funeral continued: cosmic rescue by his	
	Ancestors	121
	Social order among the dead: Earth-Sonum as a	
	transitional stage between Experience and Ancestor	132
	The kaleidoscope of feelings between the living and	
	the dead	142
	Part III Operating the calculus of all previous deaths	147
7	Transcription of a dialogue with nineteen dead persons	149
8	Memories and rememberers: states of mind among the	
	dead and the living	176
	Emotional tone and degrees of redemption	176
	Conversations with two partially redeemed sonums	180
	A metaphysical crux: translating sonums as private	
	'Memories' in a public arena	195
	Verb forms: how the dead transfer their own states	
	of mind to the living	202

Cambridge University Press
0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of
Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky
Frontmatter/Prelims
[More information](#)

	<i>Contents</i>	xi
9	Forgetting the dead	216
	The progressive dissolution of the person after death	216
	The completion of inheritance and the waning of Earth-Memory sites	219
	The joy of naming a baby: retrieving a crucial attribute of the deceased	224
	The ultimate residue of the person and the final death of Memories	231
10	Dialogues with the self? Sora bereavement and the presuppositions of contemporary psychotherapy	236
	<i>Appendix 1: List of sonums recorded in Alinsing</i>	260
	<i>Notes</i>	264
	<i>List of references</i>	275
	<i>Index</i>	282

Plates

At a funeral: the widow speaks to her dead husband through a shaman		
		<i>frontispiece</i>
1	Shamans in trance sit side by side at a funeral, surrounded by mourners	<i>page</i> 6
2	Bystanders unclench the bodies of a funeral shaman and his daughter-apprentice in trance	20
3	A shaman's wall painting	57
4	After a day's dancing at a stone-planting	72
5	A divining and healing shaman banishes Ra'tud-Sonum along the path leading out of the village	79
6	A divining and healing shaman in trance	87
7	Eating at a stone-planting feast	124
8	Washing in pig's blood to block the contagion of an accidental death	131
9	Dancing in the street at the annual <i>karja</i>	225
10	The turmeric fight at a toddler's name-giving ceremony	226
11	Ancestor-Men untying the Ancestors' rings at a name-giving ceremony	227

Figures

1.1	General location of the Sora	page 2
2.1	Approximate location of the Lanjia Sora	26
2.2	Genealogy showing relationships between central characters in the book, with quarrels	40
3.1	The succession of funeral shamans through incestuous cross-cousin marriage in the Underworld	58
3.2	The transmission of a woman's name to her descendants	62
4.1	Ancestor space and Experience space	67
4.2	Experience sonums with their broad characteristics	74
4.3	Sites of Experience sonums around Alinsing, showing their main residential sites, outposts and sacrificial points	77
5.1	The cycle of illness and death as experienced in the biography of one person	100
6.1	Vertical map of sonum space, showing points of heat and coolness, becoming and being	134
6.2	Genealogy of Mengalu's relatives who died through the agency of Hollow Water and Rere Earth-Sonum sites	138
6.3	Chain of recruitment of victims of Rere Earth-Sonum site	139
7.1	Simplified genealogy of Sagalo's lineage showing order of dead speakers	150
7.2	Dramatis personae of dialogue, dead and living	155
7.3	Chain of suicide deaths linking <i>Rumbana</i> and <i>Palda</i>	162
8.1	Sagalo's cross-cousin relationships with his wife <i>Panderi</i> and her attacker <i>Sunia</i>	186

xiv *List of figures*

8.2	Genealogy relevant to <i>Palda</i> 's case, showing births of children and changes of residence in the Underworld and above ground	188
8.3	Effect of my own past on my present	199
8.4	Effect of your past on my present	199
8.5	The object of an ordinary transitive verb	204
8.6	Active and passive verb forms in the first person singular	204
8.7	Chain of subjects and objects under the aggressive action of Experience Memories	205
8.8	Grammatical relations between members of a chain of suicides	205
8.9	Sentence about Memory containing agent, verb and patient	205
8.10	Sentence about Memory containing unspecified agent, verb and specific patient	207
8.11	Middle verb form in the first person singular	208
8.12	Chain of successive namesakes using the middle verb, representing benign succession	209
8.13	The progress through successive verb forms of a person passing from life into death	212–13
9.1	Connections between some cultivators and nearby Earth-Memory sites	222
9.2	The overlapping existence of successive persons bearing the same name	232
9.3	The cyclical transmission of names between persons	233
10.1	Freudian and Sora models of relations between the living and the dead during bereavement	242–3

Texts

The term ‘text’ is used to denote the main passages where the Sora speak for themselves. The texts are sometimes interspersed with commentary.

1.1	Dialogue between a dead little girl and her living aunt	<i>page</i> 3
1.2	Extract from a shaman’s invocation to her predecessors	18
3.1	The story of Pubic-Haired Sompā	59
4.1	How Kantino’s father was killed by a leopard	86
5.1	Transcription of a dialogue from the inquest on Jamano	104
6.1	Redemption song of the male Ancestors	123
6.2	Extract from the redemption song of the female Ancestors	128
6.3	Song to heal Mengalu’s pain in urinating	140
7.1	Transcription of a dialogue with nineteen dead persons	156

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

Preface

I lived for four years on the Indian subcontinent between 1976 and 1983. This book is based on eighteen months which I spent among the Sora, mostly during 1976–7 and 1979, and the ethnographic present refers mostly to the second of these periods. I also made brief return visits in 1984 and 1992.

I am indebted for substantial financial support at various times to the Social Science Research Council of the UK for an initial postgraduate studentship; to Girton College, Cambridge, for a Margaret Smith Research Fellowship; to the Perrott-Warwick Fund for Psychical Research; and to my parents. I also received supplementary assistance from the Governing Body of the School of Oriental and African Studies; the Emslie Horniman Fund of the Royal Anthropological Institute; and the South Asia Language and Area Center of the University of Chicago.

Many people have read part or all of the manuscript and many more have given me hospitality or encouraged me in other ways. I am grateful to Pramod Kumar Behera, André Béteille, Jean Briggs, Audrey Cantlie, Michael Carrithers, Elisabeth Chaussin, Tony Cohen, Daniel de Coppet, Susan Drucker-Brown, Dorothy Emmet, John Forrester, Doris and Meyer Fortes, Christoph von Fürer-Haimendorf, Jean-Claude Galey, Ernest Gellner, Kathleen Gough, Roberte Hamayon, Sarah Harrison, Olivier and Arlette Herrenschmidt, Mark Hobart, Caroline Humphrey, Ron Inden, N. S. Kumaraswamy, Celia and Edmund Leach, Godfrey Lienhardt, Julius Lipner, Roland Littlewood, Geoffrey Lloyd, Alan Macfarlane, T. N. Madan, Laxman Mahapatra, Sitakant Mahapatra, Adrian Mayer, Rodney Needham, Charlie Nuckolls, Gananath Obeyesekere, Dorinda Outram, Robert Paine, Michel Panoff, Dave Parkin, Johnny Parry, Prakash Pashpureddy, Bala Patnaik, D. P. Pattanayak, James Peacock, Terence

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)xviii *Preface*

Penelhum, Christian Petit, C. A. Prasad, Declan Quigley, Prasada Rao, Audrey Richards, Steve Rosen, Malcolm Ruel, Ann Salmond, Rupert Sheldrake, Milton Singer, Bhupinder Singh, Surajit Sinha, David and Patricia Stampe, Hilary Standing, Marilyn Strathern, J. S. Uberoi, Roy Wagner, Michael Yorke, Norman Zide; to two anonymous reviewers, one Indian, one American; to Mel Otis, Katie Andersen and other Christian missionaries of various denominations in Serango, Gunupur and Parlahkhemundi (Parlakimidi); to Bryce Boyer, Danny Freeman and the members of the Anthropology-Psychoanalysis Interdisciplinary Colloquium of the American Psychoanalytic Association, who devoted their December 1988 meeting in New York entirely to the discussion of this manuscript; and to my wife Sally and children Patrick and Catherine, who came into my life after I had left the Sora but who gave me much better reason than I had had before to reflect on mortality.

Most of all, my debt is to the numerous Sora who after initial doubts welcomed me into their homes and their lives and cared for me during long periods when I was heavily dependent on them. This book is about their relationships with each other and, given the intimate nature of the matters discussed, it seemed best to protect the anonymity of the main characters even though some of these are among my greatest Sora friends and benefactors. There is another book to be written about my own relationship with these people; but I hope that enough will emerge in the pages which follow to go some way towards explaining why my time among the Sora was a powerful formative period in my life, the lessons of which I am only gradually beginning to understand. I can do no more than dedicate this book to the Sora whom I knew, their ancestors and their descendants, along with my own family.

I worked exclusively in the Sora language. I deliberately did not take any written sources on the language with me into the field and it was not until quite late that I had an opportunity to learn something of the Oriya, Telugu and Hindi which are partly known by some Soras. This approach gave me a very slow start since I arrived in Soraland quite inarticulate. But it also gave me a much richer reward in the later stages of my fieldwork. For someone who enjoys languages, there can be few more fascinating experiences than working out the semantics of a language from the constant exploration of consistencies and variations in actual usage. Sora culture is an oral one. Villages, families and even some persons have their own distinctive dialects or ways of speaking: for example, it was often said that I had clearly learned to speak Sora in the company of Inama because of my extreme emphasis on glottal stops. Not surprisingly, there is no standard orthography among

Cambridge University Press

0521384478 - Dialogues with the Dead: The Discussion of Mortality among the Sora of Eastern India - Piers Vitebsky

Frontmatter/Prelims

[More information](#)

Preface xix

those who have occasion to write the language down (whether in the Oriya, Telugu or international phonetic script), namely linguists, missionaries and some Soras themselves if they write letters home while working in Assam. Though phonologists might wish for many more diacritics than I have given here and the use of the *shwa*, for the sake of other readers (whom I very much want to remember certain Sora terms) I have used only ñ (pronounced 'ny' as in Spanish) and ɪ, similar to the Russian И or the Turkish back vowel. I have also distinguished *ng* from *ngg*, corresponding respectively to the sounds in the English words 'singer' and 'linger'.¹ Words from other Indian languages are spelt according to generally accepted standards.

The dialogues quoted are *verbatim* translations of tape recordings and are laid out like the script of a drama. Elsewhere a speaker's actual words, or the literal translation of a Sora term, are given in inverted commas. Where I supply my own paraphrase of a speaker's words I make this clear. Square brackets are used for stage directions or other material supplied by me to make the meaning clearer. In dialogues and figures throughout the book names and remarks of dead speakers are printed in italics. Personal names are stressed as follows: two-syllabled usually as in Sindi; three-syllabled on the third syllable, as in Mengalú, Indirí, Jamanó (never on the second syllable, as one might be tempted to do on the analogy of Italian or Spanish). To remember this, one has only to think of people calling to each other from one hillside to another, their voices whooping upward: 'E! Mengalú!' 'E! Pirinó!'

Sora life has a strong sense of gender, though sexual roles are less sharply polarised than in much of India: men can fetch water for the house, while women can plough with buffalos. Where no specific person is meant, I have usually avoided clumsy English circumlocutions such as 'he or she' and used the pronouns 'he' for laypersons and 'she' for shamans, since the most important shamans are usually women.

My 1992 visit, made while this book was going to press, showed that Sora society is changing rapidly. The children with whom I played earlier are now young adults and many are becoming Baptists. For those young people, there are no more dialogues with the dead and the ethnographic present of this book which I was still able to share with those over thirty is already something which belongs to an older generation.