MAGIC, SCIENCE, RELIGION, AND
THE SCOPE OF RATIONALITY
THE LEWIS HENRY MORGAN LECTURES 1984
presented at
The University of Rochester
Rochester, New York

THE LEWIS HENRY MORGAN LECTURES 1984
Lewis Henry Morgan Lecture Series
Fred Eggan: The American Indian: Perspectives for the Study of Social Change
Ward, H. Goodenough: Description and Comparison in Cultural Anthropology
Nancy Munn: The Fame of Gawa: A Symbolic Study of Value Transformation in a Mussim (Papua New Guinea) Society
Lawrence Rosen: The Anthropology of Justice: Law as Culture in Islamic Society
1. Frontispiece A medieval man of many parts and pursuits: the revered and ingenious father Bertold Schwartz of the Franciscan Order, Doctor, Alchemist, and founder of the art of rifle shooting in the year 1380.
Magic, science, religion, and the scope of rationality

STANLEY JEYARAJA TAMBIAH

Harvard University
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>viii</td>
<td>List of plates</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ix</td>
<td>Foreword by Alfred Harris</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xi</td>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Magic, science and religion in Western thought: anthropology’s</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>intellectual legacy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Anthropology’s intellectual legacy (continued)</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Sir Edward Tylor versus Bronislaw Malinowski: is magic false science</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>or meaningful performance?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Malinowski’s demarcations and his exposition of the magical art</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Multiple orderings of reality: the debate initiated by Lévy-Bruhl</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Rationality, relativism, the translation and commensurability of</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cultures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Modern science and its extensions</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes  155
Bibliography  171
Index  177
Plates

A medieval man of many parts and pursuits: the revered and ingenious father Bertold Schwartz of the Franciscan Order, Doctor, Alchemist, and founder of the art of rifle shooting in the year 1380.

2.1 Anatomical dissection. Frontispiece from Andreas Vesalius's De humani corporis fabrica, Basle, 1543.

2.2 William Hogarth: The Reward of Cruelty (c. 1750).

2.3 The doctor gives up treatment on account of the seriousness of the illness. The patient is healed through spiritual blessing.

3.1 Photograph of the eminent Spanish scientist, Santiago Ramón y Cajal, at his table with scientific equipment, taken in Barcelona in 1894.

3.2 A spirit priest among the Akha, a hill tribe in Northern Thailand, with his paraphernalia laid out next to the main house post.

3.3 The Buddhist abbot of a Bangkok wat sprinkling sacralized water on lay devotees at the kathin festival held after the end of the monks' rainy season retreat in 1973.

3.4 “Goldmaker and Blacksmith”: Alchemists and their assistants in their workshop.

3.5 Two medical scientists at work c. 1900 in a laboratory at the Harvard Medical School.

4.1 A Kiriwinian man planting yams with traditional stone tool in the 1970s.

4.2 A Kiriwinian woman weeding around new yam shoots.

4.3 and 4.4 A group of girls bringing in yams from the gardens during harvest, and building a display before loading them in the yam houses.

4.5 Loading the ample decorated yam houses of a chief at harvest time.

4.6 A competitive “long yam” about four feet long, grown through the combined use of skill and magic.

4.7 Men dressed in skirts and cockatoo feathers performing a harvest dance called bisila.

5.1 Professors and students in a physiology laboratory at Harvard Medical School in 1905: a scientific community practicing “normal science.”

5.2 The collaboration of lay benefactors and medical scientists and missionaries in the transfer of medical science from the West to the East.

Acknowledgments Plates 2.1, 2.3, 3.1, 3.4, 3.5, 5.1 and 5.2 from the Francis A. Countway Library of Medicine; photograph for Plate 3.2 by Deborah Tooker; photograph for Plate 3.3 by author; photographs for Plates 4.1–4.7 by Jerry Leach.
Foreword

Since Lewis Henry Morgan’s day, anthropology has become established as an international enterprise with trained anthropologists on every continent, participants in a generalizing discipline that both includes and transcends local concerns. Professor Tambiah, educated in Ceylon and the United States, taught in Ceylon and England before coming to the United States, where he is now on the faculty of Harvard University. His previous research, based on fieldwork in southeast Asia, has attracted widespread attention, and over the past twenty-five years has earned him an enviable list of honors and awards. The 1984 Lewis Henry Morgan Lectures were delivered by Professor Tambiah on March 13, 15, 20 and 22.

An outline sketch of Professor Tambiah’s argument and conclusions could not do justice to the subtle clarity and elegance of his presentation; here it is possible to touch on only a few general points. In this expanded version of his Lewis Henry Morgan Lectures, Professor Tambiah examines several concepts that have been especially important in much anthropological work. “Magic,” “science,” “religion” and “rationality” are obviously not the exclusive concern of anthropology; the history of thinking about them can be traced very far back. In this book they are examined in a broadly conceived framework, so constructed that not only the use of the terms over the past hundred years or so is considered, they are also placed in the context of work in other disciplines.

It is apparent, on reading these lectures in relation to Professor Tambiah’s other publications, that more than twenty years of research and critical thought lie behind them. The discussion goes beyond anthropology’s boundaries, making it clear that anthropology has major contributions to offer regarding discussions and debates that have exercised philosophers, historians and others over the years. This work, then, can be read as a contribution to the history of ideas, and as a critical contextualizing of what has been written, in terms of Professor Tambiah’s own theoretical scheme.

This way of proceeding permits the author to consider what such major contributors to our thinking as Tylor, Malinowski and Wittgenstein have
said. But it is also necessary, in his view, to offer both careful evaluations of other authors and his own resolution of the problems their work raises. This set of conclusions, especially as developed in the final chapters, will undoubtedly stimulate controversy. It is just as certain, and perhaps more important, that Professor Tambiah’s theory makes it possible to move on. He, together with others, can now make use of his conclusions in dealing with particular ethnographic cases.

Interested readers will find much to think about on every page, and will undoubtedly appreciate the stimulating impact Professor Tambiah’s lectures and seminars had upon his audiences.

Alfred Harris
Editor
The Lewis Henry Morgan Lectures
Acknowledgments

I thank the University of Rochester, and in particular Professors Alfred and Grace Harris, for inviting me to give the Lewis Henry Morgan Lectures in 1984. They, together with the faculty and the graduate students of the Department of Anthropology, were warm, considerate, and stimulating hosts, and I hope that the revised text of the lectures will please them.

Thanks are also due to the following: to Dan Rosenberg for reading the text in draft form and offering comments for improvement; to Geoffrey Lloyd and Milton Singer for their valuable and encouraging comments in the role of readers; to Richard J. Wolfe, Elin L. Wolfe, and Dèla T. Zitkus of the Francis A. Countway Library of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, for their informed and gracious help in choosing many illustrations for inclusion in the book; to Jerry Leach for the wonderful photographs of people of the Trobriand Islands; and to Deborah Tooker for the picture of an Akha spirit priest.

I am very much in the debt of Kenneth Laine Ketner for permitting me to make lavish use of the translation prepared by him and James Eigsti entitled Ludwig Wittgenstein, Remarks on Frazer’s Philosophical Anthropology.