

This book sets out a generative structuralist conception of general theoretical sociology: its philosophy, its problems, and its methods. The field is defined as a comprehensive research tradition with many intersecting subtraditions that share conceptual components. The focus is on formalization and unification as processes that can help advance the state of theory today.

An integrative philosophy of the field is set out in terms of a process worldview, a focus on generativity in explanation, and a conception of the structure of theories as hierarchical meaning control systems.

This philosophy is implemented in two phases. In the first phase, Professor Fararo carefully defines the core problems of general theoretical sociology in the context of setting out and illustrating the logic of a nonlinear dynamical social systems framework. A critical analysis of the outcome of this phase then leads, in the second phase, to formal treatments of action principles and structural analysis. A variety of traditions are drawn upon to treat theoretical problems of order and integration, as well as to examine searchingly problems of formalization and unification in theoretical sociology.

Along the way, many conceptual issues and methodological problems in contemporary sociological theory are discussed as Fararo develops the implications of his generative structuralist conception of general theoretical sociology.



The Arnold and Caroline Rose Monograph Series of the American Sociological Association

The meaning of general theoretical sociology



The Rose Monograph Series was established in 1968 in honor of the distinguished sociologists Arnold and Caroline Rose, whose bequest makes the series possible. The sole criterion for publication in the series is that a manuscript contribute to knowledge in the discipline of sociology in a systematic and substantial manner. All areas of the discipline and all established and promising modes of inquiry are equally eligible for consideration. The Rose Monograph Series is an official publication of the American Sociological Association.

Editor: Teresa Sullivan

Board of Editors

Andrew Cherlin Robert Hauser
Daniel Chirot Virginia Hiday
Phillips Cutright Jonathan Turner

Kai Erikson

For other titles in this series, turn to page 388.



The meaning of general theoretical sociology

Tradition and formalization

Thomas J. Fararo

University of Pittsburgh





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521372589

© Cambridge University Press 1989

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1989 First paperback edition 1992

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Fararo, Thomas J.

The meaning of general theoretical sociology: tradition and formalization / Thomas J. Fararo p. cm. – (The Arnold and Caroline Rose monograph series of the American Sociological Association) Bibliography: p. Includes index.

1. Sociology. 2. Sociology – Philosophy. I. Title II. Series.

HM24.F353 1989

301-dc19 89-740 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-37258-9 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-43795-0 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2008



Contents

List of Figures and Tables p		<i>age</i> viii	
Preface		ix	
Introduction	1	1	
Chapter 1.	A philosophy of general theoretical sociology	9	
	1.1. Introduction	9	
	1.2. General theoretical sociology as a comprehensive		
	research tradition	10	
	1.3. Theory structure	16	
	1.3.1. A positivist model: mathematical axiomatics	16	
	1.3.2. An instrumentalist model: meaning hierarchy	24	
	1.3.3. An integrated model: meaning control hier-		
	archy with embedded optional axiomatics	26	
	1.3.4. Comments on discussions of theory structure		
	in sociology	36	
	1.4. Theoretical explanation	36	
	1.4.1. A positivist model	37	
	1.4.2. A realist model	39	
	1.4.3. An integrated model	43	
	1.5. The process worldview	47	
	1.6. Three issues	53	
	1.6.1. The first issue: the natural science model	53	
	1.6.2. The second issue: the cognitive status of		
	theories	55	
	1.6.3. The third issue: models	57	
	1.7. Summary	59	
Chapter 2.	Dynamical social systems and the key problems	62	
	2.1. Introduction	62	
	2.2. The systems idea in theoretical sociology	63	
	2.3. Dynamical systems: abstract sketch	70	
		v	



vi	Co	ontents
	2.4. Equilibrium and adjustment	81
	2.5. Four types of theorems	87
	2.6. Pareto and general theoretical sociology	90
	2.7. Homans and the human group as a system	96
	2.8. General dynamical social systems and types of social	
	structure theorems	102
	2.9. Example: four social structure theorems	120
	2.10. Nonlinear dynamics, causal explanation, and func-	
	tional analysis	129
	2.10.1. Nonlinear social dynamics	129
	2.10.2. On explanation and functional analysis	133
	2.11. Complexity, action theory, and structuralism	139
	2.12. Summary	150
Chapter 3.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	153
	3.1. Introduction	153
	3.2. Analytical action theory: the control principle of	
	action	159
	3.2.1. Interpreting Parsons dynamically	159
	3.2.2. A dynamical normative control system model	161
	3.2.3. Application to presuppositions of analytical	
	action theory	167
	3.2.4. A mathematical treatment	169
	3.2.5. Cybernetic hierarchy models	172
	3.2.6. Implications for basic theory	176
	3.3. Analytical action theory: dynamical system sketches	179
	3.3.1. The general dynamical social action system	182
	3.3.2. Action and order implications	184
	3.3.3. Interpenetration and action theory	191
	3.3.4. Critical discussion	192
	3.3.5. Analytical perspectives on action and order	195
	3.4. Interpretive sociology and structural-generative	
	action theory	197
	3.4.1. Elements of interpretive sociology	198
	3.4.2. Toward a formalization of interpretive soci-	
	ology	201
	3.4.3. Analytical action theory revisited	214
	3.5. Adaptively rational action	218
	3.5.1. Methodological individualism	220
	3.5.2. Adaptive rationality I: dynamic utility	221
	3.5.3. Adaptive rationality II: the behavioral model	222



Contents		vii
	3.5.4. Adaptive rationality III: the Durkheimian issue	223
	3.6. Adaptively rational action: behavioral models and	
	theoretical procedures	225
	3.6.1. An adaptive behavior model	225
	3.6.2. The coupling procedure3.6.3. Computer-assisted analysis of theoretical models: an example for the iterated Pris-	233
	oner's Dilemma	241
	3.7. Concluding discussion	249
Chapter 4.	Structuralism and unification	255
	4.1. Introduction	255
	4.2. Biased networks: diffusion in a social structure	264
	4.3. Theoretical significance of biased networks and dif- fusion processes	271
	4.4. The strength of weak ties and the dilemma of integration	275
	4.5. Related formal theory in the social networks tradi-	
	tion	278
	4.6. Macrostructuralism	283
	4.6.1. Introduction to macrostructural theory	284
	4.6.2. Formalization of macrostructural theory: I	288
	4.6.3. Formalization of macrostructural theory: II	295
	4.6.4. Discussion	302
	4.7. Unification of macrostructural theory and the weak- ties model	306
	4.8. Small worlds: an application of the unified theory	313
	4.9. Generativity via <i>E</i> -state structuralism	320
	4.9.1. Formulation and application of the theoretical	
	procedure	323
	4.9.2. Summary4.9.3. Toward further developments	333 335
	4.10. Summary	340
	4.10. Summary	340
Summary		342
Notes		350
References		362
Index of names		375
Index of subjects		379



Figures and tables

Figures

1.1.	Example for ABX model	page 34
1.2.	Stable equilibria for ABX model	35
2.1.	Equilibrium as adjustment	83
2.2.	Structure of inclusion relations	110
2.3.	Structure of action relations	111
2.4.	Structure of social relations	112
2.5.	Dynamic outcomes for linear model	124
2.6.	Nonlinear dynamics in behavior manifold	131
3.1.	General negative-feedback control system	165
3.2.	Form of two-level cybernetic hierarchy	173
3.3.	Values and types of social relations	189
3.4.	Social coupling with social relation aspect	190
3.5.	Prisoner's Dilemma	241
4.1.	Cumulative structure statistics: data, random net, biased net	268
4.2.	Bias parameters	269
Tabl	les	
2.1.	Pareto's procedural analogy	93
2.2.	Homans's hypotheses: examples	119
4.1.	Observed tracing data and random net predictions for Project	
	Revere	264
4.2.	The connectivity of a random net as a function of the contact	
	density	266
4.3.	Theory construction logic for unification of weak-ties theory and macrostructural theory	309

viii



Preface

The main objectives of this book are to set out a conception of a comprehensive research tradition I call *general theoretical sociology* and to show how key problems in this field are defined and studied in formal terms. The Introduction presents an overview of the topics treated in sequential terms in four chapters: a philosophy of general theoretical sociology, a dynamical systems formulation of its main problems, formal studies in action theory and social order, and integrative theory construction centered on the analysis of social structure in network terms

This work represents two tendencies in my thinking emerging over the past decade. On the one hand, there is a continuity of past and present, of traditions in sociological theory. Despite the pluralism, I have come to regard the various traditions as communicating branches of one comprehensive tradition to which each generation makes its contributions. On the other hand, theoretical advance is through a *unification dynamic*. It is not that some static state of integrated sociological theory, wiping out disagreements, is envisioned. The commitment is to a recursive process of unification of otherwise separate contributions. This can occur at a variety of levels and in diverse ways, involving metatheory, principles, and theoretical procedures, a number of which are discussed and exemplified in this book.

Two overall elements of orientation inform the approach taken in this book. First, I treat the vast body of work of the past and present of sociological theory as a compound of general theoretical analysis, world-historical analysis, and normative analysis. In a wider envisagement of the meaning of sociological theory, all three of these elements of its tradition would be treated. This book treats only the component of general theoretical analysis. Hence, the subject matter is the meaning of general theoretical sociology, which is an abstraction from the concrete body of sociological theory. A further element of selection is indicated by the use of the term *general*. These and other matters of orientation are discussed in Chapters 1 and 2 of the book. The point here is that what is involved is an element of value orientation; namely, this book is based on a value commitment to the advance of the general theoretical element in sociological theory.

ix



X Preface

A second element of orientation informs this book. It is a methodological and sociological approach that I call *generative structuralism*. On the one hand, the approach is based on the idea of generativity. With regard to theoretical method, this amounts to a commitment to the construction of generative theoretical models. Formal elements are intrinsic to this activity. This idea is explicated in Chapter 1. On the other hand, the approach is based on the idea of social structure. Structuralism can mean and has meant many things. In this book, its primary meaning is the treatment of social structure as the problem focus rather than the solution focus for other problems. Whatever else it may mean, the sociology of a phenomenon is its interpretation or explanation in terms of social structure. But general theoretical sociology treats that very resource of explanation in other contexts as the source of its key problems. This idea is explicated in Chapter 2. Accordingly, the generative structuralist approach leads to the view that the meaning of general theoretical sociology is found in the activity of constructing generative theoretical models that answer to problems of social structure.

In a previous book (Fararo, 1973), I advocated and tried to illustrate a set of standards in the use of logic and mathematics in sociological theory. These included, for instance, conceptual clarity, formal consistency, deductive fertility, and empirical meaningfulness. In this book, it has not always proved possible to maintain all these standards. This is true, in particular, of Chapter 3, with its difficult focus on action and order. For instance, some of the formal work does not exhibit deductive fertility. Yet such work may have value in exhibiting a mode of formalization specially adapted to qualitative perspectives and also in its potential to function in unification episodes. In another instance, there is an introduction of primitive quantitative terms without demonstrated empirical meaningfulness as I used this term in the earlier book. This occurs in the mathematical model of dynamic normative control. I doubt that I would have set out this model in a context where we are dealing with the normative meaning of action were it not for the exemplar of David Heise (1979, 1986). Given that his theory rests on a quantitative control systems model supplied with a measurement basis, I feel less uneasy about the problem of empirical meaningfulness than I would otherwise. So one problem for future analysis is to link the normative control model of Chapter 3 to an empirical basis, possibly even the same as that employed by Heise. Another problem is to articulate the two types of theoretical models as such, one addressed to normative meaning and the other to affective meaning. I hope there has been some compensating value in framing the particular model in terms of a process-oriented explication of an important principle of general theoretical sociology.

My aim has been to speak not only to a small circle of committed formalists but also to a broad audience of theorists, teachers of theory, and their students.



Preface xi

Since the use of formal techniques is an intrinsic feature of the approach taken in this book, there is also a substantial obstacle to the realization of this aim. It may be anticipated that not all readers will be able to follow the more technical developments of the ideas. But much of the book is couched at the level of presuppositions and principles and of theoretical procedures that can be implemented in diverse formal ways. These and related discussions should be accessible to readers who are not totally put off by the more formal aspect of the book.

I have been fortunate in the past decade to have had John Skvoretz as a collaborator on a number of formal theoretical studies reported in this book. I am grateful to him for comments on portions of an earlier version of the book and to Kenji Kosaka and John Mellott for their very useful comments. Thanks also go to external reviewers for prompting revisions that, I hope, improved the form and substance of the book; and I am especially indebted to David Willer. He provided an extraordinarily detailed and sophisticated critical commentary, which nevertheless gave the sort of encouragement an author welcomes. My colleague and friend Robert Avery was more valuable to me than he knows in giving me his reactions to some of the ideas expressed here. And for her encouragement and emotional support, my unlimited gratitude goes to my wife, Irene.

Thomas J. Fararo Pittsburgh, Pa.