REVOLUTION AND REBELLION

State and society in England in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries

This iconoclastic and satirical book provides a radical reconstruction of the recent historiography of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. It creates an alliance between those revisionist historians who have rewritten the received account of the origins of the English Civil War and those historians who have been rethinking the Hanoverian era: *Revolution and Rebellion* is thus a companion volume to the author's *English Society 1688–1832*. This book counters the Marxist interpretation of the 1640s as the 'English Revolution' by deploying our new understanding of the nonrevolutionary nature of the world after 1660: it challenges the appropriateness of 'revolution' as a description of events like those of 1688, 1715, 1745, the American Revolution, the Industrial Revolution or the Reform Bill, drawing attention instead to the idea of 'rebellion'. This is the first book so to link English history in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries: it will be required reading for students and teachers of both eras.

JONATHAN CLARK is a Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford.

REVOLUTION AND REBELLION

State and society in England in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries

J. C. D. CLARK



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge New York Port Chester Melbourne Sydney

> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

> > © Cambridge University Press 1986

First published 1986 Reprinted 1987, 1990

British Library cataloguing in publication data

Clark, J. C. D. Revolution and rebellion: state and society in England in seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. 1. Great Britain – Politics and government – 1603–1714 2. Great Britain – Politics and government – 1714–1820 I. Title 941.06 DA375

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Clark, J. C. D. Revolution and rebellion. Includes index. 1. Great Britain – Politics and government – 1603–1714. 2. Great Britain – Politics and government – 18th century. 3. England – Social conditions – 17th century. 4. England – Social conditions – 18th century. JN175.C59 1986 320.941 86–13634

> ISBN 0 521 33063 7 hard covers ISBN 0 521 33710 0 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 1999

CONTENTS

	List of abbreviations page Preface page	vii ix
I	INTRODUCTION	I
2	A DISCOURSE ON METHOD Periodisation: the effects of division Revisionism versus orthodoxy Namier's ghost: a case of mistaken identity The revival of narrative The wider setting	6
3	SOCIAL CHANGE EXPLANATIONS The Old Guard model The eighteenth-century outcome Modifying the model The two phases of the English past	24
4	 THE CASE OF THE PROVINCES Provincialism: a different model in two centuries? Provincialism: true but unimportant? The long survival of localist phenomena Provincialism: important but untrue? The Old Hat and Old Guard critique Rebellion and religion: a new direction for the Provincial model? 	45
5	THE MONARCHY AND PARLIAMENT The historiography The eighteenth century: what was the outcome? The seventeenth century: what were the origins? How, then, do we picture the monarchy?	68

vi	Contents	
6	POLITICAL IDEOLOGY The Old Guard restatement: did it work? Radicalism: a common thread? What has religion to do with politics? Why does Jacobitism matter? Parliamentary alignments and political theory: the rebirth of constitutional history?	92
7	PARTY STRUCTURE AND THE HOUSE OF COMMONS The road to 1640: the significance of issues Party alignments: the significance of structure Was there an opposition? Court and Country or Whig and Tory? From what time do modern parties date? Patronage and clientage: the survival of 'Old Corruption'?	120
	Conclusion	164
	<i>Appendix A</i> : Newman's definition of liberalism <i>Appendix B</i> : The recent debate on Jacobitism after 1714	172 174
	Index	178

ABBREVIATIONS

BJECSBritish Journal for Eighteenth Century StudiesCHJCambridge Historical JournalECThe Eighteenth Century: Theory and InterpretationECSEighteenth Century StudiesEHREnglish Historical ReviewHJHistorical JournalJBSJournal of British StudiesJEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th seriesWMQWilliam and Mary Quarterly	BIHR	Bulletin of the Institute of Historical Research
ECThe Eighteenth Century: Theory and InterpretationECSEighteenth Century StudiesEHREnglish Historical ReviewHJHistorical JournalJBSJournal of British StudiesJEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	BJECS	British Journal for Eighteenth Century Studies
ECSEighteenth Century StudiesEHREnglish Historical ReviewHJHistorical JournalJBSJournal of British StudiesJEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	ĊHJ	Cambridge Historical Journal
EHREnglish Historical ReviewHJHistorical JournalJBSJournal of British StudiesJEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	EC	The Eighteenth Century: Theory and Interpretation
HJHistorical JournalJBSJournal of British StudiesJEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	ECS	Eighteenth Century Studies
JBSJournal of British StudiesJEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	EHR	English Historical Review
JEHJournal of Ecclesiastical HistoryJHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	HJ	Historical Journal
JHIJournal of the History of IdeasJMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	JBS	Journal of British Studies
JMHJournal of Modern HistoryP&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	JEH	Journal of Ecclesiastical History
P&PPast and PresentSCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	JHI	Journal of the History of Ideas
SCHStudies in Church HistoryTHESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	ЈМН	Journal of Modern History
THESThe Times Higher Education SupplementTLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	P&P	Past and Present
TLSThe Times Literary SupplementTRHSTransactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	SCH	Studies in Church History
TRHS Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series	THES	The Times Higher Education Supplement
	TLS	The Times Literary Supplement
WMQ William and Mary Quarterly	TRHS	Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th series
	WMQ	William and Mary Quarterly

PREFACE

It will soon become obvious to readers of this book that the debates with which it deals are being described by a participant. I should say therefore that, while I am most grateful to those of my colleagues with whom I have discussed these issues, the views expressed are my personal ones: they are not an authorised statement of the tenets of any school or group. Partly these reflections arise out of self-criticism, in an attempt to improve on some early work on the politics of 1714-60, and to atone for its deficiencies. Partly they are an attempt to give order to a series of confused historical arguments, and so to suggest ways in which those arguments might develop in the future. To encapsulate the views of one's colleagues in a few lines may sometimes be a legitimate aim, but it is intensely difficult to accomplish. At all times my intention is to provide not a substitute for the originals, but an inducement which will provoke the reader to consult for himself the works of those historians whom I discuss. Much can be learned even (or perhaps especially) from those books with which we most disagree: it is only fair that I should record a general indebtedness to those authors who so figure here.

With these appropriate caveats, I can record with gratitude the advice and encouragement of those of my colleagues who read this essay in draft form: Robert Ashton, Jercmy Black, Ian R. Christie, Eveline Cruickshanks, Sir Geoffrey Elton, J. P. Ferris, Anthony Fletcher, J. P. Kenyon, Peter Laslett, Wallace T. MacCaffrey, John Morrill, J. G. A. Pocock, Conrad Russell, Quentin Skinner, John Walsh, Austin Woolrych. To have written a book with which such a diverse group of scholars could all agree was beyond my ambitions: they will, I hope, accept this intervention as a contribution to a living debate rather than as an inscription on the gravestone of a dead one.

The debate is sometimes lively to the point of acrimony. Students approaching these areas for the first time often have difficulty in appreciating what all the fuss is about: why seemingly technical historical Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-33710-6 - Revolution and Rebellion: State and Society in England in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries

J. C. D. Clark Frontmatter More information

Х

Preface

arguments over division lists or Jacobite ideology, county government or patronage networks, generated such heat among scholars. This study places those debates in a wider context and emphasises the important issues which were, and are, at stake. Students should bear in mind, too, that this is not a book to be consulted a chapter at a time. Its aim is to give a general view of the shape of the subject, and of the relation of different themes to each other. It should be read as a unity.

It is with particular pleasure that I can dedicate this book to the Warden and Fellows of All Souls College – 'For one day in thy courts : is better than a thousand.'

February 1986