CAMBRIDGE SURVEYS OF ECONOMIC LITERATURE

SOCIAL EXPERIMENTATION AND ECONOMIC POLICY

CAMBRIDGE SURVEYS OF ECONOMIC LITERATURE

Editors:

Miss Phyllis Deane, University of Cambridge Professor Mark Perlman, University of Pittsburgh

Editorial Advisory Board: Professor A. B. Atkinson, London School of Economics and Political

Sciences Professor M. Bronfenbrenner, Duke University Professor K. D. George, University College, Cardiff Professor C. P. Kindleberger, Massachusetts Institute of Technology Professor T. Mayer, University of California, Davis Professor A. R. Prest, London School of Economics and Political Science

The literature of economics is expanding rapidly, and many subjects have changed out of recognition within the space of a few years. Perceiving the state of knowledge in fast developing subjects is difficult for students and time consuming for professional economists. This series of books is intended to help with this problem. Each book will be quite brief, giving a clear structure to and balanced overview of the topic and written at a level intelligible to the senior undergraduate. The books will therefore be useful for teaching, but will also provide a mature yet compact presentation of the subject for economists wishing to update their knowledge outside their own specialism.

Other books in the series E. Roy Weintraub: Microfoundations: The compatibility of microeconomics and macroeconomics Dennis C. Mueller: Public choice Robert L. Clark and Joseph J. Spengler: The economics of individual and population aging Edwin Burmeister: Capital theory and dynamics Mark Blaug: The methodology of economics

Social experimentation and economic policy

ROBERT FERBER

Former Research Professor of Economics and Business Administration and Director, Survey Research Laboratory, University of Illinois

WERNER Z. HIRSCH

Professor of Economics, University of California, Los Angeles

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS CAMBRIDGE LONDON NEWYORK NEWROCHELLE MELBOURNE SYDNEY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521241854

© Cambridge University Press 1982

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1982 Re-issued in this digitally printed version 2008

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Ferber, Robert, 1922–
Social experimentation and economic policy.
(Cambridge surveys of economic literature)
Bibliography: p.
Includes index.
1. United States – Economic policy – 1971–

Evaluation. 2. United States – Social policy – Evaluation. 3. Public welfare – United States – Evaluation. I. Hirsch, Werner Zvi, 1920– . II. Title. III. Series.
HC106.7.F47 338.973 81–6146

ISBN 978-0-521-24185-4 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-28507-0 paperback

CONTENTS

	List of tables and figures	<i>page</i> viii
	Preface	xi
1	Introduction	1
2	Nature of social experimentation	5
	What are social experiments?	5
	Why social experiments?	9
	Alternatives to social experiments	10
	Classification of social experiments	20
3	Challenges posed by social experiments	23
	Some general problems	23
	Some technical problems	28
	Ethical and moral issues	37
	Administration	43
4	The start: the New Jersey Experiment	48
	Background	48
	Treatment variables	50
	Sample design	51
	Administration and implementation	54
	Response results	58
	Findings	61
	Evaluative comments	63

Cambridge University Press	
978-0-521-28507-0 - Social Experimentation and Economic Poli	icy
Robert Ferber and Werner Z. Hirsch	
Frontmatter	
More information	

	Contents	vi
	Appendix: On the estimation of response effects	66
5	The other negative income tax experiments	78
	Background	78
	Treatment variables	79
	Sample design	83
	Administration and implementation	89
	Findings	92
	Evaluative comments	95
6	Labor force experiments	98
	Supported Work Program	99
	Youth Entitlement Program	112
	Evaluative comments	122
7	The Health Insurance Study	125
	Background	125
	Treatment variables	127
	Basic design	133
	Administration and implementation	135
	Findings	138
	Evaluative comments	139
8	Electricity peak-load pricing experiments	142
	Background	142
	Treatment variables	143
	Some analytical problems	144
	Basic design	148
	Administration and implementation	157
	Findings	157
	Evaluative comments	160
9	The cash housing allowance experiments	164
	Background	164
	The Demand Experiment	167
	The Supply Experiment	177
	The Administrative Agency Experiment	190

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-28507-0 - Social Experimentation and Economic Policy
Robert Ferber and Werner Z. Hirsch
Frontmatter
More information

	Contents	vii
	Integrated analysis	202
	Overall comments	203
10	What have we learned?	205
	Economic behavior	205
	Pitfalls of social experimentation	210
	The social utility of social experimentation	215
	Notes	217
	Bibliography	234
	Index	243

TABLES AND FIGURES

Tables

4.1	Sample allocation by Conlisk–Watts model in New	54
	Jersey Experiment	54
4.2		
	Experiment	59
4.3	Ethnic composition of sample, by city and by	
	experimental treatment	60
4.4	Selected labor supply response results of husbands,	
	wives, and families, middle two years, New	
	Jersey Experiment	62
5.1	Background information on income maintenance	
	experiments	80
5.2	Overall sample design of the Gary Experiment	84
5.3	Comparison of number of families in original sample	
	and number in analysis sample, Gary Experiment	85
5.4	Summary of sample selection process in Seattle-	
	Denver Experiment	89
6.1	MDRC Supported Work Demonstration sites	102
6.2	Percentage distribution of project days in major	
	industries, 1975–1978	104
6.3	Percentage distribution of demographic	
	characteristics of employees in supported work	
	programs through June 1977, by target group	106

viii

	Tables and figures	ix
6.4	Participation and distribution of participants by types of departures, Supported Work Program, by target	
	group	109
6.5	Enrollees in the Youth Entitlement Demonstration	109
0.5	through August 1979, by educational status in	
	semester prior to enrollment	115
6.6	Enrollees at the time of enrollment in the Youth	115
0.0		
	Entitlement Demonstration, through August 1979,	116
67	as a percentage of total by prior status Distribution of work time in the Youth Entitlement	110
6.7		
	Demonstration, through August 1979, by site and	120
7 1	work sponsor	120
7.1	Descriptions of plans in Health Insurance Study	128
7.2	Refusal and response rates for families contacted,	107
0.1	1976 (by percent)	137
8.1	Treatment plans tested in various electricity pricing	
~ ~	experiments and type of model	145
8.2	Time-of-day tariffs selected by the allocation model	151
8.3	Seasonal flat tariffs selected by the allocation model	151
9.1	Relationship of experiments to policy questions	166
9.2	Key program design elements in the Experimental	
	Housing Allowance Program	170
9.3	Treatment cells of Demand Experiment, EHAP	172
9.4	Initial housing conditions at HASE sites	179
9.5	Enrollment data at HASE sites, as of September 1979	181
9.6	Components of gross rent increase for typical	
	dwelling, Brown County, 1974–1977	184
9.7	Characteristics of the eight AAE sites	192
9.8	Enrollment experience of agencies at AAE sites	196
9.9	Administrative costs at the AAE sites	201
	Figures	
2.1	Hypothesized impact of an income maintenance plan	11
3.1	A simplified sketch of the administration of a social	
	experiment involving transfer payments	44

4.1 Operational aspects of New Jersey Experiment 55

Cambridge University Press	
978-0-521-28507-0 - Social Experimentation and Economic Pol	licy
Robert Ferber and Werner Z. Hirsch	
Frontmatter	
More information	

	Tables and figures	Х
8.1	Proportion of households in DWP system and on	
	specific experimental tariffs	153
8.2	Experimental design decisions	155

PREFACE

Although there has been much experimentation – and information about experimentation – on issues in other fields of endeavor, especially education and psychology, there has been little work of this type in economics and even less information. Not until the past dozen years, in fact, have we seen any appreciable social experimentation on economic issues with real populations. Nevertheless, the growing interest in evaluating the effectiveness of social programs makes it likely that this type of experimentation will increase in the future. For those social experiments in economics that have been carried out, a fair amount of technical material has been published, but hardly any material of a general evaluative nature has appeared except for the survey articles by the authors of the present volume.

The objective of this volume is to provide an overview and a synthesis of the social experiments in economics, based on these review articles. The level of presentation is relatively simple and requires only a knowledge of elementary microeconomic theory and some statistics. Hence, this volume should be of use not only to professional economists and graduate students in economics but also to policymakers and to undergraduates majoring in economics. For those interested in investigating particular social experiments in greater detail, the references cited in the chapters dealing with those experiments should be very helpful.

The authors would like to thank Mark Perlman and Robert Lamp-

Preface

man for very useful comments on earlier drafts. Finally, they would like to express their appreciation to Bernita Fruhling, Bette Hulmes, and Rosemary G. Rees for typing and retyping the various drafts of this manuscript. Though the authors would like to dodge the responsibility, they must admit that any errors or mistakes in this volume are of their own making.

> ROBERT FERBER WERNER Z. HIRSCH

xii

It is with deep sadness that I must add a lonely postscript to this Preface. Bob Ferber died on September 8, 1981, after a brief illness, and after having corrected proofs but, sadly, before having seen the book in print.

He will be missed – not only by his wife Marianne, son Don, and daughter Ellen, to whom he was devoted, but also by myself and many others for whom he was colleague, teacher, collaborator, and friend. His warm, self-effacing personality and wry humor were special, endearing qualities.

The profession respected Robert Ferber for his contributions to statistics and survey methods, research on Latin America, and consumer expenditure research. His contributions were many, including those as editor of the *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, the *Journal of Consumer Research*, and the *Journal of Marketing Research*. Moreover, he wrote or collaborated on more than 17 books and 160 articles.

I feel privileged to have been Bob's collaborator on this volume.

September 28, 1981

WERNER Z. HIRSCH