

Cambridge University Press
0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II
G. S. Kirk
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Iliad: a commentary

Volume II: books 5–8

Cambridge University Press
0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II
G. S. Kirk
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE ILIAD: A COMMENTARY

GENERAL EDITOR G. S. KIRK

Volume II: books 5–8

G. S. KIRK

REGIUS PROFESSOR EMERITUS OF GREEK
IN THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE



Cambridge University Press
 0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II
 G. S. Kirk
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK <http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk>
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA <http://www.cup.org>
 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia
 Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Cambridge University Press 1990

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1990
 Reprinted 1993, 1995, 2000

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

The Iliad: a commentary.

Vol. 2, Books 5-8

1. Epic poetry in Greek. Homer. Iliad: commentaries
 I. Kirk, G. S. (Geoffrey Stephen), 1921-
 883'.01

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Kirk, G. S. (Geoffrey Stephen), 1921-

The Iliad, a commentary.

Includes index.

Contents: v. 1. Books 1-4 v. 2. Books 5-8.

1. Homer.-Iliad. 2. Homer.-Iliad. I. Title.

PA4037.K458 1985 883'.01 84-11330

ISBN 0 521 23710 6 hardback

ISBN 0 521 28172 5 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2005

UP

Cambridge University Press

0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II

G. S. Kirk

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For N. G. L. Hammond

CONTENTS

	<i>page</i>
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xi
INTRODUCTION	
1 The Homeric gods: prior considerations	i
2 Typical motifs and themes	15
3 The speech-element in the <i>Iliad</i>	28
4 History and fiction in the <i>Iliad</i>	36
COMMENTARY	
Book 5	51
Book 6	155
Book 7	230
Book 8	293
<i>Index</i>	343

PREFACE

This second volume continues the plan outlined in the first, the commentary itself being somewhat denser. Attention is increasingly drawn to typical motifs and themes, which become more marked from book 5 on. At the same time vol. 1's emphasis on poetics, especially at the level of rhythm and diction, is maintained; and the analysis of character and motivation, as well as of divine involvement, becomes somewhat fuller than before. The four introductory chapters continue the progressive examination of the background to the *Iliad*; they will be complemented here and there in subsequent volumes, not least chapter 1 on Homeric religion. Reference to modern secondary literature, which some critics have found too slight, has been increased. Subsequent volumes will go further in this respect, although the principle stated in the editorial introduction to vol. 1 still applies, that neither complete bibliographical coverage nor a generally doxographical approach to Homeric interpretation is sought after.

Two amendments have been made to the list of essential aids (cf. vol. 1, xxi). First, Dr Stephanie West's elucidation of *Odyssey* bks 1–4, in the revised, English version of the *Odissea* commentary overseen by Alfred Heubeck, is of exceptional value for many Homeric matters and is cited with corresponding frequency. Second, Ameis–Hentze's commentary, though obviously outmoded in certain respects, still contains much that is both acute and relevant, and in the present volume is cited on a par with Leaf. Other references to works in German are too few, but the influence of Burkert, Erbse, W. H. Friedrich, Latacz, Leumann, Meister, Trümper and others (not to mention Dörpfeld and Korfmann), if not of Neoanalysis except at its broadest level, is plain enough. In French, the quality and frequency of the guidance provided by Chantraine are equally obvious. Yet the 'commentary for Europe for the 1990s' desiderated by one friend is obviously not to be found in these pages – if it could, or should, be found anywhere. I have also continued to maintain a certain reserve over the ultimate intentions and attitudes, both moral and literary, of the *Iliad*'s monumental composer. That may be frustrating to some, but a commentator's first aim should be, not to provide ready-made answers to all possible questions at whatever level of generality, but to help his users make their own attempts to do so. Meanwhile (as a visit to the recent F.I.E.C. congress in Pisa served to remind one), on many points of Homeric interpretation, not least over questions of religion, a distinctly personal, not

Cambridge University Press

0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II

G. S. Kirk

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

to say visceral response is still preferred by many scholars. That is perhaps as it should be; but it gives the author of a commentary like this one a distinct hope that here and there, at least, and even to non-English-speaking scholars, he can offer a certain counter-balancing judgement based on close study (albeit sometimes imperfect) of the Greek text.

My particular thanks are due to Professor R. M. Frazer, of Tulane University, for reading the typescript and saving me from many errors. He had already pointed out a number of corrigenda in vol. I; a list of these, together with vol. II's new crop, are enclosed with the next volume to appear (v). Meanwhile certain corrections have already been incorporated in the second printing, 1987, of vol. I. The more substantial ones affect the following comments: on 2.92–3 *ad init.*, on 2.103 *ad init.* (this I owe to the late Professor Heubeck), on 2.813–14 *ad fin.*, on 3.422, and on 4.228. Owners of the first printing of vol. I may find it worthwhile to compare the second printing at these points and amend accordingly.

Dr Neil Hopkinson has once again generously read through the proofs for surface errors, with his accustomed skill. S. Morris, H. von Staden, J. N. Postgate and R. Hägg helped over specific points. R. M. Cook read chapter 4, and my four collaborators have also, of course, made valuable comments. The members of two Yale seminars in the spring of 1988 provided a welcome stimulus; I would thank in particular Shirley Werner, William Johnson, Zlatko Plěse and George Chukinas. Finally Professor Ruth Scodel made me aware, through her paper at the Pisa congress, that more remains to be said about imagined epitaphs in bk 6; we await her published observations with great interest.

Bath and Mauzens, October 1989

G. S. K.

ABBREVIATIONS

Books

- Allen, *Catalogue* T. W. Allen, *The Homeric Catalogue of Ships* (Oxford 1921)
- Ameis–Hentze K. F. Ameis and C. Hentze, *Homers Ilias* (Leipzig 1868–1932; repr. Amsterdam 1965)
- Andersen, *Diomedesgestalt* Øivind Andersen, *Die Diomedesgestalt in der Ilias* (Oslo 1978)
- ANET J. B. Pritchard, ed., *Ancient Near Eastern Texts relating to the Old Testament* (3rd edn, Princeton 1969)
- Apthorp, *MS Evidence* M. J. Apthorp, *The Manuscript Evidence for Interpolation in Homer* (Heidelberg 1980)
- Arch. Hom. *Archaeologia Homerica: Die Denkmäler und das frühgriechische Epos*, edd. F. Matz and H. G. Buchholz (Göttingen 1967–)
- Arend, *Scenen* W. Arend, *Die typischen Scenen bei Homer* (Berlin 1933)
- Aspects Tom Winniffrith, Penelope Murray and K. W. Gransden, edd., *Aspects of the Epic* (London 1983)
- Berghold, *Ἰλίου Πένης* W. Berghold, *Die Ἰλίου Πένης des Paris und Menelaos* (Bonn 1977)
- Bolling, *External Evidence* G. M. Bolling, *The External Evidence for Interpolation in Homer* (Oxford 1925)
- Burkert, *Religion* W. Burkert, *Greek Religion: Archaic and Classical* (Oxford 1985); Eng. trans. by John Raffan of *Griechische Religion der archaischen und klassischen Epoche* (Stuttgart 1977); all references, from this volume of the Commentary onwards, will be to the Eng. version
- Chantraine, *Dict.* P. Chantraine, *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue grecque* (Paris 1968–80)
- Chantraine, *GH* P. Chantraine, *Grammaire homérique* I–II (Paris 1958–63)
- Coldstream, *Geometric Greece* J. N. Coldstream, *Geometric Greece* (London 1977)
- Commentary *A Commentary on Homer's Odyssey*, vol. I, by A. Heubeck, S. West and J. B. Hainsworth (Oxford 1988); vol. II, by A. Heubeck and A. Hoekstra (Oxford 1989); vol. III, by J. Russo, M. Fernández Galiano and A. Heubeck (Oxford 1992); an Eng. trans., with revisions, of *Odissea*
- Cook, *Troad* J. M. Cook, *The Troad: an Archaeological and Topographical Study* (Oxford 1973)

Cambridge University Press

0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II

G. S. Kirk

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

- de Jong, *Narrators* I. J. F. de Jong, *Narrators and Focalizers: the Presentation of the Story in the Iliad* (Amsterdam 1987)
- Delebecque, *Cheval* E. Delebecque, *Le Cheval dans l'Iliade* (Paris 1951)
- Denniston, *Particles* J. D. Denniston, *The Greek Particles* (2nd edn, Oxford 1951)
- Desborough, *Last Mycenaeans* V. R. d'A. Desborough, *The Last Mycenaeans and their Successors* (Oxford 1964)
- Edwards, *HPI* M. W. Edwards, *Homer, Poet of the Iliad* (Baltimore and London 1987)
- Erbse H. Erbse, *Scholia Graeca in Homeri Iliadem*, vols. I–V (+ index vols.) (Berlin 1969–87)
- Fenik, *TBS* B. C. Fenik, *Typical Battle Scenes in the Iliad* (*Hermes Einzelschriften* 21, Wiesbaden 1968)
- Fenik, *Tradition* B. C. Fenik, ed., *Homer: Tradition and Invention* (Leiden 1978)
- Foxhall and Davies, *The Trojan War* L. Foxhall and J. K. Davies, edd., *The Trojan War* (Bristol 1984)
- Friedrich, *Verwundung* W. H. Friedrich, *Verwundung und Tod in der Ilias* (Göttingen 1956)
- Frisk H. Frisk, *Griechisches Etymologisches Wörterbuch* (Heidelberg 1954–73)
- Griffin, *HLD* J. Griffin, *Homer on Life and Death* (Oxford 1980)
- Hainsworth, *Flexibility* J. B. Hainsworth, *The Flexibility of the Homeric Formula* (Oxford 1968)
- Hainsworth, *Od.* Alfred Heubeck, Stephanie West and J. B. Hainsworth, *A Commentary on Homer's Odyssey* vol. I (Oxford 1988)
- Hesiod, *Erga* = Hesiod, *Works and Days*
- Hoekstra, *Modifications* A. Hoekstra, *Homeric Modifications of Formulaic Prototypes* (Amsterdam 1965)
- HSL R. Hope Simpson and J. F. Lazenby, *The Catalogue of Ships in Homer's Iliad* (Oxford 1970)
- HyDem, HyAp, HyHerm, HyAphr* *Homeric Hymns* to Demeter, Apollo, Hermes, Aphrodite
- Janko, *HHH* Richard Janko, *Homer, Hesiod and the Hymns* (Cambridge 1982)
- Kakridis, *Researches* J. T. Kakridis, *Homeric Researches* (Lund 1949)
- Kirk, *Myth* G. S. Kirk, *Myth: its Meaning and Functions* (Cambridge, Berkeley and Los Angeles 1970)
- Kirk, *Songs* G. S. Kirk, *The Songs of Homer* (Cambridge 1962)
- Krischer, *Konventionen* T. Krischer, *Formale Konventionen der homerischen Epik* (München 1971)

Cambridge University Press

0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II

G. S. Kirk

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

- Kullmann, *Quellen* W. Kullmann, *Die Quellen der Ilias* (Wiesbaden 1960)
- Latacz, *Kampfdarstellung* J. Latacz, *Kampfsparänese, Kampfdarstellung und Kampfwirklichkeit in der Ilias, bei Kallinos und Tyrtaios* (München 1977)
- Leaf W. Leaf, *The Iliad* I–II (2nd edn, London 1900–2)
- Leumann, *HW* M. Leumann, *Homerische Wörter* (Basel 1950)
- LfgRE* *Lexicon des frühgriechischen Epos*, edd. B. Snell and H. Erbse (Göttingen 1955–)
- Lohmann, *Reden* D. Lohmann, *Die Komposition der Reden in der Ilias* (Berlin 1970)
- Lorimer, *HM* H. L. Lorimer, *Homer and the Monuments* (London 1950)
- L–P E. Lobel and D. L. Page, *Poetarum Lesbiorum Fragmenta* (Oxford 1955)
- LSJ H. Liddell, R. Scott and H. S. Jones, *A Greek–English Lexicon* (9th edn, Oxford 1940)
- Macleod, *Iliad XXIV* C. W. Macleod, *Homer, Iliad Book XXIV* (Cambridge 1982)
- Meister, *Kunstsprache* K. Meister, *Die homerische Kunstsprache* (Leipzig 1921)
- Monro, *HG* D. B. Monro, *A Grammar of the Homeric Dialect* (2nd edn, Oxford 1891)
- Moulton, *Similes* Carroll Moulton, *Similes in the Homeric Poems* (Hypomnemata 49, Göttingen 1977)
- M–W R. Merkelbach and M. L. West, edd., *Fragmenta Hesiodica* (Oxford 1967)
- Nilsson, *GgrR* M. P. Nilsson, *Geschichte der griechischen Religion* I (3rd edn, München 1967)
- OCT Oxford Classical Texts: *Homeri Opera I–V*: I–II (*Iliad*) edd. D. B. Monro and T. W. Allen (3rd edn, Oxford 1920); III–IV (*Odyssey*) ed. T. W. Allen (2nd edn, Oxford 1917–19); V (*Hymns*, etc.) ed. T. W. Allen (Oxford 1912)
- Odissea* Omero, *Odissea* (general editor, A. Heubeck; Fondazione Lorenzo Valla, 1981–7); see *Commentary*
- Page, *HHI* D. L. Page, *History and the Homeric Iliad* (Berkeley and Los Angeles 1959)
- Parry, *MHV* A. Parry, ed., *The Making of Homeric Verse. The Collected Papers of Milman Parry* (Oxford 1971)
- Reinhardt, *IuD* K. Reinhardt, *Die Ilias und ihr Dichter*, ed. U. Hölscher (Göttingen 1961)
- Risch, *Wortbildung* E. Risch, *Wortbildung der homerischen Sprache* (2nd edn, Berlin 1973)

Cambridge University Press

0521281725 - The Iliad: A Commentary, Volume II

G. S. Kirk

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

- Ruijgh, *τε épique* C. J. Ruijgh, *Autour de 'τε épique': études sur la syntaxe grecque* (Amsterdam 1971)
- Schadewaldt, *Aufbau* W. Schadewaldt, *Der Aufbau der Ilias* (Frankfurt am Main 1975)
- Schadewaldt, *Ilias-Studien* W. Schadewaldt, *Ilias-Studien* (Leipzig 1938)
- Schein, *Mortal Hero* Seth L. Schein, *The Mortal Hero: an Introduction to Homer's Iliad* (Berkeley, Los Angeles and London 1984)
- Schmidt, *Weltbild* Martin Schmidt, *Die Erklärungen zum Weltbild Homers in den bT-Scholien zur Ilias* (München 1976)
- Shipp, *Studies* G. P. Shipp, *Studies in the Language of Homer* (2nd edn, Cambridge 1972)
- Shipp, *Vocabulary* G. P. Shipp, *Modern Greek Evidence for the Ancient Greek Vocabulary* (Sydney 1979)
- Stockinger, *Vorzeichen* H. Stockinger, *Die Vorzeichen im homerischen Epos* (St Ottilien 1959)
- Thornton, *Supplication* Agathe Thornton, *Homer's Iliad: its Composition and the Motif of Supplication* (Göttingen 1984)
- Trümper, *Fachausdrücke* Hans Trümper, *Kriegerische Fachausdrücke im griechischen Epos* (Basel 1950)
- van der Valk, *Researches* M. H. A. L. H. van der Valk, *Researches on the Text and Scholia of the Iliad I-II* (Leiden 1963-4)
- Ventris and Chadwick, *Documents* M. Ventris and J. Chadwick, *Documents in Mycenaean Greek* (2nd edn, Cambridge 1973)
- Vermeule, *GBA* Emily Vermeule, *Greece in the Bronze Age* (Chicago and London 1972)
- Vernant, *Problèmes de la guerre* J.-P. Vernant, ed., *Problèmes de la guerre en Grèce ancienne* (Paris, Mouton, 1968)
- von Kamptz, *Personennamen* Hans von Kamptz, *Homerische Personennamen* (Göttingen 1982)
- Von der Mühl, *Hypomnema* P. Von der Mühl, *Kritisches Hypomnema zur Ilias* (Basel 1952)
- Wace and Stubbings, *Companion* A. J. B. Wace and F. H. Stubbings, *A Companion to Homer* (London 1962)
- West, *Od.* Alfred Heubeck, Stephanie West and J. B. Hainsworth, *A Commentary on Homer's Odyssey* vol. I (Oxford 1988)
- West, *Ptolemaic Papyri* S. West, *The Ptolemaic Papyri of Homer* (Köln and Opladen 1967)
- West, *Theogony* M. L. West, *Hesiod, Theogony* (Oxford 1966)
- West, *Works and Days* M. L. West, *Hesiod, Works and Days* (Oxford 1978)
- Wilamowitz, *IuH* U. von Wilamowitz-Moellendorf, *Die Ilias und Homer* (Berlin 1916)

Abbreviations

- Wilamowitz, *Untersuchungen* U. von Wilamowitz-Moellendorff, *Homerische Untersuchungen* (Berlin 1884)
 Willcock M. M. Willcock, *The Iliad of Homer, Books I–XII* (London 1978)
 Willcock, *Companion* M. M. Willcock, *A Companion to the Iliad* (Chicago and London 1976)

Journals

- AJP *American Journal of Philology*
 BSA *Annual of the British School of Archaeology at Athens*
 CQ *Classical Quarterly*
 JHS *Journal of Hellenic Studies*
 PCPS *Proceedings of the Cambridge Philological Society*
 TAPA *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association*
 YCS *Yale Classical Studies*

NOTE

‘*Il.*’ means ‘the *Iliad*’, ‘*Od.*’ ‘the *Odyssey*’.
 The numbers of occurrences of words and formulas (in the form e.g. ‘10 × *Il.*, 6 × *Od.*’) are provided for ostensive purposes only, see vol. 1, xxiii. The abbreviation ‘(etc.)’ after a Greek word in such a reference indicates that the total is given of all relevant terminations; ‘*sic*’ in such circumstances means ‘in that position in the verse’; ‘2/11 × ’ means ‘twice out of a total of eleven occurrences in all’. In any case, the ‘Ibycus’ computer and compact disc offer new standards of word-count accuracy to which the ‘ostensive’ figures just mentioned do not, and perhaps need not, aspire.
 | is used to mark the beginning, or the end, of a verse; occasionally, too, the central caesura. ‘v.’, ‘vv.’ means ‘verse’, ‘verses’, with ‘v-e’ meaning ‘verse-end’.
 On ‘Arn/bT’ (etc.) references see vol. 1, 41f. Σ signifies ‘scholium’ or ‘scholiast’.