

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees

Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees

Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees

Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees

Edited by

D. Micah Hester

Chief of the Division of Medical Humanities and Associate Professor of Medical Humanities/Pediatrics, University of Arkansas for Medical Sciences, and Clinical Ethicist, Arkansas Children's Hospital, Little Rock, AR, USA

Toby Schonfeld

Associate Professor of Medicine at Emory University and Director of the Master of Arts in Bioethics Program, Center for Ethics, Emory University, Atlanta, GA, USA



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees
Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521279871

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

5th printing 2015

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books Inc.

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Guidance for healthcare ethics committees / edited by D. Micah Hester, Toby Schonfeld.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-27987-1 (pbk.)

I. Hester, D. Micah. II. Schonfeld, Toby.

[DNLM: 1. Ethics Committees, Clinical. 2. Delivery of Health Care – ethics. 3. Ethics, Clinical. 4. Hospital Administration – ethics.

5. Practice Guidelines as Topic. WX 150.1]

174.2 – dc23 2012008166

ISBN 978-0-521-27987-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Every effort has been made in preparing this book to provide accurate and up-to-date information which is in accord with accepted standards and practice at the time of publication. Although case histories are drawn from actual cases, every effort has been made to disguise the identities of the individuals involved. Nevertheless, the authors, editors and publishers can make no warranties that the information contained herein is totally free from error, not least because clinical standards are constantly changing through research and regulation. The authors, editors and publishers therefore disclaim all liability for direct or consequential damages resulting from the use of material contained in this book. Readers are strongly advised to pay careful attention to information provided by the manufacturer of any drugs or equipment that they plan to use.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees
Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

To HEC members committed to providing quality ethical support in their institutions.

From: DMH

To: My family

Ubi caritas et amor, familia ibi est

From: TS

To: James

שִׁיבֵנִי כְּחוֹתֶם עַל־לֶבָד כְּחוֹתֶם עַל־זְרוּעֶד
כִּי־עֲזָה כְּמִוֹת אֶהְיֶה קָשָׁה כְּשֹׂאֹל קִנְיָה
רִשְׁפִּיהָ רִשְׁפִּי אֵשׁ שְׁלֵהֲבִתֶּיהָ:

שִׁיר הַשִּׁירִים ח:ו

*[Let me be a seal upon your heart,
Like the seal upon your hand. (Song of Songs 8:6)]*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees

Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

List of contributors page ix
Preface xi

Section 1 – The Context of Healthcare Ethics Committee Work

1 **Introduction to healthcare ethics committees** 1
D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld

2 **Brief introduction to ethics and ethical theory** 9
D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld

3 **Healthcare ethics committees and the law** 17
Stephen Latham

4 **Cultural and religious issues in healthcare** 25
Alissa Hurwitz Swota

Section 2 – Consultation

5 **Mission, vision, goals: defining the parameters of ethics consultation** 32
Martin L. Smith

6 **Ethics consultation process** 41
Jeffrey Spike

7 **Informed consent, shared decision-making, and the ethics committee** 48
Randall Horton and Howard Brody

8 **Decision-making capacity** 55
Arthur R. Derse

9 **Family dynamics and surrogate decision-making** 63
Lisa Soleymani Lehmann

10 **Confidentiality** 71
Toby Schonfeld

11 **Advance care planning and end-of-life decision-making** 80
Nancy M. P. King and John C. Moskop

12 **Medical futility** 88
Thaddeus Mason Pope

13 **Ethical issues in reproduction** 98
Anne Drapkin Lyerly

14 **Ethical issues in neonatology** 106
John D. Lantos

15 **Ethical issues in pediatrics** 114
D. Micah Hester

Section 3 – Policy Development and Organizational Issues

16 **Ethics committees and distributive justice** 122
Nancy S. Jecker

17 **Developing effective ethics policy** 130
Anne Lederman Flamm

18 **Implementing policy to the wider community** 139
Mary Faith Marshall and Joan Liaschenko

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees
Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

viii	Contents
19	Ethics in and for the organization 147 Mary V. Rorty
	Section 4 – Educating Others
20	The healthcare ethics committee as educator 155 Kathy Kinlaw
21	Education as prevention 164 Kayhan Parsi
22	Understanding ethics pedagogy 172 Felicia Cohn
	<hr/>
	<i>Index</i> 180

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees
 Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contributors

Howard Brody

Institute for the Medical Humanities,
 University of Texas Medical Branch,
 Galveston, TX, USA

Felicia Cohn

Kasier Permanente Orange County, Irvine,
 CA, USA

Arthur R. Derse

Medical College of Wisconsin, Milwaukee,
 WI, USA

Anne Lederman Flamm

Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic,
 Cleveland, OH, USA

D. Micah Hester

University of Arkansas for Medical
 Sciences, and Clinical Ethicist, Arkansas
 Children's Hospital, Little Rock, AR,
 USA

Randall Horton

Institute for the Medical Humanities,
 University of Texas Medical Branch,
 Galveston, TX, USA

Nancy S. Jecker

Department of Bioethics and Humanities,
 University of Washington School of
 Medicine, Seattle, WA, USA

Nancy M. P. King

Department of Social Sciences and Health
 Policy, Wake Forest School of Medicine,
 Winston-Salem, NC, USA

Kathy Kinlaw

Center for Ethics, Emory University,
 Atlanta, GA, USA

John D. Lantos

Bioethics Center, Children's Mercy
 Hospital, Kansas City, MO, USA

Stephen Latham

Interdisciplinary Center for Bioethics,
 Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA

Lisa Soleymani Lehmann

Center for Bioethics, Brigham and
 Women's Hospital, Boston, MA, USA

Joan Liaschenko

Center for Bioethics, University of
 Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN, USA

Anne Drapkin Lyerly

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill,
 NC, USA

Mary Faith Marshall

Center for Bioethics, University of
 Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN, USA

John C. Moskop

Department of Internal Medicine, Wake
 Forest School of Medicine, Winston-Salem,
 NC, USA

Kayhan Parsi

Neiswanger Institute for Bioethics and
 Health Policy, Loyola University,
 Maywood, IL, USA

Thaddeus Mason Pope

Health Law Institute, Hamline University,
 St Paul, MN, USA

Mary V. Rorty

Stanford University, Stanford, CA,
 USA

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees
Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

x	List of contributors
---	----------------------

Toby Schonfeld
Center for Ethics, Emory University,
Atlanta, GA, USA

Martin L. Smith
Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic,
Cleveland, OH, USA

Jeffrey Spike
University of Texas at Houston, Houston,
TX, USA

Alissa Hurwitz Swota
University of North Florida, Jacksonville,
FL, USA

Preface

Since 1992, The Joint Commission on Hospital Accreditation (The Joint Commission) has required every accredited hospital to have a mechanism to handle ethical concerns within its institution. For the most part, hospitals across America satisfy this requirement in policy by constituting an institutional Healthcare Ethics Committee (HEC). Physicians, nurses, administrators, social workers, chaplains, community volunteers, and others populate these committees. Yet, by their own admission, many of these individuals, while well intentioned and personally invested, have neither training in ethics nor have the tools at their disposal to aid in their ethical considerations. Even more basically, most do not really know what constitutes an ethical consideration. So, while these individuals are the ones both medical professionals and patients turn to for ethical insight into the complexities of medical decision-making, they themselves recognize that they are under-prepared to handle the depth and complexity of many moral problems raised by health care.

It is within this context that we offer this book. The purpose of this text is to serve as a primer for members of HECs regarding the three main roles that comprise the function of an HEC: consultation, policy, and education. The book is intended to provide material to aid in educating the many different persons who find themselves confronted with ethically challenging medical situations by virtue of being members of some HECs.

To facilitate attaining this goal, we have invited leaders in the field of ethics to author chapters in their areas of expertise. Chapters are directed at educated individuals who are either new members of HECs or who seek to solidify their knowledge on a particular topic. Importantly, the chapters herein are not surveys of the topic in general, but rather are targeted specifically to members of HECs. For example, the chapter on advance care planning (Chapter 11) does not go into detail about forms, conversation partners, and other features of advance directives, but rather describes the ways in which HEC members may encounter ethical concerns about advance directives and other aspects of end-of-life planning in their work.

Further, in order to make the material as accessible as possible, we have oriented each chapter around a consistent format. Every chapter opens with a set of objectives, then proceeds to a case or series of cases, followed by key content, and concluding with questions for discussion. We would like to take a moment to explain these features:

1. *Objectives*: Objectives for each chapter were negotiated between the editors and the chapter authors. When possible, we used objectives suggested in the *Education Guide for Improving Competencies in Clinical Ethics Consultation* (2009) published by the Clinical Ethics Education Task Force of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities (ASBH). However, since this guide is directed exclusively at ethics *consultation*, many objectives were altered or authored with a broader committee charge in mind. Nevertheless, faithfulness to the work of the ASBH Task Force lends legitimacy and standardization to the topics and approaches contained herein.
2. *Cases*: All chapters begin with at least one case. Many chapters include multiple cases, or iterations of the same case, throughout the work. The purpose of such cases in this work

is twofold. For one, cases give a concrete demonstration of the way the individual chapter topics may present themselves to members of HECs. Note that such demonstrations are not meant to be representative or categorical, but rather illustrations of the kinds of things to which an HEC must attend. Second, when taken as a whole, the cases in the text demonstrate how individual personal, professional, institutional, social, cultural, or religious values can affect the emergence of and response to ethical issues in a clinical setting. These conflicts of value are important motivators of ethics cases, and it behooves members of HECs to consider the ways in which these conflicts broadly construed may affect both the form and function of their committee.

- 3. *Content:* We felt it was important to have scholars recognized in the specific fields to be addressed write the chapters for which they have particular expertise. This experience lends not just credibility to the text, but also enables HEC members to be introduced to the individuals who help shape scholarship in this arena. However, because the chapters are all independently authored, they may vary a bit in terms of tone and style. We have ensured consistency of format whenever we could, but as editors we felt it was important for each chapter author to present material in his or her own voice.
- 4. *Questions for discussion:* Partly because of the diversity of authorship described above, the orientation of the questions at the end of the chapters can vary as well. Some authors chose to ask summary or reading comprehension sorts of questions to ensure that readers understood the main points of the chapter. Others used the questions to further the conversation on the topic and to challenge the reader to think beyond the text contained in the chapter. Regardless, we tried to ensure that every chapter encouraged readers to consider conceptual issues raised by the material, pragmatic issues that related to the application of the key content, and strategic issues that include planning for avoidance of future issues.

This volume is organized into four main sections, capturing the central aspects of every HEC's mission: introduction/preliminaries, consultation, policy review and development, and educating others. Among these four sections special emphasis is placed on consultation, as this often presents the greatest challenges to committee members. While conceived of as a comprehensive volume, each chapter of this text is capable of standing alone as a teaching module through which an ethics committee can work together or members can work individually. We also strongly encourage readers of this text to consider purchasing *Complex Ethics Consultations* (Cambridge 2008), a case book edited by Paul Ford and Denise Dudzinski. Combining the resources of this casebook with our substantive volume will provide ethics committee members with useful discussion material and a robust understanding of how the work of ethics is understood and practiced in a clinical setting.

Many people contribute to a large project such as this one. We are grateful to all of the chapter authors for making it a part of their busy schedules to ensure that their chapters were meaningful to the particular audience of this book: HEC members. For some authors, this required a shift in approach, and we appreciate the time and effort they devoted to this important task. We are also grateful to supportive editors at Cambridge University Press, who welcomed this book from the beginning.

The idea for this book was generated from the time we have both spent serving on HECs at a variety of institutions. We are grateful for the insights that were gleaned from

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-27987-1 - Guidance for Healthcare Ethics Committees
Edited by D. Micah Hester and Toby Schonfeld
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

these experiences, especially in recognizing the challenges of educating a group of diverse, time-constrained, dedicated health care professionals. We had these HECs in mind as we assembled this text, and hope that our efforts have proved fruitful.

Finally, we are grateful to our institutions and our families for their support of this work. The Center for Ethics at Emory University is a supportive environment with rich resources in ethics; it is the perfect place to be to assemble a text like this. At the same time, the Division of Medical Humanities and College of Medicine at UAMS allowed the time and provided the resources necessary to do good work. We are, however, most indebted to our families: James (for Toby) and Kelly, Emily, Joshua, and Matthew (for Micah), without whom nothing good in our lives is possible.

D. Micah Hester, PhD
University of Arkansas for Medical Sciences

Toby Schonfeld, PhD
Emory University

2012