

Cambridge University Press

0521275601 - Scientific Controversies: Case Studies in the Resolution and Closure of Disputes in Science and Technology

Edited by H. Tristram Engelhardt and Arthur L. Caplan

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

 CONTENTS

Preface vii *List of contributors* ix

Introduction

Patterns of controversy and closure: the interplay of knowledge, values, and political forces

H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., and Arthur L. Caplan *page* 1

PART I. THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

1. Ethical theory and the problem of closure
Tom L. Beauchamp 27
2. Scientific controversy and its termination
Ernan McMullin 49
3. The political anatomy of controversy in the sciences
Everett Mendelsohn 93
4. Controversies involving science and technology:
a theoretical perspective *Ronald N. Giere* 125
5. Politics, public policy-making, and the process of reaching
closure *Robert F. Rich* 151
6. The role of experts in scientific controversy
Garland E. Allen 169
7. The continental drift debate *Henry Frankel* 203
8. How history and politics affect closure in biomedical
discussions: the example of the Soviet Union
Loren R. Graham 249
9. Scientific disputes over policy *Allan Mazur* 265
10. Controversies and the authority of science
Dorothy Nelkin 283
11. Post-Skinner and post-Freud: philosophical causes of
scientific disagreements *Alasdair MacIntyre* 295

Cambridge University Press

0521275601 - Scientific Controversies: Case Studies in the Resolution and Closure of Disputes in Science and Technology

Edited by H. Tristram Engelhardt and Arthur L. Caplan

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

PART II. CONTEMPORARY CASE STUDIES

Laetrile

- | | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 12. | Resolution of the Laetrile controversy: past attempts and future prospects <i>Gerald E. Markle and James C. Petersen</i> | 315 |
| 13. | Federal regulation of Laetrile <i>Robert S. K. Young</i> | 333 |
| 14. | Quasi libertarianism and the Laetrile controversy
<i>Baruch A. Brody</i> | 343 |
| 15. | Judicial deflection of scientific questions: pushing the Laetrile controversy toward medical closure
<i>Robert L. Schwartz</i> | 355 |

Homosexuality

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 16. | Politics, science, and the problem of psychiatric nomenclature: a case study of the American Psychiatric Association referendum on homosexuality <i>Ronald Bayer</i> | 381 |
| 17. | The diagnostic status of homosexuality in <i>DSM-III</i> : a reformulation of the issues <i>Robert L. Spitzer</i> | 401 |
| 18. | On arriving at the American Psychiatric Association decision on homosexuality <i>Irving Bieber</i> | 417 |

Safety in the workplace

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 19. | Values in the debate over workplace safety and health: the rancorous rhetoric about regulation <i>Gilbert S. Omenn</i> | 437 |
| 20. | The successful experiment that failed <i>Marvin S. Legator</i> | 465 |
| 21. | The power of efficiency: balancing benefits and costs in regulating occupational exposure to toxic substances
<i>Taylor R. Durham</i> | 487 |
| 22. | Closure in occupational safety and health: the benzene and cotton dust decisions <i>Mark MacCarthy</i> | 505 |

Nuclear power

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 23. | Nuclear fear: a history and an experiment <i>Spencer R. Weart</i> | 529 |
| 24. | Closure and controversy: Three Mile Island
<i>Cora Bagley Marrett</i> | 551 |
| 25. | Understanding the nuclear power controversy
<i>Douglas MacLean</i> | 567 |

PART III. CONTROVERSY, CLOSURE, AND THE PUBLIC

- | | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 26. | The role of the mass media in scientific controversy
<i>Rae Goodell</i> | 585 |
| 27. | The National Commission on Human Experimentation: procedures and outcomes <i>Stephen E. Toulmin</i> | 599 |
| 28. | The forms and norms of closure <i>Ruth Macklin</i> | 615 |

Author index 625 Subject index 632