

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PETER SINGER AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS

Interaction between Peter Singer and Christian ethics, to the extent that it has happened at all, has been unproductive and often antagonistic. Singer sees himself as leading a “Copernican revolution” against a sanctity-of-life ethic, while many Christians associate his work with a “culture of death.” Charles C. Camosy shows that this polarized understanding of the two positions is a mistake. While their conclusions about abortion and euthanasia may differ, there is surprising overlap in Christian and Singerite arguments, and disagreements are interesting and fruitful. Furthermore, it turns out that Christians and Singerites can even make common cause, for instance in matters such as global poverty and the dignity of non-human animals. Peter Singer and Christian ethics are far closer than almost anyone has imagined, and this book is valuable for those who are interested in fresh thinking about the relationship between religious and secular ethics.

CHARLES C. CAMOSY is Assistant Professor of Theology at Fordham University, New York. He is author of *Too Expensive to Treat? Finitude, Tragedy and the Neonatal ICU* (2010).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PETER SINGER AND
CHRISTIAN ETHICS

Beyond Polarization

CHARLES C. CAMOSY



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521199155

© Charles C. Camosy 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Camosy, Charles Christopher.

Peter Singer and Christian ethics : beyond polarization / Charles C. Camosy.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-19915-5 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-14933-4 (Paperback)

1. Singer, Peter, 1946– 2. Christian ethics. I. Title.

B57O4.S554C36 2012

170.92–dc23

2011042774

ISBN 978-0-521-19915-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-14933-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to
in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

| | |
|--|-----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | <i>page vii</i> |
| Introduction | I |
| Who is Peter Singer? | 4 |
| Thesis and method of this book | 7 |
| A note about my approach as a Christian | 9 |
| 1 Abortion | 11 |
| Introduction | 11 |
| Issues on which Singer and the Church agree | 13 |
| The moral status of the fetus | 18 |
| A disagreement over potential | 27 |
| Objections to the argument from potential | 29 |
| Conclusion | 39 |
| 2 Euthanasia and the end of life | 41 |
| Introduction | 41 |
| Moral status at the end of life | 44 |
| Medical treatment and care of persons at the end of life | 57 |
| From morality to public policy | 68 |
| Conclusion | 81 |
| 3 Non-human animals | 83 |
| Introduction | 83 |
| Singer on how we treat non-human animals | 85 |
| Singer on reforming our practices and attitudes | 93 |
| The Church on non-human animals: current teaching | 97 |
| The Church on non-human animals: scripture and tradition | 102 |
| The Church on non-human animals: some modern approaches | 114 |
| Are some non-human animals persons? | 120 |
| Conclusion | 133 |
| 4 Duties to the poor | 137 |
| Introduction | 137 |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| The arguments | 141 |
| Christian overlap with Singer | 144 |
| Responding to objections | 146 |
| Common objectives | 158 |
| Impartiality in duties to the poor? | 162 |
| The Church on partial preferences | 166 |
| A broader understanding of poverty? | 172 |
| How serious are our duties to the poor? | 174 |
| Conclusion | 176 |
| 5 Ethical theory | 178 |
| Introduction | 178 |
| Consequence-based reasoning | 182 |
| Rules-based reasoning | 184 |
| A common consequentialist approach? | 186 |
| Christian utilitarianism? | 192 |
| The principle of double effect | 195 |
| The place of exceptionless moral norms | 199 |
| More on proportionate reasoning | 205 |
| Conclusion | 213 |
| 6 Singer's shift? | 215 |
| Introduction | 215 |
| Objectivity and preference utilitarianism | 217 |
| Objectivity and Christian ethics | 226 |
| Singer on preferences, interests, and happiness | 230 |
| A Christian understanding: loving your neighbor as yourself | 233 |
| Teleology and the possibility of conversation | 236 |
| Conclusion | 242 |
| Conclusion | 244 |
| How Peter Singer helps push Christian ethics | 244 |
| How Christian ethics push Peter Singer | 247 |
| Moving forward together | 249 |
| Appendix | 256 |
| General moral principles | 256 |
| Abortion | 257 |
| Euthanasia and the end of life | 258 |
| Non-human animals | 258 |
| Duties to the poor | 259 |
| Ethical theory and method | 260 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 261 |
| <i>Index</i> | 274 |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

Given that my first serious interaction with Peter Singer's work began in their courses, I need to begin by thanking three important mentors at the University of Notre Dame: Jean Porter, Maura Ryan, and Todd Whitmore. This project would probably not have been put forward at all without the encouragement of Robin Gill and Franklin Harkins, and so special thanks goes to them. I also find myself in great debt to graduate assistants Monica Pierce, who tirelessly graded homework so that I could complete two chapters for initial peer review, and Ian Jones who did a full edit of the manuscript and updated the quotes to the new edition of Singer's *Practical Ethics*. My editor at Cambridge University Press, Hilary Gaskin, has also been extremely helpful every step of the way.

Two grants from Fordham's Office of Sponsored Programs supported my research for this book, which included travel to Oxford for the 'Christian Ethics Engages Peter Singer' conference. An invaluable resource for the project (most of Chapter 6 comes directly from insights gathered at the conference), I want to thank the conference hosts, Nigel Biggar and the McDonald Centre for Theology, Ethics and Public Life, for inviting me to present. Special thanks go to John Perry, organizer of the conference, who generously led a manuscript colloquium for me from which I also received invaluable feedback. I'd like to thank everyone who attended the colloquium, and particularly David Albert Jones who gave me detailed notes on two draft chapters.

I'd be totally remiss if I didn't thank Fordham's Center for Ethics Education for allowing me access to three of their best graduate students – Sigourney Giblin, Stefanie Juell, and Angelique Rivard – in a semester-long independent study of the manuscript. The book would not have been the same without their insights. I want to personally thank Stefanie and Angelique for putting together the charts in the appendix, and especially Sigourney for doing a final edit and heroic work on the footnotes, bibliography, and index down the stretch.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19915-5 - Peter Singer and Christian Ethics: Beyond Polarization

Charles C. Camosy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Acknowledgements

I'm most grateful to five people who read full drafts of the manuscript and gave me detailed written comments: David Gushee, Agata Satan, Peter Wicks, Sydney Callahan, and Peter Singer. Singer was also incredibly generous in making sure I had access to his most recent work throughout the writing process. Gilbert Meilaender, Christiana Peppard, Hilary Hammell, Elizabeth Johnson, Susan Kopp, Tito Carvalho, Travis Timmerman, and Tim Mulgan gave me helpful written feedback on individual chapters as well. I also want to thank the following individuals who contributed to the project by pointing me in the direction of an important text or thinker, sharing their own work with me, or helping me with a specific problem: Jacaranda Turvey, David Clough, Morwenna Ludlow, Christine Hinze, Barbara Andolsen, Maureen O'Connell, Maureen Tilley, Richard Viladesau, Aristotle Papanikolaou, Christopher Kaczor, Helen Alvare, Donald Kyle, Robert George, John Finnis, Jay Hammond, Oliver Putz, William Mattison, David Hollenbach, Kenneth Himes, Lisa Cahill, Stephen Pope, John Rivera, Dan Sulmasy, Eric Gregory, and John Hare.

Finally, an important thank you goes to Amy Uelmen and others I've met from the Focolare movement (especially in New York, Toronto, Trento, and Rome) for living out an amazing example of the spirituality of unity. Their capacity for dialogue inspired the spirit in which this book was written. Let me also make special mention of my father, a man who not only taught me how to make an argument, but who encouraged me to live my life boldly.