

Realist Constructivism Rethinking International Relations Theory

Realism and constructivism, two key contemporary theoretical approaches to the study of international relations, are commonly taught as mutually exclusive ways of understanding the subject. *Realist Constructivism* explores the common ground between the two, and demonstrates that, rather than being in simple opposition, they have areas of both tension and overlap. There is indeed space to engage in a realist constructivism. But at the same time, there are important distinctions between them, and there remains a need for a constructivism that is not realist, and a realism that is not constructivist. Samuel Barkin argues more broadly for a different way of thinking about theories of international relations, that focuses on the corresponding elements within various approaches rather than on a small set of mutually exclusive paradigms. *Realist Constructivism* provides an interesting new way for scholars and students to think about international relations theory.

J. SAMUEL BARKIN is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Florida. His previous books include *International Organization: Theories and Institutions* (2006) and *Social Construction and the Logic of Money* (2003). He was also the co-editor of *Anarchy and the Environment* (1999).



Realist Constructivism

SAMUEL BARKIN

Department of Political Science University of Florida





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521198714

© J. Samuel Barkin 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Barkin, J. Samuel, 1965–

Realist constructivism: rethinking international relations theory / J. Samuel Barkin. p. cm.
ISBN 978-0-521-19871-4 (hardback)
1. International relations. 2. Constructive realism. I. Title.
JZ1242.B38 2010
327.101–dc22
2009053425

ISBN 978-0-521-19871-4 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-12181-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgements		page vi
1	Introduction	1
2	Definitions	13
3	Materialism	31
4	The logic of the social	50
5	The public interest	66
6	The constraints of the social	83
7	Agency	100
8	The limits of realism	118
9	The limits of constructivism	138
10	Constructivism and realism	154
References		174
Index		190

V



Acknowledgements

About a decade ago, I began to get frustrated with the common assumption that the relationship between constructivism and realism was one of mutual opposition, and that there was little ground for a useful conversation between the two. It struck me that the two approaches are based on assumptions that are orthogonal to, rather than contradictory of, each other. Furthermore, it struck me that a conversation between the two could serve as a useful model for examining the relationships among approaches to international relations theory understood as concepts rather than as paradigms. I tried out these ideas on my graduate students, along with my colleagues, and they recommended that I write up this set of ideas. I began with an article-length manuscript making the first stage of the argument, that realism and constructivism are not incompatible.

Early signs that this argument would find an audience were not promising. The manuscript was rejected by five journals. Most of the reviews suggested that the argument just wasn't interesting, that nobody would read it. A few of the reviews took great umbrage at the argument, either because it suggested that realism should be watered down with constructivism, or because it suggested that constructivism might be sullied by realism. Eventually (in 2003) the manuscript found a home at *International Studies Review*, and I was pleasantly surprised to find a community with which it resonated. Many other scholars, it turns out, had been thinking along similar lines, and many of these scholars have been both helpful and supportive in the process of writing this book.

The idea of writing the book began to develop in a workshop on realism and constructivism organized by Patrick Jackson and Daniel Nexon, held at Georgetown University in 2005. Patrick and Dan had organized a forum on realist constructivism the previous year, also in *International Studies Review*, with contributions from Janice Bially Mattern, Richard Ned Lebow, and Jennifer Sterling-Folker, as well

vi



Acknowledgements

vii

as Patrick and Dan and me. The enthusiasm of this group for this project has provided key encouragement. Others who have provided both encouragement and feedback include Stefano Guzzini and Ido Oren, both of whom have written seminal work on the limits of contemporary realism. Thanks are also due to Peg Hermann, who edited *International Studies Review* at the time, and who made the decision to publish both the original realist constructivism article and the forum the next year, as well as to Bruce Cronin, David Ellis, Audie Klotz, Chris Layne, and all of the participants at the Georgetown seminar and at a seminar in the University of Florida's Political Science Department in 2008 at which this research was presented.

Thanks particularly are due to Janice Bially Mattern and Jennifer Sterling-Folker, who both read complete drafts of the book manuscript and provided invaluable feedback and advice. And to John Haslam of Cambridge University Press, as well as two anonymous reviewers who provided detailed and excellent comments. Research assistance was provided by Kuniyuki Nishimura (who also read and commented on the entire draft) and Sean Walsh. The index was compiled by Ty Solomon. My greatest debt of gratitude goes to Beth DeSombre, who not only provided comments on the complete manuscript, but also provided encouragement and feedback throughout the life of the project.

Finally, an acknowledgement of those institutions that supported me during the writing of this book. The University of Florida provided the sabbatical that allowed the book to be written, and provides a wonderfully collegial Political Science Department when I am not on sabbatical. Debbie Wallen and Sue Lawless-Yanchisin have both given administrative (and moral) support over the years far beyond the call of duty. While on sabbatical I was hosted by Brown University's Watson Institute for International Studies (thanks to Peter Andreas for suggesting and Tom Biersteker for formalizing my stay there) and Harvard University's Olin Institute for Security Studies (thanks to Steven Rosen).

Portions of the text of this book have appeared previously in two articles. Parts of Chapters 6 and 8 appear as "Realism, Prediction, and Foreign Policy" in *Foreign Policy Analysis* 5: 3 (July 2009), and parts of "Realist Constructivism," originally published in *International Studies Review* 5: 3 (September 2003, pp. 325–342), are scattered throughout the book.