#### VIRGIL IN THE RENAISSANCE

The disciplines of classical scholarship were established in their modern form between 1300 and 1600, and Virgil was a test case for many of them. This book is concerned with what became of Virgil in this period, how he was understood, and how his poems were recycled. What did readers assume about Virgil in the long decades between Dante and Sidney, Petrarch and Spenser, Boccaccio and Ariosto? Which commentators had the most influence? What story, if any, was Virgil's *Eclogues* supposed to tell? What was the status of his *Georgics*? Which parts of his epic attracted the most imitators? Building on specialized scholarship of the last hundred years, this book provides a panoramic synthesis of what scholars and poets from across Europe believed they could know about Virgil's life and poetry.

DAVID SCOTT WILSON-OKAMURA received his Ph.D. from the University of Chicago. He is an Associate Professor of English at East Carolina University.

# VIRGIL IN THE RENAISSANCE

DAVID SCOTT WILSON-OKAMURA

East Carolina University



Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19812-7 - Virgil in the Renaissance David Scott Wilson-Okamura Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521198127

© David Scott Wilson-Okamura 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Wilson-Okamura, David Scott, 1970– Virgil in the Renaissance / David Scott Wilson-Okamura.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-19812-7 (hardback)

 I. Virgil – Appreciation – Europe. 2. Virgil – Influence. 3. European literature – Renaissance, 1450–1600 – Classical influences. 4. Literature, Medieval – Classical influences. 5. Authors and readers – Europe – History – To 1500. 6. Authors and readers – Europe – History – 16th century. I. Title. PA6825.W537 2010 873'.01–dc22 2010000070

ISBN 978-0-521-19812-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19812-7 - Virgil in the Renaissance David Scott Wilson-Okamura Frontmatter More information

Multa renascentur quae iam cecidere, cadentque quae nunc sunt in honore . . .

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19812-7 - Virgil in the Renaissance David Scott Wilson-Okamura Frontmatter More information

## Contents

| Illustrations                                                   |    |  |  |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------|----|--|--|
| Acknowledgements                                                |    |  |  |
| Texts and abbreviations                                         |    |  |  |
|                                                                 |    |  |  |
| Introduction                                                    | I  |  |  |
| Method                                                          | 3  |  |  |
| Lacunae                                                         | 6  |  |  |
| Models                                                          | 8  |  |  |
| Plan                                                            | IO |  |  |
|                                                                 |    |  |  |
| PART I PUBLICATION                                              | 13 |  |  |
| I Virgil with an <i>i</i>                                       | 15 |  |  |
| Poliziano's proof                                               | 15 |  |  |
| How they reacted to Poliziano's bombshell                       | 18 |  |  |
| The market for Virgil editions and commentaries                 | 20 |  |  |
| The state of publishing in England; or Did the Reformation make |    |  |  |
| any difference?                                                 | 27 |  |  |
| Servius and Donatus: the authority of antiquity                 | 31 |  |  |
| Landino vs. Badius: originality vs. utility                     | 35 |  |  |
| Valeriano: the scholarly argument for <i>i</i>                  | 37 |  |  |
| Innovation vs. influence                                        | 40 |  |  |
| Latin: dead language or living?                                 | 42 |  |  |
|                                                                 |    |  |  |
| PART II REPUTATION                                              | 45 |  |  |
| 2 Patronage and the <i>Eclogues</i>                             | 47 |  |  |
| The idea of Virgil and its ancient sources                      | 47 |  |  |
| How Virgil got rich                                             | 50 |  |  |
| Virgil as counselor to the prince                               | 54 |  |  |
| <i>Eclogues</i> as encomia                                      | 56 |  |  |

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19812-7 - Virgil in the Renaissance David Scott Wilson-Okamura Frontmatter More information

| viii                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Contents                                             |  |  |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|--|--|
| Was Virgil a flatterer?<br>Maecenas as the model patron<br>Darkness invisible<br>Imitating Theocritus: the bookis<br>Love among the shepherds<br>Christian prophecy and Epicurea<br>Variety and the low style                                                                                                                                                                                            | 69                                                   |  |  |
| 3 Variety and the <i>Georgics</i><br>The ancient tradition of Virgil's of<br>Science or poetry?<br>Labor and the plow<br>Looking for the <i>Georgics</i> in Rena<br>"Ille ego qui quondam"<br>Generic substitution<br>A spectrum of styles<br>The myth of Virgil's Wheel<br>Style and genre<br>Style and variety<br>Listing variety<br>Virgil as second Nature                                           | 81<br>82                                             |  |  |
| 4 Morals and minimalism<br>Virgil the reviser<br>Style and character<br>Virgil's chastity<br>Rumors about Virgil's sex life<br>Nisus and Euryalus<br>Virgil's gay eclogue<br>Defense by forgery<br>Perfect poetry<br>Virgil and Ennius<br>Virgil as imitator of Homer<br>Refining Homer<br>Brevity as chastity<br>Defenders of Homer against Virg<br>Why brevity is better<br>Style: Virgil's last stand | IOI<br>IOI<br>IOI<br>IO3<br>IO3<br>IO3<br>IO3<br>IO3 |  |  |
| PART III INTERPRETATION<br>5 Virgil's Odyssey<br>Prioritizing episodes<br>Troy in the Odyssey                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | I43<br>I45<br>I45<br>I45<br>I46                      |  |  |

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19812-7 - Virgil in the Renaissance David Scott Wilson-Okamura Frontmatter More information

| Contents                                                     | ix  |
|--------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| The weight of the underworld                                 | 149 |
| The Gates of Sleep                                           | 153 |
| Descent by murder                                            | 157 |
| Character by example                                         | 163 |
| Pluto's daughter: hell as riches                             | 166 |
| Mourir, c'est facile: hell as habit                          | 170 |
| Life in hell                                                 | 172 |
| Purgatory                                                    | 173 |
| "Sinfull mire": the moral status of matter                   | 178 |
| Resurrection                                                 | 181 |
| Imitation: competition or assimilation?                      | 185 |
| Dynastic prophecy                                            | 187 |
| 6 Virgil's Iliad                                             | 191 |
| Turnus as tragic hero                                        | 191 |
| Modern relativism                                            | 194 |
| Defining <i>pietas</i>                                       | 196 |
| Weighing anger                                               | 199 |
| Organizing interpretation 1: classroom techniques            | 203 |
| Organizing interpretation II: the ideal man theory           | 208 |
| Organizing interpretation III: repetition and rereading      | 212 |
| Six-book readers vs. twelve-book readers                     | 215 |
| The renaissance of Virgil's Iliad                            | 220 |
| Camilla                                                      | 227 |
| The modernity of romance                                     | 230 |
| Dido and Lavinia: the importance of <i>Eneas</i>             | 233 |
| Vegio's sequel: the missing link with the Middle Ages        | 237 |
| Vegio's influence                                            | 247 |
| Epilogue                                                     | 248 |
| Appendix A Virgil commentaries in Latin editions, 1469–1599  | 252 |
| Appendix B Virgil commentaries ranked by number of printings | 267 |
| Index                                                        |     |
|                                                              |     |

# Illustrations

| I | Virgil and Ovid: Latin texts and commentaries published |         |  |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------|---------|--|
|   | in France, 1469–1599                                    | page 22 |  |
| 2 | Geography of printed editions                           | 34      |  |
| 3 | Geography of new commentaries                           | 34      |  |
| 4 | Prompted by Venus (viz., beauty), Aeneas woos Lavinia   | 244     |  |
| 5 | Lavinia's wooing and wedding feast                      | 246     |  |

# Acknowledgements

My cup is full. This book was written with the aid of several institutions: the University of Chicago, the Mellon Foundation, the Newberry Library, Macalester College, the Bibliothèque Nationale de France (through its Gallica collection), the Rare Book Library of Duke University, the Rare Book Collection of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and the Thomas Harriott College of Arts and Sciences at East Carolina University. Special thanks are due to Sarah Stanton, Sarah Roberts, and Rebecca Jones of Cambridge University Press; my copy-editor Caroline Howlett; and two anonymous readers. I am grateful to the many friends, classmates, colleagues, and teachers who answered questions, commented on drafts, made gifts of their books, and offered fellowship: Joel Baer, David Bevington, Garth Bond, April Brewer, Jean R. Brink, Colin Burrow, Nina E. Cannizzaro, Alan Cottrell, Raymond J. Cormier, my research assistant LeAnna Cox, Jeff Dolven, Charles Fantazzi, Robert Fehrenbach, Julia Haig Gaisser, Mario Geymonat, John Given, Timothy C. Graham, Peter Green, Andrew Hadfield, A. C. Hamilton, Richard F. Hardin, Peter C. Herman, Thomas Herron, Leofranc Holford-Strevens, Craig Kallendorf, Carol V. Kaske, Arthur Kinney, Christopher Kleinhenz, Roger Kuin, Elisabeth Leedham-Green, Allen Mandelbaum, Stuart McDougal, Scott McGill, David Lee Miller, Jerry Leath Mills, Janel Mueller, James Nohrnberg, Jim O'Hara, Wendy Olmsted, William Oram, Anthony Papalas, Adrian Pay, Lee Piepho, Joshua Phillips, Tanya Pollard, Anne Lake Prescott, Michael C. J. Putnam, Thomas P. Roche, Jr., Frank Romer, Charles Ross, Sarah Skwire, Andrew Smyth, John Stevens, Richard Strier, Sandra Tawake, Bart van Es, Matteo Venier, and Jan M. Ziolkowski. In particular I wish to thank W. R. Johnson, Joshua Scodel, my classmate Greg Kneidel, and Michael Murrin, il mar di tutto 'l senno. I am especially grateful to my in-laws, Arnold and Patricia Okamura, and my learned wife, Tricia Wilson-Okamura, who labored with me on the index. This book is dedicated to my parents, Ralph and Jean Wilson.

## Texts and abbreviations

Virgil's works are cited from *P. Virgilii Maronis Opera* ... (Venice: Heirs of Luca Antonio Giunta, 1544), facsimile repr., The Renaissance and the Gods, 2 vols. (New York: Garland, 1976), as are the *Supplementum* of Maffeo Vegio; the life of Virgil by Aelius Donatus; and the Virgil commentaries of Marius Servius Honoratus, Tiberius Claudius Donatus, Pierio Valeriano, Agostino Dati, Antonio Mancinelli, and Jodocus Badius Ascensius; in the notes, this edition is cited as "Giunta 1544." The Bible is cited from *The Geneva Bible: A Facsimile of the 1560 Edition* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969). Except in the appendices, where Latin names are used throughout, the names of Renaissance authors are given in whatever form seems familiar now: hence "Jodocus Badius Ascensius" for "Josse Bade van Asche," but "Cristoforo Landino" instead of "Christophorus Landinus." Abbreviations, with the exception of  $\mathcal{O}$ ; have been silently expanded. Translations are mine except where otherwise noted.

| Aen.        | Aeneid.                                                     |
|-------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|
| Ecl.        | Eclogues.                                                   |
| ECE         | Elizabethan Critical Essays, ed. G. Gregory Smith, 2 vols.  |
|             | (London: Oxford University Press, 1904). Repr. 1937.        |
| FQ          | Edmund Spenser, The Faerie Queene, ed. A. C. Hamilton,      |
|             | 2nd edn. (Harlow: Pearson, Longman, 2001).                  |
| Geo.        | Georgics.                                                   |
| Giunta 1544 | P. Virgilii Maronis Opera (Venice: Heirs of Luca            |
|             | Antonio Giunta, 1544), facsimile repr., The Renaissance     |
|             | and the Gods, 2 vols. (New York: Garland, 1976).            |
| GL          | Torquato Tasso, <i>Gerusalemme liberata</i> (1582), ed.     |
|             | Lanfranco Caretti (1971; repr. Turin: Einaudi, 1993).       |
| OF          | Ludovico Ariosto, Orlando furioso (1532), ed. Cesare Segre, |
|             | I Meridiani (Vicenza: Mondadori, 1976).                     |

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19812-7 - Virgil in the Renaissance David Scott Wilson-Okamura Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

Texts and abbreviations

OIMatteo Maria Boiardo, Orlando innamorato (1482, 1494), ed. Giuseppe Anceschi, I Grandi Libri, 2 vols. (Milan: Garzanti, 1978). SC Edmund Spenser, The Shepheardes Calender, in The Shorter Poems, ed. Richard A. McCabe (London: Penguin, 1999). STC A. W. Pollard and G. R. Redgrave, A Short-Title Catalogue of Books printed in England, Scotland, & Ireland and of English Books Printed Abroad, 1475–1640, 2nd edn., rev. W. A. Jackson, F. S. Ferguson, and Katharine F. Pantzer, 3 vols. (London: Bibliographical Society, 1986–91), supplemented by English Short Title Catalogue [database], Online, British Library and North American Center for ESTC, 1997. Maphaeus Vegius, Libri XII Aeneidos supplementum Supp. (1428), in Giunta 1544. VTJan M. Ziolkowski and Michael C. J. Putnam (eds.), The Virgilian Tradition: The First Fifteen Hundred Years (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008). Where two page numbers are provided (e.g., "279/280"), the first number indicates a Latin original, the second an English translation.

xiii