

Stakeholders Matter

The dominant shareholder-value model has led to mismanagement, market failure and a boost to regulation, as spectacularly demonstrated by the events surrounding the recent financial crisis. *Stakeholders Matter* challenges the basic assumptions of this model, in particular traditional economic views on the theory of the firm and dominant theories of strategic management, and develops a new understanding of value creation away from pure self-interest toward mutuality. This new "stakeholder paradigm" is based on a network view, whereby mutuality enhances benefits and reduces risks for the firm and its stakeholders. The understanding of mutual value creation is operationalized according to the license to operate, to innovate and to compete. The book develops a vision for a strategy in society in which, rather than the *invisible* hand of the market, it is the *visible* hands of the firm and the stakeholders that lead to an overall increase in the welfare of society.

SYBILLE SACHS is Professor and Head of the Institute for Strategic Management: Stakeholder View at the University of Applied Sciences Zurich (HWZ). In addition, she is an affiliate professor of the University of Zurich, where she established the module for Business and Society in 2000 and adjunct professor at the University of Southern Queensland in Australia. She has published numerous articles and books in the fields of strategic management and stakeholder management and is co-author of the book *Redefining the Corporation* (2002).

EDWIN RÜHLI is Professor Emeritus for Business Administration at the University of Zurich. He is also Senior Advisor at the Institute for Strategic Management: Stakeholder View of the University of Applied Sciences in Zurich. He is the author of the groundbreaking German management book *Unternehmungsführung I–III* and has published more than 150 peer-reviewed publications in the fields of international management, corporate governance, strategic management and stakeholder management.



Business, Value Creation, and Society

Series editors

R. Edward Freeman, *University of Virginia*Stuart L. Hart, *Cornell University and University of North Carolina*David Wheeler, *University of Plymouth*

The purpose of this innovative series is to examine, from an international standpoint, the interaction of business and capitalism with society. In the twenty-first century it is more important than ever that business and capitalism come to be seen as social institutions that have a great impact on the welfare of human society around the world. Issues such as globalization, environmentalism, information technology, the triumph of liberalism, corporate governance and business ethics all have the potential to have major effects on our current models of the corporation and the methods by which value is created, distributed and sustained among all stakeholders – customers, suppliers, employees, communities, and financiers.

Published titles:

Fort Business, Integrity and Peace
Gomez and Korine Entrepreneurs and Democracy
Crane, Matten, and Moon Corporations and Citizenship
Painter-Morland Business Ethics as Practice
Yaziji and Doh NGOs and Corporations
Rivera Business and Public Policy

Forthcoming titles:

Maak and Pless Responsible Leadership
Mansell Capitalism and Corporate Responsibility
Hemingway Corporate Social Entrepreneurship



Stakeholders Matter

A New Paradigm for Strategy in Society

SYBILLE SACHS and EDWIN RÜHLI





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521196390

© Sybille Sachs and Edwin Rühli 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Sachs, Sybille.

Stakeholders matter : a new paradigm for strategy in society / Sybille Sachs, Edwin Rühli.

p. cm. - (Business, value creation, and society)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-19639-0

1. Strategic planning. 2. Customer relations. I. Rühli, Edwin. II. Title.

HD30.28.S2217 2011

658.4'012-dc23

2011020616

ISBN 978-0-521-19639-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Alexandra Sachs, for whom the paradigm shift matters



Contents

Lι	st of figures	page x11
Li	st of tables	xiv
Fo	oreword by R. Edward Freeman	xv
A	cknowledgments	xvii
1	Challenges for a new paradigm in strategic management The future of business in society: social and	1
	economic changes	1
	Requirements for a new paradigm in strategic management	3
	Historic nature of paradigms	3
	Origin of the economic paradigm	4
	Post-Enlightenment Capitalism	4
	Multi-paradigm concepts to reflect reality	6
	Our contribution to the stakeholder paradigm	6
	Path toward a new stakeholder paradigm	8
	Part I Development of the basic assumptions of a new	
	stakeholder paradigm	11
2	The economic paradigm and its basic assumptions	13
	The economic paradigm of the theory of the firm	13
	What is the purpose of the firm and its underlying	
	principle of value creation?	14
	Who are the actors and who are the owners?	15
	What are the main attributes of actors and their behavior?	15
	What are the conditions of the environment?	16
	Final remarks	16
	The strategy theory: general remarks	18
	The strategy theory: the "Industry Structure View	
	of Strategy" (ISV)	19

vii



viii	i	Contents
	What is the purpose of the firm and its underlying principle	e
	of value creation?	20
	Who are the actors and who are the owners?	21
	What are the main attributes of actors and their behavior?	22
	What are the conditions of the environment?	23
	Final remarks on the ISV	24
	The strategy theory: the "Resource-based View	
	of Strategy" (RbV)	26
	What is the purpose of the firm and its underlying	
	principle of value creation?	27
	Who are the actors and who are the owners?	29
	What are the main attributes of actors and their behavior?	29
	What are the conditions of the environment?	30
	Final remarks on the RbV	30
	The economic paradigm revisited	32
3	Contribution of stakeholder theory to our understanding	3
	of the stakeholder paradigm	35
	Descriptive dimension	35
	Who are the stakeholders?	35
	What is the interaction between the firm	
	and its stakeholders?	38
	Our understanding from a descriptive perspective	40
	Instrumental dimension	41
	Stakeholders impact value creation	42
	Stakeholders create competitive advantage	42
	Stakeholder relations pay off	42
	Our understanding from an instrumental perspective	43
	Normative stakeholder dimension	43
	Economic normative foundation	44
	Social/philosophical, normative foundation	45
	Our understanding from a normative perspective	45
	Final remarks	46
4	The stakeholder paradigm	48
	The stakeholder theory of the firm	48
	What is the purpose of the firm and its underlying principle	
	of value creation?	48
	Who are the actors and who are the owners?	50
	What are the main attributes of actors and their behavior?	51
	What are the conditions of the environment?	52
	Final remarks	53



Ca	ntents	1X
	Stakeholder Capitalism	53
	What is the purpose of the firm and its underlying principles	
	of value creation?	54
	Who are the actors and who are the owners?	54
	What are the main attributes of actors and their behavior?	55
	What are the conditions of the environment?	56
	Final remarks	56
	The basic assumptions for our understanding of the	
	stakeholder paradigm	57
	What is the purpose of the firm and its underlying	
	principles of value creation?	57
	Who are the actors and who are the owners?	59
	What are the main attributes of actors and their behavior?	60
	What are the conditions of the environment?	62
	The assumptions of different paradigms	63
	Part II Our understanding of the stakeholder paradigm	
	and its operationalization	71
5	Our understanding of the stakeholder paradigm	
	operationalized in the three licenses	73
	Our claim for the stakeholder paradigm	73
	The economic paradigm in an endless series of constraints	73
	Challenging the dominance of self-interest	74
	The fundamental shift to mutuality in a network view	74
	Putting the paradigm into operation: the three licenses	76
	License as entitlement	76
	Licenses stimulate value creation	78
	Take another look at the Matterhorn	78
	Embeddedness in networks	82
	Stakeholder licenses	86
	Multiple roles of stakeholders	88
	Common dimensions of the three licenses	88
	Content of the licenses	89
	The cast of relevant stakeholders	89
	Contributions to value creation	89
	Value distribution	90
	Firm and stakeholder strategies	90
	Evaluation of mutual value creation	91
6	License to operate	95
	The content of the license to operate	95



X		Contents
	The cast of stakeholders: society as an end and value	
	contributor, not as a constraint	98
	Mutual value creation with and for social and political	
	stakeholders	102
	Corporation perspective	102
	Stakeholder perspective	104
	Important benefit and risk potentials from the perspective	
	of the license to operate	105
	Value distribution to social and political stakeholders	109
	Strategies from the perspective of the license to operate	110
	Evaluation from the perspective of the license to operate	111
	Concluding remarks to the license to operate	113
7	License to innovate	114
	The content of the license to innovate	114
	The cast of stakeholders: from the resource-based view	
	to the resource owner view	115
	Stakeholders as resource contributors	115
	Stakeholders as providers of non-limited resources	118
	Stakeholders as direct and indirect resource contributors	120
	Stakeholders as voluntary and involuntary resource	
	contributors	121
	Mutual value creation	123
	The motivation of stakeholders to contribute resources	123
	The dynamics of resource contribution	125
	Value distribution to stakeholders from the perspective of	
	the license to innovate	128
	Strategy and core competencies from the perspective of the	
	license to innovate	129
	Evaluation from the perspective of the license to innovate	130
	Concluding remarks to the license to innovate	131
8	License to compete	133
	Content of the license to compete	133
	The cast of stakeholders: from the industry structure view	
	to the dynamic network structure view	133
	The nature of stakeholder networks	133
	The attractiveness of stakeholder networks	135
	Dynamics of stakeholder networks	138
	Mutual value creation: positioning in and among stakeholde	
	networks	139
	Forms of positioning	139



Contents	X1
Benefit and risk potentials in stakeholder networks	140
Multiple roles of stakeholders	141
Positioning on the continuum between cooperation	
and confrontation	144
Value distribution to stakeholders from the perspective	
of the license to compete	145
Generic strategies from the perspective of the license	
to compete	147
Evaluation from the perspective of the license to compete	149
Concluding remarks on the license to compete	151
9 Challenges resulting from a paradigm shift	154
What are the main challenges for the required change?	154
What are basic change patterns and processes?	155
General principle of change	155
Gradual change	156
Fundamental changes	157
Three basic learning processes	158
Economic impacts	162
Requirements in the perspective of the license to operate	162
Requirements in the perspective of the license to innovate	163
Requirements in the perspective of the license to compete	163
Cultural impacts	164
Different levels of culture	165
Role of leaders	167
Structural and legal impacts	171
Structures and processes of firms and stakeholders	171
Distinctiveness and complexity of network structures	172
Governance systems and legal impacts	173
Epilogue	179
Appendix: Methodological considerations	181
Glossary	194
Notes	201
Bibliography	224
Index	269



Figures

All figures and tables in this book are our own illustrations, except where stated otherwise.

1.1	Structure of the current book	page 9
2.1	The firm and its environment	14
4.1	Perceptions of firms and stakeholders	62
5.1	Comparison of the economic and the stakeholder	
	paradigm	76
5.2	The Swiss view of the Matterhorn	79
5.3	The Italian view of the Matterhorn	80
5.4	The three licenses to analyze mutual value creation	83
5.5	Stakeholder networks	84
5.6	Evaluation concept	92
5. 7	Key elements of the three licenses	93
6.1	Types of social and political stakeholders' contributions	105
6.2	Expected benefit and risk resulting from stakeholder	
	interactions	106
7.1	Benefit and risk potentials as perceived by managers	116
7.2	Types of stakeholder contributions	117
7.3	Possible contributions by stakeholders to core	
	competencies	131
7.4	Comparison between traditional RbV and the license	
	to innovate	132
8.1	Types of stakeholder contributions	143
8.2	Three generic strategies	147
8.3	The stakeholder network of Suva's New Case	
	Management	149
8.4	Stakeholder network of microfinance institutions (MFIs)	150
8.5	Focus on stakeholders in mutual value creation	150
8.6	Comparison between traditional ISV and the license	
	to compete	152

xii



List of figures		xiii
9.1	Impacts of change processes	155
9.2	Structural differentiation in a stakeholder network	173
E.1	Mutual value creation in networks	180
A.1	Overview of the research process	186
A.2	Action research process: steps 1 to 5	188



Tables

2.1	Main theories of the firm	page 17
3.1	The most important stakeholders	36
4. 1	Overview of the assumptions of the most	
	important paradigms and theories	64
6.1	Most important social and political stakeholders	101
6.2	Strategic activities based on similarities and differences	
	of stakeholder and firm perception of an issue	111
8.1	Benefit and risk potentials	142
9.1	Different leadership types in firms	168
9.2	The stakeholder paradigm and different	
	levels of governance	177

xiv



Foreword

Stakeholders Matter: A New Paradigm for Strategy in Society is an important book. It ushers in a new wave of scholarship in management theory. The new era that is upon us obliges us tell a new story about business, as an institution that is firmly set in society, rather than apart from it. The authors take globalization, mega-change due to information technology, and the emergence of new and innovative business models as normal to this new era. The old way of thinking about business as a purely economic and instrumental tool for the benefit of financiers is no longer useful. The new narrative of business must be told in stakeholder terms to allow for the diversity of business forms that we are seeing in the twenty-first century.

When the authors claim that a new paradigm has emerged for strategic management, they are being too modest. Their proposals do no less than rewrite the contract between business and society. First of all, they broaden the notion of business as the engine of economic activity by focusing on value creation for stakeholders rather than economic value for shareholders. Business in the twenty-first century must be seen as an institution which creates value for customers, suppliers, employees, communities, financiers and society. Second, one of their key arguments is that this new narrative about business, indeed the new social contract, contains three licenses: (1) license to operate; (2) license to innovate; and (3) license to compete. The combination lays out a new agenda for thinking about the purpose of the firm, its strategic vision and its business model for value creation.

Equally as important as the substance of their argument, is the process of research on which this book is based. It comes from a multi-year, multi-company, multi-disciplinary perspective which the authors have developed over the past decade. It shows us a different way to conceptualize research that is at once intellectually rigorous, based on an analysis of good practice, and speaks to academics and thoughtful practitioners. Business research in the twenty-first century needs to



xvi Foreword

reflect the massive changes that the institution itself has undergone. We cannot afford only narrow disciplinary studies that stand closer to scientism than to improving and interpreting business practice. As the authors demonstrate, there is no trade-off between rigor and relevance. Good research must be both conceptually rigorous and practically relevant. *Stakeholders Matter* is such a work.

It is an honor to publish this book in the series on Business, Value Creation, and Society. The purpose of this series is to stimulate new thinking about value creation and trade, and its role in the world of the twenty-first century. Our old models and ideas simply are not appropriate today. We need new scholarship that builds on these past understandings, yet offers the alternative of a world of hope, freedom and human flourishing. Professors Sachs and Rühli have produced just such a volume.

R. Edward Freeman
University Professor
Academic Director, Business Roundtable
Institute for Corporate Ethics
The Darden School
University of Virginia
Charlottesville, Virginia USA



Acknowledgments

We are especially grateful to have experienced "mutual value creation" with, and hopefully also for, different "stakeholders" in our "network" in the course of writing the book.

First of all, we want to thank Isabelle Kern, who supported us from the beginning to the end of the book. Also we want to thank Ruth Schmitt who, as a co-leader of joint research projects, contributed many ideas to our understanding of the stakeholder paradigm. The work could not have been written without the support of our research team: Manuel Heer Dawson, Andrea Gäumann, Claude Meier, Marc Moser, Irene Perrin and Thomas Schneider (in alphabetical order). With them mutual value creation took place in its purest form, which we profoundly appreciate. The research team members represent a broad range of scientific disciplines: information technology, economy, political science, sociology and psychology. This diversity greatly enriched our ideas and insights.

We want to thank Christine Luisi for making our English more readable. In refining the language, she had the opportunity to challenge the logic of our argumentation, which was of unique value.

We are grateful for the outstanding support from R. Edward Freeman, the general editor of the series "Business, Value Creation, and Society." He has been a formative influence from the beginning of our research. He stimulated us to integrate strategy and stakeholder theory, and to emphasize the humanistic aspect of value creation. We had the advantages of a great reviewer team with Joseph Mahoney, James Post and Grant Savage. From their different perspectives, they challenged and advised us with valuable comments and encouragement. We also received excellent support from Paula Parish, our editor at Cambridge University Press. She was a true "benefit provider."

We thank all of our interview partners in the different case studies for providing us with insights on how mutual value creation takes place in real life situations and not just in theory.

xvii



xviii

Acknowledgments

Furthermore, we would like to include an even broader "cast of stakeholders" in our thanks: Simone de Colle, Sabine Döbeli, Hans Groth, Ulrich Gut, Jeffery Harrison, Gilbert Lenssen, Guido Mattanza, Bruce Millett, Bidham Parmar, Lee Preston, Nigel Roome, Thomas Streiff, Jean-Paul Thommen, Sandra Waddock, Christoph Weber, Patricia Werhane, Duane Windsor and Donna Wood (in alphabetical order). We had the privilege to meet and discuss with them, and to learn from their publications.

As we have based our ideas on a wide range of literature, we are grateful for the innumerable impulses and the richness of the ideas we received from all of the authors.

We are grateful to the University of Applied Sciences HWZ for supporting our research and providing us with the necessary work conditions.