

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

APPROPRIATING THE PAST

Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

In this book an international team of archaeologists, philosophers, lawyers, and heritage professionals addresses significant ethical questions about the rights to access, manage, and interpret the material remains of the past. The chapters explore competing claims to interpret and appropriate the past and the major ethical issues associated with them, including handling the sacred; contested rights over sites, antiquities, and artifacts; the involvement of local communities in archaeological research; and the legal status of heritage sites. The book covers a range of hotly debated topics in contemporary archaeological practice, focusing particularly on the relationship between academic archaeologists and indigenous communities for whom the material remnants of the past that form the archaeological record may be part of a living tradition and anchors of social identity.

GEOFFREY SCARRE is Professor of Philosophy at Durham University and the cofounder and director of the Durham University Centre for the Ethics of Cultural Heritage. He is the editor (with Chris Scarre) of *The Ethics of Archaeology: Philosophical Perspectives on Archaeological Practice* and the author of several books, including, most recently, *Death, Mill's On Liberty: A Reader's Guide*, and *On Courage*.

ROBIN CONINGHAM is Pro-Vice Chancellor and Professor of Archaeology at Durham University and cofounder of the Durham University Centre for the Ethics of Cultural Heritage. Active as a field archaeologist in South Asia and Iran, he currently leads a UNESCO archaeological team that is excavating inside the temple of the Buddha's birth at Lumbini in Nepal.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice
of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

APPROPRIATING THE PAST

Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

EDITED BY

GEOFFREY SCARRE

University of Durham

ROBIN CONINGHAM

University of Durham



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521124256

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Appropriating the past : philosophical perspectives on the practice of archaeology / [edited by] Geoffrey Scarre, University of Durham, Robin Coningham, University of Durham.
pages cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-19606-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-12425-6 (paperback)

I. Archaeology – Philosophy. 2. Archaeology – Moral and ethical aspects. 3. Indigenous peoples – Antiquities – Collection and preservation. I. Scarre, Geoffrey, editor of compilation. II. Coningham, Robin, editor of compilation.

CC72.A595 2012
930.1–dc23 2012017957

ISBN 978-0-521-19606-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-12425-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Editors</i>	xiii
1 Introduction <i>Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham</i>	I
PART ONE CLAIMING THE PAST	
2 The Values of the Past <i>James O. Young</i>	25
3 Whose Past? Archaeological Knowledge, Community Knowledge, and the Embracing of Conflict <i>Piotr Bienkowski</i>	42
4 The Past People Want: Heritage for the Majority? <i>Cornelius Holtorf</i>	63
5 The Ethics of Repatriation: Rights of Possession and Duties of Respect <i>Janna Thompson</i>	82
6 On Archaeological Ethics and Letting Go <i>Larry J. Zimmerman</i>	98
7 Hintang and the Dilemma of Benevolence: Archaeology and Ecotourism in Laos <i>Anna Källén</i>	119

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

PART TWO PROBLEMS OF MEANING AND METHOD

- 8 What Is a Crisis of Intelligibility? 141
Jonathan Lear
- 9 Contesting Religious Claims over Archaeological Sites 156
Elizabeth Burns Coleman
- 10 Multivocality and “Wikiality”: The Epistemology and Ethics of a Pragmatic Archaeology 176
Alexander A. Bauer
- 11 “Do not do unto others . . .”: Cultural Misrecognition and the Harms of Appropriation in an Open-Source World 195
George P. Nicholas and Alison Wylie
- 12 Should Ruins Be Preserved? 222
David E. Cooper

PART THREE PROBLEMS OF OWNERSHIP AND CONTROL

- 13 Legal Principles, Political Processes, and Cultural Property 239
Tom Allen
- 14 Monuments versus Moveables: State Restrictions on Cultural Property Rights 257
David Garrard
- 15 Looting or Rededication? Buddhism and the Expropriation of Relics 281
Robin Coningham and Prishanta Gunawardhana
- 16 Partitioning the Past: India’s Archaeological Heritage after Independence 295
Nayanjot Lahiri
- References* 313
- Index* 347

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

TOM ALLEN is the Master of Grey College, University of Durham, and holds a chair in law at the university. His main field of interest is the intersection between human rights and property law. His current work focuses on the relationship between the rules of property law and the construction of communities and collective memories.

ALEXANDER A. BAUER is Assistant Professor of Anthropology at Queens College and the Graduate Center, City University of New York, with research interests in Old World archaeology, material culture, trade and exchange, archaeological theory, and cultural heritage policy. He maintains a particular research interest in Peircean semiotics and the ways it can be used to develop a pragmatic archaeological theory and method. He has conducted fieldwork in Greece, Israel, Jordan, Turkey, and Ukraine and is currently Associate Director of the Sinop Regional Archaeological Project in Turkey. He is the coeditor of the recent volume *Social Archaeologies of Trade and Exchange* (Left Coast Press, 2010) and has been Editor in Chief of the *International Journal of Cultural Property* since 2005.

PIOTR BIENKOWSKI is a cultural, heritage, and museums consultant; writer and researcher; and Honorary Professor in the School of Arts, Histories, and Cultures at the University of Manchester. Previously, he was Professor of Archaeology and Museology at the University of Manchester, Deputy Director of Manchester Museum, and Head of Antiquities at National Museums Liverpool. He has directed fieldwork in Jordan and has published extensively on the Iron Age in Jordan and the ancient Near East in general, on the ethics of human remains in archaeology and museums, and on community agency and sharing of authority in cultural organisations. He is Codirector of the International Umm al-Biyara Project in Petra, Jordan.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Contributors

ELIZABETH BURNS COLEMAN lectures in communications at Monash University. She has held postdoctoral fellowships at the Australian National University's Centre for Cross Cultural Research and Monash University. She is author of *Aboriginal Art, Identity and Appropriation* (Ashgate, 2005) and coeditor of a series of collections on the theme of negotiating the sacred: *Blasphemy and Sacrilege in a Multicultural Society* (ANU E-press, 2006); *Blasphemy and Sacrilege in the Arts* (ANU E-press, 2008); *Medicine, Religion and the Body* (Brill, 2009); and *Religious Tolerance, Education and the Curriculum* (Sense, 2011).

DAVID E. COOPER is Professor of Philosophy Emeritus at Durham University. He has been a Visiting Professor at universities in Europe, North America, and South Asia. Much of his recent work has been in the area of environmental aesthetics. He is the author of many books, including *A Philosophy of Gardens* (2006) and a forthcoming book on Daoism and human beings' relationship to nature.

DAVID GARRARD has a background in academic philosophy but now works for English Heritage. He is interested in the intersection between aesthetic judgments and other kinds of values, particularly in the history and theory of the conservation movement. He is currently editing an anthology of architectural poetry.

PRISHANTA GUNAWARDHANA is Professor of Archaeology at the University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanka, and a board member of the Sri Lanka Council of Archaeologists. He has edited several books and journals and published more than fifty articles on archaeology. Gunawardhana is a Codirector of the Upper Malwathu Oya Archaeological Exploration Project, a collaborative project of Durham University and the University of Kelaniya. He is also Director of the Terra-Cotta Project in Sri Lanka, funded by the University of Kelaniya.

CORNELIUS HOLTORF is currently employed at Linnaeus University in Kalmar, Sweden, where he is responsible for the degree programme in heritage studies. A prehistorian by education, he has long been investigating the intersections of prehistory, archaeology, heritage, and contemporary society, and he is the author of the monographs *Monumental Past* (2000–8), *From Stonehenge to Las Vegas* (2005), and *Archaeology Is a Brand!* (2007). Holtorf is currently finishing a field project on the life history of a megalith in southern Portugal and has plans to investigate further the contemporary archaeology of zoological gardens. He is Associate Editor of the journal *Heritage and Society*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contributors*

ix

ANNA KÄLLÉN is a Researcher in Archaeology at Stockholm University, Sweden, where she specialises in the archaeology and heritage of mainland Southeast Asia. Her main interest is in the role of archaeology and the use of the past as narratives and materiality in contemporary society. She is currently engaged in investigating the relations between archaeology and ecotourism in northern Laos.

NAYANJOT LAHIRI is Professor in the Department of History at the University of Delhi, where she teaches Indian archaeology. She has been the recipient of various fellowships including the Commonwealth Academic Staff fellowship at the University of Cambridge (UK) and the Daniel Ingalls Fellowship at Harvard University (USA). She is on the advisory editorial board of *World Archaeology* (UK) and on the editorial board of *American Anthropologist* (USA). Apart from articles in refereed international and national journals, she has authored and edited six books, including *The Archaeology of Indian Trade Routes* (Oxford University Press) and *Finding Forgotten Cities* (Permanent Black). She was co-editor of a special issue of *World Archaeology* on *The Archaeology of Hinduism*. *Finding Forgotten Cities* was a finalist for the Hutch-Crossword Award prize in 2006. She has been a member of the Delhi Urban Art Commission.

JONATHAN LEAR is John U. Nef Distinguished Service Professor in the Committee of Social Thought and Department of Philosophy at the University of Chicago. He is the author, most recently, of *Radical Hope: Ethics in the Face of Cultural Devastation* (Harvard University Press, 2008) and *A Case for Irony* (Harvard University Press, 2011). He was recently awarded the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation Distinguished Achievement Award.

GEORGE P. NICHOLAS is Professor of Archaeology at Simon Fraser University. He was founding director of the university's Indigenous Archaeology Program in Kamloops, BC (1991–2005). He is Director of the international research initiative Intellectual Property Issues in Cultural Heritage: Theory, Practice, Policy, a seven-year initiative funded by SSHRC Canada (<http://www.sfu.ca/ipinch>). His research focuses on Indigenous archaeology, intellectual property issues relating to archaeology, the archaeology and human ecology of wetlands, and archaeological theory, on all of which he has published widely. He is series coeditor of the World Archaeological Congress's *Research Handbooks in Archaeology* and former editor of the *Canadian Journal of Archaeology*. His most

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

Contributors

recent book is *Being and Becoming Indigenous Archaeologists* (Left Coast, 2010).

JANNA THOMPSON is a Professor in the Department of Philosophy at La Trobe University in Melbourne, Australia. She is the author of *Taking Responsibility for the Past: Reparation and Historical Injustice* (Polity, 2002) and *Intergenerational Justice: Rights and Responsibilities in an Intergenerational Polity* (Routledge, 2009). She has also written books and articles on global justice, environmental ethics, ethical theory, and human rights.

ALISON WYLIE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Washington. She works primarily on theoretical and ethical issues raised by archaeological practice, particularly on questions about ideals of objectivity, evidential reasoning, and accountability. Her publications include *Thinking from Things: Essays in the Philosophy of Archaeology* (2002); edited volumes such as *Value-Free Science?* (Oxford University Press, 2007, with Kincaid and Dupré), *Doing Archaeology as a Feminist (Archaeological Method and Theory)*, 2007, with Conkey), *Epistemic Diversity and Dissent (Episteme)*, 2006, and *Ethics in American Archaeology* (SAA, 2000); as well as essays that appear in *How Well Do Facts Travel?* (Cambridge University Press, 2010), *The Ethics of Cultural Appropriation* (Wiley, 2009), *Agnatology: The Making and Unmaking of Ignorance* (Stanford University Press, 2008), *Evaluating Multiple Narratives* (Springer, 2007), and *Embedding Ethics* (Berg, 2005).

JAMES O. YOUNG is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Victoria. He is the author of more than fifty articles on the philosophy of language, philosophy of art, and other topics. His books include *Global Anti-Realism* (1995) and *Cultural Appropriation and the Arts* (2008), and he is coeditor of *The Ethics of Cultural Appropriation* (2009).

LARRY J. ZIMMERMAN is Professor of Anthropology and Museum Studies at Indiana University–Purdue University Indianapolis and Public Scholar of Native American Representation with the Eiteljorg Museum of American Indians and Western Art. His books include *A North American Archaeologist's Field Handbook* (coauthored, 2010) and *Kennewick Man: Perspectives on the Ancient One* (coedited, 2008). Recent articles and chapters include 'Creating a translational archaeology of homelessness', *World Archaeology* (coauthored 2010); 'The premise and promise of Indigenous archaeology', *American Antiquity* (coauthored

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

xi

2010); “White people will believe anything!”: Worrying about Authenticity, Museum Audiences, and Working in Native American-Focused Museums’, *Museum Anthropology* (2010); and ‘In the Public Interest: Creating a More Activist, Civically-Engaged Archaeology’, in *Voices in American Archaeology* (coauthored, 2010).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice
of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Editors

GEOFFREY SCARRE is Professor of Philosophy at Durham University. In recent years he has taught and published mainly in the areas of moral theory and applied ethics. His latest books are *Death* (Acumen/McGill–Queens University Press, 2007), *Mill's On Liberty: A Reader's Guide* (Continuum, 2007) and *On Courage* (Routledge, 2010). He also edited (with Chris Scarre) *The Ethics of Archaeology: Philosophical Perspectives on Archaeological Practice* (Cambridge University Press, 2006). He is a founder and Director of the Durham University Centre for the Ethics of Cultural Heritage.

ROBIN CONINGHAM is Pro–Vice Chancellor and Professor of Archaeology at Durham University. He has conducted fieldwork throughout South Asia, directing major excavations at the Bala Hisar of Charsadda in Pakistan, the Citadel of Anuradhapura in Sri Lanka, and Tepe Pardis and Tepe Sialk in Iran, and he has participated in twelve UNESCO missions to the region. His major publications range from the excavation monographs on Anuradhapura (1999, 2006) and Charsadda (2007) and regional synthetic analyses (2005) to studies on the archaeology of Buddhism (2001, 2011) and the relationship of heritage management, identity, and archaeology. His current research includes the completion of a survey of the hinterland of Anuradhapura in Sri Lanka and directing the new UNESCO excavations at the World Heritage Site of Lumbini in Nepal, the birthplace of the Buddha. He codirects the Durham University Centre for the Ethics of Cultural Heritage.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19606-2 - Appropriating the Past: Philosophical Perspectives on the Practice
of Archaeology

Edited by Geoffrey Scarre and Robin Coningham

Frontmatter

[More information](#)
