

ICSID Reports

Volume 16

The ICSID Reports provide the only comprehensive published collection of arbitral awards and decisions given under the auspices of the World Bank's International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes or pursuant to other multilateral or bilateral investment treaties, including in particular the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and the Energy Charter Treaty (ECT). These decisions, which are fully indexed, make an important contribution to the growing body of jurisprudence on international investment. The ICSID Reports are an invaluable tool for practitioners and scholars working in the field of international commercial arbitration or advising foreign investors. Volume 16 of the ICSID Reports includes the final award on jurisdiction and merits in Methanex v. United States, and the awards in F-W Oil Interests v. Trinidad and Tobago, Noble Ventures v. Romania and Berschader v. Russia.





# **ICSID REPORTS**

Volume

16



This volume may be cited as: 16 ICSID Reports



# **ICSID REPORTS**

Reports of cases decided under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States, 1965 and related decisions on international protection of investments

Volume

16

**EDITED** 

BY

JAMES CRAWFORD, SC, FBA, LL D (Cantab.)

Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge

AND

JOANNA GOMULA, LL M, PhD

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

CONSULTING EDITOR

Sir ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE, QC, LL D

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

 $\label{eq:continuous} \mbox{A PUBLICATION OF}$  THE LAUTERPACHT CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,  $\mbox{UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE}$ 

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521192613

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012 4th printing 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by CPI Group Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-19261-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## **CONTENTS**

Introduction	Page ix
Editorial Note	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
Table of Cases Reported in Volume 16	xiv
Table of Cases Reported in Volumes 1–16	xv
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 16	xxix
CASES	
Camuzzi International SA v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/2)	3
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 May 2005	6
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	32
Final Award on Jurisdiction and Merits, 3 August 2005	40
Noble Ventures Inc. v. Romania (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/11)	210
Award, 12 October 2005 Rectification of Award, 19 May 2006	216 294
Aguas del Tunari SA v. Republic of Bolivia (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/3)	297
Decision on Respondent's Objections to Jurisdiction, 21 October 2005 Declaration, 21 October 2005	303 379
F-W Oil Interests Inc. v. Republic of Trinidad and Tobago (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/14)	394
Award, 3 March 2006	398
Vladimir Berschader and Moïse Berschader v. Russian Federation (Case No. 080/2004)	462



viii	CONTENTS	
Award, 21 April 2006		467
Separate Opinion, 7 April 2	2006	512
Correction of Award, 9 June 2	2006	518
Fireman's Fund Insurance Comp	pany v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/0	02/01)	520
Award, 17 July 2006		523
Mytilineos Holdings SA v. State	Union of Serbia and Montenegro and	
Republic of Serbia		567
Partial Award on Jurisdiction	, 8 September 2006	572
Dissenting Opinion, 6 Sept	tember 2006	612
	INDEX	
Index, Volume 16		617



## INTRODUCTION

Arbitral tribunals and *ad hoc* committees set up under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States administered by the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) have produced a large number of awards and decisions. In recent years, through the Additional Facility mechanism, their number has increased substantially, and their contribution both to the substance of international investment law and the procedure of international arbitration grows in importance. Chapter Eleven arbitration under NAFTA will increasingly contribute its share; so too do the increasing number of *ad hoc* arbitral decisions under bilateral and multilateral investment treaties, which are also included in this series. Many of these cases raise vital issues of investment protection and relate to fundamental questions of the relations between national and international law.

Article 48(5) of the ICSID Convention provides that the Centre shall not publish an award without the consent of the parties thereto. In the absence of an official series of reports of these texts, many have appeared unofficially, from time to time, in a variety of publications in different parts of the world. For those who wish to refer to these awards and decisions in a systematic manner, this diffusion has been a source of difficulty. There is considerable value in collecting and presenting this material in a single publication accompanied by summaries, tables of cases and with a detailed index. Some of the texts in the series have previously been available only in French or Spanish.

James Crawford Joanna Gomula

Lauterpacht Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

December 2011





## EDITORIAL NOTE

The ICSID Reports contain decisions rendered by arbitral tribunals and ad hoc committees set up within the framework of the Centre established pursuant to the ICSID Convention (including those rendered by ICSID tribunals established pursuant to bilateral investment treaties) and other decisions, whether judicial or arbitral, relating to such proceedings. These are accompanied by a full scholarly apparatus and index.

Volume 1 contains, in addition to the Basic Texts of the ICSID system, decisions in cases commenced during the period 1972 to 1981. Volume 2 contains material relating to proceedings commenced between 1981 and 1983, and Volume 3 contains the first three proceedings commenced in 1984. Volume 4 contains the texts of decisions and awards relating to ICSID cases commenced between 1984 and 1992. Volume 5 contains available texts of decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1992 and 2000, and Volume 6 contains those commenced between 1995 and 2001. Volume 7 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1997 and 2002. Volume 8 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1996 and 2002. Volume 9 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1990 and 2003. Volume 10 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1998 and 2004. Volume 11 contains those for proceedings commenced between 2000 and 2002. Volume 12 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 2001 and 2003. Volume 13 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1997 and 2004. Volume 14 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1985 and 2004. Volumes 15 and 16 contain decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 2001 and 2004. To the extent possible, cases are printed in chronological order according to the date of the main award or the date of the first reported stage of proceeding. All the proceedings relating to any given case are, so far as possible, assembled together in their own chronological order.

The awards and decisions in these *Reports* are reproduced, to the greatest extent possible, in the form in which they were handed down. Editorial intervention is limited to minor editorial corrections, the introduction of a summary and of a bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. These are followed by the full text of the original decision, if available, or its translation. No attempt has been made to tamper with the texts by purporting to correct any errors of substance or to clarify obscurities of expression.

Attempts have been made to obtain the full text of all awards and decisions. Where only excerpts are available these have been reproduced. Any omission of material is indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets stating the nature of the passage which has been omitted. Should the full text of a previously excerpted or omitted decision or award subsequently become available it will be published in a later volume in the series.



xii

### EDITORIAL NOTE

Bold-letter headings preceding each case indicate the main points of law involved in the decision. These entries are also collected in a digest at the beginning of the volume.

The source of the material in this volume is indicated at the end of each case. Where the material has been published in more than one language, one publication in each language is listed. The language of the original decision is also mentioned.

Various tables are printed at the beginning of each volume: an alphabetical table of cases reported in the volume, a consolidated alphabetical table of all the cases so far reported and a digest of the cases reported in the volume.

Earlier volumes contained a consolidated index. This has become impossible due to space considerations, and thus from volume 11 the index is confined to the volume in question. The consolidated index for volumes 1–10 is to be found at 10 *ICSID Reports* 453.



## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The permissions granted for the publication of the following texts are gratefully acknowledged.

Summaries were written by Dr Tiina Pajuste and Dr Joanna Gomula. The Editors are also very grateful to Ms Tara Grant who provided general assistance.

The Index was prepared by Miss Maureen MacGlashan CMG and the Tables were prepared by the Editors.

Thanks are due to the Secretary-General and staff of ICSID for their assistance in many ways, including the provision of texts of decisions where this could be done consistent with ICSID rules. Responsibility for the summaries and other contents of this volume remains, however, solely with the Editors.



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 16

## [ALPHABETICAL]

	Page
Aguas del Tunari SA v. Republic of Bolivia (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/3) Decision on Respondent's Objections to Jurisdiction, 21 October 2005	297 303
Declaration, 21 October 2005	379
Berschader, Vladimir and Moïse v. Russian Federation (Case No. 080/2004)	462
Award, 21 April 2006	467
Separate Opinion, 7 April 2006	512
Correction of Award, 9 June 2006	518
Camuzzi International SA v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/2	2) 3
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 May 2005	6
F-W Oil Interests Inc. v. Republic of Trinidad and Tobago (ICSID Case	
No. ARB/01/14)	394
Award, 3 March 2006	398
Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case	
No. ARB(AF)/02/01)	520
Award, 17 July 2006	523
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	32
Final Award on Jurisdiction and Merits, 3 August 2005	40
Mytilineos Holdings SA v. State Union of Serbia and Montenegro	
and Republic of Serbia	567
Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 8 September 2006	572
Dissenting Opinion, 6 September 2006	612
Noble Ventures Inc. v. Romania (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/11)	210
Award, 12 October 2005	216
Rectification of Award, 19 May 2006	294



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16

## [ALPHABETICAL]

•	Vol., Page
ADC Affiliate Limited and ADC & ADMC Management Limited v. Republic of Hungary (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/16) Award, 2 October 2006	<b>15</b> , 534 <b>15</b> , 539
ADF Group Inc. v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/1) Procedural Order No. 2 Concerning Place of Arbitration, 11 July 200 Procedural Order No. 3 Concerning Production of Documents, 4 October 2001 Award, 9 January 2003	<b>6</b> , 449 <b>6</b> , 453 <b>6</b> , 461 <b>6</b> , 470
Adriano Gardella SpA v. Government of Côte d'Ivoire (ICSID Case No. ARB/74/1) Award, 29 August 1977 (excerpts)	1, 283 1, 287
AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17) Decision on Jurisdiction, 26 April 2005	<b>12</b> , 308 <b>12</b> , 312
AGIP SpA v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/1) Award, 30 November 1979	1, 306 1, 309
Aguas del Tunari SA v. Republic of Bolivia (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/3) Decision on Respondent's Objections to Jurisdiction, 21 October 2005 Declaration, 21 October 2005	
AIG Capital Partners Inc. and CJSC Tema Real Estate Company v.  Republic of Kazakhstan (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/6)  Award, 7 October 2003  United Kingdom, High Court, Queen's Bench Division, AIG  Capital Partners Inc. and Another v. Republic of Kazakhstan,  Application for Enforcement of Arbitral Award, 20 October 2005	11, 3 11, 7
Amco Asia Corp., Pan American Development Ltd and PT Amco Indonesia v. Republic of Indonesia (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/1) Jurisdiction, 25 September 1983	1, 376 1, 389



xvi

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-19261-3 - ICSID REPORTS: Volume 16 Edited by James Crawford and Joanna Gomula Frontmatter More information

Provisional Measures, 9 December 1983

Award, 20 November 1984

Annulment, 16 May 1986

# **1**, 543 Resubmitted Case: Jurisdiction, 10 May 1988

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-16

Resubmitted Case: Award, 5 June 1990	1, 569
Resubmitted Case: Rectification, 17 October 1990	<b>1</b> , 638
Resubmitted Case: Annulment, 3 December 1992	<b>9</b> , 9
Annex, Interim Order No. I, Request for Stay of Enforcement of	
Award, 2 March 1991	<b>9</b> , 59
Amorioga Manufacturing and Trading Log v. Donublic of Zaine	
American Manufacturing and Trading Inc. v. Republic of Zaire (ICSID Case No. ARB/93/1)	<b>5</b> , 11
Award, 21 February 1997	<b>5</b> , 11
Individual opinions, 21 February 1997	<b>5</b> , 14 <b>5</b> , 37
individual opinions, 21 February 1997	3, 37
Asian Agricultural Products Ltd [AAP] v. Democratic Socialist	
Republic of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/87/3)	<b>4</b> , 245
Award, 27 June 1990	<b>4</b> , 250
Dissenting opinion, 27 June 1990	<b>4</b> , 296
Atlantic Triton Company Limited v. People's Revolutionary Republic	
of Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/1)	<b>3</b> , 3
France, Cour d'appel, Rennes, 26 October 1984	<b>3</b> , 4
France, Cour de cassation, Rennes, 18 November 1986	<b>3</b> , 10
Award, 21 April 1986	<b>3</b> , 13
Autorieta Como si con de la Venera de CA en Delinaria Describio ef	
Autopista Concesionada de Venezuela CA v. Bolivarian Republic of	C 417
Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/5)	<b>6</b> , 417
Decision on Jurisdiction, 27 September 2001	<b>6</b> , 419
Award, 23 September 2003	<b>10</b> , 309
Azinian, Davitian and Baca v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case	
No. ARB(AF)/97/2)	<b>5</b> , 269
Award, 1 November 1999	<b>5</b> , 272
Azurix Corp. v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/12)	<b>10</b> , 412
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003	<b>10</b> , 416
Award, 14 July 2006	<b>14</b> , 374
Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of	
the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2)	1, 330
Award, 8 August 1980	1, 335
France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981	1, 368
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981	1, 369
France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987	1, 309 1, 373
France, Cour de Cassadon, Fairs, 21 July 1907	1,3/3

**1**, 410

**1**, 413

1,509



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	xvii
Berschader, Vladimir and Moïse v. Russian Federation Award, 21 April 2006	<b>16</b> , 462 <b>16</b> , 467 <b>16</b> , 512
Separate Opinion, 7 April 2006 Correction of Award, 9 June 2006	<b>16</b> , 512 <b>16</b> , 518
Bogdanov, Agurdino-Invest Ltd and Agurdino-Chimia JSC v. Republic of Moldova Award, 22 September 2005	<b>15</b> , 45 <b>15</b> , 49
Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997	<b>5</b> , 106 <b>5</b> , 108
Camuzzi International SA v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/2)	<b>16</b> , 3
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 May 2005	<b>16</b> , 6
Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2) Decision on Provisional Measures, 25 September 2001	<b>6</b> , 373 <b>6</b> , 375
CDC Group Plc v. Republic of the Seychelles (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/14)	<b>11</b> , 206
Award, 17 December 2003	<b>11</b> , 200 <b>11</b> , 211
Decision on Application for Annulment, 29 June 2005	11, 237
Československá Obchodní Banka AS v. Slovak Republic (ICSID Case	<b>7</b> 220
No. ARB/97/4) Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 24 May 1999	<b>5</b> , 330 <b>5</b> , 335
Decision on Further and Partial Objections to Jurisdiction,	2, 333
1 December 2000	<b>5</b> , 358
Award, 29 December 2004	<b>13</b> , 181
Champion Trading Company, Ameritrade International Inc., J. T., J. B. and T. T. Wahba v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case	
No. ARB/02/9)	<b>10</b> , 398
Decision on Jurisdiction, 21 October 2003	<b>10</b> , 400
Award, 27 October 2006	<b>14</b> , 485
CME Czech Republic BV (The Netherlands) v. Czech Republic	<b>9</b> , 113
Partial Award on the Merits, 13 September 2001	9, 121
Dissenting opinion Final Award on Damages, 14 March 2003	9, 243 9, 264
Separate opinion	9, 204 9, 412
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 15 May 2003	-, 112
Czech Republic v. CME Czech Republic BV	<b>9</b> , 439



### TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-16 xviii CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID 7,492 Case No. ARB/01/8) 7, 494 Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 17 July 2003 Award, 12 May 2005 **14**, 158 Decision on Request for Continued Stay of Enforcement of Award, **14**, 240 1 September 2006 Decision on Annulment, 25 September 2007 14, 251 Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie Générale des Eaux / Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3) 5, 296 Award, 21 November 2000 5, 299 Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee, 3 October 2001 **6**, 330 Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002 **6**, 340 Decision on Supplementation and Rectification of Annulment Decision, 28 May 2003 8,489 Compañía del Desarrollo de Santa Elena SA v. Republic of Costa Rica (ICSID Case No. ARB/96/1) **5**, 153 Award, 17 February 2000 **5**, 157 Rectification of Award, 8 June 2000 **5**, 180 Consortium Groupement LESI-DIPENTA v. People's Democratic Republic of Algeria (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/8) **15**, 3 Award, 10 January 2005 **15**, 7 Duke Energy International Peru Investments No. 1 Ltd v. Republic of Peru (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/28) **15**, 100 Decision on Jurisdiction, 1 February 2006 **15**, 108 Award, 18 August 2008 **15**, 146 Partial dissenting opinion, 25 July 2008 **15**, 239 Partial dissenting opinion, 22 July 2008 **15**, 244 Empresas Lucchetti SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4) **12**, 218 Award, 7 February 2005 **12**, 219 EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador **12**, 400 Interim Award on Request for Interim Measure of Protection, 31 January 2004 **12**, 408 Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 27 February 2004 **12**, 413 Award, 3 February 2006 **12**, 427 Partial dissenting opinion, 30 December 2005 **12**, 489



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	xi	ix
Decision on Jurisdiction, 14 January 2004	11, 26 11, 27 11, 29	73
Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 28 November 1997 Award on Jurisdiction, 24 June 1998	7, 3 7, 5 7, 12	2
Partial Award, 19 August 2005	12, 33 12, 33 12, 38	35
	<b>16</b> , 39 <b>16</b> , 39	
Fedax NV v. Republic of Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/96/3) Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 July 1997 Award, 9 March 1998	<b>5</b> , 18 <b>5</b> , 18 <b>5</b> , 20	36
Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1) Interim Decision on Preliminary Jurisdictional Issues, 6 December	<b>7</b> , 31	.8
2000	<b>7</b> , 32	27
Award, 16 December 2002	<b>7</b> , 34	
Dissenting opinion	7, 40	
Decision on the Correction and Interpretation of the Award,		
13 June 2003	<b>7</b> , 41	8
Canada, United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa		
Judicial Review, Ontario Superior Court of Justice, 3 December 2003 Judicial Review, Ontario Court of Appeal, 11 January 2005	<b>8</b> , 50 <b>9</b> , 50	
Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States		
	<b>10</b> , 21	3
Decision on the Preliminary Question, 17 July 2003	<b>10</b> , 21	4
Award, 17 July 2006	<b>16</b> , 52	!3
GAMI Investments Inc. v. Government of the United Mexican States	<b>13</b> , 14	4
Final Award, 15 November 2004	<b>13</b> , 14	17
Gas Natural SDG, SA v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case		
No. ARB/03/10)	<b>14</b> , 28	32
Decision on Preliminary Questions on Jurisdiction, 17 June 2005	<b>14</b> , 28	34
Generation Ukraine Inc. v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/9)	<b>10</b> , 23	6
Award, 16 September 2003	<b>10</b> , 24	0



XX	TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	
Award, 25		<b>6</b> , 236 <b>6</b> , 241
	on Claimants' Request for Supplementary Decisions and ation, 4 April 2002	<b>6</b> , 304
	thers v. Republic of Burundi (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/3) February 1999	6, 3 6, 5
Part 1. I	Decision on Liability, 2 September 1998 Che Parties' Agreement, 23 December 1998	<b>6</b> , 5 <b>6</b> , 46
	Enterprises Six Nations Ltd and Others v. United States	15 500
of America Decision of	on Objections to Jurisdiction, 20 July 2006	<b>15</b> , 503 <b>15</b> , 505
	alaysia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/3) November 2000	<b>5</b> , 483 <b>5</b> , 484
	Frade Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador (ICSID Case	12 102
No. ARB/	on Jurisdiction and Competence, 22 December 2003	<b>13</b> , 102 <b>13</b> , 105
	ng opinion	<b>13</b> , 118
Note on Se	• 1	<b>13</b> , 120
	A v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case	
No. ARB/		<b>12</b> , 242
Decision of	on Jurisdiction, 22 April 2005	<b>12</b> , 245
	V and Dredging International NV v. Arab Republic of	4 = 400
	SID Case No. ARB/04/13) on Jurisdiction, 16 June 2006	<b>15</b> , 400
	November 2008	<b>15</b> , 406 <b>15</b> , 437
Joy Mining M	Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID	
	ARB/03/11)	<b>13</b> , 121
Award on	Jurisdiction, 6 August 2004	<b>13</b> , 123
Note on So	ettlement	<b>13</b> , 143
	ite Company v. Government of Jamaica (ICSID Case	1 200
No. ARB/ Jurisdictio	n and Competence, 6 July 1975	1, 296 1, 298
Klöckner Ind	lustrie-Anlagen GmbH, Klöckner Belge SA and Klöckner	
	aatschappij BV v. Republic of Cameroon and Société	
	aise des Engrais SA (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/2)	<b>2</b> , 3
	October 1983 (excerpts)	<b>2</b> , 9
Dissenti	ng opinion, 21 October 1983 (excerpts)	<b>2</b> , 77



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	xxi
Annulment, 3 May 1985	<b>2</b> , 95
Resubmitted Case: Award, 26 January 1988	<b>14</b> , 8
Dissenting opinion	<b>14</b> , 80
Resubmitted Case: Decision on Annulment, 17 May 1990	<b>14</b> , 101
LANCO International Inc. v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case	
No. ARB/97/6)	<b>5</b> , 367
Preliminary Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 1998	<b>5</b> , 369
Lauder v. Czech Republic	<b>9</b> , 62
Final Award, 3 September 2001	<b>9</b> , 66
Lemire v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/1)	<b>6</b> , 59
Award embodying the Parties' Settlement Agreement,	
18 September 2000	<b>6</b> , 60
LG&E Energy Corporation and Others v. Argentine Republic (ICSID	
Case No. ARB/02/1)	<b>11</b> , 411
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 30 April 2004	<b>11</b> , 414
Liberian Eastern Timber Corporation [LETCO] v. Government of the	
Republic of Liberia (ICSID Case No. ARB/83/2)	<b>2</b> , 343
Award, 31 March 1986	<b>2</b> , 346
Rectification, 14 May 1986	<b>2</b> , 380
United States, District Court, Southern District of New York,	
5 September 1986	<b>2</b> , 383
United States, District Court, Southern District of New York,	
12 December 1986	<b>2</b> , 385
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 16 April 1987	<b>2</b> , 390
Link-Trading Joint Stock Company v. Department for Customs	
Control of the Republic of Moldova	<b>13</b> , 3
Award on Jurisdiction, 16 February 2001	<b>13</b> , 6
Final Award, 18 April 2002	<b>13</b> , 14
The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of	
America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3)	<b>7</b> , 421
Decision on Objection to Competence and Jurisdiction, 9 January 2001	<b>7</b> , 425
Award, 26 June 2003	<b>7</b> , 442
Decision on Respondent's Request for a Supplementary Decision,	
13 September 2004	<b>10</b> , 444
United States District Court, District of Columbia, <i>Loewen</i> v. <i>United States of America</i>	
Judicial Review, 31 October 2005	10. 448



## xxii TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16

Lucchetti (Empresas) SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru	12 210
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	<b>12</b> , 218
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 February 2005	<b>12</b> , 219
Maffezini v. Kingdom of Spain (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/7)	<b>5</b> , 387
Decision on Request for Provisional Measures (Procedural Order	
No. 2), 28 October 1999	<b>5</b> , 393
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 25 January 2000	<b>5</b> , 396
Award, 13 November 2000	<b>5</b> , 419
Rectification of Award, 31 January 2001	<b>5</b> , 440
Maritime International Nominees Establishment [MINE] v. Republic	
of Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/4)	<b>4</b> , 3
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 12 January 1981	4, 4
United States Court of Appeals, District of Columbia,	
12 November 1982	<b>4</b> , 8
Belgium, Rechtbank van eerste aanleg, Antwerp, 27 September 1985	<b>4</b> , 32
Switzerland, Tribunal fédéral, 4 December 1985	<b>4</b> , 35
Switzerland, Tribunal de première instance, Geneva, 13 March 1986	<b>4</b> , 41
Switzerland, Autorité de surveillance des offices de poursuite pour	
dettes et de faillite, Geneva, 7 October 1986	<b>4</b> , 45
Award, 6 January 1988	<b>4</b> , 54
Annulment, 22 December 1989	<b>4</b> , 79
Request for Annulment, Procedural Order No. 1, 17 May 1988	<b>4</b> , 110
Application for Stay of Enforcement of Award, Interim Order	
No. 1, 12 August 1988	<b>4</b> , 111
Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case	
No. ARB(AF)/97/1)	<b>5</b> , 209
Award, 30 August 2000	<b>5</b> , 212
Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia, <i>United Mexican</i>	
States v. Metalclad	<b>5</b> 226
Judicial Review, 2 May 2001	<b>5</b> , 236
Supplementary Reasons for Judgment, 31 October 2001	<b>6</b> , 52
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	7, 208
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 31 December 2000	<b>7</b> , 213
Decision on Petitions from Third Persons to Intervene as "Amici	
Curiae", 5 January 2001	<b>7</b> , 224
First Partial Award (Decision on Jurisdiction and Admissibility),	
7 August 2002	<b>7</b> , 239
Final Award on Jurisdiction and Merits, 3 August 2005	<b>16</b> , 40
Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic	
of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6)	<b>7</b> , 173
Award, 12 April 2002	<b>7</b> , 178



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	xxiii
Mihaly International Corporation v. Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/2)	<b>6</b> , 308
Award, 15 March 2002 Individual concurring opinion, 15 March 2002	<b>6</b> , 310 <b>6</b> , 323
Mobil Oil Corporation, Mobil Petroleum Company Inc., Mobil Oil New Zealand v. Her Majesty the Queen in Right of New Zealand	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/87/2)	<b>4</b> , 117
New Zealand, High Court, 1 July 1987	<b>4</b> , 119
Findings on Liability, Interpretation and Allied Issues, 4 May 1989	<b>4</b> , 140
Mondev International Ltd v. United States of America (ICSID Case	
No. ARB(AF)/99/2)	<b>6</b> , 181
Miscellaneous Procedural Orders	<b>6</b> , 186
Award, 11 October 2002	<b>6</b> , 192
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID	10.0
Case No. ARB/01/7)	<b>12</b> , 3
Award, 25 May 2004 Decision on Respondent's Request for a Continued Stay of	<b>12</b> , 6
Execution, 1 June 2005	<b>13</b> , 493
Decision on Annulment, 21 March 2007	<b>13</b> , 500
Myers, S. D., Inc. v. Government of Canada	<b>8</b> , 3
Procedural Orders Nos. 10 and 18	<b>8</b> , 13, 15
First Partial Award on Liability, 13 November 2000	<b>8</b> , 18
Separate opinion, 12 November 2000	<b>8</b> , 66
Second Partial Award on Damages, 21 October 2002	<b>8</b> , 124
Final Award on Costs, 30 December 2002	<b>8</b> , 172
Individual dissenting opinion, 30 December 2002	<b>8</b> , 183
Judicial Review, Federal Court of Canada, 13 January 2004  Attorney-General of Canada v. S. D. Myers Inc.	<b>8</b> , 194
Marking Halling CA or Contact Hairm of Cardin and Mantacas and	
Mytilineos Holdings SA v. State Union of Serbia and Montenegro and Republic of Serbia	<b>16</b> , 567
Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 8 September 2006	<b>16</b> , 572
Dissenting Opinion, 6 September 2006	<b>16</b> , 612
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	
Telecommunications) (SCC Case No. 49/2002)	<b>13</b> , 30
Final Award, 9 September 2003	<b>13</b> , 33
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 26 August 2005	10, 55
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	
Telecommunications)	<b>13</b> , 96



#### TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-16 xxiv **16**, 210 Noble Ventures Inc. v. Romania (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/11) Award, 12 October 2005 **16**, 216 Rectification of Award, 19 May 2006 16, 294 Nykomb Synergetics Technology Holding AB v. Republic of Latvia **11**, 153 Award, 16 December 2003 **11**, 158 Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467) **12**, 54 Final Award, 1 July 2004 **12**, 59 Republic of Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration and Production Company **12**, 101 England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division, 29 April 2005 **12**, 104 England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 9 September 2005 **12**, 129 Olguín v. Republic of Paraguay (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/5) **6**, 154 Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 August 2000 **6**, 156 Award, 26 July 2001 **6**, 164 Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic **13**, 335 Award I, 13 February 2003 **13**, 337 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 13 April 2006 Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic **13**, 369 Award II, 29 March 2005 **13**, 387 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 19 January 2007 Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Limited **13**, 480 Plama Consortium Limited v. Republic of Bulgaria (ICSID Case **13**, 268 No. ARB/03/24) Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 February 2005 13, 272 Order on Provisional Measures, 6 September 2005 **13**. 324 Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada **7.** 43 Ruling on Interim Measures, 7 January 2000 **7**. 54 7, 55 Award on Preliminary Motion to Dismiss the Claim, 26 January 2000 Award on the "Harmac Motion", 24 February 2000 **7**, 64 Interim Award, 26 June 2000 7, 69 Award on Canada's Motion regarding the "Super Fee", 7 August 2000 7, 92 Ruling on Claim of Crown Privilege, 6 September 2000 7, 99 Award on the Merits of Phase 2, 10 April 2001 7, 102 7, 148 Award on Damages, 31 May 2002 Final Award on Costs, 26 November 2002 7, 170 PSEG Global Inc. and Others v. Republic of Turkey (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/5) **11**, 431 Decision on Jurisdiction, 4 June 2004 11, 434



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	XXV
S. D. Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada	<b>8</b> , 3
Procedural Orders Nos. 10 and 18	<b>8</b> , 13, 15
First Partial Award on Liability, 13 November 2000	<b>8</b> , 18
Separate opinion, 12 November 2000	<b>8</b> , 66
Second Partial Award on Damages, 21 October 2002	<b>8</b> , 124
Final Award on Costs, 30 December 2002	<b>8</b> , 172
Individual dissenting opinion, 30 December 2002	<b>8</b> , 183
Judicial Review, Federal Court of Canada, 13 January 2004	
Attorney-General of Canada v. S. D. Myers Inc.	<b>8</b> , 194
Salini Costruttori SpA and Italstrade SpA v. Hashemite Kingdom of	
Jordan (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/13)	<b>14</b> , 303
Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 November 2004	<b>14</b> , 306
Award, 31 January 2006	<b>14</b> , 343
Declaration	<b>14</b> , 365
Salini Costruttori SpA and Italstrade SpA v. Kingdom of Morocco	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/00/4)	<b>6</b> , 398
Decision on Jurisdiction, 23 July 2001	<b>6</b> , 400
Saluka Investments BV v. Czech Republic	<b>15</b> , 250
Decision on Jurisdiction over Counterclaim, 7 May 2004	<b>15</b> , 256
Partial Award, 17 March 2006	<b>15</b> , 274
Judicial Review, Switzerland, Tribunal fédéral, 7 September 2006 Czech Republic (Ministry of Finance) v. Saluka Investments BV	<b>15</b> , 377
Scimitar Exploration Limited v. Republic of Bangladesh and	
Bangladesh Oil, Gas and Mineral Corporation (ICSID Case	
No. ARB/92/2)	<b>5</b> , 3
Award, 5 April 1994	<b>5</b> , 4
SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Islamic Republic of	
Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/13)	<b>8</b> , 383
Pakistan, Supreme Court, <i>Société Générale de Surveillance SA</i> v.	0, 303
Pakistan, through Secretary, Ministry of Finance	<b>8</b> , 352
Order, 15 March 2002	<b>8</b> , 354
Judgment, 3 July 2002	<b>8</b> , 356
Procedural Order No. 2, 16 October 2002	<b>8</b> , 388
Decision on Disqualification of Arbitrator, 19 December 2002	<b>8</b> , 398
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 6 August 2003	<b>8</b> , 406
Note on Settlement	<b>8</b> , 451
SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Republic of the	
Philippines (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/6)	<b>8</b> , 515
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 29 January 2004	<b>8</b> , 518
Declaration, 29 January 2004	<b>8</b> , 568



xxvi	TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16		
Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8) Decision on Jurisdiction, 3 August 2004			
	5 February 2007	<b>12</b> , 174 <b>14</b> , 518	
	ate opinion, 30 January 2007	<b>14</b> , 603	
Separ	ace opinion, 30 vanuary 2007	14, 003	
	Exploitation des Mines d'Or de Sadiola SA [Semos] v.	40 444	
	c of Mali (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/5)	<b>10</b> , 114	
Award, 7	25 February 2003	<b>10</b> , 116	
Société Ou	est Africaine des Bétons Industriels [SOABI] v. State of		
0	(ICSID Case No. ARB/82/1)	<b>2</b> , 164	
Jurisdiction, 1 August 1984			
	25 February 1988	<b>2</b> , 190	
	nting opinion, 25 February 1988	<b>2</b> , 277	
	ration of the President of the Tribunal, 25 February 1988	<b>2</b> , 333	
	Cour d'appel, Paris, 5 December 1989	<b>2</b> , 337	
France,	Cour de cassation, 11 June 1991	<b>2</b> , 341	
Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7)		<b>12</b> , 156	
Award o	n Jurisdiction, 7 July 2004	<b>12</b> , 158	
Southern F	Pacific Properties (Middle East) Limited [SPP(ME)] v.		
	public of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/3)	<b>3</b> , 45	
	ICC Award No. YD/AS No. 3493, 11 March 1983		
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 12 July 1984			
Netherla	ands, District Court, Amsterdam, 12 July 1984	<b>3</b> , 92	
France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 6 January 1987			
Jurisdiction (No. 1), 27 November 1985			
	tion (No. 2), 14 April 1988	<b>3</b> , 131	
	nting opinion, 14 April 1988	<b>3</b> , 163	
	20 May 1992	<b>3</b> , 189	
Disser	nting opinion, 20 May 1992	<b>3</b> , 249	
Tanzania E	Electric Supply Company Limited v. Independent Power		
Tanzania Limited (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/8)			
Award,	12 July 2001	<b>8</b> , 226	
Decision on Provisional Measures, 20 December 1999			
Decision on Preliminary Issues, 22 May 2000			
Decision on Tariff and Other Remaining Issues, 9 February 2001			
Decision on All Further Remaining Issues, 24 May 2001			
	on regarding Future Disputes concerning the Construction		
	ngency Account	<b>8</b> , 317	
Stipulati	on and Agreement (and Annex)	<b>8</b> , 318	



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	xxvii
Técnicas Medioambientales Tecmed SA v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/2) Award, 29 May 2003	<b>10</b> , 130 <b>10</b> , 134
Tokios Tokelės v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/18) Procedural Order No. 1, Claimant's Request for Provisional Measures, 1 July 2003 Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 April 2004 Dissenting opinion Procedural Order No. 3, 18 January 2005	11, 305 11, 310 11, 313 11, 341 11, 352
Tradex Hellas SA v. Republic of Albania (ICSID Case No. ARB/94/2) Decision on Jurisdiction, 24 December 1996 Award, 29 April 1999	<b>5</b> , 43 <b>5</b> , 47 <b>5</b> , 70
United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada Award on Jurisdiction, 22 November 2002	7, 285 7, 288
Vacuum Salt Products Limited v. Government of Republic of Ghana (ICSID Case No. ARB/92/1) Provisional Measures, 14 June 1992 Award, 16 February 1994	<b>4</b> , 320 <b>4</b> , 323 <b>4</b> , 329
"Vivendi" / Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie Générale des Eaux / Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3) Award, 21 November 2000 Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee, 3 October 2001 Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002 Decision on Supplementation and Rectification of Annulment	5, 296 5, 299 6, 330 6, 340
Decision, 28 May 2003  Waste Management Inc. v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/2)  Award, 2 June 2000  Dissenting opinion, 2 June 2000 (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/3)  Decision on Venue of the Arbitration, 26 September 2001 Decision on Preliminary Objection, 26 June 2002  Award, 30 April 2004	5, 443 5, 445 5, 462 6, 538 6, 541 6, 549 11, 361
Wena Hotels Ltd v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/4) Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 June 1999 Award, 8 December 2000 Decision on Annulment, 5 February 2002	<b>6</b> , 67 <b>6</b> , 74 <b>6</b> , 89 <b>6</b> , 129



xxviii	TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–16	
	n on the Application by Wena Hotels Ltd for Interpretation e Arbitral Award dated 8 December 2000, 31 October 2005	<b>15</b> , 71
Yaung Chi	Oo Trading Pte Ltd v. Government of the Union of	
Myanmar (ASEAN ID Case No. ARB/01/1)		<b>8</b> , 452
Procedural Order No. 2, 27 February 2002		
Award,	31 March 2003	<b>8</b> , 463
Zhinvali D	Development Limited v. Republic of Georgia (ICSID Case	
No. ARB/00/1)		<b>10</b> , 3
Award, 24 January 2003		<b>10</b> , 6
	rate opinion, 14 January 2003	<b>10</b> , 106



## DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 16

### **Applicable Law**

Absence of agreement of the parties – ICSID Convention, Article 42(1) – Whether applicable in determining jurisdiction – Scope of Article 25 of ICSID Convention – Whether only Article 25 applicable in determining jurisdiction

Camuzzi International SA v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/2), 3

### Costs

Apportionment of costs – Respectable claims on the merits to be considered in apportionment of costs

F-W Oil Interests Inc. v. Republic of Trinidad and Tobago (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/14), 394

Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States, 520

Discretion of tribunal to apportion costs – Principle that losing party pays – Considerations in determining apportionment of costs

Vladimir Berschader and Moïse Berschader v. Russian Federation, 462

Principle that injured party should be compensated – "Loser pays" principle not common in international law – Considerations in the award of costs

Noble Ventures Inc. v. Romania (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/11), 210

UNCITRAL Rules, Article 40 – Whether unsuccessful party should bear all costs – Apportionment of costs – Reasonable costs

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 32

### **Diplomatic Protection**

Difference between diplomatic protection and international investment protection – Whether diplomatic protection available as a residual mechanism

Camuzzi International SA v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/2), 3

xxix



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 16

# XXX

**Evidence** 

Admissibility of evidence – Requirement to make request for disclosure of evidence in timely manner – Good faith in collecting evidence – Claimant's indifference to the legality of evidence collected – UNCITRAL Rules, Article 15(1) – Equal treatment and procedural fairness – UNCITRAL Rules, Article 25(6) – Tribunal's discretion to admit evidence – No value of evidence obtained unlawfully – Credibility of evidence – When tribunal may resort to inference

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 32

ICSID Convention, Article 43 – Discretion of tribunal in ordering production of evidence – Tribunal's considerations in ordering the production of evidence

Aguas del Tunari SA v. Republic of Bolivia (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/3), 297

### **Expropriation**

Determination of meaning of expropriation – NAFTA, Article 1131(1) – Tribunal to rely on NAFTA and international law – Whether tribunal permitted to rely on international case law

Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States, 520

Loss of investment due to risk not expropriation – Bilateral investment treaties not insurance against investment risk – Discriminatory treatment not tantamount to expropriation – Whether host State's failure to conclude agreement constitutes expropriation

Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States, 520

NAFTA, Article 1110 – Measure tantamount to expropriation – Whether regulation for public purpose expropriatory and compensable

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 32

Whether expropriation through judicial reorganization proceedings possible – No expropriation where no viable company and no valuable assets

Noble Ventures Inc. v. Romania (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/11), 210

### **Foreign Investment**

Contract claims as opposed to treaty claims – Umbrella clause – Whether violation of contract is violation of international law – Whether host State