

## RACE AND CITIZEN IDENTITY IN THE CLASSICAL ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY

In Race and Citizen Identity in the Classical Athenian Democracy, Susan Lape demonstrates how a racial ideology grounded citizen identity. Although this ideology did not manifest itself in a fully developed race myth, its study offers insight into the causes and conditions that can give rise to race and racisms in both modern and pre-modern cultures. In the Athenian context, racial citizenship emerged because it both identified who the citizens were and explained why they deserved to share in the goods of citizenship. By investigating Athenian law, drama, and citizenship practices, this study shows how racial citizenship worked in practice to consolidate national unity and to account for past Athenian achievements. It also considers how Athenian identity narratives fueled Herodotus' and Thucydides' understanding of history and causation.

Susan Lape is Associate Professor of Classics at the University of Southern California. She is the author of *Reproducing Athens: Menander's Comedy, Democratic Culture and the Hellenistic City.* 



# RACE AND CITIZEN IDENTITY IN THE CLASSICAL ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY

### SUSAN LAPE

University of Southern California





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521191043

© Susan Lape 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

ISBN 978-0-521-19104-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### **CONTENTS**

Pre	face	page ix
Ack	knowledgments	xi
1	Theorizing Citizen Identity	1
1	Introduction	1
	Law, Ethnic-Nationalism, and the Making of Citizen	1
	Identity	7
	Transforming Myth into Law	19
	Racial Citizenship: After Ethnicity and "before" Race	31
	The Sociopolitical Context of Athenian Racism	41
	Selves and Others: The Faces of Citizen Identity	44
	Theory, Method, and Overview	52
	Theory, weether, and overview	) 2
2	The Rhetoric of Racial Citizenship	61
	From Athenian Birth to Citizen Identity	61
	Old Comedy and the City's "Foreign" Leaders	64
	The Dog Orator: The Bad Citizen as Bad Seed	71
	Aristocratic Reproductive Affronts	78
	Gender, Heredity, and the Democratic Type	82
	Gender and the Alchemy of Citizen Identity	88
3	Euripides' "Ion" and the Family Romance of Athenian	
	Racialism	95
	The Family Plot: Athenian Racialism on Stage	95
	From Autochthony to Race	100
	The Problem: Sterility or Aristocratic Inter-polis Marriage	e
	Exchange?	105
	Gender, Maternal Inheritance, and Racialized	,
	Reproduction	108
	Four Sons from a Single Root	116



#### VI CONTENTS

	Rape, Autochthony, and the Violence of Foundation	119
	Creousa's Double Bind: Maternity and Murder	124
	Polyvalent Bastards: Tensions and Ambiguities in	
	Athenian Racial Kinship	127
4	Athenian Identity in History and as History	137
	Identity and History	137
	The Athenian History of the Athenians	141
	Enemies Within: The Athenian Explanation for Decline	
	and Defeat	145
	Herodotus on the Athenians: From Identity as History to a	
	History of Identity	149
	Gender and the Origins of Athenian Imperialism	155
	Democracy, Freedom, and the Making of Athenian	
	Exceptionalism	161
	Ethnic Identity and Collective Action	167
	The Contingency of National Character	173
	Thucydides' Alchemy of Athenian-ness	176
5	Trials of Citizen Identity: Policing and Producing the	
	Racial Frontier	186
	Identifying Citizens and Prosecuting Frauds	186
	Performing Citizen Identity at the <i>Dokimasia</i>	192
	Regulating and Rationalizing Racial Citizenship	
	(Diapsēphismos)	199
	Euxitheus' Appeal and the "Secret History" of Racial	
	Citizenship (Dem. 57, "Against Eubulides")	203
	Apollodorus and the Status Anxiety of the Naturalized	
	Citizen	216
	Counterfeiting Marriage, or How to Be an Illegal Alien	
	(Dem. 59. "Against Neaera")	220



CONTENTS VII

	"Race" Trumps Class: Apollodorus on Female Citizen		
	Identity	229	
	From Race to Character: Refiguring the Racial Frontier	234	
6	Myths and Realities of Racial Citizenship	240	
	Athenian Receptivity and Racial Citizenship	240	
	Naturalization and the Character of the Nation	246	
	Kinship Nationalism and the Rhetoric of		
	Anti-Naturalization	249	
	War and Civic Boundaries: Cases of Mass Naturalization	254	
	Renewing Racism and Refusing Civil War	262	
	Conclusion: Identity and the Ingredients of Social Agency	274	
Abi	Abbreviations		
Ref	References		
Ina	Index of Names and Subjects		
Ina	Index of Passages Discussed		



#### **PREFACE**

RACE AND CITIZEN IDENTITY IN THE CLASSICAL ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY examines how social actors identified as citizens during the fifth and fourth centuries BCE. From the mid fifth century onward, citizens increasingly appealed to a language of birth and ancestry to develop narratives about who they were as citizens. Citizens assumed that having the right birth and ancestry not only qualified them for citizenship but also endowed them with capacities and characteristics associated with citizenship, including an inherited love for democracy. In this study, I argue that these narratives articulate a vision of racial citizenship.

Since there is no current consensus on the issue of whether the concepts of race and/or racialism can be used to analyze ancient identities, I thought it might be helpful to clarify why I am using the term "racial" and what I mean by it. In this study, the term "racial" describes one component or narrative of citizen identity (citizen identity was composed of several narratives). I treat this narrative, racial citizenship, as a form of social identity, and investigate the causes and conditions that encouraged the Athenians to formulate and embrace it as well as the way this narrative worked in practice. The study is roughly divided between an examination of why and how racial citizenship emerged and an investigation of its consequences for citizenship practices, historiography, and policy decisions (inter alia). What must be stressed is that nothing in this project hangs on the use of the term "racial" per se. One might read this entire study substituting "ethnic" or some other less controversial term for "racial." In the final analysis, what I hope will matter is the argument about citizen identity in the democracy rather than simply the term I apply to one component of that identity.

Although speaking of racial citizenship opens this work up to potential misunderstanding, I have elected to use the label for two reasons. The first is specificity. Although the fit is not exact, the concept of racialism more closely captures the elements of the identity narrative under consideration here than does "ethnicity" or recent amalgams like



#### X PREFACE

"racial ethnicity," as I discuss at length in Chapter I. I stress, however, that to speak of Athenian citizenship as having a racial component is not to argue or assert that race and racisms as we know them today existed in democratic Athens. The Athenians were not interested in classifying all of humanity in hierarchically ranked and biologically and/or culturally distinct races. They were interested in themselves, in delineating the body of citizens and rationalizing who was entitled to belong. By answering the question "Who belongs?" with reference to bilateral nativity norms, they inadvertently paved the way to justify their answer in racial terms.

The second reason I have chosen to employ the concept of racial citizenship involves the apparent motivation behind its genesis. The Athenians did not initially embrace racial citizenship in order to express pre-existing ideas about their racial or ethnic superiority. Rather, the need to justify the distribution of the polis's resources, material and symbolic, supplied the impetus for citizens to develop and adopt the racial possibilities that their citizenship practices made available. Historians have shown that these are precisely the kinds of concerns that stand behind the emergence of the race ideologies that remain with us today (particularly in the United States). Although Athenian racial citizenship does not prefigure modern racisms, it does offer a snapshot of the conditions that can give rise to racial ideologies and racism. But above and beyond whatever label we give to the narratives comprising citizen identity, these narratives are part of the history of Athens' democracy. We should remember "that most grand democratic projects in human history - from Athens to America - have xenophobic and imperial roots" (West 2004, 42). Accordingly, if we wish to understand something of this paradoxical entanglement or, more simply, what made the Athenian democracy possible, we must supplement the study of institutions and the ideology promulgated therein to consider the prior questions of "Who belongs?" and "Why?"



#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

I WISH TO EXPRESS SINCERE GRATITUDE TO ALL THOSE WHO HAVE supported this project and to acknowledge the assistance I have received from so many. The genesis of this book dates back to my time as a member of the Society of Scholars at the Walter Chapin Simpson Center for the Humanities, University of Washington (spring 2000). I am grateful to Alys Weinbaum for urging me to read several key works on the philosophy of race that have proved fundamental to my thinking. I wish to give profound thanks to the University Center for Human Values, Princeton University, for granting me a Laurance S. Rockefeller Visiting Fellowship for the 2004-05 academic year. While at the Center, I learned a great deal from conversations with Dale Jamieson, Rachana Kamtekar, Steve Macedo, Victoria McGeer, Peter Singer, and Robert Wright. I also wrote two chapters of this study, presented an early draft of what has become Chapter 6 at the Center, and presented material from Chapter 3 in the Classics Department of Princeton University (2005). I wish to thank Joshua Katz and Cornel West in particular for feedback and stimulating discussion.

Portions of this book were also presented at the UCLA/USC Greek seminar (2004); the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill (2004); the University of Southern California (2004); Davidson College (2005); the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign (2006); the University of California, Santa Barbara (2007); and the Center for Law, History and Culture, University of Southern California (2007). I am grateful to the audiences at all of these events for their presence and comments, and I wish to give special thanks to Jim Dengate (University of Illinois) for his remarks on ancient slavery and to Daria Roithmayr (University of Southern California) for helping me with social identity theory. Material from Chapters 2 and 5 was presented at the Early Spectacles of Race conference held at the University of California, Irvine, in May 2004. I thank Karen Bassi, James Dee, David Goldberg, Geraldine Heng, and Daniel Seldon for their feedback and support at this event.



#### XII ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I owe a debt of thanks to Karen Bassi and Peter Euben for reading and providing extensive comments on preliminary versions of Chapters 1 and 2 and for their invitations to contribute to Parallax and their most recent collaborative project, When Worlds Elide (forthcoming). Claudia Moatti and my former colleague Clifford Ando provided key support for this project, at times even buying me books. Josh Ober kindly read and commented on Chapter 4 and early drafts of Chapters 2 and 5. I am deeply grateful to Jennifer Mann for reading and providing invaluable comments on the entire manuscript. I ceased working on this book for some time after suffering the loss of three close family members in what seemed rapid succession. I owe a debt of thanks to someone I've never met, Wayne Raskind, a former dean at USC, for granting me a course release that gave me time to grieve and, eventually, to return to writing. I would also like to thank Beatrice Rehl, my editor at Cambridge University Press; the anonymous readers of the manuscript; and Russell Hahn, my copy editor, for the time and care they have taken with this project. Finally, heartfelt thanks to Stan Woo-Sam for supporting me in so many ways.



## RACE AND CITIZEN IDENTITY IN THE CLASSICAL ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY