

UNCONSCIONABILITY IN EUROPEAN PRIVATE FINANCIAL TRANSACTIONS

Protecting the Vulnerable

Given the unprecedented recent turmoil on financial markets, we now face radically challenged, 'post-Lehman' assumptions on protecting the vulnerable in financial transactions. This collection of essays explores conceptions of, and responses to, unconscionability and similar notions across Europe with specific reference to financial transactions. It presents a detailed analysis of concepts of unconscionability in Europe against a backdrop of Commission initiatives aimed, variously, at securing a single market in financial services, producing greater coherence in EC consumer protection law and consolidating European private law. This analysis illustrates, for example, that concepts of unconscionability depend on context and can be shaped by a variety of factors. It also illustrates that jurisdictions may choose to respond to questions of unconscionability through a variety of legal instruments located in different branches of the law rather than through a single doctrine. Thus this collection illuminates many of the obstacles facing harmonisation in this area.

MEL KENNY is Reader in Commercial Law at the University of Leicester.

JAMES DEVENNEY is Deputy Head of Durham Law School and Director of the Durham University Institute of Commercial and Corporate Law.

LORNA FOX O'MAHONY is Professor of Law at the University of Durham.



UNCONSCIONABILITY IN EUROPEAN PRIVATE FINANCIAL TRANSACTIONS

Protecting the Vulnerable

Edited by

MEL KENNY

JAMES DEVENNEY

LORNA FOX O'MAHONY





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521190534

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Unconscionability in European private financial transactions: protecting the vulnerable / [edited by] Mel Kenny, James Devenney, Lorna Fox O'Mahony.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-19053-4 (Hardback)

- 1. Unconscionable contracts Europe. 2. Law Europe English influences.
- 3. Financial services industry Law and legislation Europe. 4. Consumer protection Law and legislation Europe. I. Kenny, Mel. II. Devenney, James.

III. Fox O'Mahony, Lorna. IV. Title. KJC1062.U53 2010

346.402-dc22 2010000696

ISBN 978-0-521-19053-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List o	f contributors	page viii
Lisi U	i communicators	page viii

Introduction: conceptualising unconscionability in Europe 1

MEL KENNY, JAMES DEVENNEY AND LORNA FOX O'MAHONY

PART I: Conceptualising unconscionability 5

Freedom of contract as freedom from unconscionable contracts 7

AURELIA COLOMBI CIACCHI

- 2 Protection of weaker parties in English law 26
- 3 Freedom of contract, unequal bargaining power and consumer law on unconscionability 46
 IMMACULADA BARRAL-VIÑALS
- 4 Loyalty as a tool to combat contractual unfairness: a French perspective 62
 SÉVERINE SAINTIER
- 5 Unconscionability and the value of choice 79
 EMMANUEL VOYIAKIS
- 6 From individual conduct to transactional risk: some relational thoughts about unconscionability and regulation 99

JOHN WIGHTMAN

7 An economic perspective on legal remedies for unconscionable contracts 129

QI ZHOU



V1	CONTENTS

- PART II: Conceptualising unconscionability in financial transactions 145
- 8 Usury and the judicial regulation of financial transactions in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century England 147

WARREN SWAIN AND KAREN FAIRWEATHER

- 9 Protection of the vulnerable in financial transactions what the common law vitiating factors can do for you 166

 DAVID CAPPER
- 10 Borrowers as consumers: new notions of unconscionability for domestic borrowers 184

SARAH NIELD

11 Conceptualising and understanding fairness: lessons from and for financial services 205

PETER CARTWRIGHT

12 Open the box: an exploration of the Financial Services Authority's model of fairness in consumer financial transactions 227

TONI WILLIAMS

13 Conceptualising unconscionability in the context of risky financial transactions: how to converge public and private law approaches? 246

OLHA O. CHEREDNYCHENKO

14 Conceptualising unconscionability in the post-Soviet era: the Lithuanian case of legal transplants 275

ANDRIUS SMALIUKAS

15 Bank loan contracts in Polish law: the legal position of the borrower 289

STANISLAWA KALUS AND MAGDALENA HABDAS

16 Financial contracts and 'junk title' purchases: a matter of (in)correct information 308

CRISTINA AMATO



CONTENTS

vii

17 Kickback payments under MiFID: substantive or procedural standard of unconscionability? 326

AXEL HALFMEIER AND PETER ROTT

18 Unfairness under the Consumer Protection from Unfair Trading Regulations 2008 350

CHRIS WILLETT

Conclusions 375

19 Conceptualising unconscionability in Europe: in the kaleidoscope of private and public law 377

MEL KENNY, JAMES DEVENNEY AND LORNA FOX O'MAHONY

Index 400



CONTRIBUTORS

CRISTINA AMATO

Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Brescia

IMMACULADA BARRAL-VIÑALS
Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Barcelona

DAVID CAPPER Reader in Law, Queen's University, Belfast

PETER CARTWRIGHT

Professor of Consumer Protection Law, School of Law, University of Nottingham

OLHA O. CHEREDNYCHENKO

Senior Lecturer in Private Law, Centre for Law and Governance, Faculty of Law, VU University of Amsterdam

AURELIA COLOMBI CIACCHI

Reader in Law, Centre for European Law and Politics, University of Bremen

JAMES DEVENNEY

Deputy Head Durham Law School and Director of the Durham University Institute of Commercial and Corporate Law

KAREN FAIRWEATHER

Graduate Teaching Assistant, Durham Law School

viii



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19053-4 - Unconscionability in European Private Financial Transactions:

Protecting the Vulnerable

Edited by Mel Kenny, James Devenney and Lorna Fox O'Mahony

Frontmatter

More information

CONTRIBUTORS

ix

MAGDALENA HABDAS

Lecturer in Law, Faculty of Law and Administration, Department of Civil and Private International Law, University of Silesia, Katowice

AXEL HALFMEIER

Professor of German and International Private and Economic Law, Frankfurt School of Finance and Management

STANISLAW KALUS

Professor of Law, Faculty of Law and Administration, Department of Civil and Private International Law, University of Silesia, Katowice

MEL KENNY

Reader in Commercial Law, University of Leicester

SARAH NIELD

Reader, School of Law, University of Southampton

LORNA FOX O'MAHONY

Professor of Law, Durham Law School

PETER ROTT

Associate Professor in European Private Law, University of Copenhagen

SÉVERINE SAINTIER

Senior Lecturer, School of Law, University of Sheffield

ANDRIUS SMALIUKAS

Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, Vilnius University; Attorney at Law: Varul, Vilgerts, Smaliukas (Vilnius)

WARREN SWAIN

Lecturer in Law, Durham Law School

EMMANUEL VOYIAKIS

Lecturer in Law, Brunel Law School; Barrister (Greece)

STEPHEN WADDAMS

Goodman Schipper Chair, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto



x

CONTRIBUTORS

JOHN WIGHTMAN Senior Lecturer, Kent Law School

CHRIS WILLETT
Professor of Consumer Law, Leicester de Montfort Law School

TONI WILLIAMS
Professor of Law, Kent Law School

QI ZHOU Lecturer in Law, University of Sheffield