

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-18638-4 - International Authority and the Responsibility to Protect

Anne Orford

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTERNATIONAL AUTHORITY AND THE RESPONSIBILITY TO PROTECT

The idea that states and the international community have a responsibility to protect populations at risk has framed internationalist debates about conflict prevention, humanitarian aid, peacekeeping and territorial administration since 2001. This book situates the responsibility to protect concept in a broad historical and jurisprudential context, demonstrating that the appeal to protection as the basis for de facto authority has emerged at times of civil war or revolution – the protestant revolutions of early modern Europe, the bourgeois and communist revolutions of the following centuries and the revolution that is decolonisation. This analysis, from Hobbes to the UN, of the resulting attempts to ground authority on the capacity to guarantee security and protection is essential reading for all those seeking to understand, engage with, limit or critique the expansive practices of international executive action authorised by the responsibility to protect concept.

ANNE ORFORD is the Michael D. Kirby Professor of International Law, an Australian Research Council Professorial Fellow and Director of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at the University of Melbourne.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-18638-4 - International Authority and the Responsibility to Protect

Anne Orford

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTERNATIONAL AUTHORITY AND THE RESPONSIBILITY TO PROTECT

ANNE ORFORD



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-18638-4 - International Authority and the Responsibility to Protect

Anne Orford

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521199995

© Anne Orford 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Orford, Anne.

International authority and the responsibility to protect / Anne Orford.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-19999-5 – ISBN 978-0-521-18638-4 (pbk)

1. International police. 2. Peacekeeping forces. 3. Intervention
(International law) I. Title.

KZ6374.O74 2011

341.3–dc22

2010039189

ISBN 978-0-521-19999-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-18638-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to
in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements *page vii*

1 Protection in the Shadow of Empire **1**

 The role of the UN in the decolonised world 3

 From deeds into words: systematising peace and protection 6

 The powers of the international executive under the UN Charter 10

 The responsibility to protect and the question of authority 13

 From endorsement to implementation 17

 The normative significance of the responsibility to protect concept 22

 Humanitarian intervention, police action and the responsibility to protect 27

 Recognition, protection and authority: chapter overview 34

2 Practices of Protection: From the Parliament of Man to International Executive Rule **42**

 From conference diplomacy to executive action 44

 Neutrality, impartiality and the international civil servant 47

 The space of empire: the UN experiment at Suez 57

 Protecting life and maintaining order: the United Nations in the Congo 69

 The master texts of executive action 87

 The expansion of executive rule and the challenge to international authority 90

 The responsibility to protect and the legacy of Hammarskjöld 103

3	How to Recognise Lawful Authority: Hobbes, Schmitt and the Responsibility to Protect	109
	Civil war and the turn to protection	109
	Thomas Hobbes, natural law and the preservation of life	112
	Carl Schmitt, the European order and protection as war	125
	International executive rule and the politics of protection	133
4	Who Decides? Who Interprets?: Jurisdiction, Recognition and the Institutionalisation of Protection	139
	Jurisdiction, control and the modern state	143
	Completing the Reformation: Hobbes, Bellarmine and the struggle of institutions	150
	Recognition, revolution and the family of nations	161
	International jurisdiction and decolonisation: from form to function	164
	Jurisdiction, recognition and the responsibility to protect	178
	Law, politics and the conflict of competences	186
5	The Question of Status and the Subject of Protection	189
	The crisis of parliamentary democracy in international relations	189
	The impossibility of neutrality	192
	Rethinking functionalism	196
	The form of international rule	199
	The question of status	205
	Revolution, counter-revolution and the future of international law	207
	Institutionalising protection: the work of law and politics	210
	<i>Bibliography</i>	213
	<i>Index</i>	231

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-18638-4 - International Authority and the Responsibility to Protect

Anne Orford

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the Australian Research Council, which awarded me a fellowship to undertake research on a project entitled ‘Cosmopolitanism and the Future of International Law’ from 2007 to 2011. This book is part of that broader project.

My thanks go to colleagues and doctoral students at Melbourne Law School, particularly those associated with the Institute for International Law and the Humanities, for the conversations that have enriched my thinking on this project and for the camaraderie that has enriched my working life. Early work on the book was undertaken as an Edward Clarence Dyason Fellow at the Faculty of Law, Lund University and I am very grateful to Gregor Noll, Dean Per Ole Tråskman and the faculty at Lund for their hospitality. The book was largely completed while I was in residence at Queen’s College, University of Melbourne, and I am grateful to the Master of Queen’s College, David Runia, and to my colleague Margaret Young for making that stay possible. The final stages of editing and proofing of the manuscript were undertaken in the wonderful peace of the Radcliffe Camera and I would like to thank Dean Timothy Endicott for enabling my visit to Oxford in June 2010.

I am particularly grateful to Martti Koskenniemi for his generous and energetic engagement with this argument in its many and varied forms, to Andrew Robertson for insightful comments on (many) earlier versions of these chapters and to Finola O’Sullivan at Cambridge University Press for her ongoing support for the project and her patience in the face of shifting deadlines for the submission of the manuscript. My warm thanks also to Aidan Hehir for the opportunity to present this work at the University of Westminster and to the audience at that seminar, particularly David Chandler, for critical engagement with the project; to Brett O’Bannon for inviting me to be part of the rich conversation at his symposium on ‘Imperfect Duties? Humanitarian Intervention in Africa and the Responsibility to Protect in a Post-Iraq Era’ held at the Prindle

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-18638-4 - International Authority and the Responsibility to Protect

Anne Orford

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Institute for Ethics, DePauw University; to Philip Lorenz and the participants at his Theo-Political Renaissance workshop held at Cornell University Department of English for responses to material from Chapter 3 on Hobbes, Schmitt and the early modern state; to Susan Zimmerman and Karin Fischer for the opportunity to present this work in its early stages as part of a joint lecture series programme at the Institute for International Development, University of Vienna and at the Department of History, Central European University, Budapest; to Richard Falk, Vesselin Popovski and Ramesh Thakur for the invitation to write a paper on the responsibility to protect which was the initial impetus for this book; and to Hilary Charlesworth and Ann Genovese for many forms of intellectual and practical advice and support. I have also presented talks drawn from work on this project over the past four years at the Australian National University, Brown University, the joint meeting of the Indian Society of International Law and the Australian and New Zealand Society of International Law, Jindal Global Law School, the London School of Economics and Political Science, Lund University, the University of Hong Kong, the University of Melbourne, the University of Michigan, the University of Oxford, the University of Stockholm, the University of Toronto and Uppsala University. My argument has benefited enormously from formal and informal discussions at and around those presentations.

My thanks to the staff at Melbourne Law School Library, Kungliga Biblioteket in Stockholm and the National Archives in Kew for their help in accessing resources and archival material related to this project. I also benefited from a chance virtual encounter with Steve Askin through Amazon and feel privileged to have been able to use parts of the library on Congo put together by his late wife Carole Collins. I am very grateful to Sara Dehm and Mary Quinn for their excellent editorial and proofing assistance, and in addition to Sara Dehm for creating the bibliography. My thanks also to Vesna Stefanovski for the efficient and cheerful way in which she has kept the Institute for International Law and the Humanities running smoothly during my lengthening periods of absent-mindedness (and, by the end, absence) while I finalised this manuscript.

Chapter 4 includes revised material originally published in Anne Orford, 'Jurisdiction without Territory: From the Holy Roman Empire to the Responsibility to Protect' (2009) 30 *Michigan Journal of International Law* 981, and Chapter 5 includes material originally published in Anne Orford, 'International Territorial Administration and the Management of Decolonization' (2010) 59 *International and Comparative Law Quarterly*

227. An early version of the argument developed in Chapter 3 is forthcoming as Anne Orford, ‘Lawful Authority and the Responsibility to Protect’ in Richard Falk, Ramesh Thakur and Vesselin Popovski (eds.), *Legality and Legitimacy in International Order* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, forthcoming).

Finally, my love and thanks to Andrew, Hamish and Felix – your wonderful company, good humour and encouragement helped me to write this book, and the thought of having more time to spend with you helped me to finish it.