

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CATHOLICISM CONTENDING WITH MODERNITY

Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

This book is a case study in the ongoing struggle of Christianity to define its relationship to modernity, examining representative Roman Catholic Modernists and anti-Modernists, and exploring their relationship to their own historical context. Its aim is to counteract the tendency to lift the proposals made by the Modernists out of their setting and define them as a coherent, timeless philosophical/theological outlook which should be avoided. The book seeks to correct the proclivity of some contemporary proponents of Modernist ideas to de-contextualize those ideas and recommend their endorsement without a critical reconsideration of historical changes. It sketches the nineteenth-century background of the Modernist crisis, identifying the problems that the church was facing at the beginning of the twentieth century; and offers a fresh perspective on the Modernist crisis, a perspective arising from the pioneering work undertaken by the Roman Catholic Modernism Working Group of the American Academy of Religion.

DARRELL JODOCK is Bernhardson Professor of Lutheran Studies at Gustavus Adolphus College, St. Peter, Minnesota, and author of *The Church's Bible: Its Contemporary Authority* (1989) and editor and co-author of *Ritschl in Retrospect: History Community and Science* (1995). Until 1999 he taught at Muhlenberg College, Allentown, Pennsylvania. Founder of the Institute for Jewish-Christian Understanding at Muhlenberg, he served as the Chairman of its Board from 1989 to 1999. Since 1988 Professor Jodock has served on the steering committee of the Roman Catholic Modernism Seminar of the American Academy of Religion, as well as a variety of committees within the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism
and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CATHOLICISM CONTENDING WITH MODERNITY

*Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism
in Historical Context*

EDITED BY

DARRELL JODOCK



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism
and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521175029

© Cambridge University Press 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

First paperback edition 2011

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Catholicism contending with modernity: Roman Catholic modernism and anti-modernism in
historical context / edited by Darrell Jodock.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 77071 8 (hardback)

I. Modernism (Christian theology) – Catholic Church – History.

I. Jodock, Darrell, 1941–.

BX1396.C39 2000

273'.9 – dc21 00–34666 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-77071-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-17502-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism
and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	viii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	x
<i>Note on the text</i>	xiv
Introduction I: The Modernist crisis <i>Darrell Jodock</i>	 1
Introduction II: The Modernists and the anti-Modernists <i>Darrell Jodock</i>	 20
PART I: THE LATE NINETEENTH-CENTURY SETTING OF MODERNISM AND ANTI-MODERNISM	 29
1 Vatican foreign policy and the origins of Modernism <i>Gary Lease</i>	 31
2 Catholic anti-Modernism: the ecclesial setting <i>Paul Misner</i>	 56
3 Theological and philosophical Modernism <i>Gabriel Daly, O.S.A.</i>	 88
PART II: MAURICE BLONDEL AND ALFRED LOISY IN FRANCE	113
4 Seeking transcendence in the modern world <i>Phyllis H. Kaminski</i>	 115
5 Blondel's <i>Action</i> and the problem of the University <i>George H. Tavard</i>	 142
6 The politics of Loisy's Modernist theology <i>Harvey Hill</i>	 169

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism
and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

LIST OF CONTENTS

7	Innovation and biblical interpretation <i>C. J. T. Talar</i>	191
PART III: FRIEDRICH VON HÜGEL AND MAUDE PETRE IN ENGLAND		213
8	The Modernist as mystic <i>Lawrence Barmann</i>	215
9	English Catholicism and Modernism <i>Ellen M. Leonard, C.S.J.</i>	248
PART IV: SOCIAL MODERNISM AND ANTI-MODERNISM IN FRANCE		275
10	Social modernism: the case of the <i>Semaines sociales</i> <i>Peter Bernardi, S.J.</i>	277
11	Anti-Modernism and the elective affinity between politics and philosophy <i>Michael J. Kerlin</i>	308
	Conclusion <i>Darrell Jodock</i>	337
	<i>Index</i>	341

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

LAWRENCE BARMANN, *Professor, Departments of American Studies and Theological Studies, St. Louis University, St. Louis, Missouri.*

PETER BERNARDI, *S.J., Assistant Professor, Department of Religious Studies, Loyola University of New Orleans, New Orleans, Louisiana.*

GABRIEL DALY, *O.S.A., School of Hebrew, Biblical, and Theological Studies, Trinity College, Dublin, Ireland.*

HARVEY HILL, *Assistant Professor, Department of Religion and Philosophy, Berry College, Mount Berry, Georgia.*

DARRELL JODOCK, *Professor, Religion Department, Gustavus Adolphus College, St. Peter, Minnesota.*

PHYLLIS H. KAMINSKI, *Associate Professor, Department of Religious Studies, St. Mary's College, Notre Dame, Indiana.*

MICHAEL J. KERLIN, *Professor and Chair of the Philosophy Department, LaSalle University, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.*

GARY LEASE, *Professor, History of Consciousness Department, University of California, Santa Cruz, California.*

ELLEN M. LEONARD, *C.S.J., Professor, Faculty of Theology, University of St. Michael's College, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.*

PAUL MISNER, *Professor, Department of Theology, Marquette University, Milwaukee, Wisconsin.*

C. J. T. TALAR, *Professor, St. Mary's Seminary and University, Baltimore, Maryland.*

GEORGE H. TAVARD, *Professor Emeritus, Methodist Theological School in Ohio, Delaware, Ohio.*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Not many things that we humans do are accomplished in isolation from others, and this collaborative project is certainly no exception. Many have contributed to it.

Most obvious are the authors of the various chapters. They have been splendid colleagues – cooperative, diligent, insightful, good-humored, and patient with their editor. Thank you.

Preliminary drafts of the papers found in this volume were reviewed and discussed at the 1994, 1995, and 1996 sessions of the American Academy of Religion Roman Catholic Modernism Seminar. Those sessions included formal respondents. Although their responses do not appear in this volume, their contributions were significant and deserve to be acknowledged with appreciation. The following persons served as respondents (listed in chronological order):

THOMAS KSELMAN, *University of Notre Dame, Indiana*
 THOMAS F. O'MEARA, *University of Notre Dame, Indiana*
 JAMES G. LIVINGSTON, *The College of William and Mary, Virginia*
 C. J. T. TALAR, *then at Alvernia College, Pennsylvania; now at St. Mary's Seminary and University, Maryland*
 WENDELL DIETRICH, *Brown University, Rhode Island*
 LORETTA M. DEVOY, *St. John's University, New York*
 BRIAN J. KELTY, *Australian Catholic University, Australia*
 KENNETH L. PARKER, *St. Louis University, Missouri*
 NADIA M. LAHUTSKY, *Texas Christian University, Texas*
 JOHN A. MCGRATH, *University of Dayton, Ohio*
 STEPHEN HAPPEL, *Catholic University, Washington, D.C.*
 DAVID G. SCHULTENOVER, *Creighton University, Nebraska*
 WILLIAM POITIER, *Mount St. Mary's College, Maryland*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ix

The members and the steering committee of the Roman Catholic Modernism Group of the American Academy of Religion deserve a great deal of credit for initiating, supporting, and encouraging the project. They have provided the crucible within which its ideas took shape. Without the lively discussions in that Group and the considered suggestions of its members, the chapters would neither be as strong nor as interesting as they now are.

Professor George Gilmore, Spring Hill College, Alabama, handled the logistics of collecting, printing, and distributing drafts of the papers prior to the 1994, 1995, and 1996 Annual Meetings of the American Academy of Religion. It was an important, albeit unheralded, contribution.

Two members of that Group deserve special recognition for the careful advice and counsel that they gave me on several occasions regarding the design of the project: James C. Livingston of the College of William and Mary in Virginia and Paul Misner of Marquette University in Wisconsin.

Another source of good counsel has been Kevin Taylor, Senior Commissioning Editor at Cambridge University Press. During the review and the approval of the manuscript, a number of questions and dilemmas arose. I soon learned I could count on him to seek out appropriate information and to make judicious decisions. For his assistance and good judgment I am grateful.

My thanks to secretary *extraordinaire*, Mrs. Elsie Schmoyer, for the hours she spent re-formatting the essays. As always, she worked with care and good humor and kindly brought to my attention things that I had missed.

And last, but certainly not least, my profound thanks to Muhlenberg College for providing me with the setting and the support to undertake the task and to Gustavus Adolphus College for providing a new setting in which to complete it.

Gustavus Adolphus College, St. Peter, Minnesota

DARRELL JODOCK

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

For works cited in more than one chapter

- Barmann, *Baron* Lawrence F. Barmann. *Baron Friedrich von Hügel and the Modernist Crisis in England*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1972.
- Blondel, *Action* Maurice Blondel. *Action: Essay on a Critique of Life and a Science of Practice*. Translated by Oliva Blanchetti. Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1984. English translation of *L'Action: essai d'une critique de la vie et d'une science de la pratique*, 1893. Most recently published in Maurice Blondel, *Œuvres complètes*, vol. 1: 1893 *Les Deux Thèses*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1995.
- Blondel, *Letter* A. Dru and I. Trethowan (eds.). *Maurice Blondel: The Letter on Apologetics and History and Dogma*. London: Harvill Press, 1964. Reprinted: Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1994. English translation of Maurice Blondel, *Lettre sur les exigences de la pensée contemporaine en matière d'apologétique* (1896) in *Les Premiers Ecrits de Maurice Blondel*. Vol. II. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1956.
- Blondel, *LSS* Maurice Blondel. *La Semaine sociale de Bordeaux et le monophorisme*. Paris: Bloud &

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of abbreviations*

xi

- Gay, 1910. Reprint of a series of articles published between October 1909 and May 1910 under the pseudonym of “Testis” in the *Annales de philosophie chrétienne* 159 (October 1909), 5–22; (November) 162–184; (December) 245–278; (January 1910) 372–392; (February) 449–472; (March), 561–592; and 160 (May 1910), 127–162.
- Chadwick, *Secularization* Owen Chadwick. *The Secularization of the European Mind in the Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975.
- Daly, *Transcendence* Gabriel Daly. *Transcendence and Immanence: A Study in Catholic Modernism and Integralism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980.
- Fitzer (ed.), *Romance* Joseph Fitzer (ed.). *Romance and the Rock: Nineteenth-Century Catholics on Faith and Reason*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1989.
- Jenkins (ed.), *Newman* Arthur H. Jenkins (ed.). *John Henry Newman and Modernism*. Sigmaringendorf: Glock und Lutz, 1990. Special issue of *Internationale Cardinal-Newman-Studien*.
- Keylor, *Academy* William R. Keylor. *Academy and Community: The Foundation of the French Historical Profession*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1975.
- Komonchak, “Modernity” Joseph A. Komonchak. “Modernity and the Construction of Roman Catholicism.” *Modernism as a Social Construct*. Papers of the American Academy of Religion Working Group on Roman Catholic Modernism. Mobile, Alabama: Spring Hill College, 1991. Pp. 11–41.
- Kurtz, *Politics* Lester R. Kurtz. *The Politics of Heresy: The Modernist Crisis in Roman Catholicism*. Berkeley, California: The University of California Press, 1986.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

- Loisy, *Autour* Alfred Loisy. *Autour d'un petit livre*. Paris: Alphonse Picard et Fils, 1903.
- Loisy, *Duel* Alfred Loisy. *My Duel with the Vatican*. Translated by Richard Wilson Boynton. New York: E. P. Dutton & Company, 1924. Reprinted: New York: Greenwood Press, 1968. English translation of *Choses passées*. Paris: Nourry, 1913.
- Loisy, *Gospel* Alfred Loisy. *The Gospel and the Church*. New edition with a prefatory memoir by the Rev. G. Tyrrell. Translated by Christopher Home. London: Pitman & Sons, 1908. Reprinted: Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1976. English translation of *L'Évangile et l'Église*. Paris: Alphonse Picard et Fils, 1902.
- Loisy, *Histoire* Alfred Loisy. *Histoire du canon d'Ancien Testament*. Paris: Letouzey, 1890. Reprinted: Frankfurt: Minerva G.M.B.H., 1971.
- Loisy, *Mémoires* Alfred Loisy. *Mémoires pour servir à l'histoire religieuse de notre temps*. Paris: Nourry, 1930–31. 3 vols.
- Loome, *Liberal* Thomas M. Loome. *Liberal Catholicism, Reform Catholicism, Modernism: A Contribution to a New Orientation in Modernist Research*. Mainz: Grünewald, 1979.
- McCool, *Catholic* Gerald A. McCool. *Catholic Theology in the Nineteenth Century: The Quest for a Unitary Method*. New York: Seabury Press, 1977. Republished as *Nineteenth-Century Scholasticism*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1989.
- Misner, *Social* Paul Misner. *Social Catholicism in Europe: From the Onset of Industrialization to the First World War*. New York: Crossroad, 1991.
- O'Connell, *Critics* Marvin R. O'Connell. *Critics on Trial: An Introduction to the Catholic Modernist Crisis*. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University Press of America, 1994.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of abbreviations*

xiii

- Petre, *Life* Maude D. Petre. *Autobiography and Life of George Tyrrell*. London: Arnold, 1912. 2 vols.
- Poulat, *Histoire* Emile Poulat. *Histoire, dogme et critique dans la crise moderniste*. Second edition. Paris: Casterman, 1979.
- Schultenover, *View* David Schultenover. *A View from Rome*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1993.
- Tyrrell, *Medievalism* George Tyrrell. *Medievalism: A Reply to Cardinal Mercier*. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1909. Reprinted: Tunbridge Wells: Burns & Oates, 1994, with a foreword by Gabriel Daly.
- Tyrrell, *Scylla* George Tyrrell. *Through Scylla and Charybdis; or, The Old Theology and the New*. London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1907.
- Vidler, *Variety* Alec. R. Vidler. *A Variety of Catholic Modernists*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.
- Virgoulay, *Blondel* René Virgoulay. *Blondel et le Modernisme: la philosophie de l'action et les sciences religieuses (1896–1913)*. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1980.
- Von Hügel, *Eternal* Baron Friedrich von Hügel. *Eternal Life: A Study of Its Implications and Applications*. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1912.
- Von Hügel, *Letters* Bernard Holland (ed.). *Baron Friedrich von Hügel: Selected Letters, 1896–1924*. London: Dent, 1928.
- Von Hügel, *Mystical* Baron Friedrich von Hügel. *The Mystical Element of Religion as Studied in Saint Catherine of Genoa and Her Friends*. Second edition. London: Dent, 1923. 2 vols.
- Weisz, *Emergence* George Weisz. *The Emergence of Modern Universities in France, 1863–1914*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1983.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-17502-9 - Catholicism Contending with Modernity: Roman Catholic Modernism
and Anti-Modernism in Historical Context

Edited by Darrell Jodock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Note on the text

Chapter 8, 'The Modernist as mystic' by Lawrence Barmann, was published in substantially the same form in the October 1997 issue of the *Zeitschrift für Neuere Theologiegeschichte / Journal for the History of Modern Theology* (Walter de Gruyter, Berlin).