CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Index

Accommodation approach to federalism, 109–110, 197–198, 200
Accountability, lack of, 39–40, 300
Ackerman, Bruce, 295, 296
Adenauer, Konrad, 116
Administrative acts, judicial review of, 113–114
Adygei, 226
Age discrimination cases
  First RCC and
    damages, 203–204
    judicial review,
    Russian constitution, under, 112
  judges, retirement age for (*See* Tenure of judges)
Akaev, Askar, 262
Albania, constitutional court in, 2, 259
Alcohol license fees, 211–212
Alekseev, Sergei, 60, 95, 98–99
All-Russian Center for the Study of Public Opinion, 248
All-Russian Congress of Judges, 133, 212
Ambiguity, constitutional rights and, 177–178
Ametistov, Ernest
  Constitutional Convention of 1993, role at, 73, 74
  impeachment of Yeltsin, on, 108
  individuals, on petitions by, 114
  retirement age cases, on, 203
Amnesty, suits against acts of, 159–160
Argentina
  nonlinear judicial empowerment in, 24
  tenure of judges in, 264
Armenia
  constitutional court in, 263
  CSC and, 96
Arrest power
  Russian constitution, under, 213
  Second RCC and, 133–134, 213–214
Audit Chamber, 131–132
Australia, federalism in, 142
Austria, constitutional court in, 28
Azerbaijan
  constitutional court in, 261
  CSC and, 96

Baglai, Marat
  appointment of, 118
  chair of Second RCC, as, 119
  Chechnya, on, 119
  constitutional rights, on, 158
  mass media, on, 252–253
  presidential decrees, on, 222
  social justice, on, 181
  Tatarstan referendum, on, 197
  tenure of judges and, 86
Bakiev, Kurmanbek, 262
Bankruptcy, Second RCC and, 169
Bashkortostan, 168, 196, 206, 219, 224, 225–227
Belarus, constitutional court in, 2, 23, 271
Breyer, Stephen, 8, 36
Brozova, Iva, 281
Bulgaria
  constitutional court in, 1, 2, 40
  judicial review in, 190
  "War of the Courts" in, 268

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Cabinet
alcohol license fees, 211–212
Stalinist purges, and victims of, 241, 242–243
taxation and, 154
Canada
federalism in, 142, 287
impact of jurisprudence, 176
judicial review in, 50
Capital punishment, Second RCC and, 163
Central Elections Commission, 137–138, 171, 172
Chavez, Rebecca, 24, 285
Chechnya
public opinion regarding, 197
Second RCC and
federalism, 142, 144, 221
mass media, in, 252
separation of powers, 128–129
short-term policy making and, 8
Chelyabinsk, 198–199
Chernobyl, 178–179, 240
Chernomyrdin, Viktor, 212, 221
Civil Procedure Code, 153
Civil rights, CSC and, 97–98
Coexistence of courts, 283–284
Collective complaints, 161
Communist Party
First RCC and
ban of party, case regarding, 103, 106–107, 192–193
opposition to, 66–68
support for, 64
referendum process and, 137–138, 172
Second RCC, support for, 80
Communist Russia. *See* Soviet Union
Comparison of Russian courts, 10–11
Compliance
capacity of state machinery, 41
CSC, with (*See* Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC))
decision making, effect on, 23, 33
design, effect on, 22–23
executive decree, and rule by, 36–37
First RCC, with (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
institutional uncertainty, impact of, 189
judicial appointments and, 223–225
judicial empowerment and problems in, 8
overview, 188
presidential decrees, importance of, 222–223
problems in, 33–34
prosecutors, problems with, 232
routine obedience, ensuring, 36–37
Second RCC, with (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
short-term policy making and, 301
strategic approach, under, 49–50
strategies for success, 188–189
threat to vital interests, impact of, 34–35
trial procedures, problems with, 232–233
unpopular decisions, 34–35
values of ruling authorities, impact of, 34
Conference of European Constitutional Courts, 229
Conflict of laws, 136
Congress of People's Deputies
dissolution by Yeltsin, 74–75, 108
First RCC and
opposition to, 66–68
role in establishing, 61–62
separation of powers, 106
referendum regarding, 193–195
Constitutional/charter courts, 218–219
Constitutional Commission, 61–62, 63–64
Constitutional Convention of 1993
appointments to RCC at, 75–77
compromise at, 79
convening of, 73–74, 193–195
expansion of judicial review at, 78–79
jurisdiction of RCC at, 77
limits on authority of RCC at, 75, 77–78
new draft by Yeltsin, 73
preservation of RCC at, 75–77
tenure of judges, changes in, 75
threats to authority of RCC at, 73–74
Constitutional courts. *See also specific state*
authoritarian states, in, 2
comparison of Russian courts, 10–11
Constitutional Supervision Committee (*See* Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC))
First Russian Constitutional Court (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
hybrid states, in, 2
international context, 12–13
judicial pluralism (*See* "War of the Courts")
legal *versus* ethical authority, 35–36

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

nondemocratic states, in, 2
other states, Russian courts compared with courts in, 12–13
overview, 1–2
purposes of, 19
scholarly debate regarding Russian experience, 12
Second Russian Constitutional Court (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
tables, 3
toleration by authoritarian rulers, 6
uniqueness of Russian experience, 10, 296
"War of the Courts" (*See* "War of the Courts")
Constitutional review. *See* Judicial review
Constitutional rights. *See also specific right*
ambiguity and, 177–178
CSC, compliance with, 190
fairness and (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
First RCC and (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
proportional restrictions on (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
Second RCC and (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
vagueness and, 177–178
"War of the Courts," effect of, 284
Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC)
civil rights cases in, 97–98
compliance with
constitutional rights, in, 190
First RCC compared, 191
judicial heteronomy theory, 190–191
lessons from failure of, 191
poor performance, 190–191
republics, resistance from, 189–190
consumer rights cases in, 97
decision making by, 95–99
dissolution, 61
establishment of, 58
extrajudicial behavior of, 98–99
First RCC compared
compliance, 191
decision making, 99–100
extrajudicial behavior, 98–99
statutory authorization, 64–66
strength of, 63–64
Gorbachev and, 58
judicial review, weakness of, 59, 95–96
labor cases in, 97
legal elites in, 59–61
political weakness of, 99
Procuracy and, 68
propiska and, 97–98
proposals for, 57
purposes of, 58
radical political change, impact of, 58–59
republics and, 58–59, 95–97
residence permits and, 97–98
Soviet Union, effect of weakness of, 61
strategic behavior of, 98
wrongful dismissal cases in, 97
Consumer rights, CSC and, 97
Contract rights, Second RCC and, 166–168
Council of Europe, 43, 44, 228
Coup of August 1991, 60–61
Court design. *See* Design
Criminal procedure
arrest power
Russian constitution, under, 213
Second RCC and, 133–134, 213–214
First RCC and, 111–112
judges, complaints for damages against, 233–234
prosecutors, compliance problems, 232
search and seizure, Second RCC and, 133–134
sentencing, fairness in, 180–181
separation of powers, Second RCC and, 133–134, 213–214
siloviki, power of, 234–235
trial procedures, compliance problems, 232–233
Criminal Procedure Code, 204, 213–214, 230–232
Croatia, constitutional court in, 176
CSC. *See* Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC)
Customs officials, confiscation of property by, 239–240
Czechoslovakia, constitutional court in, 28, 190
Czech Republic
constitutional court in, 40
"War of the Courts" in
assumption of jurisdiction by constitutional court, 270, 276–277

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Czech Republic (*cont.*)
criticism of constitutional court, 277
judicial appointments and, 281–282
lack of referrals to constitutional court, 277–278
legalistic explanation, 268
military service cases, 278–280
noncompliance with constitutional court, 277
overview, 51, 52, 220
progressive/reactionary explanation, 268, 269
purge of Communists and, 276
resolution of, 281
timeline, 279

Dagestan, 144, 158, 226
Decision making
authoritativeness of, 37–38
compliance, effect on, 23
CSC, in, 95–99. (*See also* Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC))
design, effect on, 21–22
discretion in, 31
extrajudicial behavior
CSC, of, 98–99
First RCC, of, 115
politics and, 31–32
First RCC, in (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
institutional uncertainty, impact of, 40–41
overview, 93–94
political context, 30–31
Second RCC, in (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
short-term policy making and, 301
Delegation of power, 47–49
Democratization and nonlinear judicial empowerment, 52
Design
compliance, effect on, 21
Constitutional Convention of 1993 (*See* Constitutional Convention of 1993)
CSC, of (*See* Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC))
decision making, effect on, 21
difficulties in, 90–91
First RCC, of (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
legal elites, significance of, 286
overview, 54–55
rule of law, effect on, 21
Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994 (*See* Russian Constitutional Court act of 1994)
Second RCC, of (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
short-term policy making and, 54–55, 91–92, 301
Disability payments, Second RCC and, 178–179
Discretion in decision making, 31
Duma. *See* State Duma
Dynamic analysis of judicial empowerment, 19–21

Ebzeev, Boris
chair of First RCC, on, 100
Constitutional Convention of 1993, role at, 73, 74
constitutional rights, on, 163
European Court of Human Rights, on, 176
federalism, on, 109
regional law making, on, 151
Economic rights, Second RCC and, 178
Egypt
constitutional court in, 261
judicial independence in, 33
nonlinear judicial empowerment in, 24
Elections
electoral rights, 244
gerrymandering, 244
local officials, of, 149–150, 152–153, 155–156
proportional restrictions on rights
campaigning, 172–173
dispute resolution, 171–172
mass media and, 172–173
referendum process, 172
State Duma, 170–171
referendum process
Communist Party and, 137–138, 172
Congress of People's Deputies, regarding, 193–195
Tatarstan referendum, 109, 195–197
Employment Act, 182
Enforcement of decisions. *See* Compliance
Epp, Charles R., 292
Epstein, Lee, 11

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Ersson, Svante, 42
Estonia, constitutional court in, 2
European Convention on Human Rights, 163, 174–176, 233, 278
European Court of Human Rights
  appeals to, 162
  avoidance of, 234
  effect of litigation on reputation of Russia, 187
  encouragement of human rights, 158
  increase in petitions to, 291
  Putin on, 229
  Romania in, 272
  Second RCC and
    citation of decisions by, 174–176
    study of decisions by, 228
  speedy trial requirements, 125
  "War of the Courts" and, 275–276, 293
European Union, 43
Extension of terms of judges, 261, 262–264
Extrajudicial behavior
  CSC, of, 98–99
  First RCC, of, 115
  politics and, 31–32

Fairness. *See* Second Russian Constitutional Court
Federal Budget Code, 154
Federalism. *See also* Regions (Russia)
  First RCC and (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
  fiscal federalism
    First RCC and, 199–200
    Second RCC and, 145–146, 154–155
  historical context of, 139–140
  local self-government, 155–156, 244–245
  matryoshka federalism, 140
  Russian constitution and, 140
  Second RCC and (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
  symmetrical federalism, 221
  "War of the Courts" and, 293–294
Federal Migration Service, 246
Federation Council
  composition of, 210
  relocation of Second RCC, resistance to Putin proposals regarding, 89–90
  retirement and tenure of judges, resistance to Putin proposals regarding, 86
  Second RCC and
    appointments to, 81, 82–85
    conflict with, 209
  separation of powers and, 209
  State Duma, disputes with, 130–131
  taxation and, 154
Federation Treaty, 109
Feeley, Malcolm, 141
Filatov, Sergei, 76
First Russian Constitutional Court. *See also specific justice*
  administrative acts, judicial review of, 113–114
  age discrimination cases
    damages, 203–204
    judicial review,
    Russian constitution, under, 112
  appointments to
    Constitutional Convention of 1993, at, 75–77
    initial appointments, 69–71
    Yeltsin, by, 69–70, 75–77
  authority of, 66
  avoidance of political cases, 103–104
  caseload, 103
  Communist Party, case regarding ban of, 103, 106–107, 192–193
  compliance with
    constitutional rights, 200–205
    cost–benefit analysis, 195
    CSC compared, 191
    federalism, 195–200
    obstacles to, 202, 205
    overview, 205–206, 290
    political willingness, importance of, 200
    selective political reaction, 195
    separation of powers, 191–195
    strategies for success, 290
  Constitutional Convention of 1993 (*See* Constitutional Convention of 1993)
  constitutional rights and
    compliance, 200–205
    decision making, 111–115
    monetary obligations of government to individuals, 200–202
    Second RCC compared, 158
  criminal procedure and, 111–112
  CSC compared
    compliance, 191
    decision making, 99–100

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

First Russian Constitutional Court (*cont.*)
extrajudicial behavior, 98–99
statutory authorization, 64–66
strength of, 63–64
decision making by
constitutional rights and, 111–115
CSC compared, 99–100
federalism and, 109–111
Second RCC compared, 185
separation of powers and, 104–109
difficulties in establishing, 90–91
dissenting opinions, 104
dissolution of Soviet Union and, 103
extrajudicial behavior of, 115
federalism and
accommodation approach, 109–110, 197–198, 200
Chelyabinsk case, 198–199
compliance, 195–200
decision making, 109–111
fiscal federalism, 199–200
Irkutsk case, 110, 199–200, 206
joint jurisdiction issues, 110
Kabardino-Balkaria case, 110, 223
Mordovia case, 198
Moscow privatization case, 199
overview, 110–111
Second RCC compared, 227–228
subfederal units, 109
Tatarstan referendum, 109, 195–197
impeachment and
power of, 78
Yeltsin, of, 108, 193–195
individuals, petitions by, 111, 113, 114
innovation in, 92
judicial activism in, 92, 100
judicial review in
limitations on, 200
strength of, 100, 105
struggle for, 115
jurisdiction, 77
labor law cases, 112–114
law-application practice and, 68–69, 111, 137, 202–203
legal elites and, 286
legitimacy of, 64
limits on authority of, 75, 77–78
lobbying by, 101
nonbinding decisions by, 101
opposition to
Communist Party, from, 66–68
Congress of People's Deputies, from, 66–68
law enforcement, from, 68–69
Procuracy, from, 68–69
other states compared, 72, 115–116
overestimation of power, 287–288
political fragmentation and, 116–117
political struggles regarding, 72
politicization of, 115–116
president and, 63–64
press, relationship with, 101
privatization and, 103
proactive nature of, 99–100
proposals for, 62–63
publication of decisions, 101–102
Referendum of 1991 and, 66
retirement age cases
damages, 203–204
judicial review, Russian constitution, under, 112
Russian constitution and, 61–62, 71–72
Russian sovereignty and, 63–64
Russian Supreme Court, conflict with
age discrimination cases, 203–204
constitutional rights, over, 114–115
labor law cases, in, 112–114
reasons for, 204–205
retirement age cases, 203–204
wrongful dismissal cases, 202–203
Second RCC compared
constitutional rights, 158
decision making, 185
federalism, 227–228
separation of powers, 138–139
separation of powers and
Communist Party, case regarding ban of, 106–107, 192–193
compliance, 191–195
Congress of People's Deputies, authority of, 106
decision making, 104–109
impeachment of Yeltsin, 108
implied powers of president, 108–109
intraexecutive disputes, 106
intralegislative disputes, 106
joint executive–legislative decrees, 105–106
overview, 104–105
Second RCC compared, 138–139
special governance regime, 107–108, 193–195

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

short-term policy making and, 91–92
statutory authorization, difficulties in, 64–66
suspension of, 1, 74–75, 108–109, 193–195
tenure of judges, changes in, 75
threats to authority of, 73–74
timelines, 65
wrongful dismissal cases
compensation, 202–203
damages, 113
judicial review, 112–113
Fiscal federalism
First RCC and, 199–200
Second RCC and, 145–146, 154–155
Fradkov, Mikhail, 151
France
constitutional court in
First RCC compared, 72
impact of jurisprudence, 176
judicial review, 186
judicial review in, 26
legal elites in, 27
Fundamental rights. *See* Constitutional rights

Gadzhiev, Gadis
constitutional rights, on, 174
economic rights, on, 178
federalism, on, 142, 156, 247
problems in compliance, on, 49
separation of powers, on, 128
taxation cases, on, 183, 237
Ganev, Venelin, 190
Garlicki, Lech, 276
General Procurator, 153–154
Georgia
constitutional court in, 2, 22
"War of the Courts" in, 267
Germany
constitutional court in
caseload, 159
constitutional rights and, 288
dissenting opinions, 121–122
establishment of, 28
financial independence of, 22
hierarchy of rights, 186
impact of jurisprudence, 176
individuals, petitions by, 126
interpretative decisions, 122
intrajudicial disputes, 134
politicization of, 116
politics and, 31
public support for, 50
sessions and chambers, 122
judicial review in, 26
legal elites in, 27
nonlinear judicial empowerment in, 24
Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994 compared, 79
"War of the Courts" in, 270
Gerrymandering, 244
Ginsburg, Tom, 294
Gorbachev, Mikhail
Coup of August 1991 and, 60–61
CSC and, 58
dissolution of Soviet Union, on, 98
joint police/military patrols, on, 96
judicial review and, 56–58
legal elites and, 26–27
mass meetings and demonstrations, on, 95
retirement age, on, 112
rule of law and, 286
Govorin, Boris, 200
Gusliannikov, Vasilii, 198

Higher *Arbitrazh* Court
financial independence of, 212
guiding explanations, 215
reopening of cases, 214–215
Second RCC, conflict with
continuing problems, 290
guiding explanations, 215
regional law making, 216
reopening of cases, 214–215
statutory interpretation, 134–135
taxpayer rights and, 235, 236, 237
Hirschl, Ran, 295, 297
Hobbes, Thomas, 29
Human rights law
judicial review, impact on, 295–296
Second RCC, impact on, 174–176
Human Rights Ombudsman, 78, 246
Hungary
constitutional court in, 1, 40, 51, 116
extension of terms of judges, 263–264
judicial independence in, 33
judicial review in, 202
"War of the Courts" in, 271

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Impeachment
First RCC, powers of, 78
Yeltsin, of, 1, 103, 108, 193–195
Zorkin, of, 206
Implementation of decisions. *See* Compliance
Individual rights. *See* Constitutional rights
Ingushetia, 110, 224–225
Institutional conflict as strengthening courts, 45–47
Institutionalist approach
judicial empowerment, to, 5, 45–46
judicial review, to, 296–297
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 174, 204
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 174
International Labor Organization, 112
International pressure
judicial review, impact on, 295–296
nonlinear judicial empowerment, effect on, 43–44
Second RCC, impact on, 228–229, 286–287
Interpretative decisions, 122–123
Irkutsk, 110, 199–200, 206
Israel
constitutional court in, 263
judicial review in, 50
Italy
constitutional court in, 36, 122, 176
overstaying of terms of judges, 259
"War of the Courts" in, 51, 269, 270, 274, 302

Judicial activism
First RCC, in, 92, 100
Second RCC, in, 92, 122–125
Judicial behavior. *See* Decision making
Judicial empowerment
compliance (*See* Compliance)
decision making (*See* Decision making)
democratization and, 4–5, 6
design (*See* Design)
domestic context, 5
dynamic analysis, 19–21
effectiveness of, 8–9
failures of, 11–12
feedback in, 19–21
institutionalist approach to, 5, 45–46, 296–297
institutional uncertainty, impact of, 9
international context, 4–5
judicial independence compared, 32
"juristocracy" and, 302
linear analysis, 19
nonlinear judicial empowerment (*See* Nonlinear judicial empowerment)
overview, 2–4, 9–10
political context, 41–42
political struggles, in context of, 6–7
public support approach to, 5–6, 50–52
questions regarding, 2–4, 285, 300
resistance to, 302
short-term policy making, impact of, 7–8
strategic approach to, 5, 7, 47–50, 297–299
strategies for survival, 301–302, 303
successes of, 11–12
toleration by authoritarian rulers, 6
Judicial heteronomy theory, 190–191
Judicial independence
judicial empowerment compared, 32
Second RCC, public support for, 251–252
tenure of judges and political commitment to, 264–265
Tsarist Russia, in, 33
variation in, 32–33
Judicial pluralism. *See* "War of the Courts"
Judicial review
administrative acts, of, 113–114
Constitutional Convention of 1993, expansion at, 78–79
CSC, weakness in, 59, 95–96
democratization and, 6
dynamic analysis, 19–21
First RCC, in
limitations on, 200
strength of, 100, 105
struggle for, 115
Gorbachev and, 56–58
human rights law, impact of, 295–296
institutionalist approach to, 296–297
international pressure, impact of, 295–296
legal elites, role of, 25–26
legitimacy of, 28–30
monopolizing by constitutional courts, 272–273
overview, 28
perestroyka and, 56–58
political struggles, arising from, 292
psychological power of, 28–30
public support approach to, 299–300

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Russian exceptionalism and, 295–296
Second RCC, in
growth of, 186
intrajudicial disputes, 137
limitations on, 120–121
proportional restrictions on rights, development of standard via, 169
theories of, 219–220
Soviet Union, in, 56
strategic approach to, 297–298, 299, 300
Tsarist Russia, in, 55–56
uniqueness of Russian experience, 10
"Juristocracy," 11–12, 294–295, 302

Kabardino-Balkaria, 110, 223
Kalmykia, 143, 225
Kasianov, Mikhail, 89
Kazakhstan, constitutional court in, 2, 23
Kazantsev, Sergei, 138, 184
KGB, 105, 192
Khakassia, 143
Khokhriakova, Olga, 181
Khasbulatov, Ruslan, 71, 101, 102–103, 193–195, 196
Kirienko, Sergei, 212, 235
Klaus, Vaclav, 281
Komi, 223
Kononov, Anatolii
Communist Party, on ban of, 107
Constitutional Convention of 1993, role at, 74
constitutional rights, on, 176
impeachment of Yeltsin, on, 108
sentencing, on, 181
Korea
constitutional court in, 159, 166, 176
"War of the Courts" in, 51, 220, 302
Krasnodar, 168
Krug, Peter, 166
Kuchma, Leonid, 263
Kyrgyzstan
constitutional court in, 2, 40, 61
criminal procedure in, 272
shortening of terms of judges, 262
"War of the Courts" in, 267, 270

Labor Code, 203
Labor law
CSC and, 97
First RCC, in, 112–114
Labor Ministry, 242
Labor Pensions Act, 184
Land use statutes, 243–244
Lane, Jan-Erik, 42
Latvia
constitutional court in, 2, 46, 61
CSC and, 96
"War of the Courts" in, 215
Law-application practice, 68, 111, 137, 202–203
Lebed, Alexandr, 221
Legal elites
CSC, in, 59–61
design, significance in, 286
First RCC and, 286
Gorbachev and, 26–27
influence of, 26–27
judicial review, role in rise of, 25–26
other states compared, 27–28
rule of law and, 25–26
Second RCC and, 286
Legislature. *See* Congress of People's Deputies; State Duma
Levitsky, Steven, 255
Linear analysis of judicial empowerment, 19
Lithuania
constitutional court in, 1, 2
CSC and, 96
Local self-government, 155–156, 244–245
Luchin, Viktor
Communist Party, on ban of, 103
dissolution of Soviet Union, on, 103
resignation of, 77
retirement age cases, on, 203
Second RCC, on, 119
separation of powers, on, 128
Lukianov, Anatoliy, 96
Luzhkov, Yuri, 199

Mass media, Second RCC and, 252–253
Matryoshka federalism, 140
Matvienko, Valentina, 88
Mexico, constitutional court in, 8, 31, 34, 52, 300
Ministry of Internal Affairs, 105, 192
Mitchell, Gregory, 23
Mitiukov, Mikhail, 62, 63, 71
Mizulina, Elena, 231

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Moldova
constitutional court in, 2, 23
criminal procedure in, 272
Montesquieu, Charles, 273
Mordovia, 198, 206
Moroz, Oleksandr, 263
Morshchakova, Tamara
compliance, on problems with, 256
Constitutional Convention of 1993, role at, 73, 74
criminal procedure, on, 158
impeachment of Yeltsin, on, 108
individual rights, on, 133
overstaying of term, 258
retirement age cases, on, 203
Second RCC, on, 119
separation of powers, on, 128
tenure of judges and, 86
Moscow privatization case, 199
Moustafa, Tamir, 24

Nagorno-Karabakh, 96
National Salvation Front, 107
Nonlinear judicial empowerment
accountability, and lack of, 39–40
assumptions regarding, 38–39
compliance (*See* Compliance)
decision making (*See* Decision making)
democratization and, 52
design (*See* Design)
feedback in, 19–21
"good guys" *versus* "bad guys," 44–45
institutional conflict as strengthening courts, 45–47
international pressure, effect of, 43–44
legal elites in
influence of, 26–27
judicial review, role in rise of, 25–26
other states compared, 27–28
other states compared, 23–24
overview, 19, 38–39
prior elites, and commitment to democratization and rule of law, 42–45
public support approach to
objection to nonlinear theory, as, 50–52
other states, in, 50–52
problems with, 52
separation of powers and, 45–46
short-term policy making and, 39–41, 52–53
Soviet experience, rejection of, 24–25
strategic approach to
compliance under, 49–50
delegation of power and, 47–49
objection to nonlinear theory, as, 47–50
strength of constitutional courts under, 49
Ulysses metaphor, 47–49
variation in, 52
Normative decrees, 130
North Ossetia, 110

Olshan, Izhak, 263
Orenburg, 244
Orphans Benefits Act, 182
Overstaying of terms of judges, 259–261
Overview, 15–18

Pension cases, Second RCC and, 161, 184
Perestroyka
judicial review and, 56–58
retirement age and, 112
Poland, constitutional court in, 2, 22, 261
Pomeranz, William, 139
Portugal
constitutional court in, 116
overstaying of terms of judges, 259–261
Positive content decisions, 123–125, 208
Positive law making, 272, 273
President. *See also* Putin, Vladimir; Yeltsin, Boris
compliance, importance of presidential decrees to, 222–223
implied powers of
First RCC and, 108–109
Second RCC and, 128–130
law making power, 211
Russian constitution, powers under, 128
separation of powers and, 209
veto power, 129–130, 211
Prior elites, commitment to democratization and rule of law, 42–45
Privatization, 103
Procuracy
CSC and, 68
detention of accused by, 213–214
establishment of, 56

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

harmonization of laws and, 218–219
opposition to First RCC, 68–69
regional law making and, 217–218
residence permits and, 245
Stalinist purges, and victims of, 242
taxpayer rights and, 236
Procurator General, 78, 213
Property rights, Second RCC and, 166
Propiska
CSC and, 97–98
Second RCC and
compliance, 245–246
proportional restrictions on rights, 168
Proportional restrictions on rights. *See* Second Russian Constitutional Court
Prosecutors, compliance problems with, 232
Przeworski, Adam, 116
Public support approach
judicial empowerment, to, 5–6
judicial review, to, 299–300
nonlinear judicial empowerment, to
objection to nonlinear theory, as, 50–52
other states, in, 50–52
problems with, 52
Putin, Vladimir
Criminal Procedure Code, on, 213–214
dissolution of regional governments and, 147–148
electoral rights and, 244
European Court of Human Rights, on, 229
federalism and, 150, 246–247, 293–294
Irkutsk case and, 199–200
judicial appointments by, 225
local self-government and, 155–156, 244–245
monetary obligations of government to individuals and, 201–202
referendum against, 137–138
Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994, amendments to
binding nature of rulings, regarding, 87–88
proposals, 85
relocation of court, 88–90
tenure of judges, regarding, 85–87
siloviki and, 234–235
sovereignty clauses, on, 226
Stalinist purges, and victims of, 240–243
subnational sovereignty and, 146–147
Tatarstan referendum, on, 197

Rakhimov, Murtaza, 227
RCC. *See* First Russian Constitutional Court; Second Russian Constitutional Court
Referendum process
Communist Party and, 137–138, 172
Congress of People's Deputies, regarding,
Tatarstan referendum, 109, 195–197
Regions (Russia). *See also* Federalism; *specific region*
accommodation approach, 109–110
constitutional/charter courts, 218–219
dissolution of regional governments, 147–148
election of local officials, 149–150, 152–153, 155–156
federal preemption of regional law, 145–146
fiscal policy, federal control over, 148–149
harmonization of laws, 218–219
joint jurisdiction issues, 110
judicial appointments, 223–225
regional law making, 142–143, 151–152, 153–154, 215–216, 218
relative strength of, 150–151
Second RCC, use of, 127
sovereignty clauses, 225–227
subfederal units, 109
subnational sovereignty, 146–147
Tatarstan referendum, 109
uniformity in regional governments, 144–145
Yelstin, relationship with, 142–143
Religious freedom, Second RCC and, 178
Remington, Thomas, 129
Republics (Soviet Union), CSC and, 58–59, 95–97, 189–190
Residence permits
CSC and, 97–98
Second RCC and
compliance, 245–246
proportional restrictions on rights, 168

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Retirement age cases
First RCC and
damages, 203–204
judicial review,
Russian constitution, under, 112
judges, retirement age for (*See* Tenure of judges)
Right to counsel, Second RCC and, 163
Romania
constitutional court in, 2
"War of the Courts" in, 220, 268, 271–272
Rubin, Edward, 141
Rudkin, Iurii
First RCC, role in establishing, 62, 63
retirement age cases, on, 203
Rule of law
coexistence of courts and, 283–284
design, effect of, 21
fiscal policy and, 169–170
Gorbachev and, 286
legal elites and, 25–26
political struggles, arising from, 2–4
prior elites, commitment of, 42–45
public support for, 251–252
United Kingdom, in, 283
"War of the Courts" and, 265, 274–275
Rupp, Hans G., 35
Russian Academy of Sciences, 246
Russian Central Bank, 149
Russian constitution
age discrimination cases under, 203–204
amendment process, 209–210
arrest power under, 213
Constitutional Convention of 1993 (*See* Constitutional Convention of 1993)
federalism and, 140
First RCC and, 61–62, 71–72
presidential powers under, 128
retirement age cases under, 203–204
Yeltsin, new draft by, 73
Russian Constitutional Court. *See* First Russian Constitutional Court; Second Russian Constitutional Court
Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994
draft of bill, 79–80
Putin, amendments under
binding nature of rulings, regarding, 87–88
proposals, 85
relocation of court, 88–90
tenure of judges, regarding, 85–87
State Duma, debate in, 80
Russian Council of Judges, 133, 212
Russian exceptionalism, 295–296
Russian Orthodox Church, 178
Russian Supreme Court
financial independence of, 212
First RCC, conflict with
age discrimination cases, 203–204
constitutional rights, over, 114–115
labor law cases, in, 112–114
reasons for, 204–205
retirement age cases, 203–204
wrongful dismissal cases, 202–203
reopening of cases, 214–215
residence permits, on, 246
Second RCC, conflict with
continuing problems, 290
harmonization of laws, 218–219
judicial review, 137
regional law making, 215–216, 217
reopening of cases, 214–215
statutory interpretation, 134–135
taxpayer rights and, 236
tenure of judges and, 85

Scholarly debate regarding Russian experience, 12
Search and seizure, Second RCC and, 133–134
Second Russian Constitutional Court. *See also specific justice*
alcohol license fees, 211–212
appointments to
Federation Council, by, 81, 82–85
Yeltsin, by, 80–81, 82–85
binding nature of rulings, amendments regarding, 87–88
capital punishment cases, 163
caseload, 123, 126–127
Central Elections Commission, conflict with, 137–138
chambers, 122
Chechnya and
federalism, 142, 144, 221
mass media, in, 252
separation of powers, 128–129
Chernobyl and, 178–179
compliance with

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

binding nature of rulings, amendments regarding, 87–88
complaints of justices regarding, 256
constitutional rights, problems with, 229–230, 291
decision making, relationship with, 150
distrust of courts, impact of, 291–292
effective governmental infrastructure, necessity of, 292
executive branch resistance, 211
federalism, 221–228
financial independence and, 212–214
judicial appointments and, 223–225
monitoring, difficulty in, 208–209
overview, 207–208, 254–255, 290–291
presidential decrees, importance of, 222–223
problems with, 81–82
prosecutors, problems with, 232
reasons for problems with, 255–256
residence permits, 245–246
separation of powers, 209–214
trial procedures, problems with, 232–233
constitutional rights and
access to court, 288
ambiguity and, 177–178
amnesty, suits against acts of, 159–160
binding nature of international laws, 174–176
caseload, 158–159
collective complaints, 161
compliance problems, 229–230, 291
creation of, 288
distrust of courts, impact of, 291–292
effective governmental infrastructure, necessity of, 292
equality of outcome, 178
expansion of access to court, 160–161
First RCC compared, 158
focus on, 228, 288–289
hidden principles, 173–174, 288
hierarchy of rights, 163–165
human rights law, effect of, 174–176
importance of, 158
institutions, suits against, 159–160
international pressure, impact of, 228–229
jurisprudence from other states, effect of, 176
legitimate restrictions, 165–166
overview, 185–187
strategic behavior of, 161–163
vagueness and, 177–178
contract rights, 166–168
criminal procedure and
Criminal Procedure Code, 230–232
judges, complaints for damages against, 233–234
prosecutors, compliance problems, 232
sentencing, fairness in, 180–181
separation of powers, 133–134, 213–214
siloviki, power of, 234–235
trial procedures, compliance problems, 232–233
customs officials, confiscation of property by, 239–240
decision making by
compliance, relationship with, 150
First RCC compared, 185
overview, 120, 127
difficulties in establishing, 90–91
disability payments and, 178–179
dissenting opinions, 121, 122
distrust of all courts, effect of, 250–251
economic rights and, 178
education of public, need for, 256–257
electoral rights and, 244
European Court of Human Rights and
citation of decisions by, 174–176
study of decisions by, 228
fairness in
deference to political branches, 183–184
legal formalism contrasted, 180
overview, 179–180, 184–185
pension cases, 184
sentencing, in, 180–181
social justice and
balancing individual rights, 181–182
overview, 181
taxation cases, 182–183
vulnerable groups, 182
wage cases, 182–183
federalism and
caseload, 139
Chechnya and, 142, 144, 221
compliance, 221–228
dissolution of regional governments, 147–148

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Second Russian Constitutional (*cont.*)
election of local officials, 149–150, 152–153, 155–156
First RCC compared, 227–228
fiscal federalism, 145–146, 154–155
growing role of, 156–157
historical context of, 139–140
judicial reluctance, 143–144
Komi, 223
local self-government, 155–156, 244–245
preemption of regional law, 145–146
presidential decrees, importance of, 222–223
regional fiscal policy, federal control over, 148–149
regional law making, 142–143, 151–152, 153–154, 215–216, 218
relationship between decision making and compliance, 150
sovereignty clauses in regional constitutions, 225–227
subnational sovereignty, 146–147
symmetrical federalism, 221
taxation cases, 154–155
Udmurtia case, 144, 149, 221–222
unification approach, 140–141
uniformity in regional governments, 144–145
financial independence of, 82, 133, 212–214
First RCC compared
constitutional rights, 158
decision making, 185
federalism, 227–228
separation of powers, 138–139
growth in power of, 294–295
Higher *Arbitrazh* Court, conflict with
continuing problems, 290
guiding explanations, 215
regional law making, 216
reopening of cases, 214–215
statutory interpretation, 134–135
ignorance regarding, 249–250
individuals, petitions by, 126
innovation in, 92
international pressure and, 228–229, 286–287
interpretative decisions, 122–123
judicial activism in, 92, 122–125
judicial independence, public support for, 251–252
judicial review in
growth of, 186
intrajudicial disputes, 137
limitations on, 120–121
proportional restrictions on rights, development of standard via, 169
theories of, 219–220
"juristocracy" and, 294–295
lack of information regarding rulings, 247
land use statutes and, 243–244
legal elites and, 286
mass media and, 252–253
opinion polls regarding, 247–248, 250–251
political bodies, petitions by, 126–127
political disputes, avoidance of, 288–289
political problems in, 118–120
politicization of, 157
positive content decisions, 123–125, 208
property rights, 166
proportional restrictions on rights
bankruptcy cases, 169
election cases
campaigning, 172–173
dispute resolution, 171–172
mass media and, 172–173
referendum process, 172
State Duma, 170–171
fiscal penalties, 169–170
judicial review, development of standard via, 169
malicious intent standard, 173
overview, 165–166, 168–169
residence permits and, 168
statutory requirement, 168
taxation cases, 169–170
public hearings, lack of, 125–126
public image of, 247–254
public policy changes and, 289
public relations efforts, 253–254
regions and
constitutional/charter courts, 218–219
dissolution of regional governments, 147–148
election of local officials, 149–150, 152–153, 155–156
federal preemption of regional law, 145–146

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

fiscal policy, federal control over, 148–149
harmonization of laws, 218–219
judicial appointments, 223–225
regional law making, 142–143, 151–152, 153–154, 215–216, 218
relative strength of, 150–151
sovereignty clauses, 225–227
subnational sovereignty, 146–147
uniformity in regional governments, 144–145
use by, 127
religious freedom and, 177–178
relocation of, 88–90
reopening of cases, 214–215
residence permits and
compliance, 245–246
proportional restrictions on rights, 168
right to counsel, 163
Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994 (*See* Russian Constitutional Court act of 1994)
Russian Supreme Court, conflict with
continuing problems, 290
harmonization of laws, 218–219
judicial review, 137
regional law making, 215–216, 217
reopening of cases, 214–215
statutory interpretation, 134–135
separation of powers and
arrest power, 133–134, 213–214
Audit Chamber, 131–132
Cabinet decrees, 211–212
Chechnya and, 128–129
compliance, 209–214
conflict of laws, 135–137
constitutional amendment process, 209–210
criminal procedure, 133–134, 213–214
executive branch resistance, 211
Federation Council, conflict with, 209
First RCC compared, 138–139
implied powers of president, 128–130
intrajudicial disputes, 134–135
intralegislative disputes, 130–131
normative decrees, 130
president and
law making power, 211
veto power, 211
referendum process, 137–138
search and seizure, 133
stability in, 127–128
State Duma and
conflict with, 209
second reading, fundamental changes introduced in, 210–211
subconstitutional disputes, 135–137
taxation cases, 132–133
veto power, 129–130, 211
sessions, 122
short-term policy making and, 91–92, 287
specific rulings, public support for, 248–249
Stalinist purges, and victims of, 240–243
strategies to enhance reputation of, 252
surveillance cases, 163–165
taxation cases
bank deposits and tax obligations, 235–237
double taxation, 235–237
fairness in, 182–183
federalism and, 154–155
good faith taxpayers, 237–238
overview, 235
proportional restrictions on rights, 169–170
resistance to rulings, 239
separation of powers and, 132–133
YUKOS case, 238–239
tenure of judges, amendments regarding, 85–87
timelines, 83
transparency, lack of, 125–126
Yeltsin and
appointments by, 80–81
conflict with, 209
relationship with, 118–120
Selivon, Mykola, 262
Sentencing, fairness in, 180–181
Separation of powers
Federation Council and, 209
First RCC and (*See* First Russian Constitutional Court)
nonlinear judicial empowerment and, 45–46
president and, 209
Second RCC and (*See* Second Russian Constitutional Court)
State Duma and, 209

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Serbia
constitutional court in, 2
"War of the Courts" in, 267
Shakhrai, Sergei, 68, 70, 126
Shortening of terms of judges, 261–262, 263
Short-term policy making
Chechnya and, 8
compliance and, 301
decision making and, 301
design and, 54–55, 91–92, 301
judicial empowerment, impact on, 7–8
nonlinear judicial empowerment and, 39–41, 52–53
Second RCC and, 287
Shulzhenko, Iurii, 57
Shumeiko, Vladimir, 84
Siloviki, power of, 234–235
Skuratov, Yuri, 213
Slaughter, Anne-Marie, 176
Slobodkin, Yuri, 67, 68
Slovakia, constitutional court in, 2, 261
Slovenia, "War of the Courts" in, 268
Social justice, Second RCC and
balancing individual rights, 181–182
overview, 181
vulnerable groups, 182
Soloviev, Vadim, 198
Solyom, Laszlo, 263–264
Sources of data
interviews, 14
primary sources, 13–14
secondary sources, 14
South Africa, constitutional court in, 261
Sovereignty clauses in regional constitutions, 225–227
Soviet Union
Central Executive Committee, 56
Congress of People's Deputies (*See* Congress of People's Deputies)
CSC (*See* Constitutional Supervision Committee (CSC))
dissolution of, 98, 103
judicial review in, 56
Procuracy (*See* Procuracy)
republics, CSC and, 58–59, 95–97, 189–190
Supreme Court, 56
Supreme Soviet (*See* Supreme Soviet)
Union Treaty, 60–61
Spain
constitutional court in
caseload, 159
compliance problems, 34
impact of jurisprudence, 176
impeachment power, 8
individuals, petitions by, 126
legal hierarchy, 36
overstaying of terms, 259
politicization of, 116
politics and, 31
public support for, 50
federalism in, 142
judicial independence in, 33
"War of the Courts" in, 51, 269, 270, 274, 302
Special governance regime, 107–108
Stalin, Joseph, 283
Stalinist purges, victims of, 240–243
State Duma
binding nature of judicial rulings, resistance to Putin proposals regarding, 87–88
dissolution power, 78
election cases, proportional restrictions on rights, 170–171
Federation Council, disputes with, 130–131
relocation of Second RCC, resistance to Putin proposals regarding, 89–90
retirement and tenure of judges, resistance to Putin proposals regarding, 86
Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994, debate on, 80
Second RCC, conflict with, 209
second reading, fundamental changes introduced in, 210–211
separation of powers and, 209
Stalinist purges, and victims of, 241
taxation and, 154
Stepankov, Valentin, 68, 72
Strategic approach
judicial empowerment, to, 5, 7
judicial review, to, 297–298, 299, 300
nonlinear judicial empowerment, to
compliance under, 49–50
delegation of power and, 47–49

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

objection to nonlinear theory, as, 47–50
strength of constitutional courts under, 49
Ulysses metaphor, 47–49
"War of the Courts" and, 293, 299
Subfederal units, 109
Subnational sovereignty, 146–147
Sumin, Petr, 198, 199
Supreme Soviet
CSC and, 59
dissolution by Yeltsin, 74–75, 108
First RCC, role in establishing, 61–62
Surveillance cases, Second RCC, 163
Symmetrical federalism, 221

Taiwan
constitutional court in, 34
shortening of terms of judges, 261–262
"War of the Courts" in, 52
Tajikistan, constitutional court in, 2
Tatarstan
constitutional/charter courts and, 219
electoral rights in, 244
judicial appointments in, 224
judicial review, resistance to, 206
referendum, 109, 195–197
residence permits in, 168
sovereignty and, 225–227
Taxation
Cabinet and, 154
Federation Council and, 154
Second RCC and
bank deposits and tax obligations, 235–237
double taxation, 235–237
fairness in, 182–183
federalism, 154–155
good faith taxpayers, 237–238
overview, 235
proportional restrictions on rights, 169–170
resistance to rulings, 239
separation of powers, 132–133
YUKOS case, 238–239
State Duma and, 154
Tax Code, 236, 237
Tax Ministry, 235–237, 239
Tenure of judges
comparative perspective, 282–283
Constitutional Convention of 1993, changes at, 75
extension of terms, 261, 262–264
overstaying of terms, 259–261
overview, 258, 259
political commitment to judicial independence and, 264–265
Russian Supreme Court and, 85
Second RCC, amendments regarding, 85–87
shortening of terms, 261–262, 263
tables, 87, 260
Teune, Henry, 116
Tilly, Charles, 37
Tiunov, Oleg, 203
Trial procedures, compliance problems, 232–233
Tsarist Russia
judicial independence in, 33
judicial review in, 55–56
Tumanov, Vladimir
chair of Second RCC, as, 119
Chechnya, on, 221
civil rights, on, 158
compliance, on problems with, 81
mass media, on, 252
Stalinist purges, on victims of, 241
Zorkin, on, 77
Tyler, Tom, 23
Tyva, 225

Udmurtia, 144, 149, 155, 221–222
Ukraine
constitutional court in, 2, 61
extension of terms of judges, 262–263
"War of the Courts" in, 52, 267, 274
Union Treaty, 60–61
Uniqueness of Russian experience, 10
United Kingdom
legal elites in, 27
"War of Courts" in, 283
United States
compliance in, 302
federalism in, 142
First RCC compared, 72
judicial review in, 27–28, 50
tenure of judges in, 264
Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 174

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

USSR. *See* Soviet Union
Uzbekistan, constitutional court in, 2, 46

Vagueness, constitutional rights and, 177–178
Vanberg, Georg, 24
Vedernikov, Nikolai
  monetary obligations of government to individuals, on, 200, 201
  regional law making, on, 152
Venice Commission for Democracy through Law, 229, 262
Verdery, Katherine, 39
Veto points approach, 292–293
Veto power, 129–130, 211
Vitruk, Nikolai
  appointments to Second RCC, on, 81
  compensation of victims, on, 240
  compliance, on problems with, 82, 256
  conflict of laws, on, 136
  Constitutional Convention of 1993, role at, 73, 74
  decision making, on, 80
  dissolution of First RCC and, 75
  financial independence of Second RCC, on, 82
  impeachment of Yeltsin, on, 108
  joint executive–legislative decrees, on, 105
  retirement of, 227
  Russian Constitutional Court Act of 1994, on, 79
  sentencing, on, 181
  sovereignty clauses, on, 226
  Udmurtia case, on, 222
Voronezh, 168

"War of the Courts." *See also specific state*
  assumption of jurisdiction by constitutional courts, 269–270
  coexistence of courts and, 283–284
  competition among courts, necessity of, 265, 269–270
  constitutional rights, effect on, 284
  Czech Republic, in (*See* Czech Republic)
  European Court of Human Rights and, 275–276
  federalism and, 293–294
  Higher *Arbitrazh* Court, conflict with Second RCC
    continuing problems, 290
    guiding explanations, 215
    regional law making, 216
    reopening of cases, 214–215
    statutory interpretation, 134–135
  judicial resistance to constitutional courts, 270–271
  legalistic explanation, 267–268
  monopolizing of judicial review by constitutional courts, 272–273
  nature of disputes, 265–266
  overview, 258–259, 265
  political causes of, 274
  positive law making and, 272, 273
  postcommunist states, in, 270
  problems arising from, 273–274
  progressive/reactionary explanation, 268–269
  rule of law and, 265, 274–275
  Russian Supreme Court
    First RCC, conflict with
      age discrimination cases, 203–204
      constitutional rights, over, 114–115
      labor law cases, in, 112–114
      reasons for, 204–205
      retirement age cases, 203–204
      wrongful dismissal cases, 202–203
    Second RCC, conflict with
      continuing problems, 290
      harmonization of laws, 218–219
      judicial review, 137
      regional law making, 215–216, 217
      reopening of cases, 214–215
      statutory interpretation, 134–135
  scholarly attention, lack of, 266–267
  strategic approach and, 293, 299
  strategies for resolving, 274, 276
  table, 216
  veto points approach, 292–293
Way, Lucan, 193, 255
Widner, Jennifer, 302
World Bank, 43
Wrongful dismissal
  CSC and, 97
  First RCC, in
    compensation, 202–203
    damages, 113
    judicial review, 112–113

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-17335-3 - Judging Russia: Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990-2006
Alexei Trochev
Index
More information

Yeltsin, Boris
  Chelyabinsk case and, 198–199
  Communist Party, ban of, 106–107, 192–193
  Congress of People's Deputies, dissolution of, 108
  constitutional amendment process and, 209–210
  Constitutional Commission, as head of, 61–62
  Constitutional Convention of 1993, convening of, 73–74
  First RCC and
    appointments to, 69–70, 75–77
    legal elites and, 286
    resistance to, 290
    support for, 64
    suspension of, 1, 74–75, 108–109
  impeachment of, 1, 103, 108
  Irkutsk case and, 199
  judicial appointments by, 223–225
  Khasbulatov, relationship with,
  monetary obligations of government to individuals and, 201
  Mordovia case and, 198
  Moscow privatization case and, 199
  new draft of Russian constitution by, 73
  regions, relationship with, 142–143
  Second RCC and
    appointments to, 80–81, 82–85
    conflict with, 209
    legal elites and, 286
    relationship with, 118–120
  special governance regime, 107–108
  Supreme Soviet, dissolution of, 108
  Tatarstan referendum, on, 196–197
  Udmurtia case and, 222
  veto power, on, 129
  Zorkin and
    impeachment of, on, 206
    relationship with, 101, 102–103, 115, 288
Yugoslavia, constitutional court in, 190
YUKOS case, 238–239

Zadornov, Mikhail, 212–213
Zorkin, Valerii
  chair of First RCC, as, 100–101
  chair of Second RCC, as, 119–120
  compensation of victims, on, 240–241
  compliance, on problems with, 256
  constitutional rights, on, 158
  "court packing," on, 77
  dissolution of First RCC and, 75
  federalism, on, 141–142
  impeachment of, 206
  institutional conflict, on, 46
  judicial review, on, 105
  Khasbulatov, relationship with, 101, 102–103
  monetary obligations of government to individuals, on, 201
  political strength of, 100–101
  public hearings, on, 125
  public relations efforts, 253–254
  regions, on petitions by, 157
  resignation from First RCC, 104
  Second RCC, on, 119
  separation of powers, on, 63, 104–105, 192
  Yeltsin and
    impeachment of, on, 108
    relationship with, 101, 102–103, 115, 288

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org