

Death and Mortality in Contemporary Philosophy

This book contributes to current bioethical debates by providing a critical analysis of the philosophy of human death. Bernard N. Schumacher discusses contemporary philosophical perspectives on death, creating a dialogue between phenomenology, existentialism, and analytic philosophy. He also examines the ancient philosophies that have shaped our current ideas about death. His analysis focuses on three fundamental problems: (1) the definition of human death, (2) the knowledge of mortality and of human death as such, and (3) the question of whether death is “nothing” to us or, on the contrary, whether it can be regarded as an absolute or relative evil. Drawing on scholarship published in different languages and from distinct currents of thought, this volume represents a comprehensive and systematic study of the philosophy of death, one that provides a provocative basis for discussions of the bioethics of human mortality.

Bernard N. Schumacher received his Ph.D. in philosophy and his Habilitation from the University of Fribourg in Switzerland, where he currently teaches. He has served as a visiting professor at the University of Chicago; Providence College, Rhode Island; and the University of Lugano. He is the author of *A Philosophy of Hope* (2003) and has edited and co-edited numerous scholarly works, including *L'humain et la personne* (2008, translated into German as *Der Mensch und die Person*) and *A Cosmopolitan Hermit: Modernity and Tradition in the Philosophy of Josef Pieper* (2009).

Death and Mortality in Contemporary Philosophy

BERNARD N. SCHUMACHER

University of Fribourg

Translated by Michael J. Miller



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-0-521-17119-9 — Death and Mortality in Contemporary Philosophy
 Bernard N. Schumacher, Translated by Michael J. Miller
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521171199

© Bernard N. Schumacher 2005, 2004, 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published in French as *Confrontations avec la mort. La philosophie contemporaine et la question de la mort* by Cerf, Paris 2005

Published in German as *Der Tod in der Philosophie der Gegenwart* by Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, Darmstadt 2004

Revised English edition published by Cambridge University Press 2011

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Schumacher, Bernard N.

Death and mortality in contemporary philosophy / Bernard N. Schumacher.
 p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76932-7 — ISBN 978-0-521-17119-9 (pbk.)

1. Death. I. Title.

BD444.S3936 2010

128⁷.5-dc22 2010030606

ISBN 978-0-521-76932-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-17119-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-0-521-17119-9 — Death and Mortality in Contemporary Philosophy
Bernard N. Schumacher , Translated by Michael J. Miller
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

to Michele Marie

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-0-521-17119-9 — Death and Mortality in Contemporary Philosophy
Bernard N. Schumacher , Translated by Michael J. Miller
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

This award-winning book received the
Prince Franz-Joseph II of Liechtenstein Prize.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction	1
PART ONE HUMAN PERSONAL DEATH	
1 Definitions of Death and What We Mean by Person	13
Introduction	13
Biological Death	17
So-called Personal Death	20
The Anthropological Challenge of Neocortical Death	31
Ethics as the Criterion for Defining Death	38
Diversity of Definitions of Death in a Secular Ethic	45
Conclusion	48
PART TWO THEORY OF KNOWLEDGE ABOUT DEATH	
2 Scheler's Intuitive Knowledge of Mortality	51
Introduction	51
Modern Man's Attitude Towards Death Itself	53
The Certainty of Mortality Based on Observation and Induction or on Intuition	54
Problematic Questions Raised by Scheler's Thesis of an Intuitive Knowledge of Mortality	58
3 Heidegger's Being-Towards-Death	61
The Distinction Between Ontical and Ontological	62
The Impossibility of Experiencing My Own Death	64
The Death of Another as a Possible Object of Thanatological Knowledge	68
Being-Towards-Death	72
Critique	80
	vii

viii	<i>Contents</i>
4	Is Mortality the Object of Foreknowledge? 85
5	Inductive Knowledge of Death and Jean-Paul Sartre 91
	The Realist and Idealist Concepts of Death 92
	The Expectation of My Death 95
	Death as Another's Victory 99
	Death as a Situation-limit 107
	Conclusion 109
6	Knowledge of Mortality Is Inseparable from the Relation to the Other 112
7	Death as the Object of Experience 117
	Mutual Exclusiveness of the States of Life and Death 122
	The Meaning of the Expression "My Death" 127
	Death in Life 131
	Love as the Unveiling of What Is Unthinkable about Death 139
	The Phenomenology of Death 140
PART THREE DOES DEATH MEAN NOTHING TO US?	
8	The "Nothingness of Death": Epicurus and His Followers 151
	Presuppositions of the Epicurean Thesis of the "Nothingness of Death": Materialism, Hedonism, and Experientialism 151
	"Death Is Nothing to Us" 153
	The Ancients 155
	Modern Thinkers: Montaigne, Feuerbach, Schopenhauer, and Others 165
9	Discussion of Experientialism and the Need for a Subject 168
	The <i>A Priori</i> Character of the Epicurean Assertion that Death Is Nothing to Us 168
	First Series of Examples Against Experientialism: Comparisons Between Two States of Life 171
	Second Series of Examples Against Experientialism: Comparisons Between a State of Life and a State of Death 174
	Third Set of Possible Arguments Against Experientialism: Posthumous Evils 175
	The Subject of Posthumous Evils 177
10	Death: An Evil of Privation 182
	Of What Does Death Deprive the Subject? 184
	Is Death Always an Evil? 192
	Defense of the Characterization of Death as an Evil in View of the Peaceful State of Prenatal Nonexistence 206
	Conclusion 213
	<i>Bibliography</i> 221
	<i>Index of Names</i> 249
	<i>Index of Concepts</i> 255

Preface

In order to safeguard his happiness, contemporary Western man has contrived to stop thinking at all about death and, more particularly, about his own death, to deny it in a way by maintaining a stony silence with regard to it. Some philosophers end up taking part in this masquerade by considering the subject taboo or by declaring that it is not philosophical. Whereas the act of philosophizing was understood in the philosophical tradition as a preparation for death, as a rumination on life and death, many contemporary philosophers set aside the very question of man's relation to "his own death". Does this habit of averting their eyes originate in a fear of death? Is it due to a shift of attention away from radical questions concerning the meaning and ultimate foundation of human life, in both its personal and its social dimension, so as to focus on particular and local problems? Whatever the reason, it seems that philosophy would have everything to gain if it once again centered its theoretical and practical reflections on such fundamental themes, for they are at the heart of human existence.

When they heard that I was writing a book on death, most of my colleagues smiled ironically; they just couldn't understand how a young philosopher could "waste" several years of his life meditating on death, given that the subject eludes all philosophical investigation and there is no hope whatsoever of arriving at definitive answers. But isn't philosophy, in some sense, a waste of time? Like true leisure and love, philosophy cannot be evaluated in terms of profitability, and I am glad that I devoted time to contemplating a philosophical subject that of course continues to elude me but that nonetheless is evident under the aspects of the incomprehensible and the frontier.

The years that I spent meditating on death have certainly enabled me to tame it somewhat, to understand it a little better by clarifying certain points and by dispelling several false notions with regard to it. While eluding thorough comprehension, it nevertheless remains one of the most troubling mysteries for philosophical reflection. Writing the present volume did not lay to rest my philosophical and existential musings; I am still seeking a better understanding of death and, more particularly, my death and the death of those whom I love.

I am extremely grateful to my wife, Michele Marie, without whom this book could not have been written. During her patient and painstaking reading of the various drafts of the manuscript, she managed with great perspicacity to identify a number of problems in my arguments, suggesting excellent comments and corrections and offering many pertinent arguments and criticisms. I am very grateful to her for those long and stimulating discussions that shaped the present volume, as well as for her constant support over the course of those many years. I dedicate this book to her as a token of my profound gratitude. I likewise thank my older daughter, Myriam, for her patience, during the final months of composition, with a Dad who was absorbed in his reflections, and also for her regular visits with her mother to the library to look up references. I am likewise very thankful for my three other children, Sophia, Teresa, and Nicolas, who helped me, along with Myriam, to understand better what it means to live.

My thanks also to Evandro Agazzi for his generous support and his availability, as well as for his valuable comments and suggestions; to Martine Nida-Rümelin, Daniel Schulthess, and Jean-Claude Wolf for their helpful remarks; to the late Jorge Arregui for the long and stimulating discussions that we had on several themes treated in this work; to Jacinto Choza, Günther Figal, John Martin Fischer, Thomas Flynn, Paul Griffiths, Otfried Höffe, Thomas De Koninck, Thomas Nagel, Gregory Reichberg, and Ronald Santoni for their discussions and their excellent critiques; to the anonymous reviewers of the manuscript for their very helpful comments and enlightening points; to Michael J. Miller not only for his excellent translation but also for his marvelous synthesis of professional and human qualities including his dedication and true kindness; and finally to the staff of Cambridge University Press – especially Beatrice Rehl, editor; Emily Spangler, assistant editor; and Regina Paleski, production editor – for their helpful comments, fine work, and patience. This monograph was also made possible thanks to the financial assistance of the Humboldt Foundation and of the National Swiss

Preface

xi

Foundation for Scientific Research. Finally, I am very grateful to the students of the University of Fribourg (Switzerland) and the University of Chicago who attended my seminars and my lectures on death and on the notion of person for their questions and comments, which stimulated my personal reflection.

The present work constitutes a revised edition of the original French and German editions. The first part of this English edition has been entirely rewritten and the first chapter of the second part (treating the knowledge of death and mortality of the animal, the “primitive” human being, and the child) of the original editions does not appear here.